

TOWN OF COLLINGWOOD JUDICIAL INQUIRY

Before:

Associate Chief Justice Frank Marrocco

Held at:

Collingwood Town Hall Council Chambers 97 Hurontario Street Collingwood, Ontario

June 14th, 2019



```
2
1
                 APPEARANCES
2
3 Kate McGrann
                         ) Inquiry Counsel
4 John Mather
                     ) Associate Inquiry
5
                          ) Counsel
6
7 Michael Watson ) Alectra Utilities
8 Belinda Bain (np) ) Corporation
9 Heather Fisher
10
11 (No Counsel)
                   ) For Paul Bonwick
12
13 George Marron
                   ) For Sandra Cooper
14
15 (No Counsel)
                         ) For Timothy Fryer
16
17 Frederick Chenoweth ) For Edwin Houghton
18
19 William McDowell (np) ) For Town of Collingwood
20 Ryan Breedon
                         )
21
22 Patrick Gajos (np) ) For Collus PowerStream
23
                         )Corporation
24
2.5
```

		3
1	TABLE OF CONTENTS	
2		PAGE NO.
3	List of Exhibits	4
4		
5	PAUL BONWICK, Previously Sworn	
6	Cross-examination by Mr. Tim Fryer	5
7	Cross-examination by Mr. Ryan Breedon	
8		
9	PAUL BONWICK, Testifies	185
10		
11	SHIRLEY HOUGHTON, Sworn	
12	Examination-in-Chief by Mr. John Mather	203
13	Cross-examination by Mr. Michael Watson	252
14	Cross-examination by Mr. Ryan Breedon	278
15	Cross-examination by Mr. Frederick Chenoweth	286
16		
17		
18		
19		
20		
21		
22		
23	Certificate of Transcript	299
24		
25		

-			,		
					4
	1		List of Exhibits		
	2	Exhibit No.	Description	Page No.	
	3	355	TOC0060090		
	4	356	TOC0060091		
	5	357	CJI0007645		
	6	358	AFF000010		
	7	359	TOC0249903.0001		
	8				
	9				
	10				
	11				
	12				
	13				
	14				
	15				
	16				
	17				
	18				
	19				
	20				
	21				
	22				
	23				
	24				
	25				

```
5
   --- Upon commencing at 9:04 a.m.
 2
 3
                   THE HONOURABLE FRANK MARROCCO: Mr.
   Fryer...?
 5
                   MR. TIM FRYER: Good morning, Justice
   Marrocco. Thank you. Mr. -- I'm sorry.
 7
                   THE REGISTRAR: Mr. Bonwick, you
   understand you're still under oath?
 9
                   MR. PAUL BONWICK: Yes, I do.
10
11
                 PAUL BONWICK, Previously Sworn
12
   CROSS-EXAMINATION BY MR. TIM FRYER:
13
14
                   MR. TIM FRYER: Mr. Bonwick, as a
15
   matter of record, I am Tim Fryer and I am representing
   myself during these proceedings.
17
                   The questions I had on your role and
18
   influence on the Collus share sale outcome had been
   generally covered yesterday, so I will start with
   getting your perspective of the general sense of
   Collingwood Council when they made their decision to
21
22
   enter into the strategic partnership aggressive growth
23
   strategy model.
24
                   In preparation for the January 23rd,
25
   2012, Collingwood Council decision to sell to
```

- 1 PowerStream, was Collingwood Council ever fully
- 2 apprised of the growth strategy model?
- 3 MR. PAUL BONWICK: I don't know.
- 4 MR. TIM FRYER: Was there a particular
- 5 meeting that there'd been an actual business plan
- 6 outline presented to them?
- 7 MR. PAUL BONWICK: Mr. Fryer, you've
- 8 sat here as much as I have. I've watched the various
- 9 slide decks that were presented to Collingwood
- 10 Council. Beyond that, I really couldn't comment.
- I was not involved in any of the
- 12 presentations, either in camera or public for Council,
- 13 so I really can't speak to their understanding.
- 14 MR. TIM FRYER: Okay. Your
- 15 examination of Mr. Bentz on June 3rd, was that it was
- 16 incumbent that the shareholder take a very long view -
- 17 term view as to how the growth strategy unfolds,
- 18 correct? Do you remember that?
- MR. PAUL BONWICK: Yes.
- MR. TIM FRYER: The January 23rd,
- 21 2012, vote -- vote, was eight (8) to zero (0).
- 22 Councillor Hull was absent.
- Was unanimous support what you
- 24 expected?
- MR. PAUL BONWICK: In my twenty-five

 \neg

- 1 (25) or thirty (30) years of dealing with various
- 2 political bodies, I reserve the right to expect any
- 3 particular result.
- 4 MR. TIM FRYER: So I just had wondered
- 5 if --
- 6 MR. PAUL BONWICK: I'm sorry, should I
- 7 look this way or --
- THE HONOURABLE FRANK MARROCCO: Well,
- 9 you -- you can look at the questioner -- it'll be
- 10 easier for you to hear. Just watch the mic, that's
- 11 all.
- MR. PAUL BONWICK: Oh, sorry, do you
- 13 want it back further or --
- 14 MR. TIM FRYER: Mr. Bonwick, I'm --
- 15 I'm the culprit. I'm a little too loud.
- MR. PAUL BONWICK: Sorry about that.
- 17 Could you repeat that, please?
- 18 MR. TIM FRYER: Yeah. I just got to
- 19 find where T was.
- 20
- 21 CONTINUED BY MR. TIM FRYER:
- 22 MR. TIM FRYER: Yeah. So I had asked
- 23 if -- if a unanimous vote was what you expected, and
- 24 you said you weren't -- so, I could just follow that
- 25 up with, I just wondered if you'd given a perspective

- 1 to PowerStream leading up to that vote in your role
- 2 with PowerStream?
- 3 MR. PAUL BONWICK: Certainly based on
- 4 -- based on my view of how the events were unfolding,
- 5 based on the public meetings that I watch on
- 6 television, not knowing what transpired in the in
- 7 camera stuff, but from the public meetings that we'd
- 8 seen, there didn't appear to be -- there didn't appear
- 9 to be a lot of objections being raised by members of
- 10 Council. Most of the comments that I witnessed seemed
- 11 to be entirely positive.
- So all I can do is share my opinion
- 13 based on what I seen from the public meetings and any
- 14 feedback through casual conversation with Councillors.
- 15 I never really got any sense that there was
- 16 significant objection, but going back to your earlier
- 17 question, that doesn't mean how the vote turns out.
- 18 Again, I've seen people very positive
- 19 about various items and all of a sudden it comes to a
- 20 vote, whether it's a council or legislature or
- 21 Parliament, and the votes sometimes go the opposite
- 22 direction. So, I really can't comment on what the
- 23 expectations were beyond that.
- 24 MR. TIM FRYER: Okay. Were you aware
- 25 during 2010 and '11, Collingwood Council discussions,

- 1 Councillor Guardhouse had expressed desire to sell a
- 2 hundred percent of the Utility?
- MR. PAUL BONWICK: I wasn't privy to
- 4 that meeting. Simply through the evidence or
- 5 testimony that's been presented.
- 6 MR. TIM FRYER: Okay. Would you agree
- 7 the suggested benefits of the growth strategy were an
- 8 influential factor for most of Collingwood Council's
- 9 support.
- 10 MR. PAUL BONWICK: It's difficult for
- 11 me to put myself in the minds of the individual
- 12 Councillors. I would suggest that through various
- 13 sources of information that were provided to them, I
- 14 think Council generally understood, similar to the
- 15 Board, that the status quo is not necessarily an
- 16 option that they wanted to land on.
- I think beyond that, Council -- again,
- 18 it's difficult for me to put myself and -- and say
- 19 what they were thinking, but I would certainly believe
- 20 that the opportunity to create a new entity that had
- 21 the potential to grow versus be assimilated into a
- 22 larger entity was certainly a con -- what should have
- 23 been a consideration for them, I assume was.
- 24 MR. TIM FRYER: And that's what I was
- 25 trying to do here, was work with you to understand

- 1 your perspective at that time, right. So that's what
- 2 you've explained.
- I was going to bring up Mr. Houghton's
- 4 notes, which is CJI0011186, and go to page 23, and
- 5 Item Number 5, and this will be part the -- what
- 6 you've already mentioned about evidence showing.
- 7 So this -- this simply is -- just --
- 8 THE HONOURABLE FRANK MARROCCO: Did
- 9 you say Item Number 5?
- 10 MR. TIM FRYER: Item 5 on page 23,
- 11 which is a collection of different topics.

- 13 CONTINUED BY MR. TIM FRYER:
- 14 MR. TIM FRYER: So if we just scroll
- 15 down --
- 16 MR. PAUL BONWICK: Can I just read it
- 17 or do you want me to --
- 18 MR. TIM FRYER: I'm just going to
- 19 highlight a particular area, so if I can just locate
- 20 it for us, it'll save you having to read the whole
- 21 thing.
- 22 So just come down a little bit. This
- 23 is -- it's about the slide presentation that was given
- 24 to Council on the 23rd. You saw the header there was
- 25 January 23rd. So if we go down to the next page,

- 1 right there.
- 2 So this is what you alluded to a little
- 3 bit earlier. Some of the evidence you've seen. This
- 4 is Councillor Guardhouse statement, within -- within
- 5 Mr. Houghton's notes, which he's transcribed from the
- 6 -- the meeting. So if -- if you wanted, we could just
- 7 read that out into -- into the record because this is
- 8 my question about he had been thinking a hundred
- 9 percent and he changed his -- his -- to support
- 10 the -- the -- so if you want to just read that out.
- MR. PAUL BONWICK:
- "Guardhouse states" --
- 13 And I'm assuming for the record that
- 14 would be Councillor Guardhouse. It doesn't identify
- 15 that, but I would assume that's the person.
- 16 -- "I think I made it clear to a few
- people early in the year that we
- 18 should have had full consideration
- in selling off electric utility and,
- quite frankly, I didn't have it in
- 21 my head that it would be getting
- into a partnership, but now I look
- 23 at the business structure and it is
- a good move and let's get on with
- 25 it."

1 THE HONOURABLE FRANK MARROCCO: And

- 2 just -- just to be clear, the -- Mr. Bonwick is
- 3 reading what purports to be a quote from Councillor
- 4 Guardhouse. That -- that last statement wasn't Mr.
- 5 Bonwick's.
- 6 MR. PAUL BONWICK: And just to clarify
- 7 that, Your Honour, I -- this is the first time I'm
- 8 reading it. I didn't -- I wasn't present when he made
- 9 that statement.
- 10 THE HONOURABLE FRANK MARROCCO: No, I
- 11 know, and -- but I want to hear Mr. Fryer's question
- 12 and then we'll see whether you need to read the note
- 13 or note. We've been fairly liberal with people giving
- 14 their impression about what other people meant when
- 15 they did things and so on.
- 16 MR. FREDERICK CHENOWETH: Your Honour,
- 17 it's interesting to note that I think that may be
- 18 right out of the transcript of the January 23rd
- 19 meeting.
- THE HONOURABLE FRANK MARROCCO:
- 21 Perhaps.
- 22 MR. TIM FRYER: Thank you, Justice
- 23 Marrocco, because that's an important point that I
- 24 should have made, is that that is exactly the -- and
- 25 actually Mr. Bonwick's already answered my question

- 1 because in the reference it does -- says, "speaking to
- 2 others," and I was going to ask Mr. Bonwick if he'd
- 3 spoken to Councillor Guardhouse but he says he -- he
- 4 didn't already, but -- but that's where the question
- 5 was going to go.
- 6 THE HONOURABLE FRANK MARROCCO: Well -
- 7 well, why don't you just -- because of the kind of -
- 8 because of different people who have spoken in the
- 9 last minute or so, why don't you just ask Mr. Bonwick
- 10 the question and then we'll get his answer.

- 12 CONTINUED BY MR. TIM FRYER:
- MR. TIM FRYER: So in the reference
- 14 there it does speak to having discussions with others.
- Were you speaking with Councillor
- 16 Guardhouse?
- MR. PAUL BONWICK: No.
- 18 MR. TIM FRYER: So there was no
- 19 business plan presented but even still Councillor
- 20 Guardhouse says he's seen enough to influence his view
- 21 and supported it, correct?
- 22 MR. PAUL BONWICK: I -- I don't know
- 23 that -- what Councillor Guardhouse was presented.
- 24 MR. TIM FRYER: That's all I'm saying,
- 25 is that he'd seen enough or he'd heard enough to make

- 1 the decision to go with the partnership.
- 2 MR. PAUL BONWICK: It appears to be
- 3 the case from the transcript.
- 4 MR. TIM FRYER: Right. Thank you. In
- 5 my examination of Mr. Bentz and Mr. Houghton, the
- 6 reasoning for lack of success of the model was that
- 7 the Town wasn't interested.
- 8 Do you recall that?
- 9 MR. PAUL BONWICK: Not exactly. From
- 10 what I understood from testimony from numerous
- 11 individuals that were attached throughout the process,
- 12 that in fact it was a success, quite a -- quite a
- 13 significant success in terms of the uniqueness of the
- 14 approach. I think it was somewhat unprecedented, the
- 15 scoring, the valuations, and the end product.
- 16 We've heard testimony that over the
- 17 course of the next year after the closing of the deal
- 18 and subsequent OEB approval, that the culture was very
- 19 good, the atmosphere was very good, and people,
- 20 generally speaking, that were attached to it at that
- 21 time felt that it had been a success, and then post
- 22 eighteen (18) months or two (2) years, that's where it
- 23 appeared to be that the Town was no longer interested
- 24 in pursuing that type of a model, but again that
- 25 speculative on my part because I wasn't part of those

- 1 deliberations.
- 2 MR. TIM FRYER: Okay. So that -- that
- 3 wasn't my question though.
- 4 My question was, do you recall that Mr.
- 5 Bentz made the statement that the Town wasn't
- 6 interested? And I can bring the transcript up if
- 7 you'd like.
- 8 MR. PAUL BONWICK: I don't think
- 9 that's necessary. I do recall that but I think you
- 10 need to put it into context with respect to the timing
- 11 of that statement, when he felt that was the case.
- 12 MR. TIM FRYER: And -- and the
- 13 question had been, why had it not been successful, but
- 14 we can move on from that.
- 15 Also in that particular area, Mr. Bentz
- 16 talked about the critical year being 2013. Do you
- 17 recall that?
- 18 MR. PAUL BONWICK: Somewhat.
- 19 MR. TIM FRYER: That's good enough.
- 20 There -- but because of that, there appears to be a
- 21 disjoint then. Even though all the particular parties
- 22 involved apparently had the same long-term vision and
- 23 should have the drive to bring it to fruition, would
- 24 you agree it's because there was no business plan that
- 25 showed the probable governance and financing structure

- 1 brought forward before voting to proceed?
- 2 MR. PAUL BONWICK: No. I wasn't
- 3 involved in the decision-making from Council. I
- 4 wasn't privileged to all the information they
- 5 received. I have no idea what transpired in terms of
- 6 in camera discussions. I'm not sure what individual
- 7 councillors -- what length individual councillors went
- 8 to research it on their own.
- 9 Quite often we'll find, depending on
- 10 the individual councillor, some will really sink into
- 11 a particular issue and do a lot of research on their
- 12 own; some rely strictly on staff. So I -- I can't
- 13 really comment on what information specifically they
- 14 were provided and why two (2) years later it wasn't as
- 15 successful as it had been the earlier year.
- 16 MR. TIM FRYER: Would you agree, in
- 17 initiating any initiative, having a business plan up
- 18 front to consider before voting would be the proper
- 19 procedure?
- 20 MR. PAUL BONWICK: Sorry, the business
- 21 plan moving forward?
- MR. TIM FRYER: Yes. So you
- 23 understand what your plan is.
- 24 MR. PAUL BONWICK: I think it's always
- 25 helpful. More information is better. Any information

- 1 Council could have that would give them an indication
- 2 of what the growth strategy was going to look like, I
- 3 think would be absolutely helpful to them.
- 4 MR. TIM FRYER: So moving on, the
- 5 other important element of long-term implementation is
- 6 of course having resources involved, like yourself Mr.
- 7 Houghton, for the roll-out and the momentum building
- 8 years. Is that correct?
- 9 MR. PAUL BONWICK: I would agree with
- 10 that.
- 11 MR. TIM FRYER: That certainly is what
- 12 I shared with Mr. Houghton, that a business plan was
- 13 critical and whoever was taking this forward need to
- 14 be committed.
- Did you discuss with that -- that with
- 16 him as well?
- MR. PAUL BONWICK: Yes, to some degree
- 18 we had a discussion -- or we had discussions, specific
- 19 to growth strategy, LDCs, that -- sort of where they
- 20 were in terms of progress or lack thereof as it
- 21 related to mergers, acquisitions, what had happened in
- 22 the past with specific LDCs, what their appetite might
- 23 be, to look at a regional model. There was those
- 24 kinds of discussions.
- MR. TIM FRYER: Okay. In your

- 1 testimony yesterday you reviewed that you had been
- 2 suggesting to Mr. Houghton that with the potential on
- 3 the retail, he should consider retiring and working
- 4 directly with you.
- 5 Do you recall that?
- 6 MR. PAUL BONWICK: Absolutely.
- 7 MR. TIM FRYER: So again there appears
- 8 to be a disjoint to the initiatives of being committed
- 9 to one (1) or -- or the other. But I -- I'm going to
- 10 move ahead and -- but before that, just one (1) last
- 11 question.
- 12 So after the January 23rd vote, during
- 13 the critical two-year implementation period, were any
- 14 meetings held between Collus PowerStream Board and
- 15 Collingwood Council to discuss potential for future
- 16 partnerships?
- 17 MR. PAUL BONWICK: I can't comment to
- 18 that. I wasn't on the Board, nor was I on Council.
- 19 THE HONOURABLE FRANK MARROCCO: I
- 20 think maybe one way you might ask, Mr. Fryer, is
- 21 whether Mr. Bonwick is aware of any, if you want to
- 22 phrase it that way.
- MR. TIM FRYER: I will certainly take
- 24 the advice.
- 25 THE HONOURABLE FRANK MARROCCO: I

- 1 appreciate you weren't at all of them, or all of the
- 2 Board meetings, but are you aware of meetings of that
- 3 nature?
- 4 MR. PAUL BONWICK: I am not aware of
- 5 interaction between full Council and full Board. It
- 6 was my understanding that there was councillors and
- 7 member from the public at large on the Board but I'm
- 8 unsure what kind of cross-sharing of information took
- 9 place.

- 11 CONTINUED BY MR. TIM FRYER:
- 12 MR. TIM FRYER: So again you're --
- 13 you're exercising the communications strategy for the
- 14 roll-out of the growth strategy. That's what I was
- 15 asking if you're aware of any meetings that did
- 16 happen.
- 17 We know that there was no successful
- 18 future partnership, but were you aware of any meetings
- 19 that happened in that two-year period, that there was
- 20 interaction between Council and the Board?
- 21 MR. PAUL BONWICK: No, but you'll
- 22 reflect on the point that my services were terminated
- 23 early on in the process, but I'm not familiar with
- 24 meetings that were scheduled between the Board or
- 25 Council over that two-year period.

1 MR. TIM FRYER: Okay. So I'm going to

- 2 switch over to now look at again, still the growth
- 3 strategy, but in particular the targeted CHEC group of
- 4 LDCs.
- 5 Back in 2010 when you were getting
- 6 familiar with things, did you know that CHEC was
- 7 started in 2000 by a number of new LDCs forming the
- 8 Organized Power Group?
- 9 MR. PAUL BONWICK: I'm not sure at
- 10 what point I learned that, but yes, I did learn that
- 11 there was an association of -- of various LDCs
- 12 throughout this region.
- MR. TIM FRYER: And the OPG acronym
- 14 wasn't by happenchance seeing how the province had
- 15 just formed Ontario Power Generation, but the name
- 16 changed fairly quickly.
- 17 Did you know that the CHEC -- that CHEC
- 18 originated with an objective of sharing CIS services
- 19 rather than each LDC creating their own?
- MR. PAUL BONWICK: No.
- 21 MR. TIM FRYER: You recall that
- 22 earlier evidence shows --
- MR. PAUL BONWICK: Sorry, if I may
- 24 back up there. Are you asking at that time? No, I
- 25 did not.

- 1 MR. TIM FRYER: You recall that
- 2 earlier evidence showed the CHEC group in 2011
- 3 comprised of 12 LCDs representing 102,000 ratepayers?
- 4 MR. PAUL BONWICK: Yes.
- 5 MR. TIM FRYER: Back in 2010 and '11,
- 6 did you believe CHEC was well-organized in meeting its
- 7 objectives?
- MR. PAUL BONWICK: I couldn't comment,
- 9 I wasn't that knowledgable about what CHEC's
- 10 objectives were and how they met that mandate or met
- 11 those objectives.
- 12 MR. TIM FRYER: In your capacity then,
- 13 and thinking about the CHEC group being the particular
- 14 target group, I had anticipated that you'd be looking
- 15 at it to see are they in a strong position or a weak
- 16 position? Did you look into that at all?
- 17 MR. PAUL BONWICK: Yes. I think our -
- 18 certainly my perspective on CHEC was it was an
- 19 association of various-sized LDCs, some quite small,
- 20 there seemed to be three that were sort of all in the
- 21 same range of size and based on factors beyond the LDC
- 22 world, it was our -- it was my opinion that they
- 23 represented opportunities to become part of a more
- 24 structured regional consolidated LDC as opposed to --
- 25 and I don't mean this is any derogatory sense, more of

- 1 a loosely fitted association where they find synergies
- 2 where possible to work together.
- 3 MR. TIM FRYER: Okay. Mr. Houghton
- 4 had said to me back then that he was surprised how
- 5 organized CHEC was.
- 6 Did he express that opinion to you as
- 7 well?
- MR. PAUL BONWICK: I don't recall him
- 9 speaking to me about how organized they were. I heard
- 10 Mr. -- or Mr. Houghton shared with me not on any
- 11 particular one occasion, but that he seemed to be very
- 12 pleased with the association that had been created,
- 13 recognizing the diversity in terms of size.
- 14 He certainly never spoke to me in any
- 15 sense of -- in a derogatory manner towards CHEC.
- 16 MR. TIM FRYER: No, it was just an
- 17 expression of surprise, that's all.
- 18 MR. PAUL BONWICK: I don't know that I
- 19 was surprised or he was surprised. He just spoke
- 20 positively about the CHEC group and the fact that the
- 21 various synergies brought them together, seemed to
- 22 make sense.
- MR. TIM FRYER: So based on your
- 24 knowledge back then, was your expectation that in --
- 25 back in 2011 that the CHEC model was not sustainable?

- 1 MR. PAUL BONWICK: I don't know that
- 2 it wasn't sustainable. It was my opinion that there
- 3 was greater efficiencies that could have been
- 4 achieved, recognizing what I believe to be trends back
- 5 then towards consolidation.
- If I look at some of the smaller LDCs
- 7 that are in that group, I would sit there and go -- if
- 8 we brought up the CHEC group I could reference them,
- 9 but I would sit there and go you've got seven or eight
- 10 relatively small LDCs that all have a president and
- 11 CEO, that all have a CFO, that would all have a
- 12 director of operations, that would all have a director
- 13 or a senior person responsible for human resources.
- 14 The list goes down and so you have
- 15 relatively small organizations or corporations that
- 16 have similar types of top structure. So in my mind
- 17 there would be significant efficiencies if you brought
- 18 four or five of them together and you had one
- 19 president, one CFO, one director of human resources,
- 20 one director of operations and so forth and so on.
- So to me, that would create
- 22 efficiencies from an organizational structure. I'm
- 23 not in any way a technical guy in terms of the
- 24 services you have to deliver. But I've heard
- 25 testimony and certainly was my opinion, uneducated as

- 1 it is, that it was stressful for even organizations
- 2 the size of Collus, which was one (1) of the big three
- 3 (3), if I can call it that, within the CHEC group.
- 4 So for those reasons I thought it would
- 5 make good sense for similar cultured LDCs that are
- 6 small to come together and create greater
- 7 efficiencies, certainly from a corporate perspective.
- 8 MR. TIM FRYER: So I think by your
- 9 answer, essentially you felt it wasn't sustainable in
- 10 its present form and its status quo?
- 11 MR. PAUL BONWICK: I think not so much
- 12 that it wasn't sustainable, I think every
- 13 organization, especially one that's in the public
- 14 domain, has a responsibility not simply to look at
- 15 what's sustainable, but what are the responsibilities
- 16 to create even greater efficiencies, and if greater
- 17 efficiencies move beyond a sustainable model that's in
- 18 association, then in my mind it's incumbent for boards
- 19 and senior executives within those organizations to
- 20 look at how they might achieve those -- the betterment
- 21 of the services that they deliver collectively.
- 22 MR. TIM FRYER: At the time you
- 23 thought there was an opportunity for Collus based on
- 24 the existence of CHEC.
- MR. PAUL BONWICK: Absolutely. It was

- 1 my understanding that Collus founded CHEC. I met with
- 2 the president or the CEO of CHEC at that time during
- 3 my discussions Mr. Houghton was held in very high
- 4 regard. I can say that you were held in very high
- 5 regard with the CHEC group.
- I think that there was a comfort level
- 7 in terms of the support your -- I'll call it second-
- 8 tier management provided within the CHEC.
- 9 So I think there was -- there was more
- 10 a cultural comfort in terms of CHEC members as it
- 11 related to Collus versus for no specific reason other
- 12 than PowerStream is right next door, then they might
- 13 have with a very significantly larger entity like
- 14 PowerStream.
- So we've spoke about those cultural --
- 16 sense of cultural trepidation as it related to things
- 17 like Hydro One. In fairness, I think people from
- 18 PowerStream have acknowledged that there was
- 19 sensitivities in regards to acquisitions within these
- 20 smaller ones as well.
- 21 So for those reasons, yes, I would say
- 22 that Collus was an ideal candidate to take a lead in
- 23 terms of consolidation into one regional entity.
- 24 MR. TIM FRYER: So the opportunity for
- 25 Collus by extension, it was an opportunity for

- 1 yourselves, through Compenso then too?
- MR. PAUL BONWICK: Yes, I mean, if I
- 3 had of stayed on as a consultant, we had talked about
- 4 -- that this was likely going to be a -- this could
- 5 be, depending on what the appetite was as you did the
- 6 early research on it, this could be a -- a long-term
- 7 initiative in order to secure buy in from these
- 8 various LDCs.
- 9 MR. TIM FRYER: It is in the evidence
- 10 that CHEC achieves efficiencies for its members,
- 11 essentially through shared services, correct?
- MR. PAUL BONWICK: Again, I've
- 13 commented on that. I -- I believe that's why it was
- 14 put together, but I can't comment on exactly what they
- 15 did together.
- 16 MR. TIM FRYER: Do you recall that a
- 17 goal of the strategic partnership was for Collus
- 18 PowerStream to be the hub, not geographically, but as
- 19 service provider to achieve scale?
- 20 MR. PAUL BONWICK: Yes. But when you
- 21 -- sorry, can you back that up. Geographically, you
- 22 said?
- 23 MR. TIM FRYER: What I meant -- when I
- 24 said "hub" I didn't want to say hub because
- 25 geographically Collingwood is kind of on the edge.

- 1 But it was about a hub as a service
- 2 provider, so the scale could be achieved that was
- 3 being sought.
- 4 MR. PAUL BONWICK: That was my
- 5 understanding.
- 6 MR. TIM FRYER: Were you aware a
- 7 central CHEC objective is to achieve scale without
- 8 relinquishing accountability?
- 9 MR. PAUL BONWICK: No, I don't
- 10 understand, relinquishing what without accountability?
- 11 MR. TIM FRYER: You get scale without
- 12 relinquishing accountability, so each utility achieves
- 13 scale but still has its own singularity?
- 14 MR. PAUL BONWICK: Okay, I don't know
- 15 that there's any less or more accountability through a
- 16 regional LDC versus 12 smaller LDCs. In fact, I would
- 17 submit that there could be greater accountability
- 18 through one (1) larger organization rather than having
- 19 twelve (12) different boards comprised of various
- 20 members.
- 21 And so, again, I -- I don't understand
- 22 the accountability side because I think it applies to
- 23 both sides.
- 24 MR. TIM FRYER: And I wasn't looking
- 25 for an analysis of the objective. I was just asking

- 1 if you were aware that that was one (1) of their
- 2 central objectives.
- 3 MR. PAUL BONWICK: No.
- 4 MR. TIM FRYER: No. So, essentially,
- 5 for the growth strategy model to be successful for
- 6 Collus PowerStream, it would have to usurp the role of
- 7 CHEC for the targeted LDCs, correct?
- 8 MR. PAUL BONWICK: No, I don't think
- 9 it usurps it. I think it presents a different vision,
- 10 a different opportunity for CHEC. Again, at the end
- 11 of the day, the -- my understanding from the LDC's
- 12 perspective is they're there to serve in the best
- 13 possible way they can their ratepayers and their
- 14 shareholder.
- And so, to my mind, it's not about
- 16 trying to usurp CHEC but rather present an option or
- 17 an alternative that could create even more
- 18 efficiencies, more structural control, more structural
- 19 efficiencies than you would have through a dozen
- 20 smaller organizations acting somewhat independently.
- 21 MR. TIM FRYER: So, we had reviewed
- 22 that -- that one (1) of the objectives of CHEC was to
- 23 achieve scale without relinquishing accountability?
- 24 MR. PAUL BONWICK: So, I don't know
- 25 how they -- I can see how in some regards they might

- 1 achieve scale if there's back office sharing of
- 2 information or things of that regard.
- 3 But in terms of delivering optimum
- 4 value, the most cost-effective service for the
- 5 ratepayer, I think there's strong evidence that would
- 6 suggest consoli -- consolidated models will provide
- 7 greater efficiencies than having a dozen LDCs
- 8 operating independently while sharing some services.
- 9 MR. TIM FRYER: Okay. So, did you
- 10 know that CHEC has an arm of operation that provides a
- 11 complete menu of back office support, including
- 12 twenty-four (24) seven (7) call centre and CIS
- 13 services?
- 14 MR. PAUL BONWICK: I was made aware of
- 15 that.
- 16 MR. TIM FRYER: And those are exactly
- 17 what you just talked about having, and -- and they do
- 18 have those?
- 19 MR. PAUL BONWICK: Sorry, Mr. Fryer, I
- 20 spoke about the corporate structure more than I did
- 21 the back office support, but that's certainly
- 22 critical.
- 23 But I'll -- for the sake of repeating
- 24 myself, if you've got twelve (12) CEOs, twelve (12)
- 25 CFOs, go down the list, you're talking about millions

- 1 of dollars worth of wages going out to effectively
- 2 deal with an LD -- a ratepayer group -- with a
- 3 ratepayer group that would be similar in size to other
- 4 LDCs that only have one (1) CEO, one (1) CFO, one (1)
- 5 board of directors.
- And that's where I'm talking about
- 7 creating efficiencies within the cost of delivery of
- 8 service. And I'm not taking away the importance of
- 9 the back room at all; those are critical, as well.
- 10 MR. TIM FRYER: And, aga -- again, I
- 11 reviewed the objective of not relinquishing
- 12 accountability. Each member utility wanted to
- 13 maintain their singularity. And that's why I'm
- 14 saying, effectively, in order for the growth strategy
- 15 of Collus PowerStream to work, it would usurp what
- 16 CHEC was doing and achieving?
- 17 MR. PAUL BONWICK: I think we're going
- 18 to have to disagree on that point.
- 19 MR. TIM FRYER: Did you know that in -
- 20 CHEC has now expanded to seventeen (17) members just
- 21 having added Grimsby and Tillsonburg most recently?
- MR. PAUL BONWICK: No.
- 23 MR. TIM FRYER: The evidence -- and I
- 24 can bring it up if -- if you'd like, but I had shown
- 25 an administrative cost per customer chart that showed

- 1 that Collus PowerStream has remained stable through
- 2 2013/'17 and continues to be in the low range.
- 3 Do you recall the chart that I showed?
- 4 It compared the partners in --
- 5 MR. PAUL BONWICK: Yes.
- 6 MR. TIM FRYER: -- in Collus? Thank
- 7 you. So, the failure of the Collus PowerStream model
- 8 hasn't negatively impacted the ratepayer by leading to
- 9 higher costs as evidenced by that chart?
- 10 MR. PAUL BONWICK: The chart seems to
- 11 demonstrate that -- efficient servicing, which comes
- 12 as no surprise. I think EP -- EPCOR's highly regarded
- 13 in the industry. I'm not surprised to see that.
- 14 MR. TIM FRYER: Yeah. Now, again,
- 15 this -- this is 2013 to '17, so the EPCOR impact has
- 16 not been --
- MR. PAUL BONWICK: Okay.
- 18 MR. TIM FRYER: So, just the
- 19 shareholder has been negatively impact and the
- 20 perspective of the time frame these proceedings are
- 21 considering, correct?
- 22 MR. PAUL BONWICK: No. I think
- 23 evidence would demonstrate the exact opposite. I
- 24 think the shareholder received one (1) of the highest
- 25 bids over the course of the last decade or more in

- 1 terms of the bid.
- I think the shareholder received one
- 3 (1) of the largest dividends, or the largest dividend
- 4 it ever had during the first year, based on what I was
- 5 watching.
- I think there's substantial evidence to
- 7 suggest when they sold the LDC through sole-source bid
- 8 to EPCOR, that the shareholder received significantly
- 9 higher value than they would have if they had have
- 10 been a standalone organization just as a result of
- 11 having PowerStream as a partner.
- 12 So, I would suggest that the
- 13 shareholder, at the end of the day, received several
- 14 million dollars more in value than they would have if
- 15 they had have been a standalone organization.
- 16 MR. TIM FRYER: But that wasn't my
- 17 question. My question was, at the time frame of these
- 18 proceedings, which is to 2017, before EPCOR came into
- 19 the picture, the -- Collus PowerStream -- the evidence
- 20 shows that the dividend that was paid was higher than
- 21 any one (1) before because there hadn't been a
- 22 dividend paid before, correct?
- MR. PAUL BONWICK: Yes.
- 24 MR. TIM FRYER: It also showed that it
- 25 would have been double if they hadn't have done the

- 1 partnership, correct?
- MR. PAUL BONWICK: I don't know that.
- 3 MR. TIM FRYER: If -- if you pay -- 50
- 4 percent is -- is two hundred thousand dollars
- 5 (\$200,000) and you own a hundred percent, then you're
- 6 going to get four hundred thousand dollars (\$400,000),
- 7 are you not?
- 8 MR. PAUL BONWICK: So, you're working
- 9 on the premise that, if you had have maintained the
- 10 status quo, you would have enjoyed the same
- 11 efficiencies, you would have enjoyed the same business
- 12 success had PowerStream not got involved.
- 13 And I can't comment on whether your
- 14 status quo would have driven the same kind of dividend
- 15 that happened as a result of PowerStream coming in and
- 16 being a 50/50 partner with you.
- So, I don't know how to speculate on
- 18 what would have happened. If Collingwood would had
- 19 chose to remain in the status, I don't know what kind
- 20 of dividend they would have received.
- 21 All I can say is, historically, they
- 22 did not get dividends, and so I'm not sure I could
- 23 forecast and say, had they not go down -- gone down
- 24 this path, that miraculously that year all of the
- 25 sudden they would have had that large dividend coming

- 1 in, and 100 percent of it versus 50 percent of it.
- 2 MR. TIM FRYER: And I hadn't wanted to
- 3 get into that kind of a realm of -- of discovery. I
- 4 was simply looking at it as a situation, if you own a
- 5 hundred percent of an asset, you get a hundred percent
- 6 of the dividend. If you own 50 percent, you get 50
- 7 percent of the dividend. That's just simply that.
- MR. PAUL BONWICK: I think that's a
- 9 given, Mr. Fryer.
- MR. TIM FRYER: Yeah.
- 11 MR. PAUL BONWICK: I think that's a
- 12 given. The issue that I'm raising is, if you own a
- 13 hundred percent of the asset and you get a hundred
- 14 percent of the dividend, if there's no dividend that
- 15 exists, you don't get a dividend.
- 16 MR. TIM FRYER: In regarding the
- 17 success of PowerStream with the sharing of services,
- 18 do you recall when I interviewed -- or examined Mr.
- 19 Glicksman, we spoke about three hundred and sixty-six
- 20 thousand dollars (\$366,000) for the cost of service --
- 21 2013 cost of service to be completed?
- Do you recall that figure?
- MR. PAUL BONWICK: Vaquely.
- 24 MR. TIM FRYER: Okay. And I explained
- 25 that the average for the CHEC group was a hundred and

- 1 seventy-five thousand dollars (\$175,000)?
- 2 MR. PAUL BONWICK: Okay.
- 3 MR. TIM FRYER: Okay. It has been
- 4 shown in the evidence that growing strategic
- 5 partnership was a shareholder goal and that Collus
- 6 PowerStream didn't in fact grow, correct?
- 7 MR. PAUL BONWICK: If you're asking me
- 8 to look through that lense, I mean, I'm looking back
- 9 from 2019, and it doesn't appear to have. But
- 10 understand -- it doesn't appear to have.
- 11 MR. TIM FRYER: Okay. Thank you. In
- 12 the end, anticipated forced amalgamation didn't occur,
- 13 and that's the major reason for no success, correct?
- 14 MR. PAUL BONWICK: No. I would
- 15 disagree with that. I think the forced amalgamation
- 16 scenario was a back consideration for LDCs. I think
- 17 there was some sensitivity to whether or not that may
- 18 or may not happen.
- 19 Certainly, with the deliverance of --
- 20 delivery of the Drummond report, it may have
- 21 heightened that sensitivity, but I don't know that the
- 22 idea of forced consolidation was the major driving
- 23 force.
- I think the idea was, based on various
- 25 representations in the industry, the challenge the

- 1 small LDCs were facing and the benefits of
- 2 consolidation that might be presented.
- 3 So, I don't know that forced
- 4 consolidation was the number 1 consideration that
- 5 would have led people down that -- or led LDCs down
- 6 the path to a consolidation; it would have simply been
- 7 a consideration.
- 8 MR. TIM FRYER: Okay. Fair enough.
- 9 And I won't dwell on that. Status quo has continued
- 10 to be a viable option, correct?
- 11 MR. PAUL BONWICK: For whom?
- 12 MR. TIM FRYER: For the utilities in
- 13 the characteristics of Collus prior to the
- 14 partnership?
- MR. PAUL BONWICK: I'm sorry. So are
- 16 you asking me was the status quo prior to the 50/50
- 17 partnership good?
- 18 THE HONOURABLE FRANK MARROCCO: No,
- 19 no. I thought Mr. Fryer's question was that the
- 20 status quo continues to be a viable option.
- 21
- 22 CONTINUED BY MR. TIM FRYER:
- MR. TIM FRYER: If I could rephrase
- 24 for you, you recall that one of the comments by
- 25 Mr. Houghton is that status quo was not an option.

- 1 That's what his Board had determined.
- 2 So what I'm saying is status quo of
- 3 then was still an option. It's still a viable option
- 4 today.
- 5 MR. PAUL BONWICK: I think there had
- 6 been lots of testimony both here at the Inquiry, as
- 7 well as lots of information out in the industry
- 8 itself, that provides two (2) perspectives on that.
- 9 I think some would suggest that status
- 10 quo is not a responsible way to go. And some that are
- 11 in the status quo and want to maintain that would
- 12 argue that they're creating efficiencies unto
- 13 themselves.
- So I think there's two (2) different
- 15 perspectives on whether you should maintain status quo
- 16 or whether you should be looking at models that would
- 17 create even greater -- greater efficiencies beyond
- 18 simple associations.
- 19 MR. TIM FRYER: I gave in my earlier
- 20 evidence to being a Board member of a CHEC-member LDC
- 21 that had and still does have the similar
- 22 characteristics to Collus pre-2011. Correct? You
- 23 recall that I did that?
- MR. PAUL BONWICK: Yes.
- MR. TIM FRYER: Okay. So yes, status

- 1 quo has continued, and it's led to increased value for
- 2 that utility that I'm a Board member of. So I'm
- 3 making my contention to you that status quo is an
- 4 option and increases value.
- 5 THE HONOURABLE FRANK MARROCCO: What's
- 6 the question?
- 7 MR. TIM FRYER: And that's why I had
- 8 asked if -- and he's answered to me that status quo
- 9 was not an option.
- 10 MR. PAUL BONWICK: I don't think I
- 11 said that. I -- what I tried to say is there -- there
- 12 will be two (2) perspectives towards status quo. And
- 13 just help me understand, CHEC is not an LDC, is it?
- 14 It's an association.
- 15
- 16 CONTINUED BY MR. TIM FRYER:
- 17 MR. TIM FRYER: And I'm a member of a
- 18 Board of a CHEC-member LDC.
- 19 MR. PAUL BONWICK: Oh, I'm sorry.
- 20 That -- that helps. I thought you meant you were a
- 21 member of the CHEC Board.
- 22 So all I'm saying to you, Mr. Fryer, is
- 23 I think that there's two (2) strong and reasonably
- 24 well positioned opinions that status quo is not the
- 25 ideal solution. And there's those are maintaining the

- 1 status quo that say they are -- that it is the ideal
- 2 solution, and they're creating efficiencies within the
- 3 status quo.
- 4 MR. TIM FRYER: M-hm, yes.
- 5 MR. PAUL BONWICK: Kind of a
- 6 contradiction in terms but...
- 7 MR. TIM FRYER: So -- sorry. Are you
- 8 finished?
- 9 MR. PAUL BONWICK: Yeah.
- 10 MR. TIM FRYER: Okay. So Collus
- 11 PowerStream, status quo was not an option for them
- 12 because one of the central pillars to an LDC being
- 13 successful in the municipality is trust between the
- 14 LDC and the shareholder and in this particular case
- 15 Collingwood Council.
- 16 And I believe that the status quo was
- 17 not an option for Collus PowerStream because that
- 18 trust factor had disappeared between the shareholder,
- 19 and we've moved into now more the 2015 -- or '14 to
- 20 '18 Council.
- 21 MR. PAUL BONWICK: Okay. If that's
- 22 your opinion, I would agree. I think there's been
- 23 substantial evidence that showed that there was a --
- 24 after thirty (30) years of a very collegial and
- 25 positive, cooperative working relationship that there

- 1 was a disconnect in -- between the shareholder and the
- 2 utility somewhere in 2014.
- 3 MR. TIM FRYER: Yeah.
- 4 MR. PAUL BONWICK: I'm just repeating
- 5 what you said, I guess.
- 6 MR. TIM FRYER: Yeah. The other
- 7 reason the status quo isn't -- wasn't an option for
- 8 Collus PowerStream was because the poor financial
- 9 position it was in in 2017.
- 10 MR. PAUL BONWICK: I suspect that's
- 11 your opinion.
- 12 MR. TIM FRYER: Okay. Those are my
- 13 questions.
- 14 THE HONOURABLE FRANK MARROCCO: Thank
- 15 you, Mr. Fryer. Mr. Breedon.
- Well, Mr. Breedon, we'll take the
- 17 morning break around 10 or 5 after ,so let me know
- 18 then what's a convenient time.
- MR. RYAN BREEDON: Thank you,
- 20 Your Honour.
- 21
- 22 CROSS-EXAMINATION BY MR. RYAN BREEDON:
- MR. RYAN BREEDON: Mr. Bonwick, you
- 24 served on Town Council from 1994 to 1997?
- MR. PAUL BONWICK: Yes.

- 1 MR. RYAN BREEDON: You were elected MP
- 2 for Simcoe-Grey in 1997?
- 3 MR. PAUL BONWICK: Yes.
- 4 MR. RYAN BREEDON: You were re-elected
- 5 in 2000?
- 6 MR. PAUL BONWICK: Yes.
- 7 MR. RYAN BREEDON: You were appointed
- 8 to the Privy Council in 2003?
- 9 MR. PAUL BONWICK: Yes.
- 10 MR. RYAN BREEDON: The Progressive
- 11 Conservatives and the Canadian Alliance got their act
- 12 together, and that was the end of that.
- MR. PAUL BONWICK: Just to clarify, I
- 14 was appointed as Parliamentary secretary, which was
- 15 a -- it's semantics perhaps, but the Prime Minister of
- 16 the day changed the role of Parliamentary secretary's
- 17 to actually be engaged at Cabinet. And so the
- 18 subsequent effect of that was you automatically became
- 19 a privy councillor.
- 20 MR. RYAN BREEDON: Right. And since
- 21 leaving politics, you have, amongst other things,
- 22 acted as a consultant?
- MR. PAUL BONWICK: Correct.
- 24 MR. RYAN BREEDON: In a variety or for
- 25 a variety of industries?

- 1 MR. PAUL BONWICK: Correct.
- MR. RYAN BREEDON: You have also been
- 3 involved in several businesses?
- 4 MR. PAUL BONWICK: Correct.
- 5 MR. RYAN BREEDON: We've seen a number
- 6 of them in these proceedings: Compenso, Green Leaf,
- 7 Gemba, ISSI. I presume others as well?
- 8 MR. PAUL BONWICK: I wasn't involved
- 9 in ISSI but the other ones, yes.
- MR. RYAN BREEDON: And other
- 11 businesses also?
- MR. PAUL BONWICK: Correct.
- MR. RYAN BREEDON: And in your various
- 14 businesses, you have worked with a number of different
- 15 partners.
- MR. PAUL BONWICK: Correct.
- 17 MR. RYAN BREEDON: And I --
- 18 MR. PAUL BONWICK: Some were
- 19 partnerships -- sorry -- and some are standalone.
- MR. RYAN BREEDON: Right. And I'm not
- 21 here specifying a legal partnership but people who you
- 22 were working with in business, whether you are joint
- 23 shareholders of an organization or whether it's a
- 24 partnership or how -- regardless of how it's
- 25 structured.

- 1 MR. PAUL BONWICK: In my mind, it is
- 2 actually very clear in terms of what a partnership is.
- 3 If you're an investor and a director or a shareholder
- 4 that -- not even a director. If you're a shareholder,
- 5 then you're a partner.
- If you have a working relationship, I
- 7 don't know that I would consider people that worked
- 8 with me that did not have any equity in my company or
- 9 shares to be partners.
- 10 MR. RYAN BREEDON: Okay. Fair enough.
- 11 And the companies where you did have partners, whether
- 12 by way of shareholders or otherwise, I think you'll
- 13 agree that you were always honest with your partners.
- 14 MR. PAUL BONWICK: I try to be.
- MR. RYAN BREEDON: And you're always
- 16 candid with your partners.
- MR. PAUL BONWICK: I try to be.
- 18 MR. RYAN BREEDON: You would never
- 19 mislead your partners.
- MR. PAUL BONWICK: Correct.
- 21 MR. RYAN BREEDON: I want to touch on
- 22 a couple of things that have been addressed over the
- 23 last couple of days and the first is Mr. Muncaster.
- I take it from your evidence that you
- 25 were not friends with Mr. Muncaster?

- 1 MR. PAUL BONWICK: Correct.
- 2 MR. RYAN BREEDON: You didn't have a
- 3 social relationship with him?
- 4 MR. PAUL BONWICK: Correct.
- 5 MR. RYAN BREEDON: And am I correct
- 6 that you first met him as part of this process?
- 7 MR. PAUL BONWICK: I don't know that
- 8 100 percent to be the case. I think when we first
- 9 met, there was a -- sort of a recognition that we had
- 10 maybe been in different -- different municipal events
- 11 or things like that together, but we had no
- 12 relationship prior to that.
- MR. RYAN BREEDON: Okay. So you may
- 14 have run into him at some sort of event before, but
- 15 you didn't have any working relationship with him
- 16 prior to these events.
- MR. PAUL BONWICK: Correct.
- 18 MR. RYAN BREEDON: All right. And I
- 19 think you testified that you met him once at
- 20 PowerStream's office, and this is this July 7th
- 21 meeting?
- MR. PAUL BONWICK: On or about, yes.
- MR. RYAN BREEDON: It seems to be the
- 24 July 7th meeting?
- MR. PAUL BONWICK: Yes.

- 1 MR. RYAN BREEDON: And then you
- 2 testified that you went to the Collus office and met
- 3 with Mr. Muncaster on one occasion?
- 4 MR. PAUL BONWICK: Correct.
- 5 MR. RYAN BREEDON: And was that before
- 6 or after the meeting at PowerStream?
- 7 MR. PAUL BONWICK: I don't recall.
- 8 I -- as I mentioned yesterday, I didn't mark it in a
- 9 daytimer or make a mental note of the date.
- 10 MR. RYAN BREEDON: Okay. Where in the
- 11 process was this meeting with Mr. Muncaster?
- MR. PAUL BONWICK: I'm going to
- 13 suggest it -- it would have likely been during the --
- 14 the committee or the Strategic Task Team was in place
- 15 at the time.
- 16 And so I don't know that the -- the --
- 17 and I'm trying to fix dates in my mind or timing in my
- 18 mind -- the Strategic Task Team was in place, I
- 19 believe. There had already been a meeting or meetings
- 20 with the Strategic Task Team. I believe there had
- 21 already been meetings with the four (4) or five (5)
- 22 potential bidders.
- MR. RYAN BREEDON: All right, and so
- 24 the meetings with the four (4) or five (5) potential
- 25 bidders are these July 7th meetings that we're talking

- 1 about, and -- and that series of meetings?
- 2 MR. PAUL BONWICK: I'm not -- I would
- 3 say yes. I'm not sure. As I said to you, I can't
- 4 recall the date.
- 5 MR. RYAN BREEDON: Well, I'm just
- 6 trying to understand -- I mean, we've all got this
- 7 chronology now probably embedded in our minds forever,
- 8 --
- 9 MR. PAUL BONWICK: I couldn't be more
- 10 confused about it.
- 11 MR. RYAN BREEDON: We know that in
- 12 July there are a series of meetings with Mr. Houghton
- 13 and Mr. Muncaster where they went out to the various
- 14 bidders.
- MR. PAUL BONWICK: Right.
- MR. RYAN BREEDON: Right. And so the
- 17 PowerStream one is this July 7th meeting that we were
- 18 just talking about?
- MR. PAUL BONWICK: Okay.
- MR. RYAN BREEDON: Yes?
- MR. PAUL BONWICK: That's my
- 22 understanding, yes.
- MR. RYAN BREEDON: Right, and -- and
- 24 we understand from the materials and the evidence that
- 25 you've heard that there were also meetings with other

- 1 perspective bidders.
- 2 MR. PAUL BONWICK: Correct.
- 3 MR. RYAN BREEDON: Including St.
- 4 Thomas, who ultimately did not become a bidder.
- 5 MR. PAUL BONWICK: My understanding as
- 6 well.
- 7 MR. RYAN BREEDON: Right. You weren't
- 8 involved in any of those meetings?
- 9 MR. PAUL BONWICK: Correct.
- 10 MR. RYAN BREEDON: All right.
- 11 And then we know that in September
- 12 there were meetings of the four bidders with the STT?
- MR. PAUL BONWICK: Correct.
- 14 MR. RYAN BREEDON: All right. And you
- 15 did not attend any of those meetings?
- MR. PAUL BONWICK: Correct.
- MR. RYAN BREEDON: So when you say
- 18 that your meeting with Mr. Muncaster was after some of
- 19 the meetings with the bidders, do you mean the July
- 20 meetings or do you mean the September meetings?
- 21 MR. PAUL BONWICK: I don't recall the
- 22 date that I met with Mr. Muncaster. I think you were
- 23 present when I was cross-examining Ms. Hogg if she
- 24 could reflect on my meeting with Mr. Muncaster and
- 25 what date and she simply could not remember.

- 1 And so I'm in the same situation, I --
- 2 I have a feeling that it was in September and not in
- 3 July.
- 4 MR. RYAN BREEDON: Why do you say
- 5 that?
- 6 MR. PAUL BONWICK: I can reflect on
- $7\,$ some of the -- some of the conversation that I think I
- 8 was taking in a -- it was my opinion based on that
- 9 meeting that PowerStream was being viewed in a very
- 10 positive light. And so I could only draw that
- 11 conclusion if Mr. Muncaster had had the opportunity to
- 12 go through somewhat of an evolved process in order to
- 13 make that determination.
- 14 MR. RYAN BREEDON: Well, is that fair?
- 15 Because we know that even before this process started,
- 16 from what Mr. Houghton says, is he thought PowerStream
- 17 would be a good fit and was an appropriate partner.
- 18 MR. PAUL BONWICK: I don't know that
- 19 it's unfair. I've heard Mr. Houghton give testimony
- 20 $\,$ that -- I think the quote was it's theirs to lose, I -
- 21 I think that there was a consensus, certainly in his
- 22 mind and perhaps others, both elected and non-elected,
- 23 that PowerStream could have been a good candidate or a
- 24 good fit.
- But again, I'm saying Mr. Muncaster was

- 1 a -- from what I understand, a very experienced
- 2 businessperson and the -- would not necessarily draw
- 3 those conclusions simply based on feelings of others,
- 4 but rather I suspect through his own experiences as
- 5 well.
- 6 MR. RYAN BREEDON: Right, although he
- 7 had been the Chairman of Collus for some time?
- 8 MR. PAUL BONWICK: Right, and I'm not
- 9 sure how much interaction Collus had with PowerStream
- 10 during his role as Chairman.
- 11 MR. RYAN BREEDON: And then other than
- 12 this meeting at the Collus office and the meeting at
- 13 PowerStream, you also testified that you believe that
- 14 you spoke with Mr. Muncaster once on the telephone?
- 15 MR. PAUL BONWICK: I recall calling
- 16 PowerStream and I'm going to assume it would have been
- 17 Mr. Houghton that would have told me that he was going
- 18 to be in the office.
- 19 MR. RYAN BREEDON: You mean Collus?
- MR. PAUL BONWICK: Sorry, yes.
- 21 I could have only known that Mr.
- 22 Muncaster would have been in the office. I know that
- 23 Mr. Houghton said they met regularly, if not daily.
- 24 So I -- I remember making a call and
- 25 getting put through to Mr. Muncaster and I really --

- 1 beyond that I don't recall a lot of the -- the
- 2 conversation.
- 3 MR. RYAN BREEDON: Do you know how
- 4 long that conversation was?
- 5 MR. PAUL BONWICK: Short.
- 6 MR. RYAN BREEDON: Five (5) minutes?
- 7 One (1) minute?
- 8 MR. PAUL BONWICK: Yes. Well, more
- 9 than one (1) minute. How are you doing takes one
- 10 minute (1) and -- the -- in my mind the purpose of the
- 11 call is -- is everything going well, anything that
- 12 PowerStream needs to be aware of in terms of any red
- 13 flags that have come up, anything in that regard. I
- 14 think it was just a general courtesy call to see if he
- 15 was prepared to share any information.
- MR. RYAN BREEDON: When did that call
- 17 take place?
- 18 MR. PAUL BONWICK: I don't recall. As
- 19 I said in my earlier testimony, I did not mark down
- 20 dates.
- 21 MR. RYAN BREEDON: Is that before or
- 22 after the meeting at PowerStream's -- pardon me, at
- 23 Collus's office.
- 24 MR. PAUL BONWICK: I think it was more
- 25 towards the end of the process.

- 1 MR. RYAN BREEDON: And when you say
- 2 "more towards the end of the process", do you mean
- 3 after PowerStream had already been selected as the
- 4 preferred bidder?
- 5 MR. PAUL BONWICK: No.
- 6 MR. RYAN BREEDON: Okay. So when?
- 7 What is the timing of this call?
- 8 MR. PAUL BONWICK: So I -- I
- 9 recognized the process to your point went beyond the
- 10 selection, but what I'm referring to is the process
- 11 leading up to the selection.
- 12 MR. RYAN BREEDON: All right. Would
- 13 it be after the submission of PowerStream's bid, so in
- 14 that time period between when the bids were submitted
- 15 and the final selection was made?
- 16 MR. PAUL BONWICK: As I said, I don't
- 17 recall.
- 18 MR. RYAN BREEDON: And am I correct
- 19 that that is the full extent of your interaction with
- 20 Mr. Muncaster?
- 21 MR. PAUL BONWICK: That is the only
- 22 three times I remember having any kind of significant
- 23 interaction with him other than, again, public events
- 24 of any nature.
- MR. RYAN BREEDON: Okay, thank you.

```
1 Your Honour, it's 5 to, I'm happy to
```

- 2 keep going, but I'm moving into another topic, so if
- 3 this is a convenient time to take a break?
- 4 THE HONOURABLE FRANK MARROCCO: Why
- 5 don't we go through the next topic and then we'll
- 6 stop?
- 7 MR. RYAN BREEDON: Sure.

- 9 CONTINUED BY MR. RYAN BREEDON:
- 10 MR. RYAN BREEDON: The email between
- 11 Mr. Lloyd and Ms. Almas, you know the one I'm talking
- 12 about, the January 17th email?
- MR. PAUL BONWICK: Yes.
- 14 MR. RYAN BREEDON: Mr. Lloyd had
- 15 testified what seems like a very long time ago, that
- 16 he sent this as the result of a dispute which took
- 17 place in a bar that he was unable to recall with some
- 18 gentlemen he couldn't recall, but which had happened
- 19 either the night before or maybe a few nights earlier.
- You remember that evidence?
- 21 MR. PAUL BONWICK: I remember his
- 22 evidence, yes.
- MR. RYAN BREEDON: And as I understand
- 24 what you have said, you actually remember this meeting
- 25 that he's talking about, but believe that it happened

- 1 some months earlier. Is that right?
- 2 MR. PAUL BONWICK: First of all, I'm
- 3 not trying to counter Mr. Lloyd's testimony. There
- 4 wasn't a meeting per se surrounding this particular
- 5 issue. I don't recall getting together with Mr. Lloyd
- 6 and others anytime within that two (2) weeks, two (2)
- 7 months.
- I recall something where we were
- 9 together and there was some convincing back and forth
- 10 about him getting in trouble on a -- or raising issues
- 11 because of his brother on a regular basis.
- 12 So I don't recall sitting with Mr.
- 13 Lloyd two days before.
- 14 MR. RYAN BREEDON: Right. And -- and
- 15 the thing that you recall, where did that take place?
- MR. PAUL BONWICK: It would have been
- 17 a rather insignificant discussion, I think.
- 18 From what I remember, a bar in Barrie.
- 19 MR. RYAN BREEDON: And who was
- 20 present?
- 21 MR. PAUL BONWICK: I believe his
- 22 brother was present. And again, you're asking to go
- 23 back eight years in time. This was not -- until he
- 24 brought it up I wasn't even thinking in that world and
- 25 I -- his brother was present and I -- I can't recall.

1 MR. RYAN BREEDON: Were there -- were

- 2 there other people present?
- 3 MR. PAUL BONWICK: Possibly.
- 4 MR. RYAN BREEDON: And --
- 5 MR. PAUL BONWICK: It was such a non -
- 6 and again, until it was brought up at this
- 7 commission, I was -- or this Inquiry, I'm sitting
- 8 there going I -- I -- it was -- it would have been
- 9 something that was so insignificant.
- 10 And Mr. Lloyd and I have got together
- 11 on many occasions after work for cocktails or in
- 12 groups of people. I'm surprised he cited one (1)
- 13 example simply because, as guys will sometimes get
- 14 together, they will challenge or bring up issues that
- 15 they find humorous as it relates to potential
- 16 conflicts and, boy, you've got yourself in the wringer
- 17 this time or...
- So, how he pinpointed one (1), I
- 19 suspect there was several times.
- 20 MR. RYAN BREEDON: Well, and he -- he
- 21 described you as egging on these other guys. And I
- 22 take it you -- you --
- MR. PAUL BONWICK: On several
- 24 occasions.
- MR. RYAN BREEDON: And I take it the

- 1 idea is you found this to be kind of funny. Is that
- 2 fair?
- MR. PAUL BONWICK: I can tell you
- 4 that, while I don't recall any specific, it has come
- 5 up numerous times over the years. And I suspect, yes,
- 6 I would have maybe tried to lend some humour or
- 7 sarcasm or -- to any particular issue when he was --
- 8 they were raising with him on Council.
- 9 MR. RYAN BREEDON: Okay. Now, this
- 10 meeting that you recall happened some months earlier
- 11 than January 17th?
- MR. PAUL BONWICK: Again, I -- I had
- 13 just -- not that I want to spend too much time on the
- 14 meeting, but I don't think it was a meeting. And not
- 15 to play on words, but it wasn't a scheduled meeting.
- 16 There's been many occasions where he,
- 17 I, back in those days, his -- his brother -- brother
- 18 doesn't really drink, but where others have got
- 19 together. And I -- again, I can tell you that Mr.
- 20 Lloyd was quite often a target or a topic of
- 21 discussion based on his time on Council.
- MR. RYAN BREEDON: This particular
- 23 interaction that you're talking about happened some
- 24 months before January 17th?
- 25 MR. PAUL BONWICK: I don't recall the

- 1 exact date. I've said that. I just can't move beyond
- 2 that.
- 3 MR. RYAN BREEDON: I -- I'm not asking
- 4 you for the exact date. I just want to confirm that
- 5 I'm right. I think this is what you testified --
- 6 MR. PAUL BONWICK: I think you're --
- 7 MR. RYAN BREEDON: -- the other day.
- 8 MR. PAUL BONWICK: I think you're
- 9 right, but --
- 10 MR. RYAN BREEDON: You have to -- you
- 11 have to let me --
- 12 MR. PAUL BONWICK: I think you're
- 13 right.
- 14 MR. RYAN BREEDON: -- ask the
- 15 question. I just want you to confirm that I'm correct
- 16 that, to the best of your recollection, this happened
- 17 some months earlier?
- 18 MR. PAUL BONWICK: It could have.
- 19 Again, I suspect that a week before -- you have to
- 20 understand how often Mr. Lloyd and I do socialize or
- 21 get together; it's on a fairly regular basis.
- 22 At that time, there was interactions
- 23 with lots of people, and so we would have been at a
- 24 bar or having -- sharing cocktails, it could have been
- 25 two (2) or three (3) times a month -- every month.

- 1 Oh, sorry. It could have been two (2) or three (3)
- 2 times a month every month leading up to my initial
- 3 inquiry.
- 4 MR. RYAN BREEDON: Right. But this
- 5 particular event or discussion that you recall, your
- 6 belief is it happened some months earlier?
- 7 MR. PAUL BONWICK: That's my
- 8 understanding. But, again, I think that it -- what
- 9 I'm trying to communicate to you is that Mr. Lloyd,
- 10 during many of our forays, when friends would get
- 11 together, was a target.
- 12 We would have some fun with various
- 13 issues that he was dealing with, you know, especially
- 14 related to his time on Council. Whether they be
- 15 conflicts or controversial votes or anything in that
- 16 regard, there would be -- there would be general
- 17 discussion about it.
- 18 And I think I've maybe overstated the
- 19 recollection of any one (1) meeting because it was --
- 20 it was fairly consistent. You tended to poke holes at
- 21 the politician sitting at the table.
- MR. RYAN BREEDON: Okay. Now, I think
- 23 you testified yesterday in response to some questions
- 24 that Mr. Watson was asking you that you do remember
- 25 having a discussion with Mr. Lloyd about his

- 1 experience in dealing with these conflict issues on or
- 2 around January 17th?
- 3 MR. PAUL BONWICK: I do recall
- 4 reaching out to him. I won't repeat it. Yes.
- 5 MR. RYAN BREEDON: Right. And the
- 6 idea is that, I -- I think, because it had come up in
- 7 your discussion with Mr. Bentz, you reached out to Mr.
- 8 Lloyd to -- to talk about it because you know that he
- 9 had had a similar issue?
- 10 MR. PAUL BONWICK: On several
- 11 occasions.
- MR. RYAN BREEDON: Right.
- MR. PAUL BONWICK: Correct.
- 14 MR. RYAN BREEDON: And did you explain
- 15 to Mr. Lloyd why you were asking the question when you
- 16 spoke to him?
- 17 MR. PAUL BONWICK: Well, I don't
- 18 recall the exact wording that I used. I believe I
- 19 called him, suggested -- or informed him that I was
- 20 looking at becoming involved within the company
- 21 outside of the community, that that company would have
- 22 work within the community.
- I may very well have even told him
- 24 PowerStream, I don't recall that, that there is an
- 25 issue regarding the potential for conflict of interest

- 1 for an elected official if their sibling's doing work
- 2 in the community.
- I suspect it was couched in some
- 4 humour, I know you've dealt with this on numerous
- 5 occasions and had numerous challenges, what is your
- 6 experience, what is the information that you received
- 7 back.
- 8 MR. RYAN BREEDON: And -- and it's
- 9 that discussion, it -- it seems, that then prompted
- 10 Mr. Lloyd to go and send the email to Ms. Almas?
- 11 MR. PAUL BONWICK: If I was following
- 12 the train of events, I would say that Mr. Lloyd took
- 13 it upon himself to do that.
- 14 MR. RYAN BREEDON: Right. Right. And
- 15 you've been very clear that you didn't ask Mr. Lloyd
- 16 to do that?
- 17 MR. PAUL BONWICK: One hundred
- 18 percent.
- 19 MR. RYAN BREEDON: All right. Did you
- 20 know that Mr. Lloyd was going to do that?
- MR. PAUL BONWICK: No.
- MR. RYAN BREEDON: Okay. Maybe this
- 23 would be an appropriate time to break.
- 24 THE HONOURABLE FRANK MARROCCO: Ten
- 25 (10) minutes.

- 1 --- Upon recessing at 10:06 a.m.
- 2 --- Upon resuming at 10:17 a.m.

- 4 CONTINUED BY MR. RYAN BREEDON:
- 5 MR. RYAN BREEDON: Mr. Bonwick, before
- 6 the break, we were just talking about Mr. Lloyd's
- 7 decision to email Ms. Almas. And although you've
- 8 testified that you were not aware that he was going to
- 9 do it, before he emailed Ms. Almas you discussed it
- 10 with him shortly after, I take it?
- 11 MR. PAUL BONWICK: I don't know that I
- 12 had a discussion with him after, words he forwarded me
- 13 (sic). So the discussion that I had with Mr. Lloyd,
- 14 from a content perspective, was really centered around
- 15 me enquiring about the advice he had received related
- 16 to his potential conflicts or the challenges that had
- 17 arose.
- 18 It appears -- it happened subsequently
- 19 that Mr. Lloyd sent this email to Ms. Almas and then
- 20 forwarded on the response to me.
- MR. RYAN BREEDON: Okay.
- MR. PAUL BONWICK: And I don't know
- 23 that I necessarily had a conversation with him
- 24 afterwards as to why.
- MR. RYAN BREEDON: Sure.

```
1
                  MR. PAUL BONWICK: But I very well
   could have called him up and said, thanks, but
   what's -- you enquiring. How does that help me?
 3
   Other than the general sense that irrespective of
   whether it's Councillor Lloyd, Mayor Ford, or Mayor
   Cooper, the general principle of the rule is, and
   thanks very much for sharing that with me, that by
 7
   simply working directly or indirectly with the
   municipality, it does not put the elected official
   in -- in conflict.
10
11
                  And so the email, it obviously didn't
12
   serve any desired effect, because subsequent to that,
13
   PowerStream reached out and said, to Mr. Glicksman's
   point, there appears to be a misunderstanding here.
14
15
   This is not what we're looking for.
16
                  MR. RYAN BREEDON: Right. That's all
   much later, right?
17
18
                  MR. PAUL BONWICK: Correct.
19
                  MR. RYAN BREEDON: Okay. So can we
   look at Foundation Document paragraph 128, please.
20
21
22
                      (BRIEF PAUSE)
23
24
                  MR. RYAN BREEDON: So this is quoting
25
   from an email that you sent to Mr. Bentz on
```

- 1 January the 20th, a couple of days after your
- 2 discussion with Mr. Lloyd and then Mr. Lloyd's email
- 3 exchange with Ms. Almas.
- And you'll see that in the first
- 5 paragraph, you wrote to Mr. Bentz:
- 6 "The Town's solicitor provided a
- 7 legal opinion to the deputy mayor
- 8 clarifying that there's no breach of
- 9 conflict interest guidelines in this
- 10 situation."
- 11 You see that?
- MR. PAUL BONWICK: Yes.
- MR. RYAN BREEDON: Okay. Now, I
- 14 appreciate that it wasn't with the solicitor and all
- 15 the rest of it. You don't -- we don't need to go over
- 16 that.
- But what you're talking about in this
- 18 email to Mr. Bentz is the exchange between
- 19 Deputy Mayor Lloyd and Ms. Almas.
- 20 MR. PAUL BONWICK: I don't know just
- 21 specific to that. I think I was more generally
- 22 referring to the fact that it is my clear
- 23 understanding, having communicated with
- 24 Deputy Mayor Lloyd, that conflicts do not exist as a
- 25 result of a sibling working directly or indirectly

- 1 with the municipality.
- MR. RYAN BREEDON: Okay. I'm going to
- 3 suggest to you -- and it may help when we look at the
- 4 subsequent correspondence to clarify this -- but I'm
- 5 going to suggest to you that in this email, what
- 6 you're referring to is the exchange between
- 7 Deputy Mayor Lloyd and Ms. Almas and that you had
- 8 therefore had a discussion with Deputy Mayor Lloyd
- 9 about that sometime between January the 17th and
- 10 January the 20th.
- 11 MR. PAUL BONWICK: I don't know that
- 12 you can draw that conclusion specific to that one
- 13 exchange. As I've mentioned to you in the past, this
- 14 had been an issue that had been raised, from my
- 15 understanding and personal experience, on various
- 16 occasions with Mr. Lloyd.
- And so anytime that issue is raised,
- 18 you would either seek advice from the clerk or, as
- 19 we've heard, you would seek outside independent legal
- 20 advice. Mr. Longo has confirmed, of course, that he
- 21 is not in a position to give any individual councillor
- 22 advice, and so I suspect I've not characterized the
- 23 conversation properly when I said the "Town's
- 24 solicitor."
- MR. RYAN BREEDON: Okay. You spoke --

- 1 scroll down to paragraph 129, please -- you spoke with
- 2 Mr. Bentz again on January the 25th?

3

4 (BRIEF PAUSE)

- 6 MR. PAUL BONWICK: Okay. Yes.
- 7 MR. RYAN BREEDON: All right. And --
- 8 MR. PAUL BONWICK: It says there was a
- 9 call scheduled. I'm not positive the call took place
- 10 on the 25th, but I suspect it did.
- MR. RYAN BREEDON: Well, if we look at
- 12 the -- I think your email of that date actually
- 13 suggests that there was --
- 14 MR. PAUL BONWICK: After the call --
- 15 yes, sorry. Yeah. I'm reading the first sentence and
- 16 then going to the second in the email after the call.
- 17 Yes.
- 18 MR. RYAN BREEDON: And in that
- 19 discussion with Mr. Bentz, he also raised this
- 20 question of whether there was or was not a conflict?
- 21 MR. PAUL BONWICK: I think we've gone
- 22 through that with PowerStream's counsel. It appears
- 23 that that was brought up by Mr. Bentz.
- 24 MR. RYAN BREEDON: Okay. And then
- 25 two (2) days later, Mr. Lloyd forwards the -- I'm

- 1 sorry. Yeah. Two (2) days later on the 27th,
- 2 Mr. Lloyd forwards his email exchange with Ms. Almas
- 3 to you?
- 4 MR. PAUL BONWICK: That's what the
- 5 record shows, yes.
- 6 MR. RYAN BREEDON: All right. And did
- 7 you have a discussion with Mr. Lloyd asking him for a
- 8 copy of that exchange?
- 9 MR. PAUL BONWICK: No.
- 10 MR. RYAN BREEDON: All right. You
- 11 didn't go back to Mr. Lloyd after you spoke with
- 12 Mr. Bentz and say, hey, can I get a copy of that
- 13 email? 'Cause I need to give it to Mr. Bentz.
- MR. PAUL BONWICK: No.
- 15 MR. RYAN BREEDON: You've forwarded --
- 16 nevertheless, you did forward the email that you
- 17 received from Mr. Lloyd to Mr. Bentz?
- MR. PAUL BONWICK: Yes.
- 19 MR. RYAN BREEDON: Okay. And can we
- 20 just scroll down so we can see paragraph 130.
- 21 And you write in the third paragraph:
- 22 "The deputy mayor had informed that
- it was a legal opinion."
- 24 You see that?
- MR. PAUL BONWICK: Yes.

- 1 MR. RYAN BREEDON: All right. And so
- 2 again, it appears from this exchange that when you
- 3 first told PowerStream that the deputy mayor had
- 4 obtained a legal opinion, you were referring to this
- 5 discussion with Ms. Almas.
- 6 MR. PAUL BONWICK: Once I have this in
- 7 my hand -- and again, I think I'm mischaracterizing
- 8 legal opinion versus clerk's opinion -- it's evident
- 9 that there was no internal legal opinion provided to
- 10 Mr. Lloyd.
- 11 So at that point, when I -- if I've
- 12 forwarded on that email -- and again, I'm -- the
- 13 dates and the relevance of it in my mind wasn't
- 14 significant. I just thought that it characterized the
- 15 fact that there is no conflict for an individual,
- 16 based on what Mr. Lloyd had, again, forwarded me.
- 17 So I apologize for being vague on it,
- 18 but I don't recall specific conversations following up
- 19 to -- or following up after -- after the fact.
- 20 MR. RYAN BREEDON: But isn't the only
- 21 way to read this that you had had a discussion with
- 22 Mr. Lloyd? You maybe understood that he had had a
- 23 legal opinion when in fact he had just had this
- 24 discussion with the clerk. That's what you then
- 25 communicated to PowerStream.

- 1 And when PowerStream asked for a copy
- 2 of the legal opinion, you got this email from
- 3 Mr. Lloyd, and then you -- you had to send the
- 4 clarification.
- 5 MR. PAUL BONWICK: You'll have to show
- 6 me where they asked for a copy of the legal opinion.
- 7 I don't know that they did that.
- MR. RYAN BREEDON: Well, did it not
- 9 come up in your discussion with Mr. Bentz?
- 10 MR. PAUL BONWICK: I don't recall
- 11 Mr. Bentz ever asking for a legal opinion. I
- 12 recall -- as I've said before, I don't know that we
- 13 got into the kind of detail where, I need you --
- 14 Mr. Bonwick -- to engage the city clerk --
- 15 Ms. Almas -- specific to your engagement with
- 16 PowerStream.
- I don't know that that kind of
- 18 conversation took place versus we want clarification
- 19 that you're not putting your sister in a conflict
- 20 because obviously I wouldn't be in one. I think that
- 21 was more a generalized assessment of the conversation.
- MR. RYAN BREEDON: Well, if Mr. Bentz
- 23 didn't ask you for a copy of the opinion that you had
- 24 referred to in your earlier email to him, then why did
- 25 you send this email between Deputy Mayor Lloyd and

- 1 Sarah Almas to Mr. Bentz on the -- on the 29th and
- 2 refer to the fact that you had previously understood
- 3 it to be a legal opinion?
- 4 MR. PAUL BONWICK: So again, I think
- 5 I've mischaracterized it as a legal opinion. And that
- 6 could have been either through me describing it
- 7 inaccurately or Mr. Lloyd describing -- or me just
- 8 describing inaccurately when I think it would be
- 9 viewed -- and I think a reasonable person would say if
- 10 you got this email -- unsolicited email -- that it
- 11 only reinforces the conversation that I've had with
- 12 Mr. Bentz in terms of, as an individual, you do not --
- 13 as a sibling of an elected official, you do not put a
- 14 person in conflict.
- And so I'm struggling with the dates
- 16 and the times on this and, quite frankly, the
- 17 relevance. But you can go to that point.
- 18 MR. RYAN BREEDON: Well, your email
- 19 doesn't say, oh, by the way, Mr. Bentz, here is a
- 20 completely unrelated email but that happens to support
- 21 what I told you previously, does it?
- MR. PAUL BONWICK: No. Again, I
- 23 didn't go into any kind of detail other than what I've
- 24 stated here. Hindsight being 20/20, perhaps it could
- 25 have been better to -- to describe it in some way.

- 1 My point being, Mr. Breedon, is this
- 2 scenario was not acceptable. Full stop. It was not
- 3 acceptable in PowerStream's mind. It did not provide
- 4 them the clarity they were looking for. They then
- 5 advised me that this was not the direction that
- 6 Mr. Bentz wanted to go or expected.
- 7 And so subsequently, we put this behind
- 8 and moved on to what it exactly is, clearly spell out
- 9 what is it you are expecting? They identified that.
- 10 And that was specific to meeting with Ms. Almas,
- 11 declaring my interests, and providing disclosure at
- 12 that time, and confirming that disclosure.
- 13 And so I'm struggling with this and
- 14 putting dates around it because it was sort of very
- 15 quickly deemed at that time to be irrelevant.
- 16 PowerStream full -- was not interested in the
- 17 deputy mayor's opinion of a conflict or the potential
- 18 to put in a conflict.
- They weren't interested in me
- 20 communicating with the deputy mayor or, for that
- 21 matter, any other member of Council to secure an
- 22 opinion of whether or not there was a conflict. They
- 23 wanted something far more specific.
- 24 The wanted disclosure from Paul Bonwick
- 25 and Compenso specific to the clerk as it were -- as it

- 1 related to the relationship between Compenso and
- 2 PowerStream, and that's exactly what transpired.
- MR. RYAN BREEDON: Well, let's move
- 4 on. TOC49530, please.

5

6 (BRIEF PAUSE)

- 8 MR. RYAN BREEDON: This is -- scroll
- 9 down. And up a little bit, sorry. Keep going. All
- 10 right, stop. All right. So, this is the email you
- 11 were asked about yesterday in which you state to Mr.
- 12 Houghton that you were recommending that Mr. Budd and
- 13 yourself use Mr. Houghton's Gmail address. And you've
- 14 been through this in some detail, yes?
- MR. PAUL BONWICK: (NO AUDIBLE
- 16 RESPONSE).
- 17 MR. RYAN BREEDON: And, as I
- 18 understand your explanation from yesterday, you -- you
- 19 sent this email because you were trying to recruit Mr.
- 20 Houghton?
- 21 MR. PAUL BONWICK: Right. So, I -- I
- 22 think I stated I'm not sure I recall sending this on
- 23 June the 9th at 6:14 p.m.
- 24 MR. RYAN BREEDON: Okay, stop -- stop
- 25 there for a second.

- 1 MR. PAUL BONWICK: Sorry.
- 2 MR. RYAN BREEDON: You don't take
- 3 issue with the fact that --
- 4 MR. PAUL BONWICK: No.
- 5 MR. RYAN BREEDON: -- you sent it?
- 6 MR. PAUL BONWICK: No.
- 7 MR. RYAN BREEDON: Okay.
- 8 MR. PAUL BONWICK: Sorry. So, I'm
- 9 trying to recall the details. But I can tell you
- 10 that, in answer to your question, yes, I was
- 11 suggesting I was aware of the fact that Mr. Houghton
- 12 was either very close or at the stage where he
- 13 qualified for his full OMERS pension. Helps the
- 14 Inquiry understand what that means.
- 15 MR. RYAN BREEDON: No. We'll be --
- MR. PAUL BONWICK: Okay.
- MR. RYAN BREEDON: We'll be here for
- 18 three (3) weeks if we go down every rabbit hole.
- 19 So, the -- the point though is that
- 20 your email -- you -- you suggested that you wanted to
- 21 send -- use Mr. Houghton's Gmail account, his personal
- 22 email account, as opposed to his Collus account
- 23 because you were hoping to get him to become involved
- 24 in the solar vent project?
- 25 MR. PAUL BONWICK: Yes. Mr. Houghton

- 1 had been clear in terms of, in his capacity as
- 2 President and CEO of Collus, he was not in a position
- 3 to get involved.
- I continued to solicit or encourage him
- 5 to take a more active role and step out of his role of
- 6 Collus. And so, in my mind, looking back at these
- 7 emails now, it would only seem reasonable that you
- 8 would want to communicate to him through a personal
- 9 email account versus his corporate email account.
- 10 MR. RYAN BREEDON: The -- the reason
- 11 that Mr. Houghton could not become involved in ISSI or
- 12 the solar vent project in a personal capacity while he
- 13 was President and -- President of Collus was because
- 14 Collus was doing business with ISSI?
- MR. PAUL BONWICK: I can't speak --
- 16 I've never seen Mr. Houghton's employment contract or
- 17 the rules under which he's employed, so all I can go
- 18 by is Mr. Houghton saying that, in his capacity as
- 19 President and CEO of Collus, he cannot get involved in
- 20 a much grander solar solution.
- 21 MR. RYAN BREEDON: All right. And --
- 22 and so, your decision to continue sending him the
- 23 information about ISSI to his personal account was to
- 24 keep it separate from his role at Collus?
- 25 MR. PAUL BONWICK: I don't -- I would

- 1 say, yes. And the purpose behind sending the emails,
- 2 generally speaking, was to show him -- or to try to
- 3 demonstrate to him that this was a very viable -- or
- 4 had the potential to be a very viable business venture
- 5 that had significant opportunity in years to come.
- 6 MR. RYAN BREEDON: And one (1) of the
- 7 effects of using his Gmail address was that Collus
- 8 wouldn't be able to access those emails?
- 9 MR. PAUL BONWICK: I think I've
- 10 clarified it was my understanding not so much that
- 11 Collus couldn't access those emails. It was my
- 12 understanding then and continues to be now that those
- 13 emails are not treated in the same fashion as a
- 14 municipal email, and so that they are not accessible
- 15 unless, of course, you have something like this going
- 16 --
- 17 MR. RYAN BREEDON: Well, you mentioned
- 18 yesterday that they wouldn't be subject to a freedom
- 19 of information request or -- or that sort of thing.
- 20 But -- but setting that aside, the Collus emails would
- 21 be accessible to Collus?
- 22 MR. PAUL BONWICK: I -- I don't know
- 23 what their communication policies are, or protocols,
- 24 relating to that, so I can't comment.
- MR. RYAN BREEDON: Certainly, if Mr.

- 1 Houghton was using his Gmail account, your
- 2 understanding was that Collus would have no technical
- 3 way of accessing those emails?
- 4 MR. PAUL BONWICK: I didn't give it so
- 5 much thought about them accessing his emails but
- 6 rather, if I was trying to recruit him or suggest that
- 7 this was an appropriate chine -- time to make a change
- 8 in his life, that it would be more appropriate to do
- 9 it through a Gmail account or a private email account
- 10 versus a corporate email account.
- MR. RYAN BREEDON: Right, because it's
- 12 a --
- MR. PAUL BONWICK: I think --
- 14 MR. RYAN BREEDON: Because it's a
- 15 private account that nobody else can access?
- 16 MR. PAUL BONWICK: Those are your
- 17 words. I'm suggesting it's not so much about people
- 18 accessing it, it's about the appropriateness of the
- 19 communication.
- I don't think in my mind back then it
- 21 was so much about people accessing his information.
- 22 If I look here and I'm saying I don't even know if
- 23 this person is employed there anymore, but their --
- 24 one (1) of their IT people, and I don't know his last
- 25 name, but I'm suggesting that Mark tie it into his

- 1 BlackBerry, and so I don't think it was being --
- 2 trying to hide anything, it's about making sure you
- 3 have access to your personal accounts.
- And so, again, I'm suggesting that he
- 5 actually get the company to show him how to do a
- 6 forward situation for his Gmail to his BlackBerry.
- 7 And I think if you go up one (1) -- if you could,
- 8 please, go up.

9

10 (BRIEF PAUSE)

- MR. PAUL BONWICK:
- "I agree. Can you try it? I think
- I already did that."
- So, I think he'd already done it before
- 16 I ever asked or suggested that that was what he do.
- MR. RYAN BREEDON: Now, you'll agree
- 18 with me, I think, that there are no emails from you to
- 19 Mr. Houghton suggesting that he should retire?
- MR. PAUL BONWICK: No. But, again, I
- 21 had that conversation with him on several occasions.
- 22 And then -- and I think it -- it's not a rabbit hole.
- 23 I think it does provide some value to the Inquiry to
- 24 understand that, if somebody -- this happens all the
- 25 time in the public sector as well as the private

- 1 sector.
- 2 If somebody has reached their full
- 3 pension, for discussion purposes, you get 70 percent,
- 4 it -- you get 70 percent of your money, you're no
- 5 longer contributing to OMERS. You end up actually
- 6 making very close to the same amount of money as you
- 7 did when you're fulfilling your role or staying in
- 8 that position.
- 9 And so, my point to him was constantly,
- 10 based on my confidence in his abilities, his history,
- 11 that this would make a good -- this is a good idea for
- 12 him to make that transition at that time.
- MR. RYAN BREEDON: My question to you
- 14 was that there is -- you'll agree that there are no
- 15 emails from you to Mr. Houghton suggesting that he
- 16 should retire?
- 17 MR. PAUL BONWICK: There are no emails
- 18 from me, you're correct. And I'm not sure that that
- 19 would be the -- you would have that discuss -- or you
- 20 would have that level of engagement via emails.
- 21 If you're trying to encourage somebody
- 22 to transition from one (1) company to another, I would
- 23 submit that you would -- any reasonable person would
- 24 assume you're going to have that discussion in purpose
- 25 -- or in -- directly.

- 1 MR. RYAN BREEDON: There are no emails
- 2 from you to Mr. Houghton suggesting that he should
- 3 become involved in ISSI?
- 4 MR. PAUL BONWICK: There are -- I
- 5 haven't seen any, no.
- 6 MR. RYAN BREEDON: And there are no
- 7 emails from you to Mr. Houghton suggesting that Mr.
- 8 Houghton will become involved in ISSI at some point in
- 9 the future?
- 10 MR. PAUL BONWICK: Cor -- correct.
- 11 MR. RYAN BREEDON: Or that he should
- 12 consider becoming involved in ISSI at some point in
- 13 the future?
- 14 MR. PAUL BONWICK: You're -- in my
- 15 opinion, what you're doing is you're trying to take
- 16 slices versus look at the broader environment at that
- 17 point in time.
- 18 If one understands that there has been
- 19 conversations that have taken place, as much as those
- 20 conversations are taking place, then it would make
- 21 sense that these -- that I would continue to share
- 22 emails in order to encourage him and understand what
- 23 the potential is.
- And so I'll answer your question in
- 25 terms of no, there's no emails, suggesting existing or

- 1 future, but when you roll it into that broader
- 2 context, then to my mind it makes totally reasonable
- 3 sense that I was doing what I was doing.
- 4 MR. RYAN BREEDON: There are no emails
- 5 from Mr. Budd to Mr. Houghton suggesting that he
- 6 should become involved in ISSI in the future.
- 7 MR. PAUL BONWICK: I don't recall
- 8 anything from Mr. Budd. I do recall Mr. Budd in one
- 9 email that I hadn't seen in a number of years
- 10 suggesting that Mr. Houghton and I were or would
- 11 become partners.
- 12 MR. RYAN BREEDON: There's no email
- 13 from Mr. Budd saying Mr. Houghton you're not involved
- 14 in ISSI, but you should -- you should become involved
- 15 in the future?
- MR. PAUL BONWICK: I think we'd have
- 17 to go through the string of emails because I believe -
- 18 and I could have read it incorrectly -- but I think
- 19 Mr. Budd was proposing that Mr. Houghton get involved
- 20 in some ISSI Inc. or -- sorry, ISSI marketing or get
- 21 involved in that regard, if I understood Mr. Budd's
- 22 emails correctly.
- 23 And I can't speak on behalf of Mr.
- 24 Budd.
- MR. RYAN BREEDON: All right. Well,

- 1 we'll look at that email in a minute.
- 2 Can we look at CJI7644, please?
- 3 All right. You looked at this one
- 4 yesterday. This was a statement from ISSI to
- 5 yourself. It is dated September 12th, 2011.
- 6 Do you see that?
- 7 MR. PAUL BONWICK: Yes.
- 8 MR. RYAN BREEDON: And could you
- 9 scroll down so we can see the statement, please?
- 10 Thank you.
- 11 What is shows is the division of
- 12 profits from the sale of sort of the first batch of
- 13 solar vents to PowerStream and Collus?
- MR. PAUL BONWICK: Yes.
- MR. RYAN BREEDON: Right. And the
- 16 share that was to be paid to Compenso, according to
- 17 this statement, was \$30,975 plus HST?
- 18 MR. PAUL BONWICK: \$35,001.75,
- 19 correct, total.
- 20 MR. RYAN BREEDON: That's the total?
- 21 Thank you.
- 22 And over in the bottom left corner, it
- 23 says 35 percent Nature's Power, do you see that?
- MR. PAUL BONWICK: Yes.
- MR. RYAN BREEDON: And Nature's Power

- 1 was Mr. Bushey's corporation?
- 2 MR. PAUL BONWICK: I believe so.
- 3 MR. RYAN BREEDON: Yes. And then 35
- 4 percent to Compenso and 30 percent to Budd Energy, do
- 5 you see that?
- 6 MR. PAUL BONWICK: Yes.
- 7 MR. RYAN BREEDON: And Budd Energy is
- 8 Mr. Budd's company?
- 9 MR. PAUL BONWICK: Correct.
- 10 MR. RYAN BREEDON: And you testified,
- 11 I think it was yesterday, that by this date this was
- 12 the arrangement that had been agreed for a profit
- 13 sharing for ISSI?
- 14 MR. PAUL BONWICK: Yes, there was an
- 15 understanding that this is what would unfold, correct.
- 16 MR. RYAN BREEDON: Okay. So earlier
- 17 today you told me that you were not involved in ISSI.
- 18 That's not quite correct because in fact you were
- 19 receiving a share of the profit.
- 20 MR. PAUL BONWICK: And so unless I
- 21 misunderstood you, I took it from your statement that
- 22 you felt that I was a partner in ISSI. I may have
- 23 misunderstood you because I am not involved in ISSI,
- 24 but rather received a percentage of profit as a result
- 25 of my activities.

- 1 MR. RYAN BREEDON: Now, can you look
- 2 at -- can we look at TOC60090? And scroll down to the
- 3 bottom, please.
- 4 So this is an email from somebody named
- 5 Alec to you. Do you see that?
- 6 MR. PAUL BONWICK: Yes.
- 7 MR. RYAN BREEDON: And Alec, I take
- 8 it, is somebody at ISSI?
- 9 MR. PAUL BONWICK: Yes.
- MR. RYAN BREEDON: And they are
- 11 attaching a -- a PDF which purports to show a
- 12 breakdown of the gross profit for disbursement.
- 13 You see that in the first line?
- MR. PAUL BONWICK: Yes.
- MR. RYAN BREEDON: Right, and I'll
- 16 show you the attachment in a moment. So -- so don't
- 17 worry.
- 18 And then they -- Alec goes on to say
- 19 that:
- 20 "As a result of signing
- 21 requirements, the cheque will not be
- ready Thursday, but Friday instead."
- 23 And then they go on to say that it will
- 24 be couriered to your office. Do you see that?
- MR. PAUL BONWICK: Yes.

1 MR. RYAN BREEDON: All right. And

- 2 this is sent on Tuesday, September 27th.
- 3 MR. PAUL BONWICK: Okay.
- 4 MR. RYAN BREEDON: You see that in the
- 5 email. So Friday is the 30th?
- MR. PAUL BONWICK: Correct.
- 7 MR. RYAN BREEDON: And then if we
- 8 scroll up to the next email in the chain, please, you
- 9 forward the email to Mr. Houghton at his gmail account
- 10 and to Mr. Budd and ask them to review it?
- MR. PAUL BONWICK: Yes.
- MR. RYAN BREEDON: Okay. And then --
- 13 that's fine. And then the attachment is TOC60091.
- 14 All right.
- 15 And this, you'll see is a -- another
- 16 version of the same statement. I should tell you,
- 17 it's not evident here, if you need to confirm it I'm
- 18 sure one of the computer people can help us, but the
- 19 actual file name of this document is statement of
- 20 disbursement for Compenso, September 26th, 2011.
- 21 So although it's dated on -- on it's
- 22 face the 12th, it seems to have actually been
- 23 generated a bit later. Okay?
- MR. PAUL BONWICK: Yes.
- 25 MR. RYAN BREEDON: And if we scroll

- 1 down, you'll see that what it shows -- just scroll
- 2 down a little bit more, please. Thank you.
- 3
 What is shows is -- it's very similar
- 4 to the previous statement that we looked at, but it
- 5 has some additional expenses and in this -- on this
- 6 statement the disbursement that was being paid to
- 7 Compenso is only \$27,475.
- 8 Do you see that?
- 9 MR. PAUL BONWICK: Yes.
- 10 MR. RYAN BREEDON: Okay, so a slight
- 11 reduction from the one that we looked at a moment ago.
- 12 And it would appear that what's
- 13 happening is in this period there are some discussions
- 14 going on about what is the amount to be paid to
- 15 Compenso, correct?
- 16 MR. PAUL BONWICK: As I follow this
- 17 train of emails there appears to be an addition as it
- 18 relates to a contribution by either -- by ISSI for
- 19 \$10,000 to the golf tournament.
- 20 MR. RYAN BREEDON: Right. And so
- 21 there's a question about whether that should come off
- 22 the top to be reflected then in the -- in the --
- 23 essentially the dividends that are being paid out.
- 24 MR. PAUL BONWICK: Profit sharing. A
- 25 dividend would -- would suggest that you're a

- 1 shareholder.
- 2 MR. RYAN BREEDON: All right, profit
- 3 sharing.
- 4 MR. PAUL BONWICK: Right.
- 5 MR. RYAN BREEDON: And -- and then for
- 6 some reason also they've removed the HST from the
- 7 payment to Compenso on this statement.
- 8 MR. PAUL BONWICK: Which would be in
- 9 error. Compenso is a registered corporation, both
- 10 provincially and federally and so you can't -- you
- 11 need to charge HST.
- 12 MR. RYAN BREEDON: None of us are tax
- 13 lawyers, so we don't need to wade into that.
- 14 But the point is that there was ongoing
- 15 discussions about what are the costs to be allocated
- 16 to the -- to the -- against the profits to figure out
- 17 how much each of the -- each of you was going to get.
- 18 Is that fair?
- MR. PAUL BONWICK: It appears to be
- 20 the case.
- 21 MR. RYAN BREEDON: Okay. Now, the
- 22 next thing that seems to happen is that the next day,
- 23 so this was sent on the 27th, as we've seen, the next
- 24 day Compenso issues an invoice to ISSI, that one is
- 25 CJI7645. You're familiar with this one.

```
1
                  MR. PAUL BONWICK: Scroll down,
   please. It's a long time ago.
3
                          (BRIEF PAUSE)
5
 6
                  MR. PAUL BONWICK: Yes.
                  MR. RYAN BREEDON: All right. And so
   it appears that what has happened is there has been an
   agreement as to the amount that Compenso was going to
10
   be paid?
11
                  MR. PAUL BONWICK: I don't recall
12
   having any back-and-forth on discussions, or
13
   negotiations, or anything in that regard. There was
   an initial email that outlined what the distribution
14
   or the commission would be. It appears as if my
15
   office has subsequently put that amount on an invoice,
   added the HST, and said, Here's your invoice.
17
18
                  MR. RYAN BREEDON: Right. But -- but
19
   there was in the intervening period, we've seen
   another proposed invoice -- and -- and -- which
21
   suggests that there were some discussion going on what
22
   the amount of profit sharing paid to Compenso would
23
   be?
24
                  MR. PAUL BONWICK: And again, I can
25
   tell you that I do not recall having any discussion
```

- 1 about the negotiating or accepting some change in
- 2 information. From what I can see, there was a record
- 3 sent that proposed this -- there was this many sales,
- 4 there was these costs associated with those sales.
- 5 Here's the profit, and here's the distribution. And
- 6 it appears as if the invoice matches up to that
- 7 original invoice -- or that original calculation.
- 8 MR. RYAN BREEDON: All right. When
- 9 you got the email that we looked at a moment ago from
- 10 Alec with the different calculation, you sent it on to
- 11 Mr. Houghton and Mr. Budd, we've seen. It -- did you
- 12 respond?
- MR. PAUL BONWICK: I don't see any
- 14 email communications that is responding to it other
- 15 than forwarding it on.
- Sorry, I don't -- I don't recall seeing
- 17 any other email communications related to it.
- 18 MR. RYAN BREEDON: All right.
- 19 Ultimately, what happens is ISSI cuts a cheque to
- 20 Compenso for the amount shown on this invoice, thirty-
- 21 five thousand one dollar and seventy-five cents
- 22 (\$35,001.75).
- MR. PAUL BONWICK: Which makes sense.
- 24 MR. RYAN BREEDON: Yes. And so they
- 25 either ignored the other statement that we looked at a

- 1 moment ago, or there was some discussion and you just
- 2 don't recall?
- 3 MR. PAUL BONWICK: I don't recall
- 4 having discussion about any amount other than the
- 5 initial one and the amount of the invoice.
- 6 MR. RYAN BREEDON: And -- and the
- 7 cheque that you received from ISSI came on September
- 8 the 30th?
- 9 MR. PAUL BONWICK: No idea.
- 10 MR. RYAN BREEDON: Okay. It was
- 11 deposited on October the 3rd, which is the following
- 12 Monday.
- MR. PAUL BONWICK: So that would make
- 14 sense, then.
- 15 MR. RYAN BREEDON: So it would make
- 16 sense that when, you know, they had told you, We could
- 17 courier it out on Friday because that's when the
- 18 signing officers would be available, that seems to be
- 19 what happened?
- 20 MR. PAUL BONWICK: It would have
- 21 either come in Friday or possibly Monday.
- MR. RYAN BREEDON: And you don't
- 23 recall, I take it?
- 24 MR. PAUL BONWICK: No, I -- I don't
- 25 think I would have been doing the deposits.

- 1 MR. RYAN BREEDON: Okay. Now let's
- 2 talk about Mr. Budd for a moment. Do -- do I
- 3 understand correctly that it was Mr. Houghton who
- 4 introduced you to Peter Budd?
- 5 MR. PAUL BONWICK: Yes.
- 6 MR. RYAN BREEDON: Okay. And he
- 7 introduced you with the idea that you might become
- 8 involved in -- in business with Mr. Budd?
- 9 MR. PAUL BONWICK: Yes. As I think I
- 10 stated yesterday, it started out with me being shown
- 11 the solar vent. Ed -- Mr. Houghton seeking feedback
- 12 in terms of what I thought; he gave his description of
- 13 what he thought it could do, or what Mr. Budd or Mr.
- 14 Bushey felt that it could do.
- 15 As for my feedback, after he provided
- 16 that description, and subsequent to that, I started to
- 17 get very interested in it, and then sometime
- 18 thereafter, he provided an introduction to Mr. Budd.
- MR. RYAN BREEDON: Sure. And at some
- 20 point along the way, you must have researched Mr.
- 21 Budd's background?
- MR. PAUL BONWICK: No.
- 23 MR. RYAN BREEDON: All right. You
- 24 didn't look into who Mr. Budd was before you got into
- 25 business with him?

- 1 MR. PAUL BONWICK: Well, I don't know
- 2 that I'm -- got into business. Again, I'm -- it's a
- 3 commission structure. Mr. Houghton spoke very highly
- 4 of Mr. Budd. I didn't take the time to -- based on
- 5 Mr. Houghton's description and knowledge, or personal
- 6 experience -- business experiences with him going back
- 7 many, many years, I didn't do a background check on
- 8 him, no.
- 9 MR. RYAN BREEDON: All right. You --
- 10 you knew that Mr. Budd had, at one (1) time, been a
- 11 very prominent lawyer in the energy sector?
- MR. PAUL BONWICK: Certainly the way
- 13 Ed described it, yes.
- 14 MR. RYAN BREEDON: Okay. And you knew
- 15 that Mr. Budd had also been involved in a variety of
- 16 different businesses?
- 17 MR. PAUL BONWICK: No, I don't think I
- 18 knew that, no.
- 19 MR. RYAN BREEDON: You knew that he
- 20 was well-connected in the energy sector?
- 21 MR. PAUL BONWICK: I don't know that I
- 22 knew him that well. I think Mr. Houghton described
- 23 him as a top lawyer in the energy sector that had
- 24 worked with Collus in years gone by, and Ed held him
- 25 in, from what I recall, in pretty high regard.

1 (BRIEF PAUSE)

- 3 MR. RYAN BREEDON: And you certainly
- 4 met Mr. Budd?
- 5 MR. PAUL BONWICK: Yes.
- 6 MR. RYAN BREEDON: And you found him
- 7 to be intelligent?
- MR. PAUL BONWICK: Yes.
- 9 MR. RYAN BREEDON: And you found him
- 10 to be knowledgeable?
- MR. PAUL BONWICK: About?
- 12 MR. RYAN BREEDON: Well, you found him
- 13 to be knowledgeable about business?
- 14 MR. PAUL BONWICK: I found him to be
- 15 intelligent. I'm not sure that I felt that he had a
- 16 good understanding of the potential for the product
- 17 that he was involved with, and I don't think he -- my
- 18 take in the early days was there wasn't necessarily a
- 19 full appreciation of the kind of capital that was
- 20 going to be required, or the business organization
- 21 that was going to be needed to put in play in order to
- 22 maximize the potential of this product.
- 23 So to suggest -- for me to say that I
- 24 felt he was knowledgeable from a business perspective,
- 25 I think that there was room for him to learn more

- 1 about how he could be successful with this product.
- MR. RYAN BREEDON: All right. Because
- 3 you saw this product as being an potentially a very
- 4 big deal, right?
- 5 MR. PAUL BONWICK: I believed that
- 6 they needed to not so much put all their eggs in one
- 7 (1) basket as it related to the LDCs, because in my
- 8 opinion, the LDC world was significant, but very
- 9 limited.
- 10 It was my opinion, based on what I
- 11 understood the value this product could bring to a
- 12 homeowner, that it should be -- a much larger focus
- 13 should be put on introducing the product to big box
- 14 stores, introducing the product to large roofing
- 15 companies, introduce the product down into the US.
- 16 And so that's sort of the train that I was trying to
- 17 get those guys on.
- 18 MR. RYAN BREEDON: Right. You thought
- 19 that -- that -- I don't want to put words into your
- 20 mouth, but --
- MR. PAUL BONWICK: No.
- MR. RYAN BREEDON: -- you thought that
- 23 Mr. Budd and Mr. Houghton had perhaps too narrow a
- 24 focus, and didn't appreciate kind of the full scope of
- 25 possibilities that the product offered?

```
MR. PAUL BONWICK:
                                       I think that would
 1
   be a -- a fair statement. I understood Mr. Houghton's
   desire to do the pilot project, and possibly do it
 3
   with two (2) or three (3) partners.
                  My assertion was, Well, that's well and
 5
   good, and it can provide you the necessary information
   potentially -- or data to get your approval through
 7
   OPA or OEB. To me, that represented a relatively
   small part of what this product could arguably
10
   achieve.
                  MR. RYAN BREEDON: Right. And you
11
12
   thought that there was the opportunity for a
13
    significant profit for all of you if this is product
14
   was brought to market and achieved its full potential?
15
                  MR. PAUL BONWICK:
                                       I believed this
   could -- this product had the potential to provide a
17
   very significant business opportunity.
18
                  MR. RYAN BREEDON: For all of you?
19
                  MR. PAUL BONWICK: Absolutely.
20
                  MR. RYAN BREEDON: Okay. Now can we
   look TOC59599, please.
21
22
23
                          (BRIEF PAUSE)
24
```

MR. RYAN BREEDON: This is an email

2.5

- 1 from Mr. Budd to Mr. Houghton and yourself. And the
- 2 subject line is, "Simplicity."
- 3 You've seen this one before?
- 4 MR. PAUL BONWICK: I have, and you'll
- 5 -- apologize, I keep doing this, I put the wrong
- 6 glasses on this morning, so I'm --
- 7 MR. RYAN BREEDON: That's okay.
- 8 MR. PAUL BONWICK: -- throughout --
- 9 MR. RYAN BREEDON: That's all right.
- 10 It's sent on September the 21st, 2011.
- 11 You see that?
- MR. PAUL BONWICK: Yes.
- 13 MR. RYAN BREEDON: And that is in the
- 14 time when there are these -- there seems to be some
- 15 discussion about profit sharing based on the -- the
- 16 different statements that we just looked at a moment
- 17 ago.
- 18 It's in that same time period?
- 19 MR. PAUL BONWICK: There are emails
- 20 that demonstrate profit-sharing, yes.
- 21 MR. RYAN BREEDON: Yes. And emails in
- 22 which it -- emails which seem to suggest that there
- 23 was some question about how best to calculate the
- 24 profit-sharing.
- 25 MR. PAUL BONWICK: There seem to be a

- 1 number of emails going back and forth related to that.
- MR. RYAN BREEDON: Now, can we scroll
- 3 down so we can see the -- the body of the email?
- 4 Thank you.
- 5 You'll see that Mr. Budd starts out by
- 6 telling Mr. Houghton and yourself that he was working
- 7 on a marketing agreement that day. And then in the
- 8 second paragraph he says:
- 9 "Rather than sit around discussing
- 10 fees, insurance, rent, utilities,
- 11 admin, allocations, et cetera, what
- 12 would you both say about being paid
- a flat fee per unit reflecting your
- 14 35 percent?"
- 15 See that?
- MR. PAUL BONWICK: Yes.
- 17 MR. RYAN BREEDON: All right. And --
- 18 and then he gives, in the next paragraph, an example
- 19 of how he is proposing to calculate that. See that?
- MR. PAUL BONWICK: Yes.
- 21 MR. RYAN BREEDON: Okay. And then he
- 22 -- he says:
- 23 "Please give this simple concept
- some advanced thought. The
- bookkeeper, accountant, and Tom

- 1 raised this with me."
- 2 Stop there. Tom is Mr. Bushey?
- 3 MR. PAUL BONWICK: I have to assume
- 4 so.
- 5 MR. RYAN BREEDON: That -- that's how
- 6 you --
- 7 MR. PAUL BONWICK: That's the only Tom
- 8 -- that's the only Tom that was involved in the
- 9 process, so I think that would be a fair statement.
- 10 MR. RYAN BREEDON: That was how you
- 11 understood it at the time certainly?
- 12 MR. PAUL BONWICK: That's how I --
- 13 yes, it -- it has to be that.
- 14 MR. RYAN BREEDON: All right. So
- 15 carrying on:
- "They had raised it as a means to,
- 17 number one (1) see you both paid a
- 18 set flat fee for each unit sold
- 19 under the marketing agreements for
- 20 each jurisdiction entered."
- 21 See that?
- MR. PAUL BONWICK: Yes. Sorry. Can
- 23 we look...
- 24
- 25 (BRIEF PAUSE)

- 1 MR. PAUL BONWICK: Okay, yes. I read
- 2 the whole paragraph.
- MR. RYAN BREEDON: Okay. So what he's
- 4 doing is he's setting out the reasons why he is
- 5 proposing this flat fee concept and it was number 1,
- 6 that -- that you and Mr. Houghton would be paid a set
- 7 flat fee for each unit sold; number 2, it would keep
- 8 the admin simple, he says; and then number 3, he and
- 9 Mr. Bushey would absorb any operating costs.
- 10 Do you see that?
- 11 MR. PAUL BONWICK: That's what he's
- 12 proposed in this email.
- MR. RYAN BREEDON: Okay. And so it
- 14 appears from this that Mr. Budd is assuming that you
- 15 and Mr. Houghton are somehow splitting the 35 percent.

16

17 (BRIEF PAUSE)

- 19 MR. PAUL BONWICK:
- "So if we sell the units at 175, the
- 21 profit, you are paid a set of..."
- I don't want to play on words because I
- 23 don't understand. You'll have to question Mr. Budd on
- 24 this.
- 25 He says:

```
97
 1
                      "So if we sell -- you are paid a set
 2
                      35 percent of the $120, or $50 per
                      unit."
 3
                   I'm confused about that line, but --
 5
                   So he's saying I get 35 percent? Is
   that how you take that?
 7
                   MR. RYAN BREEDON: Well, how I take it
 8 doesn't matter. But what he is saying is that there
   is going to be a payment of 35 percent and he is
   proposing that that be done by way of a flat fee,
10
11 correct?
                  MR. PAUL BONWICK: That's what he's
12
13
  proposing here.
14
                   MR. RYAN BREEDON: All right. And he
15 is asking whether you and Mr. Houghton agree to that.
16
17
                          (BRIEF PAUSE)
18
19
                   THE HONOURABLE FRANK MARROCCO: Well,
20
   that's the contest. The document will reappear in a
21 minute.
22
23
                          (BRIEF PAUSE)
24
2.5
                  MR. RYAN BREEDON: Such was the vigour
```

```
1 of my question, I broke the computer.
2
3 (BRIEF PAUSE)
```

4

- 5 MR. RYAN BREEDON: Were you planning
- 6 on taking another break, Your Honour, at --
- 7 THE HONOURABLE FRANK MARROCCO: Well,
- 8 I was trying to sort of go every hour, give the --
- 9 everybody five (5) or ten (10) minutes, but we're back
- 10 in business, so --
- MR. RYAN BREEDON: Okay, good.
- 12 THE HONOURABLE FRANK MARROCCO: --
- 13 let's carry on a little longer.
- MR. RYAN BREEDON: All right.

- 16 CONTINUED BY MR. RYAN BREEDON:
- MR. RYAN BREEDON: So what Mr. Budd is
- 18 -- we -- we looked at a moment ago, he is proposing
- 19 that the 35 percent be paid by way of a flat fee, and
- 20 he is asking whether you and Mr. Houghton agree to
- 21 that. That's the second paragraph.
- MR. PAUL BONWICK: Yes.
- MR. RYAN BREEDON: Right. And he's
- 24 asking what would you both say about this, and the
- 25 "both" is you and Mr. Houghton. You're the only

- 1 recipients of the email. Yes?
- MR. PAUL BONWICK: Yes.
- 3 MR. RYAN BREEDON: Right. And then
- 4 when he sets out his reasons, the first reason is that
- 5 it would see you both, again you and Mr. Houghton,
- 6 paid a set flat fee for each unit sold.
- 7 You see that?
- MR. PAUL BONWICK: Yes.
- 9 MR. RYAN BREEDON: And so what Mr.
- 10 Budd is assuming is that you and Mr. Houghton are
- 11 sharing the 35 percent.
- 12 MR. PAUL BONWICK: I have to assume,
- 13 based on his email, he feels Mr. Houghton and I are
- 14 partners in some way and that we're into a profit-
- 15 sharing mode.
- MR. RYAN BREEDON: Right. And that's
- 17 the only way of interpreting this email.
- 18 MR. PAUL BONWICK: Again, it's
- 19 certainly how I interpret it. I think in fairness,
- 20 you'll have an opportunity to question Mr. Budd on it
- 21 and get his direct --
- 22 MR. RYAN BREEDON: All right. Now --
- MR. PAUL BONWICK: -- messaging, but I
- 24 don't know how -- that's how I would read it.
- MR. RYAN BREEDON: -- you didn't

- 1 respond to this email.
- MR. PAUL BONWICK: I don't see any
- 3 record of me responding to it. I don't know if at
- 4 that time I would have picked up the phone and called
- 5 Mr. Budd or not.
- 6 MR. RYAN BREEDON: You don't remember
- 7 having that discussion, I take it?
- 8 MR. PAUL BONWICK: I don't recall
- 9 having --
- 10 MR. RYAN BREEDON: Right.
- 11 MR. PAUL BONWICK: -- a discussion,
- 12 no.
- MR. RYAN BREEDON: And -- and
- 14 certainly there is no record of any written response
- 15 to this email from you.
- 16 MR. PAUL BONWICK: I would -- if he's
- 17 soliciting my opinion -- this is standard operating
- 18 practice on my part. Rather than bounce back and
- 19 forth with emails, if he soliciting my opinion, I can
- 20 only believe that I would have picked up the phone and
- 21 called him and said here's what I think.
- MR. RYAN BREEDON: Okay. There's no
- 23 email from you to Mr. Budd.
- 24 MR. PAUL BONWICK: I've confirmed that
- 25 already.

- 1 MR. RYAN BREEDON: And there's no
- 2 email from Mr. Houghton to Mr. Budd responding to this
- 3 email?
- 4 MR. PAUL BONWICK: That, I don't know.
- 5 I don't believe so, but I -- I haven't seen anything.
- 6 MR. RYAN BREEDON: That's all -- you
- 7 haven't seen anything.
- 8 MR. PAUL BONWICK: I don't know of
- 9 one.
- 10 MR. RYAN BREEDON: Okay. Mr. Houghton
- 11 does seem to have sent this on to his wife. You see
- 12 that, just at the top of the screen?
- MR. PAUL BONWICK: I do.
- 14 MR. RYAN BREEDON: Okay. All right.
- 15 Now, that's in September of 2011. And then we know
- 16 from a moment ago that Compenso received a payment for
- 17 the 35 percent a week and a half later.
- MR. PAUL BONWICK: Correct.
- 19 MR. RYAN BREEDON: Okay. Can we next
- 20 look at TOC65379, please?

21

22 (BRIEF PAUSE)

- 24 MR. RYAN BREEDON: Scroll down to Mr.
- 25 Budd's email.

- 1 So I think this is the email that you
- 2 referred to a few moments ago, the one in which the --
- 3 there's a discussion of this marketing corporation.
- 4 MR. PAUL BONWICK: Yes, that's what I
- 5 recall seeing.
- 6 MR. RYAN BREEDON: Okay. If we look
- 7 at the one, two, three -- the fifth paragraph down,
- 8 the one that says:
- 9 "But before you both."
- MR. PAUL BONWICK: Yes.
- MR. RYAN BREEDON: Okay. And --
- 12 sorry, can you just scroll? Oh no, that's actually
- 13 fine.
- 14 So this email again is sent by Mr. Budd
- 15 to yourself and Mr. Houghton.
- MR. PAUL BONWICK: Yes.
- 17 MR. RYAN BREEDON: And it was sent on
- 18 November the 3rd of 2011?
- MR. PAUL BONWICK: Yes.
- 20 MR. RYAN BREEDON: Right. And so he
- 21 says:
- "But before you both"
- 23 And the "you both" are you and Mr.
- 24 Houghton?
- MR. PAUL BONWICK: Yes.

Transcript Date June 14, 2019 103 "Before you joined, the deal was 1 2 70/30 TB/PB on everything from 3 sales, costs, marketing, et cetera." You see that? 5 MR. PAUL BONWICK: Yes. MR. RYAN BREEDON: And what he's 6 saying is that before you and Mr. Houghton became involved in this project, the deal was that Mr. Bushey and Mr. Budd would share everything on a 70/30 basis? 10 MR. PAUL BONWICK: I have to assume 11 that, based on the two (2) initials. MR. RYAN BREEDON: Right. Well, it's 12 13 not you that he's talking about. 14 MR. PAUL BONWICK: That's what I'm 15 saying. 16 MR. RYAN BREEDON: Right. And that's certainly how you understood it at the time? 17

- 18 MR. PAUL BONWICK: I would have to
- 19 assume so. I don't recall having put a lot of thought
- into this, but yes, I -- it's fairly straight forward
- 21 in my opinion.
- 22 MR. RYAN BREEDON: All right. Then in
- 23 the next paragraph, he says:
- 24 "Then with Paul and Ed --"
- 2.5 You see that?

- 1 MR. PAUL BONWICK: Yes.
- 2 MR. RYAN BREEDON: And Paul and Ed are
- 3 you and Mr. Houghton.
- 4 MR. PAUL BONWICK: Correct.
- 5 MR. RYAN BREEDON: There isn't another
- 6 Paul and Ed that we don't know about.
- 7 MR. PAUL BONWICK: I'm sure there is,
- 8 but I don't think it's relevant to this particular
- 9 email.
- MR. RYAN BREEDON: And he says:
- "With the inaugural LDC deal in
- 12 sight -- "
- 13 That is the deal between ISSI and
- 14 Collus and PowerStream?
- 15 MR. PAUL BONWICK: One has to assume
- 16 that's the case. That's the only one.
- MR. RYAN BREEDON: He says:
- "We established an amended sharing
- 19 arrangement."
- You see that?
- MR. PAUL BONWICK: Yes.
- MR. RYAN BREEDON: And the "we" is you
- 23 and Mr. Houghton and Mr. Budd and Mr. Bushey.
- 24 MR. PAUL BONWICK: I'm going to say
- 25 "we" -- does it not make sense that the "we

- 1 established an amended sharing arrangement" being
- 2 Mr. Bushey and Mr. Budd? That's how I would take that
- 3 but --
- 4 MR. RYAN BREEDON: All right. Well,
- 5 he then -- he then has a -- there's a colon, and he
- 6 sets out what appears to be the amended sharing
- 7 amendment. And it's -- you see that -- it's on the
- 8 next line:
- 9 "35/35/30 for TB/EH-PB/PB."
- 10 You see that?
- MR. PAUL BONWICK: Yes.
- 12 MR. RYAN BREEDON: Okay. And what
- 13 that is saying is that 35 percent goes to Mr. Bushey?
- MR. PAUL BONWICK: Correct.
- MR. RYAN BREEDON: 35 percent goes to
- 16 Mr. Houghton and yourself?
- MR. PAUL BONWICK: He's assuming that.
- 18 MR. RYAN BREEDON: That's what it
- 19 says.
- MR. PAUL BONWICK: Again, you're going
- 21 to have to question him on this. I'm saying he's
- 22 assuming that that's the case. That's what he's
- 23 purporting.
- 24 MR. RYAN BREEDON: That's what you
- 25 understand this to mean.

- 1 MR. PAUL BONWICK: Correct.
- 2 MR. RYAN BREEDON: Okay. And
- 3 30 percent to Mr. Budd.
- 4 MR. PAUL BONWICK: Again, correct.
- 5 MR. RYAN BREEDON: I just want to make
- 6 sure when I'm interpreting this correctly --
- 7 MR. PAUL BONWICK: I think you're
- 8 both -- we're both interpreting it in a very similar
- 9 fashion.
- MR. RYAN BREEDON: Okay, good.
- 11 MR. PAUL BONWICK: My only assertion
- 12 is that this is based on Mr. Budd's assumptions. Yes.
- MR. RYAN BREEDON: Yes. So he's
- 14 saying that this is -- this has been established, this
- 15 new arrangement?
- 16 MR. PAUL BONWICK: I think what he's
- 17 saying is we -- being Tom Bushey and Peter Budd --
- 18 have established an amended sharing agreement. Here's
- 19 what it is.
- 20 MR. RYAN BREEDON: Okay. And
- 21 established in the past?
- 22 MR. PAUL BONWICK: Established is past
- 23 tense.
- MR. RYAN BREEDON: Yes. And then he
- 25 goes on to say:

- 1 "That worked well."
- MR. PAUL BONWICK: Again, I can't read
- 3 anything into that because there was no agreement in
- 4 the past, and there was no delivery of funds in the
- 5 past. So I don't -- not sure how it would have worked
- 6 well because it's not predicated on any transaction.
- 7 MR. RYAN BREEDON: Okay. I'm not
- 8 asking you to -- for your opinion about whether
- 9 Mr. Budd is correct or incorrect. We'll come to that
- 10 in a moment. But what he's saying is that, just based
- 11 on the plain reading of the email, there had been a
- 12 new sharing arrangement that had been agreed to and
- 13 that that worked well. That's what it says.
- 14 MR. PAUL BONWICK: That's not how I
- 15 interpret it. Again, I'm sitting here going the issue
- 16 is we -- and I assume he means Tom Bushey and
- 17 Peter Budd -- established an amended sharing
- 18 agreement. This is what he's proposed the sharing
- 19 agreement, and then he goes, "That worked well."
- 20 I don't understand which context he's
- 21 saying that worked well because there hadn't been any
- 22 transactions leading up to that to measure whether it
- 23 worked well or didn't work well.
- 24 MR. RYAN BREEDON: All right. He then
- 25 says:

- 1 "Tom agreed to it, and then cash was
- fully distributed to Compenso and
- 3 partially to PB/TB."
- 4 You see that?
- 5 MR. PAUL BONWICK: Right. This has --
- 6 yes. So I'm thinking this is earlier than
- 7 September -- so yes -- than when he said, "This worked
- 8 well." He's talking about the profit sharing that he
- 9 provided to Compenso.
- 10 MR. RYAN BREEDON: Right. So what
- 11 he's saying is that -- what he's saying that
- 12 originally there was a deal between just him and
- 13 Mr. Bushey for 70/30.
- MR. PAUL BONWICK: Correct.
- 15 MR. RYAN BREEDON: And then at some
- 16 point -- and he doesn't say in this email -- when that
- 17 point was, but that there was an amended sharing
- 18 agreement under which 35 percent goes to Mr. Bushey,
- 19 30 percent goes to Mr. Budd, and 35 percent goes to
- 20 yourself and Mr. Houghton. That's what he's saying.
- 21 MR. PAUL BONWICK: That's what he's
- 22 saying.
- MR. RYAN BREEDON: Okay. And then he
- 24 says, that works well -- or had worked well, and that
- 25 cash was distributed to Compenso. And the cash that

- 1 was distributed to Compenso is that \$35,000 that we
- 2 looked at a few moments ago.
- 3 MR. PAUL BONWICK: Correct. And so
- 4 there is a slight contraction there. He's suggesting
- 5 that the profit sharing come to Paul Bonwick and
- 6 Ed Houghton, when in fact what he did was he paid --
- 7 this was a relationship between Compenso and his
- 8 company, not specific to Paul Bonwick or Ed Houghton
- 9 but rather Compenso, which Compenso was paid.
- 10 MR. RYAN BREEDON: Okay. But what
- 11 he's saying is that his understanding is that there is
- 12 some arrangement between Paul Bonwick and Ed Houghton.
- MR. PAUL BONWICK: I would agree.
- 14 MR. RYAN BREEDON: All right. And
- 15 that the 35 percent is going to be shared between
- 16 Paul Bonwick and Ed Houghton?
- MR. PAUL BONWICK: That's what he's
- 18 proposing. Correct.
- 19 MR. RYAN BREEDON: And that that
- 20 35 percent was just paid to Compenso.
- MR. PAUL BONWICK: Correct.
- 22 MR. RYAN BREEDON: Okay. And
- 23 presumably at your direction, and then you and
- 24 Mr. Houghton would deal with it however you decided to
- 25 deal with it.

- 1 MR. PAUL BONWICK: Fair statement.
- 2 MR. RYAN BREEDON: All right.
- 3 That's -- that's what Mr. Budd seems to have
- 4 understood was the arrangement between the parties as
- 5 of November 2011.
- 6 MR. PAUL BONWICK: I can't speak for
- 7 Mr. Budd. But I follow the train, and I'm agreeing
- 8 with how the email reads in terms of your
- 9 interpretation.
- 10 MR. RYAN BREEDON: And this one -- and
- 11 then he goes on to talk about a future variation of
- 12 the arrangement that might happen in the future, and
- 13 the balance of the email talks about that. Right?
- MR. PAUL BONWICK: Right.
- MR. RYAN BREEDON: Okay.
- MR. PAUL BONWICK: Yes. Sorry. Yeah.
- MR. RYAN BREEDON: Now, this email --
- 18 scroll up, please; keep going -- this email was
- 19 forwarded by Mr. Houghton to his wife? You see that?
- MR. PAUL BONWICK: I do.
- 21 MR. RYAN BREEDON: And you didn't
- 22 respond to this email, did you?
- MR. PAUL BONWICK: The one that he
- 24 forwarded to his wife?
- MR. RYAN BREEDON: Sorry, no.

- 1 Mr. Budd's email. You did not respond to Mr. Budd's
- 2 email?
- 3 MR. PAUL BONWICK: Again, I didn't
- 4 respond via email. I don't know if I phoned him.
- 5 MR. RYAN BREEDON: Okay. Well, we'll
- 6 start the email. So there's no email --
- 7 MR. PAUL BONWICK: No email.
- 8 MR. RYAN BREEDON: -- from you to
- 9 Mr. Budd --
- 10 MR. PAUL BONWICK: Correct.
- MR. RYAN BREEDON: -- responding to
- 12 his email.
- MR. PAUL BONWICK: Correct.
- 14 MR. RYAN BREEDON: We have to -- we
- 15 have to not talk over each other. Yes?
- 16 MR. PAUL BONWICK: We've already
- 17 agreed on that.
- 18 MR. RYAN BREEDON: And you don't have
- 19 a recollection of phoning Mr. Budd about this email.
- 20 MR. PAUL BONWICK: I don't have a
- 21 specific recollection. That said, you wouldn't just
- 22 let it stand. You -- common sense would dictate that
- 23 one would pick up the phone and call. But I do not
- 24 recall the -- the conversation, no.
- 25 MR. RYAN BREEDON: And it seems

- 1 like -- we looked at the email back in September in
- 2 which Mr. Budd seems to have assumed that you and
- 3 Mr. Houghton were sharing 35 percent. He still
- 4 believes the same thing in November. So it -- it
- 5 seems like nobody called Mr. Budd and said,
- 6 Mr. Houghton doesn't have a part of this.
- 7 MR. PAUL BONWICK: I think
- 8 Mr. Houghton has gone on record to say he did. I
- 9 certainly have not in email confirmations said
- 10 Mr. Houghton is not a part of this.
- MR. RYAN BREEDON: All right. Mr. --
- 12 all right. And similarly, you haven't seen any email
- 13 from Mr. Houghton to Mr. Budd responding to the
- 14 November 3rd email at all.
- MR. PAUL BONWICK: Correct.
- 16 MR. RYAN BREEDON: This might be an
- 17 appropriate time to take a break.
- 18 THE HONOURABLE FRANK MARROCCO:
- 19 Ten (10) minutes.
- 20
- 21 --- Upon recessing at 11:18 a.m.
- 22 --- Upon resuming at 11:31 a.m.
- 23
- 24 MR. PAUL BONWICK: Excuse me, Your
- 25 Honour, could I just go and trade glasses?

- THE HONOURABLE FRANK MARROCCO: Sure.
- 2 MR. PAUL BONWICK: Somebody was kind
- 3 enough to lend me some, but they're a bit stronger.

- 5 CONTINUED BY MR. RYAN BREEDON:
- 6 MR. RYAN BREEDON: Is that better?
- 7 MR. PAUL BONWICK: It's close. It's
- 8 better than these ones were. Thank you.
- 9 MR. RYAN BREEDON: Before the break,
- 10 we were talking about the fact that Mr. Budd seems to
- 11 have believed that you and Mr. Houghton were splitting
- 12 a 35 percent interest in ISSI.
- And I'm going to suggest to you that
- 14 the reason that Mr. Budd believed that is because
- 15 that's what you and Mr. Houghton told him?
- MR. PAUL BONWICK: You'll have to ask
- 17 Mr. Budd that. I can't agree with your assertion.
- 18 You'll have an opportunity to find out why he felt
- 19 that once you get him on the stand.
- 20 MR. RYAN BREEDON: Well, Mr. Budd was
- 21 an intelligent man who, you know, had been a lawyer,
- 22 et cetera. We've been through his background. You're
- 23 not suggesting that he was somehow confused about who
- 24 he was in business with?
- 25 MR. PAUL BONWICK: I think he was

- 1 fully aware that I was attempting to get Mr. Houghton
- 2 to come in to my company or to become a partner. I
- 3 never gave him any indication other than that was my
- 4 continued attempt.
- 5 And so, based on my assertions, that
- 6 would be reasonable, that he would continue to think
- 7 that.
- 8 MR. RYAN BREEDON: But he's not -- his
- 9 emails don't suggest that he thought you were trying
- 10 to get Mr. Houghton to come in. His emails suggest
- 11 that he thought you and Mr. Houghton had already
- 12 reached an agreement?
- MR. PAUL BONWICK: Again, you're going
- 14 to have to speak to him about that.
- 15 MR. RYAN BREEDON: Well, but that --
- 16 we've been through it. That's the only way of reading
- 17 his emails?
- 18 MR. PAUL BONWICK: There's no way for
- 19 me to -- to comment on it other than you're going to
- 20 have to ask him to explain what his thinking was.
- 21 MR. RYAN BREEDON: And -- and I'm
- 22 going to suggest to you that, if you thought that Mr.
- 23 Budd had mischaracterized the arrangement you would
- 24 have responded in writing?
- MR. PAUL BONWICK: Not necessarily.

- 1 MR. RYAN BREEDON: Well, you thought
- 2 that this business was potentially worth a significant
- 3 amount of money?
- 4 MR. PAUL BONWICK: I felt that this
- 5 business -- this product had the opportunity to grow
- 6 and create a significant business.
- 7 MR. RYAN BREEDON: Right. And you
- 8 thought it would be a lucrative venture for all of the
- 9 people who were involved in the profit sharing?
- 10 MR. PAUL BONWICK: My mind was
- 11 starting to shift from that point in terms of how that
- 12 structure would work as it related to Mr. Budd and Mr.
- 13 Bushey versus me and trying to bring in Mr. Houghton.
- 14 MR. RYAN BREEDON: Right. You've
- 15 already told us that you thought that this was an idea
- 16 that had the potential to make you all a lot of money?
- 17 MR. PAUL BONWICK: Very si -- I
- 18 believe it had the potential to become a very
- 19 significant business venture, yes.
- MR. RYAN BREEDON: Right. And if Mr.
- 21 Houghton did not have an interest in that, you would
- 22 have responded to Mr. Budd's emails because you would
- 23 be worried that ten (10) years down the road when the
- 24 business is worth millions of dollars, Mr. Houghton
- 25 would be waving around those emails saying I'm

- 1 entitled to a share of the 35 percent?
- MR. PAUL BONWICK: No, I wasn't
- 3 thinking about what would happen years from now in
- 4 terms of Mr. Houghton waving a piece of paper around.
- 5 My hope was years down the road Mr. Houghton would be
- 6 a partner.
- 7 And in terms of getting these
- 8 communications from Mr. Budd, my -- my primary focus
- 9 would be to get my invoice paid from Compenso. What I
- 10 do with the money from that point forward is not part
- 11 of the discussion with Mr. Budd irrespective of what
- 12 he believed to be the case.
- MR. RYAN BREEDON: Did you ever have
- 14 any discussions with either Mr. Budd or with Mr.
- 15 Houghton concerning the fact that, given Mr.
- 16 Houghton's role at Collus, he could face very serious
- 17 consequences if it was learned that he had an interest
- 18 in ISSI?
- MR. PAUL BONWICK: No.
- MR. RYAN BREEDON: You understood, I
- 21 take it, from his reluctance -- to what you say his
- 22 reluctance to become involved at that was -- would be
- 23 a serious matter?
- MR. PAUL BONWICK: No. Again, as I've
- 25 stated before, I was not familiar with Mr. Houghton's

- 1 employment contract. My point was I was trying to get
- 2 him to move out of the employment contract, termit --
- 3 or iss -- issue his notice for retirement and come and
- 4 create something that I thought could become very
- 5 significant.
- 6 MR. RYAN BREEDON: You understand now,
- 7 after having heard all of the evidence that -- that
- 8 has been here thirty-one (31) days or whatever it's
- 9 been, that, if in fact Mr. Houghton had an undisclosed
- 10 interest in ISSI, that that would be a very serious
- 11 matter. You -- you understand that now?
- 12 MR. PAUL BONWICK: I -- I -- based on
- 13 some of the testimony that's been brought forward,
- 14 some have suggested that Mr. Con -- or Mr. Houghton
- 15 would be in a -- would be in a very uncomfortable
- 16 position if he hasn't declared earnings.
- 17 Again, I've got to go back to the
- 18 point. I don't know what Mr. Houghton's contract
- 19 allowed, but I wasn't interested in the interface
- 20 between Mr. Houghton and Collus. I was interested in
- 21 Mr. Houghton moving outside of Collus and taking this
- 22 opportunity and running with it far beyond a small
- 23 purchase by two (2) LDCs or four (4) or five (5) LDCs.
- 24 MR. RYAN BREEDON: Can we look at
- 25 Foundation Document paragraph 677, please?

1 (BRIEF PAUSE)

- 3 MR. RYAN BREEDON: And scroll down to
- 4 the table. This is the table of payments from
- 5 Compenso to Shirley Houghton. Ms. McGrann took you to
- 6 it?
- 7 MR. PAUL BONWICK: She did.
- 8 MR. RYAN BREEDON: Okay. And I
- 9 understand that you had agreed to pay Ms. Houghton
- 10 twenty dollars (\$20) per hour?
- 11 MR. PAUL BONWICK: I believe that was
- 12 the amount.
- MR. RYAN BREEDON: Did that change?
- MR. PAUL BONWICK: I don't think so.
- 15 I -- I originally thought it was twenty-five (25), but
- 16 twenty dollars (\$20) an hour is what the records have
- 17 shown.
- MR. RYAN BREEDON: Okay. And Ms.
- 19 Houghton apparently gave you invoices for her time?
- MR. PAUL BONWICK: My understanding,
- 21 and I didn't deal with all of them, but when -- what
- 22 she would typically do is come in with a paper that
- 23 had the number of hours and the rate that she was
- 24 charging.
- 25 MR. RYAN BREEDON: And -- and did

- 1 those pieces of paper explain what it is that she had
- 2 been doing?
- 3 MR. PAUL BONWICK: I don't recall the
- 4 description of service, but I was certainly fully
- 5 aware of the services that she was providing.
- 6 MR. RYAN BREEDON: And I take it you
- 7 had to approve all of the invoices before she would be
- 8 paid?
- 9 MR. PAUL BONWICK: Correct.
- MR. RYAN BREEDON: Now, Ms. Houghton
- 11 apparently, based on an affidavit that was delivered
- 12 today, doesn't have any copies of the invoices. Did
- 13 you keep copies of her invoices?
- 14 MR. PAUL BONWICK: We don't have -- so
- 15 in working with the inquiry, the bookkeeper went back
- 16 through and could not find invoices for Ms. Houghton -
- 17 Mrs. Houghton going back to 2011, so we couldn't
- 18 find a file with the -- with the invoices in them.
- 19 MR. RYAN BREEDON: But you have your
- 20 financial records from 2011?
- 21 MR. PAUL BONWICK: Correct. We've --
- 22 and we've provided those.
- MR. RYAN BREEDON: So, what happened
- 24 to Ms. Houghton's invoices?
- MR. PAUL BONWICK: Well, you don't

- 1 typically keep the hard copies. Once an invoice is
- 2 paid, I would assume that the bookkeeper would put it
- 3 in a file and that we would do our tax filings and we
- 4 would show it as -- we would report it as contract
- 5 labour.
- 6 The income tax would have been filed --
- 7 or the federal -- the corporate taxes would have been
- 8 filed in 2011. And I don't think we maintain records
- 9 going back that far other than our financial -- the
- 10 information the accountant provided, which I believe
- 11 the accountant provided all the information that was
- 12 requested or that he had within his possession.
- 13 We provided the year end tax filings
- 14 for everything that we had. We also provided the bank
- 15 statements, showing credits and debits during this
- 16 entire period of time.
- 17 MR. RYAN BREEDON: So is the -- is
- 18 your answer that you just didn't keep any of the --
- 19 any invoices from 2011 or 2012?
- 20 MR. PAUL BONWICK: For contract labour
- 21 we would typically -- and we've done this in many
- 22 other areas, rather than put people on the payroll if
- 23 they're relatively small in nature, we would issue a
- 24 cheque based on the number of hours that somebody had,
- 25 and we would write that off into a casual labour file,

- 1 or --
- MR. RYAN BREEDON: My question was
- 3 just is it your evidence that you don't have any
- 4 invoices from any of your suppliers or contract
- 5 labourers or any such thing from 2011 or 2012?
- 6 MR. PAUL BONWICK: Again, we've given
- 7 everything that we had in our files.
- 8 MR. RYAN BREEDON: What I'm trying to
- 9 understand, sir, is were all of your invoices from
- 10 that time period destroyed, like maybe in accordance
- 11 with your normal practice or whatever, or -- or do you
- 12 have your other invoices from that time period and you
- 13 just don't have Ms. Houghton's?
- 14 MR. PAUL BONWICK: No, it would not be
- 15 specific to Ms. Houghton.
- MR. RYAN BREEDON: So if we look at
- 17 the table, you'll see that the first bank statement --
- 18 and I take it this is a reference to Compenso's bank
- 19 statements?
- MR. PAUL BONWICK: Yes.
- 21 MR. RYAN BREEDON: Okay. The first
- 22 one shows a payment to Ms. Houghton of \$240.
- MR. PAUL BONWICK: Yes.
- 24 MR. RYAN BREEDON: All right. And so
- 25 that's twelve (12) hours of work, I take it?

1 MR. PAUL BONWICK: That would seem

- 2 reasonable.
- 3 MR. RYAN BREEDON: And that would have
- 4 been incurred from the time period in January, when
- 5 you had first agreed to hire her, until whenever that
- 6 cheque was issued?
- 7 MR. PAUL BONWICK: That would be
- 8 reasonable.
- 9 MR. RYAN BREEDON: And the -- and then
- 10 in June there is a payment for \$360 or eighteen (18)
- 11 hours, and that's a similar sort of amount of work?
- MR. PAUL BONWICK: Correct.
- MR. RYAN BREEDON: Okay. And then in
- 14 July there is a payment for \$2,000 or one hundred
- 15 (100) hours?
- MR. PAUL BONWICK: Correct.
- 17 MR. RYAN BREEDON: All right. What
- 18 was Ms. Houghton doing for you in-between the June and
- 19 July payments?
- MR. PAUL BONWICK: So Ms. Houghton had
- 21 -- I'd asked Ms. Houghton to be -- or support us in a
- 22 variety of different ways. One of the things that Ms.
- 23 Houghton did was helped deal with the Lobby
- 24 Registration Act and so it's a -- if you're familiar
- 25 with it or not, it's a fairly complex registration

- 1 system where you have to collect a significant amount
- 2 of information, you register it online, there's a
- 3 process that the Registrar goes through, then provides
- 4 feedback, gets any additional questions answered and
- 5 then you're registered as a lobbyist on any particular
- 6 file. So she would help in that regard.
- 7 She would do some administrative work
- 8 related to making sure that documents that I was
- 9 preparing or letters or reports or things like that
- 10 were grammatically correct. She was tasked with
- 11 responsibility of putting together a significant
- 12 database specific to the political arena in Queen's
- 13 Park and at Ottawa. That might have been in around
- 14 that time.
- 15 That database that we created was for
- 16 the purpose of sending out communications to
- 17 Ministers, to MPPs, to Chiefs of Staff within the
- 18 Provincial Legislature for all parties, as well as at
- 19 Ottawa, and the same thing applies there.
- 20 MR. RYAN BREEDON: And the database
- 21 was as part of kind of the proposed lobby activities
- 22 that you were trying to get into?
- 23 MR. PAUL BONWICK: No, back then we
- 24 would do things like send out a Christmas card, a
- 25 handwritten Christmas card to senior -- or politicians

- 1 at Queen's Park and the Federal Government and we
- 2 would do it as well to some of their staff, just to
- 3 sort of keep our company profile.
- 4 MR. RYAN BREEDON: When did you first
- 5 incorporate Compenso?
- MR. PAUL BONWICK: 2004.
- 7 MR. RYAN BREEDON: Right. And it was
- 8 not registered as a lobbyist until 2011? 2012?
- 9 MR. PAUL BONWICK: No. It's not the
- 10 company that gets registered as the lobbyist, it's the
- 11 individual.
- 12 MR. RYAN BREEDON: Okay, so you
- 13 personally?
- 14 MR. PAUL BONWICK: Right. And so
- 15 during -- leading up to that time I had different
- 16 staff working for me.
- One of the people that had handled --
- 18 who had transitioned out of political office with me
- 19 and into the private sector had stayed with me for
- 20 five (5) or six (6) years, and then she transitioned
- 21 into a teaching position in Meaford or Owen Sound and
- 22 so we filled part of that gap with -- with this.
- 23 MR. RYAN BREEDON: Right, you talked
- 24 about that yesterday, that was what sort of prompted
- 25 your initial discussion with Ms. Houghton back in

- 1 January or somewhat earlier.
- 2 MR. PAUL BONWICK: Well, I don't know
- 3 that that's what prompted the discussion as much as it
- 4 was conversation about what she was up to.
- 5 But depending on -- we're a relatively
- 6 small firm, sometimes we would have a few people
- 7 engaged, depending on the number of files or the
- 8 number of clients I was working with.
- 9 Sometimes we didn't have as many, and
- 10 so the work level was very much related to the amount
- 11 of work that was going on or the clients she had at
- 12 that particular time.
- MR. RYAN BREEDON: And had you
- 14 operated Compenso continuously since you first founded
- 15 it back in 2003-2004?
- MR. PAUL BONWICK: Yes.
- MR. RYAN BREEDON: Did you have any
- 18 actual employees of Compenso, other than perhaps
- 19 yourself, depending on how you structured that during
- 20 that time, or were they all independent contractors?
- 21 MR. PAUL BONWICK: No, we had some
- 22 employees, most were independent contractors.
- MR. RYAN BREEDON: And how many
- 24 employees in 2011 did Compenso have?
- MR. PAUL BONWICK: The bookkeeper

- 1 bills us on a contractual basis, so she wasn't an
- 2 employee. We had -- I don't know if in 2011 I don't
- 3 think I had Ms. Stec on employment at that point in
- 4 time, and I think she was contract.
- 5 We might have had a front end
- 6 administration, reception person. Anybody that would
- 7 be full-time, that's when you would typically make the
- 8 transition or something close to full-time, that's
- 9 typically where you would make the transition to
- 10 putting them on the payroll, making the source
- 11 deductions and treating them as an employee, full-time
- 12 employee versus a contract or part-time employee.
- MR. RYAN BREEDON: All right.
- 14 And then how many contract employees
- 15 did you have, again in around 2011? Roughly.
- MR. PAUL BONWICK: I'd have to pull --
- 17 go back and look at it. But during that period of
- 18 time we sometimes had three (3), sometimes four (4)
- 19 people, but they would be assigned to a specific file,
- 20 it wasn't so much administrative.
- 21 So I had one person working with me on
- 22 the US files, I had one guy working on a file out of
- 23 Ottawa. I had a guy working with me out of the
- 24 Niagara region that was a former MPP working on a
- 25 couple of files out of Toronto.

- 1 So it -- it depended on the term of the
- 2 contract and the -- the efforts that were required and
- 3 whether I could do them or whether I could hand them
- 4 off and pay somebody and sort of, at a high level,
- 5 stay involved.
- 6 MR. RYAN BREEDON: And -- and again --
- 7 so in -- in the early part of 2011 you enter in -- or
- 8 in mid-2011 you enter into an agreement with
- 9 PowerStream, which we've seen and PowerStream
- 10 initially is paying you \$10,000 a month, plus some
- 11 expenses?
- 12 MR. PAUL BONWICK: And I don't want to
- 13 put too fine of a point on this, but yes, they're
- 14 paying the company \$10,000 a month.
- MR. RYAN BREEDON: Paying Compenso
- 16 \$10,000 a month.
- MR. PAUL BONWICK: Yes.
- 18 MR. RYAN BREEDON: And then that --
- 19 we've seen that changes to \$15,000 a month at some
- 20 point?
- MR. PAUL BONWICK: Yes.
- MR. RYAN BREEDON: And I just want a
- 23 sense of how much of your revenue was that?
- 24 MR. PAUL BONWICK: I'd have to pull up
- 25 bank statements and see what we were depositing

- 1 monthly.
- MR. RYAN BREEDON: Well, do you have a
- 3 sense? I mean, was this a big client for you, a small
- 4 client?
- 5 MR. PAUL BONWICK: Decent sized
- 6 client.
- 7 MR. RYAN BREEDON: A decent sized
- 8 client?
- 9 MR. PAUL BONWICK: I mean, we would
- 10 run -- I think our total billings -- and again, I'd
- 11 have to check, but I'd really want to pull the
- 12 billings, but I think in 2011 our billings could have
- 13 been 900,000 maybe. We had -- we had billings where
- 14 we would get sometimes as -- depending on the number
- 15 of clients, 45-50,000 in a month.
- MR. RYAN BREEDON: Okay. And how
- 17 many -- and during the time of the PowerStream RFP,
- 18 about how many active clients did you have? So how
- 19 many files were you running?
- 20 MR. PAUL BONWICK: Again, I'd -- I'd
- 21 have to check. If I -- we'd have to bring up the bank
- 22 statement and look. They're typically --
- MR. RYAN BREEDON: But do you have a
- 24 sense? I mean, again is it -- are we talking ten
- 25 (10)?

- 1 MR. PAUL BONWICK: No.
- 2 MR. RYAN BREEDON: Are we talking a
- 3 hundred?
- 4 MR. PAUL BONWICK: No, no. Gosh, no.
- 5 You know, I wish. No. I mean, when we were running
- 6 full steam, you would typically have maybe four (4) or
- 7 five (5) clients.
- 8 And then you might have something
- 9 that's very specific for a term of three (3) months or
- 10 for four (4) months. It might be something to do with
- 11 a development, trying to get permits through DFO, or
- 12 something like that. And so it had sort of a
- 13 finite mission and a finite term.
- 14 MR. RYAN BREEDON: Okay. And then
- 15 we've gone and kind of sidetracked. One last question
- 16 about this. Where did the name Compenso come from?
- 17 MR. PAUL BONWICK: Me. I was trying
- 18 to come up with something that was creative back in
- 19 2004. And we were just doing -- or I was just doing
- 20 some word searches, and from what I recall, the
- 21 definition of Compenso in Latin was bringing together
- 22 two (2) parties.
- 23 MR. RYAN BREEDON: So back to the
- 24 table, in -- you'll see in August, it's \$540,
- 25 27 hours. In September, it's up to a hundred and 20

- 1 hours. And do you recall what Ms. Houghton was doing
- 2 in this time period? Is it the same sort of thing
- 3 that you've told us?
- 4 MR. PAUL BONWICK: Same sort of thing.
- 5 Yes. Sorry to talk over you there.
- I think I should also mention that
- 7 Ms. Houghton would pick up expenses; she would bill
- 8 that into the hours as well. So if, for example, I
- 9 had said run to here or mail these out or that kind of
- 10 stuff -- and so you would see that incorporated as
- 11 well.
- 12 MR. RYAN BREEDON: All right. So
- 13 there -- it could not -- it's possible that there was
- 14 some expenses built into these figures.
- 15 MR. PAUL BONWICK: Correct. For --
- MR. RYAN BREEDON: Although they're
- 17 all round numbers. So --
- 18 MR. PAUL BONWICK: She just billed
- 19 them as her hours.
- MR. RYAN BREEDON: Okay.
- 21 MR. PAUL BONWICK: She'd round up or
- 22 round down, and say here's the amount for the month,
- 23 and here's what I did.
- 24 MR. RYAN BREEDON: All right. And
- 25 then the October payment -- I think you've

- 1 testified -- relates partly to her time and partly to
- 2 this Florida property?
- MR. PAUL BONWICK: Correct.
- 4 MR. RYAN BREEDON: And then the last
- 5 payment in August of 2012 is another \$2,500 or a
- 6 hundred and 25 hours. You see that?
- 7 MR. PAUL BONWICK: (NO AUDIBLE
- 8 RESPONSE).
- 9 MR. RYAN BREEDON: And was
- 10 Ms. Houghton working for you continuously from the
- 11 start of October 2011 into the following summer?
- MR. PAUL BONWICK: In a very limited
- 13 way. Ms. Houghton, I believe, for the months of --
- 14 and you'll have to ask her this to confirm -- so I
- 15 believe for the months of January and February or
- 16 February and March, Ms. Houghton was down south.
- 17 They rented their property, I think
- 18 typically, so it might have been February and March.
- 19 They rented their property typically, from what I know
- 20 now, January and -- December and January or January
- 21 and February.
- 22 My point is, she was down south at some
- 23 point between -- or over the winter season, so she
- 24 would have had limited interaction almost the entirety
- 25 of this work. And I would say the entirety of the

- 1 work that she provided was able to be done from home.
- 2 And so you're doing it on your laptop, or you're
- 3 running down to the post office, or it's email
- 4 transactions or transition -- or communications.
- 5 So I'm going to assume from
- 6 August 3rd -- and I shouldn't use that word. I'm
- 7 going to state the invoice that would have come in for
- 8 \$2,500, cheque number 2049, would have been a
- 9 cumulation of hours over two (2) or three (3) months
- 10 at least, maybe four (4).
- MR. RYAN BREEDON: Okay. And was she
- 12 doing the same sorts of things or --
- MR. PAUL BONWICK: Yes.
- 14 MR. RYAN BREEDON: -- had her services
- 15 changed?
- 16 MR. PAUL BONWICK: No. I mean,
- 17 Ms. Houghton -- as I'm sure she'll articulate -- her
- 18 strength or her background was administrative in
- 19 nature. She had spent a few years with the Catholic
- 20 School Board. Prior to that, she had worked as an
- 21 administrator providing administrative services for
- 22 LOF, which is a large glass -- windshield glass
- 23 manufacturer.
- 24 She was no longer employed or had gone
- 25 into retirement or semi-retirement at that point in

- 1 time. So her background was specific to
- 2 administrative tasks.
- MR. RYAN BREEDON: Now, just to unpack
- 4 what you had said a moment ago, do I understand your
- 5 evidence to be that for some point of time -- or for
- 6 some period of time during the winter months,
- 7 Ms. Houghton wasn't working for you because she was
- 8 off in Florida?
- 9 MR. PAUL BONWICK: It was -- it was
- 10 not as significant during the winter months. But
- 11 again, it's not significant in terms of any particular
- 12 time. It's obviously not a full-time position. But
- 13 there would have been less engagement. Certainly, you
- 14 couldn't ask her to take five hundred (500) envelopes
- 15 and run down to the post office if she's sitting in
- 16 Naples.
- 17 MR. RYAN BREEDON: Right. And do you
- 18 recall when Ms. Houghton was down in Naples during the
- 19 winter of 2011?
- 20 MR. PAUL BONWICK: I -- again, I think
- 21 it's January/February, but I'm not -- I'm not
- 22 100 percent positive. It could be -- it could be
- 23 December and January as well. I -- there was a
- 24 two (2) month window where they -- I think they used
- 25 it. She's going to have to provide that

- 1 clarification.
- 2 MR. RYAN BREEDON: Okay. But you
- 3 think your -- to the best of your recollection --
- 4 we'll ask her later this afternoon, I'm sure -- your
- 5 recollection is that she used the property or
- 6 Mr. Houghton and Ms. Houghton used the property either
- 7 December/January and January/February?
- 8 MR. PAUL BONWICK: I think there was a
- 9 60-day window where my -- I know that Mr. Houghton
- 10 would, where possible, fly back and forth and try to
- 11 grab long weekends or a week here and there.
- MR. RYAN BREEDON: Okay.
- MR. PAUL BONWICK: I think she stayed
- 14 most of the time.
- MR. RYAN BREEDON: Now, the -- we
- 16 touched on the October payment a moment ago, and
- 17 you've testified previously that some portion of that
- 18 was for rent for the Houghton's residence?
- MR. PAUL BONWICK: Correct.
- 20 MR. RYAN BREEDON: How much was rent?
- 21 MR. PAUL BONWICK: \$18,000.
- 22 MR. RYAN BREEDON: And what was the
- 23 period that you were renting the property for?
- 24 MR. PAUL BONWICK: And from what I
- 25 recall, it was -- from what I recall, it was

- 1 October/November. It may have -- I'm pretty it was --
- 2 it may have been November/December. It was -- it was
- 3 a two (2) month window in the off-season leading up,
- 4 and so I'm going to say November/December.
- 5 And then there was a two (2) month
- 6 period that it was available, and I'm going to say
- 7 that was April/May.
- 8 MR. RYAN BREEDON: The -- and I think
- 9 you testified yesterday that the reason that you were
- 10 renting the property is because you were doing some
- 11 business in Miami?
- 12 MR. PAUL BONWICK: That, and I
- 13 didn't -- I don't own a home in Florida. We were also
- 14 looking at a development or a housing opportunity in
- 15 Fort Myers. If you're familiar with the coast, Naples
- 16 is sort of just south of Fort Myers.
- 17 And I've rented traditionally up to
- 18 that point in time. The months that I would rent
- 19 would typically be peak season: January/February,
- 20 February/March. We would -- we would typically rent
- 21 for a 60-day period of time, and then it grew to
- 22 longer periods of time after that.
- 23 MR. RYAN BREEDON: So I'm not sure I
- 24 totally understand. So you had the business in Miami.
- 25 MR. PAUL BONWICK: We had a client in

- 1 Miami.
- 2 MR. RYAN BREEDON: Okay. And one of
- 3 the reasons that you were going to Florida was to be
- 4 able to deal with that client.
- 5 MR. PAUL BONWICK: No, not
- 6 specifically. I mean, I would have interaction with
- 7 them and meet with them from time to time. You would
- 8 drive down to Miami or -- typically drive down to
- 9 Miami if that was the case.
- I have the ability to the largest
- 11 extent to run the services I provide from email and
- 12 telephone, so I don't have a schedule of meetings
- 13 every day. So what I would always try to do is go
- 14 down and work out of Florida and work in the mornings
- 15 and, when possible, take the afternoons off.
- 16 MR. RYAN BREEDON: And then you say
- 17 that you were looking into an opportunity in
- 18 Fort Myers. Is that you were looking to buy a place
- 19 in Florida?
- MR. PAUL BONWICK: No, we weren't
- 21 looking to buy a place. A friend of mine who is down
- 22 on the south Florida region was looking at and did
- 23 develop a product that was a -- I'll call it an
- 24 affordable housing model. It was a free -- pre-
- 25 manufactured home.

```
1 For purposes of this discussion,
```

- 2 customer manufacturing -- or the -- the retail price
- 3 on the thing was somewhere around forty thousand
- 4 dollars (\$40,000). It was assembled onsite.
- 5 And so, the idea -- or the concept
- 6 behind this was -- and we brought one (1) of them into
- 7 Canada. We also were trying to put them into
- 8 indigenous communities, as well. But they had a
- 9 hurricane rating, and so we were trying to promote
- 10 them in the gulf region for the purposes of replacing
- 11 things like trailer homes and that kind of thing.
- 12 MR. RYAN BREEDON: Okay. Now, the --
- 13 the time that you were renting this, sort of either
- 14 October/November or November/December, the -- the
- 15 first --
- 16 MR. PAUL BONWICK: I think it was
- 17 November/December.
- 18 MR. RYAN BREEDON: -- the first period
- 19 --
- MR. PAUL BONWICK: Yes.
- 21 MR. RYAN BREEDON: -- and it's right
- 22 in sort of the wheelhouse of this RFP process,
- 23 correct?
- MR. PAUL BONWICK: Correct.
- MR. RYAN BREEDON: And how were you

- 1 planning on being in Florida given your ongoing
- 2 engagement with PowerStream?
- 3 MR. PAUL BONWICK: I think you've
- 4 heard me testify and you will see that a lot of my
- 5 stuff can be done via email and phone call. So, when
- 6 I'm down in Florida, I typically fly back -- will fly
- 7 back a couple of times a month, sometimes more than
- 8 that.
- 9 I've seen situations where I'll be home
- 10 for Monday, Tuesday, Wednesday, fly out Thursday
- 11 afternoon, come home Sunday night.
- MR. RYAN BREEDON: Did you ever -- did
- 13 you actually go down to Mr. Houghton's --
- MR. PAUL BONWICK: Yes.
- 15 MR. RYAN BREEDON: -- house during
- 16 this period?
- MR. PAUL BONWICK: Yes.
- MR. RYAN BREEDON: How many days were
- 19 you in Florida during the November/December period?
- 20 MR. PAUL BONWICK: I don't recall the
- 21 exact number of days. I recall being there on two (2)
- 22 occasions. I recall calling Shirley from the house
- 23 one (1) time and looking for some direction on stuff
- 24 inside.
- 25 Unfortunately, the situation did not

- 1 transpire the way I hoped. I think you're getting a -
- 2 in terms of, if I think there's an opportunity or
- 3 see an opportunity, I try to grab a hold of it. I've
- 4 done that in a number of different areas.
- 5 I thought that the housing initiative,
- 6 while good for Florida, but -- and partnering with
- 7 Leonard (phonetic) on it, if we were going to do that,
- 8 also presented great opportunity in Canada, as well.
- 9 And so, I was certainly interested in
- 10 exploring the options in Florida, as well.
- MR. RYAN BREEDON: So, my question was
- 12 just, how many days were you actually in Florida?
- 13 MR. PAUL BONWICK: I don't recall the
- 14 number of days. I know I was there twice in the fall.
- MR. RYAN BREEDON: And how long were
- 16 you there for approximately when you went on those two
- 17 (2) occasions?
- 18 MR. PAUL BONWICK: If -- it was a
- 19 short period of time, down for three (3) days, four
- 20 (4) days or less, and back.
- 21 MR. RYAN BREEDON: All right, on both
- 22 occasions?
- 23 MR. PAUL BONWICK: On both occasions.
- 24 I may have stayed a little longer on one (1) because I
- 25 do recall doing some golfing, but...

- 1 MR. RYAN BREEDON: What about in the
- 2 spring?
- 3 MR. PAUL BONWICK: I don't know if I
- 4 went in the spring. I don't recall going in the
- 5 spring. I recall having a discussion with Mr.
- 6 Houghton the late winter saying that this wasn't
- 7 working out the way I wanted it to or was hoping to
- 8 and wasn't utilizing the place as much as I would have
- 9 liked to, would be considering reimbursing some of the
- 10 money.
- 11 MR. RYAN BREEDON: Right. And he -- I
- 12 think we heard he directed you to Shirley and --
- MR. PAUL BONWICK: Suggested that I
- 14 speak to Shirley. And I could give you an example
- 15 whereby when I left Ottawa, I continued to keep a
- 16 place in Ottawa, for example, for a number of months
- 17 and finally gave up the rental on that place, as well,
- 18 for the simple reason that I wasn't using it.
- 19 MR. RYAN BREEDON: I take it Shirley
- 20 did not give you a refund for any of the rent that you
- 21 had paid?
- MR. PAUL BONWICK: I didn't ask her.
- MR. RYAN BREEDON: Okay. Let's talk
- 24 about the confidential information. You heard a lot
- 25 of evidence and we've talked about confidential

- 1 information probably every day of this hearing and --
- 2 and, in particular, information which you were passing
- 3 to PowerStream.
- And I -- I take it that PowerStream
- 5 never told you to stop giving them confidential
- 6 information?
- 7 MR. PAUL BONWICK: Thanks for the
- 8 question. I think it's been demonstrated by -- or
- 9 conveyed by other witnesses.
- 10 MR. RYAN BREEDON: Well, we've heard
- 11 what PowerStream had to say.
- 12 MR. PAUL BONWICK: So, at no time --
- 13 at no time was I advised that any of the information
- 14 that I was providing in terms of emails or briefings -
- 15 there was no issue raised ever on it.
- 16 MR. RYAN BREEDON: Right. They never
- 17 said, Mr. Bonwick, stop providing this information to
- 18 us --
- MR. PAUL BONWICK: Correct.
- 20 MR. RYAN BREEDON: -- or stop
- 21 obtaining this information?
- MR. PAUL BONWICK: Or where did you
- 23 get that information.
- MR. RYAN BREEDON: Right.
- MR. PAUL BONWICK: If I may --

- 1 MR. RYAN BREEDON: No, no. Just
- 2 answer -- just answer my questions. You get to make a
- 3 --
- 4 MR. PAUL BONWICK: Okay.
- 5 MR. RYAN BREEDON: -- speech at the
- 6 end, I -- I think, so --
- 7 MR. PAUL BONWICK: Well, not a speech,
- 8 but, yes.
- 9 MR. RYAN BREEDON: -- you can -- if
- 10 you want to --
- MR. PAUL BONWICK: Okay.
- 12 MR. RYAN BREEDON: -- add other
- 13 things.
- 14 THE HONOURABLE FRANK MARROCCO: But --
- 15 but if -- if -- not if you're going off on a tangent.
- 16 But if you're completing an answer, then you can
- 17 complete your answer.
- 18 MR. PAUL BONWICK: I'll deal with it
- 19 later, Your Honour. I -- I think I answered.
- 20 THE HONOURABLE FRANK MARROCCO: And --
- 21 and you -- the idea would be -- sorry to interrupt,
- 22 but the idea would be that, at the conclusion of the
- 23 questioning, with the exception of the concluding
- 24 examination, anything which you think is con -- has
- 25 been confused, you can clear it up by way of a

- 1 statement to -- and -- and so, I -- I don't want to
- 2 get into it any further than that right now, but that
- 3 would be the opportunity to clear up anything that you
- 4 think has become confused during the course of the
- 5 examination or cross-examinations.
- 6 MR. PAUL BONWICK: Thank you, Your
- 7 Honour. And I'll ask -- I'll -- I'll seek some --
- 8 some clarification on that point --
- 9 THE HONOURABLE FRANK MARROCCO: Well,
- 10 we can do it just before lunch for the clarification
- 11 purpose.
- MR. PAUL BONWICK: Yes. Thank you.
- 13 THE HONOURABLE FRANK MARROCCO: Sorry,
- 14 Mr. Breedon.
- MR. RYAN BREEDON: Oh, thank you, Your
- 16 Honour.

- 18 CONTINUED BY MR. RYAN BREEDON:
- 19 MR. RYAN BREEDON: And -- and the --
- 20 the service that you were providing PowerStream, we
- 21 don't need to go the retainer agreement again, but,
- 22 you know, it's -- number 1, you gave them some advice
- 23 on communication strategy?
- MR. PAUL BONWICK: Correct.
- MR. RYAN BREEDON: I mean, that was a

- 1 thing that you knew about and you were able to give
- 2 them advice about that?
- MR. PAUL BONWICK: Correct.
- 4 MR. RYAN BREEDON: And, in particular,
- 5 communication strategy as it related to this area?
- 6 MR. PAUL BONWICK: Correct. I would
- 7 refer to it as a rural or regional communication
- 8 strategy.
- 9 MR. RYAN BREEDON: Right. I mean, the
- 10 idea is that you know this community, and so you were
- 11 able to tell PowerStream what sort of communications
- 12 would likely play well in this community?
- MR. PAUL BONWICK: I think that's
- 14 reasonable.
- MR. RYAN BREEDON: I mean, that's one
- 16 (1) of the services that you're providing --
- 17 MR. PAUL BONWICK: Correct.
- 18 MR. RYAN BREEDON: -- why -- why they
- 19 would get you to do -- to provide communications
- 20 advice as opposed to some PR person in Toronto?
- MR. PAUL BONWICK: In Toronto,
- 22 correct.
- MR. RYAN BREEDON: Okay. And
- 24 similarly, you were providing PowerStream with local
- 25 intelligence?

- 1 MR. PAUL BONWICK: Fair statement.
- 2 MR. RYAN BREEDON: All right. And --
- 3 and, lastly, access to key decision makers?
- 4 MR. PAUL BONWICK: Fair enough.
- 5 MR. RYAN BREEDON: Right. I mean,
- 6 that -- you were particularly well connected, and --
- 7 and that was the advantage that you were bringing to
- 8 PowerStream in respect of this transaction?
- 9 MR. PAUL BONWICK: It was one (1) of
- 10 the advantages.
- MR. RYAN BREEDON: Right. I don't
- 12 mean to -- I don't want to sound like I'm trying to
- 13 sell you short, but --
- MR. PAUL BONWICK: No.
- MR. RYAN BREEDON: -- but certainly,
- 16 that was -- that -- that puts Mr. Bonwick in a
- 17 different category than other consultants who might be
- 18 --
- 19 MR. PAUL BONWICK: -- indeed.
- 20 MR. RYAN BREEDON: -- in the
- 21 marketplace, right?
- MR. PAUL BONWICK: Fair enough.
- MR. RYAN BREEDON: Okay. And the --
- 24 and the key decision makers in this case of course
- 25 include your sister, right?

- 1 MR. PAUL BONWICK: But I think
- 2 testimony in evidence has shown that in fact that
- 3 wasn't the one (1) decision maker that I was trying to
- 4 access.
- 5 MR. RYAN BREEDON: No, no. But -- but
- 6 one (1) of the things that you were able to do was
- 7 pick up the phone and communicate with your sister if
- 8 need be in a way that other consultants might not be
- 9 able to?
- 10 MR. PAUL BONWICK: I don't know that
- 11 that's the case. I -- and, in fairness, singling out
- 12 my sister, I think I've gone through the list, I had
- 13 the ability to pick up the phone and call just about
- 14 any one (1) of them.
- MR. RYAN BREEDON: Okay. Right,
- 16 because -- because, again, of your connection to the
- 17 community, right?
- 18 MR. PAUL BONWICK: (NO AUDIBLE
- 19 RESPONSE).
- 20 MR. RYAN BREEDON: And -- and we know
- 21 that you were close family friends with Mr. Lloyd?
- MR. PAUL BONWICK: Correct.
- MR. RYAN BREEDON: He -- he talked
- 24 about your families have a long history together, I
- 25 think?

```
1 MR. PAUL BONWICK: Yes.
```

- 2 MR. RYAN BREEDON: Is that -- that's
- 3 fair? And -- and even on your evidence today you
- 4 obviously socialize with Mr. Lloyd regularly?
- 5 MR. PAUL BONWICK: Yes.
- 6 MR. RYAN BREEDON: Okay. And -- and
- 7 you were good friends with Mr. Houghton?
- MR. PAUL BONWICK: Yes.

9

10 (BRIEF PAUSE)

- MR. RYAN BREEDON: And those were all
- 13 assets that you were able to sell to PowerStream, and
- 14 that's why they were paying you.
- 15 MR. PAUL BONWICK: I don't know that
- 16 it was specific to those three (3). I -- as I've
- 17 stated, I think it was based on the fact that I did
- 18 have extensive network and relationships that had been
- 19 built over many years, based on my service in
- 20 Parliament, based on my business over the course of
- 21 the years following, my time on Council.
- 22 And so I think it was certainly what I
- 23 tried to promote was that I have a trusted and
- 24 engaging relationship with most of the politicians,
- 25 most of the senior staff, as well as many profile

- 1 people within the community.
- MR. RYAN BREEDON: Okay. Now, to turn
- 3 then to the information that you were providing to
- 4 PowerStream -- we can go through it all in detail if
- 5 you like -- but after having sat here for however many
- 6 weeks we've been here, I think you'll agree with me
- 7 that they should not have been providing you with that
- 8 information.
- 9 MR. PAUL BONWICK: I don't know that I
- 10 would agree with that. I would say that based on what
- 11 I've heard during the time of this Inquiry, you're
- 12 looking through a very different lens.
- 13 At no time did anybody share
- 14 information with me through any of our discussions and
- 15 say, oh, by the way, this is embargoed, or this is
- 16 privileged, or please don't share this with anybody.
- 17 I think we've heard lots of evidence
- 18 that throughout these -- these Strategic Task Team
- 19 meetings that there didn't appear to be a
- 20 significant -- in my opinion significant enough
- 21 education for the participants to understand the
- 22 importance of not talking about anything.
- 23 And so you go back in time and try to
- 24 look through that lens, the information that was
- 25 shared with me, understanding the environment, seemed

- 1 reasonable at that time for me. And I can say -- and
- 2 you've heard it -- there's not been -- none of the
- 3 other firms on this particular file engaged somebody
- 4 or hired a consultant to work with the various
- 5 stakeholders.
- 6 MR. RYAN BREEDON: So what -- and
- 7 again, I do not want to put words in your mouth, but I
- 8 think what you're saying is that, setting aside what
- 9 you may believe now from having listened to all this
- 10 evidence, back in 2010 and 2011 -- and particularly in
- 11 2011, you didn't appreciate that the information that
- 12 was being conveyed to you by different sources might
- 13 be confidential or the sort of thing that shouldn't be
- 14 said to you. Is that fair?
- 15 MR. PAUL BONWICK: That's fair.
- 16 MR. RYAN BREEDON: Okay. And you
- 17 didn't appreciate that because nobody said to you,
- 18 this is confidential.
- 19 MR. PAUL BONWICK: So I think we've
- 20 heard two (2) pieces of information that are quite
- 21 relevant to what you're asking. The first one is
- 22 nobody that has been on the stand and questioned about
- 23 it -- and I certainly brought it to the floor -- is,
- 24 did you at any time when you were having a discussion
- 25 with Mr. Bonwick state please, do not disseminate or

- 1 please don't share anything that I'm talking to you
- 2 about.
- 3 We've also heard the fact that
- 4 PowerStream team members have suggested that they
- 5 didn't qualify it as they were getting information,
- 6 and it wasn't one time, keeping in mind we got to --
- 7 irregular. But there was information sharing on a
- 8 irregular basis, whether it be through mostly email or
- 9 phone call but the odd meeting.
- I think it's also important to reflect
- 11 on the fact now that I -- as I sit down through the
- 12 past number of weeks, it's come to my attention that
- 13 there was a NDA signed by PowerStream. I had never
- 14 seen a copy of that. I have never been referenced to
- 15 that.
- 16 And so for that purpose, there would be
- 17 no reason to me -- for me to think that the
- 18 information that I'm trying to get to help better
- 19 position my client is anything other than information
- 20 that will help better position my client.
- 21 MR. RYAN BREEDON: Okay. So I don't
- 22 need you to tell me about what the witnesses have
- 23 testified. Right? I mean, that -- we all were here.
- 24 So we have the transcripts. That's fine. And you'll
- 25 get to make your argument at the end of the case.

- All I want to know is what was in your
- 2 head back in 2011 when you're receiving this
- 3 information from people? And do I take it that what
- 4 you're saying is that you didn't think that this
- 5 information was confidential because nobody told you
- 6 it was confidential?
- 7 MR. PAUL BONWICK: So you're asking a
- 8 question, and then you're providing the answer and
- 9 asking if I will agree with it?
- 10 MR. RYAN BREEDON: Yes. That's how
- 11 this works.
- MR. PAUL BONWICK: Well, I thought as
- 13 an Inquiry, you would ask the question and try to get
- 14 a fulsome perspective on the person sitting there,
- 15 rather than condense it into your words.
- MR. RYAN BREEDON: Do you agree with
- 17 what I've said or not?
- 18 MR. PAUL BONWICK: It is my opinion
- 19 then that the information that was being shared with
- 20 me was done so based on me reaching out and trying to
- 21 have conversations and that it was not of a
- 22 confidential nature.
- MR. RYAN BREEDON: Okay. So you
- 24 didn't think that the information that you were
- 25 receiving was confidential back -- back in 2011.

- 1 MR. PAUL BONWICK: Correct.
- MR. RYAN BREEDON: Okay. And when --
- 3 you've testified that after you sent that September
- 4 memo -- the one that deals with Hydro One and
- 5 Veridian. We've seen it probably every day of this
- 6 hearing. You sent that to Mr. Houghton for a comment,
- 7 right?
- MR. PAUL BONWICK: Yes.
- 9 MR. RYAN BREEDON: And then
- 10 Mr. Houghton raised some concerns with you about that
- 11 memo?
- 12 MR. PAUL BONWICK: Very shortly
- 13 thereafter.
- 14 MR. RYAN BREEDON: Right. And I think
- 15 you've testified that you then did not, to the best of
- 16 your recollection, send the memo on to PowerStream?
- MR. PAUL BONWICK: Correct.
- 18 MR. RYAN BREEDON: But -- but you told
- 19 us yesterday that the information contained in the
- 20 memo probably was conveyed to PowerStream?
- 21 MR. PAUL BONWICK: No, not all of it.
- 22 I think what I tried to do is demonstrate the same
- 23 thing His Honour did a number of days ago. You can't
- 24 unread something. You can't unhear something.
- 25 And so in the general discussions

- 1 surrounding what things would provide advantages, I'm
- 2 reasonably confident that I would have brought that up
- 3 again through the round table that would take place.
- 4 MR. RYAN BREEDON: All right. So
- 5 certainly, some of the information contained in the
- 6 memo you believe you conveyed to the people at
- 7 PowerStream.
- MR. PAUL BONWICK: Correct.
- 9 MR. RYAN BREEDON: And -- and you just
- 10 don't recall whether it was all of it or some of it
- 11 or...
- 12 MR. PAUL BONWICK: I don't recall
- 13 giving all of the information to PowerStream.
- MR. RYAN BREEDON: Okay. Now, when
- 15 Mr. Houghton raised this with you in -- it would be in
- 16 September I take it?
- MR. PAUL BONWICK: Yes.
- 18 MR. RYAN BREEDON: Okay. Did he -- I
- 19 understand his evidence is that he did not ask you
- 20 where you got the information from?
- 21 MR. PAUL BONWICK: I thought he did.
- 22 I don't recall word for word how the call went, but I
- 23 know he called me as soon as he reviewed it. I think,
- 24 in my opinion from what I recall, he did ask about it.
- MR. RYAN BREEDON: Okay. So stop

- 1 there. So you -- your recollection sitting here today
- 2 is that when you had this discussion with
- 3 Mr. Houghton, he asked you, where did you get this
- 4 information from?
- 5 MR. PAUL BONWICK: That's my
- 6 understanding.
- 7 MR. RYAN BREEDON: Okay. And what did
- 8 you tell him?
- 9 MR. PAUL BONWICK: Multiple sources.
- 10 I said to him -- and again, I'm reflecting on the
- 11 conversation eight (8) years ago -- I said, Ed, you'll
- 12 understand, of course, how I will approach people.
- I mean, I could pick up the phone and
- 14 go, how was the Task Team meeting, if you knew one was
- 15 happening the day before. Or if you had an
- 16 understanding that PowerStream had just finished, and
- 17 you would pick up the phone and go, how did they --
- 18 how did PowerStream make out? And you might get
- 19 information.
- I had conversations with
- 21 Deputy Mayor Lloyd. I don't recall getting this
- 22 information specifically from him. I would pick up
- 23 the phone and query Ed on -- he was sensitive to
- 24 sharing anything that he felt was confidential, but
- 25 again, there was back and forth.

- I had the meeting with Mr. Muncaster,
- 2 and if you'll recall in my testimony, I had said to
- 3 Mr. Houghton when he said, I'm going to have to share
- 4 this -- or I want to share with Mr. Muncaster -- and I
- 5 should also state when I recall the conversation,
- 6 Houghton didn't raise issues about commercially
- 7 sensitive -- that kind of language wasn't used. It
- 8 was just, where are you getting this information from?
- 9 I said, multiple sources, having conversations with
- 10 people that are involved.
- 11 He then said -- it was important enough
- 12 to him. He said I'm going to have to provide a copy
- 13 to the Board chair, and I kind of chuckled and said,
- 14 okay, that's fine. I said, it'd be interesting to see
- 15 how he responds, knowing that I met with him.
- 16 MR. RYAN BREEDON: Okay. So -- well,
- 17 a couple of things. So just on that very last point,
- 18 so do you believe then that your meeting with
- 19 Mr. Muncaster happened before this discussion with
- 20 Mr. Houghton?
- MR. PAUL BONWICK: Yes.
- MR. RYAN BREEDON: And did it happen
- 23 before or after the meeting with Hydro One and
- 24 Veridian that is set out in that memo?
- 25 MR. PAUL BONWICK: That I don't

- 1 recall.
- MR. RYAN BREEDON: Okay. And then the
- 3 meeting though with Mr. Muncaster that you're talking
- 4 about is the one at Collus?
- 5 MR. PAUL BONWICK: Correct.
- 6 MR. RYAN BREEDON: All right. Now, I
- 7 had asked you what you told Mr. Houghton about the
- 8 source of the information that, you know, was
- 9 contained in the memo.
- MR. PAUL BONWICK: Right.
- 11 MR. RYAN BREEDON: And I -- and then
- 12 you've given me an explanation and discussed some of
- 13 the different people who you were speaking with,
- 14 right?
- MR. PAUL BONWICK: Correct.
- MR. RYAN BREEDON: What I want to know
- 17 though, is what did you actually tell Mr. Houghton at
- 18 that time?
- 19 Like, did you say to him I have been
- 20 speaking to a bunch of different people and leave it
- 21 at that, or did you say to him well, Mr. Houghton, I
- 22 got the information from Mr. Lloyd and I got it from
- 23 discussions with you and I got it from Mr. Muncaster?
- MR. PAUL BONWICK: No, I did not say
- 25 that.

1 MR. RYAN BREEDON: Okay, so you just

- 2 told him you'd been having discussions with different
- 3 people?
- 4 MR. PAUL BONWICK: Correct.
- 5 MR. RYAN BREEDON: Okay. Did Mr.
- 6 Houghton ask you who were those people?
- 7 MR. PAUL BONWICK: No.
- 8 MR. RYAN BREEDON: Now, do I take it
- 9 though, based on the evidence that you've just given,
- 10 that the -- your belief is that the source of the
- 11 information contained in that September memo is Mr.
- 12 Lloyd, Mr. Houghton, and Mr. Muncaster?
- MR. PAUL BONWICK: I can't say it's
- 14 specifically limited to them. I wasn't in
- 15 conversation with anybody else on the task team.
- So for the information that reflects on
- 17 any discussions that took place within the task team,
- 18 it would have had to have come from one of those three
- 19 sources.
- MR. RYAN BREEDON: Okay.
- 21 MR. PAUL BONWICK: And I've spoke to
- 22 you about -- there's also other sources that I
- 23 utilized in order to try to build the background case
- 24 on it.
- MR. RYAN BREEDON: Right, but the --

- 1 but the memo -- and we can turn it up although I'm
- 2 sure you remember it very well now, the memo talks
- 3 about what the presentations were that were made to
- 4 the strategic task team, right?
- 5 MR. PAUL BONWICK: It describes in
- 6 part the presentations and I've filled in some blanks
- 7 because it's me putting together the information.
- 8 So where I might have had comments
- 9 about Hydro One, for example, if we could use them as
- 10 the example, there may have been some information
- 11 shared that was specific to the presentation and then
- 12 I would build that narrative into a here's what's --
- 13 here's what they're doing.
- 14 MR. RYAN BREEDON: Okay, so why don't
- 15 we just pull it up, make it easier. It's TOC59013.
- 16 So this is the September 14th memo and
- 17 as you'll recall, the first section deals with Hydro
- 18 One, right?
- MR. PAUL BONWICK: Correct.
- 20 MR. RYAN BREEDON: Scroll down so we
- 21 can see it, please. All right.
- 22 And so what you have recorded is,
- 23 first, that Hydro One was articulating the regional
- 24 value that Collus had that it could be used as a
- 25 regional hub, right?

- 1 MR. PAUL BONWICK: Correct.
- MR. RYAN BREEDON: Okay, and so what
- 3 you're reporting to PowerStream in this memo, even
- 4 though it wasn't given to them in this form, was that
- 5 what Hydro One has presented to the STT was that
- 6 Collus would be this regional hub, that that was their
- 7 approach.
- 8 MR. PAUL BONWICK: That was the
- 9 information that I put in this memo, correct.
- 10 MR. RYAN BREEDON: Okay. And that was
- 11 information that you obtained from somebody on the
- 12 Strategic Task Team?
- MR. PAUL BONWICK: Possibly.
- 14 MR. RYAN BREEDON: Well, only somebody
- 15 on the Strategic --
- 16 MR. PAUL BONWICK: I'm gonna -- yes.
- 17 Yes.
- 18 MR. RYAN BREEDON: We can't talk over.
- 19 Only somebody on the Strategic Task
- 20 Team could know what Hydro One had said in this
- 21 meeting?
- MR. PAUL BONWICK: Sorry. I said yes.
- MR. RYAN BREEDON: Yes. Okay.
- 24 And do you know who told you that?
- MR. PAUL BONWICK: No.

- 1 MR. RYAN BREEDON: But your evidence
- 2 is it's one of those three individuals?
- MR. PAUL BONWICK: Those were the only
- 4 three task team members that I spoke with.
- 5 MR. RYAN BREEDON: And then similarly,
- 6 the next point is -- again, deals with what Hydro One
- 7 was proposing with respect to the existing staff?
- MR. PAUL BONWICK: Corr -- that's what
- 9 the memo says, correct.
- 10 MR. RYAN BREEDON: Right. And again,
- 11 that's something that had to come from one (1) of
- 12 those three (3) individuals?
- MR. PAUL BONWICK: And in fairness,
- 14 from my end, part of the information could have come
- 15 from one, part of it could have come from others.
- 16 These were flowing conversations, I was reaching out
- 17 on a regular basis to try to find out what was going
- 18 on and where the competitors stood.
- 19 MR. RYAN BREEDON: I -- I understand.
- 20 You didn't -- you didn't get a bullet point memo from
- 21 Mr. Lloyd with this entire thing, you -- you've put
- 22 this together based on your discussions.
- 23 MR. PAUL BONWICK: Correct. Mr.
- 24 Muncaster didn't send me an email that says here's
- 25 what's happening.

- 1 MR. RYAN BREEDON: Right.
- MR. PAUL BONWICK: Or Mr. Houghton.
- 3 MR. RYAN BREEDON: Right.
- 4 And then -- and then the next point,
- 5 again, deals with the -- the way that Hydro One was
- 6 sort of pitching itself or -- or it's proposal?
- 7 MR. PAUL BONWICK: So again, it would
- 8 have been in my words. I mean, when Mr. Houghton
- 9 reviewed it he took exception and said that some of
- 10 these things were not accurate.
- 11 So again, through conversation I would
- 12 take a point or two and go here's what I believe they
- 13 communicated took place at the meeting and bring to
- 14 him my misinterpreted some of it.
- MR. RYAN BREEDON: And then you've got
- 16 a quote, it says "model would help to solidify Hydro
- 17 One's position in the region", do you see that?
- MR. PAUL BONWICK: Right.
- 19 MR. RYAN BREEDON: And that -- that is
- 20 a quote or at least a paraphrase of something which
- 21 you understood that Mr. Mueller had said to the
- 22 Strategic Task Team?
- 23 MR. PAUL BONWICK: I'm not sure if
- 24 that's my quote of if that's something, you know,
- 25 you're -- you're asking me to reflect on what I was

- 1 thinking eight (8) years go when I wrote the memo.
- 2 It could be my quote or it could have
- 3 been you need to understand that Hydro One is trying
- 4 to solidify its position within the region.
- 5 MR. RYAN BREEDON: Okay. And then you
- 6 go on to discuss how the members of the Strategic Task
- 7 Team responded to the presentation in the last bullet
- 8 on this page?
- 9 MR. PAUL BONWICK: Absolutely, and I
- 10 may have been overstepping there, because obviously I
- 11 wasn't speaking to all the members of the Strategic
- 12 Task Team, but if somebody shared with me, I think
- 13 generally speaking that people were impressed with the
- 14 presentation.
- MR. RYAN BREEDON: Okay.
- 16 MR. PAUL BONWICK: That would be
- 17 something that I would put in and those would be --
- 18 MR. RYAN BREEDON: So all -- all of
- 19 this information is based on your understanding of
- 20 what these three individuals were telling you?
- 21 MR. PAUL BONWICK: This is my -- this
- 22 is a summation of what information I received and the
- 23 putting it into a memo format to brief my client.
- 24 MR. RYAN BREEDON: None of it came
- 25 from internet research or -- or --

```
1 MR. PAUL BONWICK: It's entirely
```

- 2 possible, because when you get some information it --
- 3 it could be shared in a fairly light fashion, like for
- 4 example -- where am I here? I may have put the last
- 5 point in there, while they -- they demonstrated some
- 6 integrity if -- if it was communicated to me that
- 7 generally speaking people were pleased with the
- 8 presentation or they seemed to do a good job at the
- 9 presentation.
- I may have done some background work
- 11 and went -- but the committee is not enamoured with
- 12 the -- because that was the general assertion with the
- 13 concept or direction of a Hydro One.
- 14 MR. RYAN BREEDON: I see. So you're
- 15 saying that you may have been told that the committee
- 16 wasn't enamoured with the --
- 17 MR. PAUL BONWICK: Or I may have
- 18 extrapolated that based on information that was
- 19 completely unrelated to it.
- 20 My point being this isn't meant to be
- 21 minutes from the meeting.
- MR. RYAN BREEDON: Right.
- 23 MR. PAUL BONWICK: You're going to get
- 24 some information that took place in the meeting and
- 25 you're going to do some background -- again, it was

- 1 reasonably well understood that Hydro One had an
- 2 uphill battle.
- 3 MR. RYAN BREEDON: Right.
- 4 MR. PAUL BONWICK: I could -- I could
- 5 put my own opinion in there and say --
- 6 MR. RYAN BREEDON: Well, but hold on.
- 7 So -- so, you couldn't go on the
- 8 internet and determine whether Mr. Mueller had
- 9 demonstrated integrity and in-depth knowledge of the
- 10 industry in his presentation to the STT?
- 11 MR. PAUL BONWICK: I was later
- 12 informed that Mr. Mueller actually didn't even make
- 13 the presentation. He was rather there in support of
- 14 it.
- That being said, what I'm talking about
- 16 is the committee is not enamoured with the concept or
- 17 direction Hydro One presented.
- 18 And so that could be something that I
- 19 would have from a takeaway from other discussions of
- 20 having a sense of where other people are as it's
- 21 specific to Hydro One.
- MR. RYAN BREEDON: Right, based on
- 23 your discussions with the people who are actually in
- 24 the room?
- MR. PAUL BONWICK: And beyond.

- 1 MR. RYAN BREEDON: Right.
- 2 And we can go through the much longer
- 3 section on Veridian, but maybe we can save us all a
- 4 bit of time.
- 5 It's the same thing, right? You've
- 6 taken the information from these members of the
- 7 Strategic Task Team, put your spin on it, and -- and
- 8 recorded as best as you understood it?
- 9 MR. PAUL BONWICK: Accurate statement.
- 10 MR. RYAN BREEDON: Okay. We agree on
- 11 something.
- MR. PAUL BONWICK: Anything.
- MR. RYAN BREEDON: Your Honor, it's
- 14 12:30. I'm happy to press on. I have so --
- 15 THE HONOURABLE FRANK MARROCCO: How
- 16 much longer will you be?
- 17
- 18 (BRIEF PAUSE)
- 19
- MR. RYAN BREEDON: Maybe half an hour.
- 21 THE HONOURABLE FRANK MARROCCO: Well,
- 22 why don't we press on for another fifteen (15) minutes
- 23 or so, around a quarter to 1:00, and then we'll break
- 24 for lunch. You never can tell. You might get closer
- 25 to the end than you think.

- 2 CONTINUED BY MR. RYAN BREEDON:
- 3 MR. RYAN BREEDON: Correct. Okay.
- 4 Now, Mr. Lloyd, of course, testified that he did not
- 5 provide you with any of the information from the
- 6 Strategic Task Team, you -- meetings.
- 7 Do you recall that?
- MR. PAUL BONWICK: Yes.
- 9 MR. RYAN BREEDON: All right. And --
- 10 and Mr. Houghton, I think, testified to -- to the same
- 11 effect, that he didn't provide you with any of the
- 12 information from the Strategic Task Team meetings?
- MR. PAUL BONWICK: Yes.
- 14 MR. RYAN BREEDON: And so it -- do I
- 15 take it that your evidence is that although they
- 16 provided you with information, they were unaware that
- 17 they were doing so?
- 18 MR. PAUL BONWICK: I don't know that -
- 19 that -- if they put enough emphasis on the
- 20 importance of the information they were sharing, and
- 21 so it didn't reflect on them. I'm not psychic, and so
- 22 I've -- obviously, didn't somehow come into this
- 23 without information being shared through a
- 24 conversation, and so it -- it had -- had to be.
- 25 Common sense dictates that, in my opinion.

1 MR. RYAN BREEDON: All right. So what

- 2 you're saying is I -- and again, I -- I don't want to
- 3 put words in your mouth, but what you're saying is you
- 4 didn't sit down with Mr. Houghton, and he said, Okay
- 5 Paul, here's what happened, first they said this, and
- 6 then they said this, and they said that. That -- that
- 7 kind of conversation didn't happen?
- MR. PAUL BONWICK: Correct.
- 9 MR. RYAN BREEDON: Right? But what
- 10 they did do in your discussions is either share or let
- 11 drop details from which you were then able to piece
- 12 together what was going on?
- MR. PAUL BONWICK: Correct.
- 14 MR. RYAN BREEDON: Is that -- is that
- 15 a fair characterization of what was happening?
- MR. PAUL BONWICK: Correct.
- 17 MR. RYAN BREEDON: Okay. And of
- 18 course, Mr. Muncaster is the one (1) member of the
- 19 Strategic Task Team who can't come and testify, but do
- 20 I understand that what you're saying is that he did
- 21 sort of the same kind of thing?
- MR. PAUL BONWICK: From what I recall
- 23 of the meeting, as I've testified earlier, it was what
- 24 -- my takeaway from the meeting -- my takeaway from
- 25 the meeting was that Mr. Muncaster had a strong level

- 1 of confidence or belief that PowerStream was a good
- 2 choice. There was conversation back and forth, and so
- 3 most definitely, I would have been poking and prodding
- 4 about, you know, is there things they could do better?
- 5 Is there one (1) particular example where one (1) of
- 6 the other LDCs had done something that maybe
- 7 PowerStream hasn't?
- 8 It's those kinds of conversations. And
- 9 when -- it's not overly difficult to get people to
- 10 share information when they already have a preference
- 11 in a certain direction.
- 12 MR. RYAN BREEDON: So then did --
- 13 based on what the --
- 14 MR. PAUL BONWICK: And that applies to
- 15 all -- sorry for interrupting, but that applies to
- 16 anybody that I spoke with.
- 17 MR. RYAN BREEDON: Right. And so
- 18 based on what you just said, then, do -- do you -- do
- 19 I take it that your discussion with Mr. Muncaster
- 20 likely happened after the PowerStream presentation?
- 21 MR. PAUL BONWICK: Again, I -- I don't
- 22 recall when the meeting with Mr. Muncaster took place.
- 23 MR. RYAN BREEDON: Well, it -- it --
- 24 so what do you remember Mr. Muncaster actually telling
- 25 you?

- 1 MR. PAUL BONWICK: Verbatim? I can't
- 2 recall. Again, it's -- it's eight and a half (8 1/2)
- 3 years ago. I just remember taking away a feeling at
- 4 that time that PowerStream was being viewed in a much
- 5 more favourable light than the other bidders.
- I think I took away that Mr. Muncaster
- 7 felt that this would provide -- this had the ability
- 8 to provide a great partnership, or we've heard
- 9 strategic alliance since then.
- 10 And out of that, I know I would have --
- 11 because I ask everybody when they were involved in
- 12 this, you know, is there something we should be doing
- 13 differently? Is there something we should be doing
- 14 better? Is there something that sticks in your mind
- 15 that Coll -- or that PowerStream could do that would
- 16 help them do a better job at presenting themselves to
- 17 Collus?
- 18 And so that's the kind of format that I
- 19 would try to follow.
- 20 MR. RYAN BREEDON: Right. And so do
- 21 you recall discussing anything other than sort of
- 22 PowerStream's approach with Mr. Muncaster?
- 23 MR. PAUL BONWICK: Yes. But I -- and
- 24 again, I -- I want to make sure what I say is
- 25 accurate. Like, I would have -- how I would generally

- 1 conduct a conversation is I think Hydro One is up
- 2 against it. Certainly, based on all the feedback that
- 3 I get, that would be how I would approach Mr.
- 4 Muncaster, or Mr. Lloyd, or Mr. Houghton, for that
- 5 matter.
- 6 You might say -- I agree. I -- I think
- 7 the committee is -- is adverse -- or the community is
- 8 adverse to PowerStream. There's a mental note for me.
- 9 You know, you could get -- and I -- and I'm
- 10 speculating, because I'm -- I don't recall the exact
- 11 conversation, but it -- I -- I believe -- I'm not
- 12 positive, but I believe out of that meeting, I did
- 13 have one (1) takeaway with regards to a -- a community
- 14 fund. I -- I think that came out of that meeting, but
- 15 I'm not positive.
- Again, I just -- you're having
- 17 conversations with several different people.
- 18 MR. RYAN BREEDON: Okay. And the
- 19 community fund was the thing that was proposed by
- 20 Veridian?
- 21 MR. PAUL BONWICK: It was by one (1)
- 22 of them, one (1) of the bidders, and my point in
- 23 saying that is that there is no possible way that I
- 24 could have invented, in my own mind, that Veridian is
- 25 prepared to do specifically this.

- 1 MR. RYAN BREEDON: Right.
- MR. PAUL BONWICK: I mean, and I --
- 3 that had to be said to me, because that's, from what I
- 4 understand, may have been exactly what they presented.
- 5 MR. RYAN BREEDON: Right. And -- and
- 6 so what I'm trying to understand -- what we've been
- 7 here for weeks trying to understand is where this
- 8 information came from. So are you telling me that you
- 9 believe that just that one (1) detail came to you from
- 10 Mr. Muncaster?
- 11 MR. PAUL BONWICK: I was trying to
- 12 think about in terms of who I was discussing it with.
- 13 I'm not sure, and no disrespect to Mr. Lloyd, but I'm
- 14 not sure he would retain how a -- and -- and no, that
- 15 -- I'm not trying to be critical of him. I just --
- 16 he's not the kind of guy that would go, They're going
- 17 to do two dollars (\$2) for this.
- 18 Ed was very sensitive about sharing any
- 19 information as related to the finances specific to
- 20 what others were doing. There was only the three (3)
- 21 of them that I really spoke to about what went on in
- 22 the -- in the Strategic Task Team meetings.
- 23 MR. RYAN BREEDON: So -- so you think
- 24 based on process of elimination --
- 25 MR. PAUL BONWICK: Correct.

- 1 MR. RYAN BREEDON: -- that it was Mr.
- 2 Muncaster?
- 3 MR. PAUL BONWICK: That would make
- 4 sense to me.
- 5 MR. RYAN BREEDON: But you don't have
- 6 a -- a specific recollection of him --
- 7 MR. PAUL BONWICK: Correct.
- 8 MR. RYAN BREEDON: -- telling you
- 9 that. Is that right?
- 10 MR. PAUL BONWICK: Correct.
- MR. RYAN BREEDON: Okay. And is there
- 12 other information that you specifically think came
- 13 from Mr. Muncaster?
- 14 MR. PAUL BONWICK: Again, you -- we --
- 15 I think we've gone down this path in terms of how I
- 16 evolved in securing information, and it was sometimes
- 17 two (2) or three (3) conversations, you know? I would
- 18 pick up the phone and go to Rick, I've heard -- is --
- 19 is this sort of what Veridian's thinking?
- MR. RYAN BREEDON: Right, but your
- 21 interaction with Mr. Muncaster is pretty limited,
- 22 right --
- MR. PAUL BONWICK: One (1) -- yes, but
- 24 --
- 25 MR. RYAN BREEDON: -- because we've

- 1 been through -- but there's one (1) meeting --
- 2 MR. PAUL BONWICK: Correct.
- 3 MR. RYAN BREEDON: -- and then maybe
- 4 one (1) follow-up telephone call --
- 5 MR. PAUL BONWICK: Correct.
- 6 MR. RYAN BREEDON: -- as opposed to
- 7 Mr. Lloyd, who you're seeing all the time?
- MR. PAUL BONWICK: Correct.
- 9 MR. RYAN BREEDON: And Mr. Houghton,
- 10 who you -- we've seen you had -- were having a lot of
- 11 interaction with on different issues during this
- 12 period, right?
- MR. PAUL BONWICK: Correct.
- 14 MR. RYAN BREEDON: Okay. So -- and --
- 15 and we've heard from Mr. Houghton, and we've heard
- 16 from Mr. Lloyd. We -- we can't hear from Mr.
- 17 Muncaster. And so that's why -- I just want to
- 18 understand what you're saying about what it is that
- 19 Mr. Muncaster actually told you.
- So there's this piece about the
- 21 community fund. Is there anything else?
- MR. PAUL BONWICK: Not specifically.
- 23 And I want to be respectful of Mr. Muncaster in terms
- 24 of if I clearly remembered these four (4) bullets,
- 25 then I would say them for the record.

- 1 MR. RYAN BREEDON: Right.
- 2 MR. PAUL BONWICK: I don't recall
- 3 these four (4) bullets or these five (5) bullets
- 4 related to these specific things, and --
- 5 MR. RYAN BREEDON: Okay, that's fine.
- 6 So -- and -- and you don't even recall necessarily
- 7 that Mr. Muncaster told you about the community fund.
- 8 You've just kind of inferred that from what you know
- 9 about Mr. Lloyd and Mr. Houghton?
- MR. PAUL BONWICK: Yes.
- MR. RYAN BREEDON: Okay. Now we --
- 12 you -- you know, though, that Mr. Muncaster -- and
- 13 we've heard a lot of evidence about Mr. Muncaster. He
- 14 was a very experienced businessman, yes?
- MR. PAUL BONWICK: Yes, that's --
- MR. RYAN BREEDON: Very -- very
- 17 impressive businessman, by all accounts?
- 18 MR. PAUL BONWICK: Absolutely.
- MR. RYAN BREEDON: All right.
- 20 Sophisticated?
- 21 MR. PAUL BONWICK: Was a senior
- 22 executive in the private sector, absolutely.
- MR. RYAN BREEDON: Right. And -- and
- 24 you know that Collus had entered into a
- 25 confidentiality agreement with each of the bidders.

- 1 We've seen those?
- MR. PAUL BONWICK: Yes.
- 3 MR. RYAN BREEDON: I appreciate you
- 4 didn't maybe know that at the time, but you know that
- 5 now.
- 6 MR. PAUL BONWICK: Yes.
- 7 MR. RYAN BREEDON: And those were
- 8 binding on Collus?
- 9 MR. PAUL BONWICK: Yes.
- 10 MR. RYAN BREEDON: Right. And they
- 11 prevented the disclosure of any sort of confidential
- 12 information like the kinds of things we've been
- 13 talking about.
- 14 MR. PAUL BONWICK: Hence the reason as
- 15 we've gone through this now and understand that, I was
- 16 quite surprised to see that there -- if it was that
- 17 important to them, if they were signatories to that,
- 18 which I didn't realize they were, that there wouldn't
- 19 be greater emphasis at the beginning of each strategic
- 20 task team meeting to say please keep in mind, or have
- 21 a lawyer there that would say please keep in mind.
- MR. RYAN BREEDON: Well, maybe
- 23 there'll be a recommendation about that. But -- but -
- 24 but certainly it -- it was an important thing, the
- 25 confidentiality of this process. You -- you've seen

- 1 that.
- MR. PAUL BONWICK: It is now. I don't
- 3 know that they had the same level of importance
- 4 attached to it then.
- 5 MR. RYAN BREEDON: And -- and Mr.
- 6 Muncaster had to have known about those
- 7 confidentiality agreements, given his position and
- 8 involvement in this process.
- 9 MR. PAUL BONWICK: I would agree. I
- 10 assume he -- I can't speak on his behalf obviously,
- 11 but I have to assume he was aware that they existed.
- MR. RYAN BREEDON: Sure. And -- and
- 13 similarly you've heard that the RFP process, its
- 14 success depended in part on the control of
- 15 information. We've heard a lot of evidence about
- 16 that. You understand that?
- 17 MR. PAUL BONWICK: I understand that's
- 18 the evidence that was provided.
- MR. RYAN BREEDON: Right. And -- and
- 20 the idea is that it is important in an RFP to ensure
- 21 that all of the bidders are given the same
- 22 information?
- MR. PAUL BONWICK: I would say it's
- 24 important in an RFP that all the bidders have access
- 25 to the same information. I don't think you can --

- 1 MR. RYAN BREEDON: All right. And --
- 2 and Mr. Muncaster would have understood that, based on
- 3 his experience in business?
- 4 MR. PAUL BONWICK: I would agree that
- 5 Mr. Muncaster would understand that it's important
- 6 that all bidders have access to the same information.
- 7 MR. RYAN BREEDON: And then -- and the
- 8 RFP process directed that communication was to go
- 9 through KPMG?
- 10 MR. PAUL BONWICK: That's what I've
- 11 seen.
- MR. RYAN BREEDON: Yes.
- 13 MR. PAUL BONWICK: I was never
- 14 directed either by Collus staff or PowerStream that my
- 15 point of contact was supposed to be somebody at KPMG.
- 16 MR. RYAN BREEDON: I under -- I
- 17 understand you weren't told that, but you understand
- 18 that now.
- MR. PAUL BONWICK: Yes.
- MR. RYAN BREEDON: And again, that's -
- 21 the idea is so that Collus, the vendor, can control
- 22 the information that's being disseminated to the
- 23 bidders.
- 24 MR. PAUL BONWICK: Again, this is a --
- 25 is a new process, very complex RFP system, and so I

- 1 certainly understand why they would try to have a
- 2 point person or a point organization as the
- 3 facilitator, disseminator of information. I would
- 4 argue that that's maybe information that is certainly
- 5 of a sensitive nature, but again I -- I wasn't aware
- 6 of that at the time, that KPMG was the point contact.
- 7 MR. RYAN BREEDON: And -- and -- and
- 8 so I just want to understand what your evidence is.
- 9 Your evidence is that, notwithstanding all of those
- 10 factors that we've just gone through, you met with Mr.
- 11 Muncaster and Mr. Muncaster provided you with
- 12 information about these meetings in breach of the
- 13 confidentiality agreements and in breach of the best
- 14 interests of the Corporation and the Town in terms of
- 15 the way this process was to roll out, even though he
- 16 didn't have any sort of relationship with you.
- Is that what you're saying?
- 18 MR. PAUL BONWICK: Not at all, and I
- 19 don't know how in the world you took that from what
- 20 I've just said. In my opinion that's a complete
- 21 distortion of what I've just said.
- 22 MR. RYAN BREEDON: And then -- and
- 23 then if -- if what Mr. Houghton says is accurate, when
- 24 Mr. Muncaster receives your September 14th memo, he
- 25 apparently goes to the next STT meeting and reminds

- 1 everybody about confidentiality, notwithstanding that
- 2 -- that apparently some of the information came from
- 3 him.
- 4 MR. PAUL BONWICK: I can't speak to
- 5 what Mr. Muncaster did at that meeting. I can tell
- 6 you that your description of what I've just provided
- 7 in terms of testimony could not be further afield. I
- 8 don't think Mr. Muncaster felt, nor did I feel at any
- 9 time nor do I now, that he was in breach or taking
- 10 liberties or compromising PowerStream in any manner or
- 11 fashion. I think it was a -- I've already described
- 12 it, so I won't do it anymore. I don't think that your
- 13 --
- MR. RYAN BREEDON: Well, I --
- MR. PAUL BONWICK: I don't think your
- 16 assertion warrants much more discussion from my end on
- 17 that.
- 18 MR. RYAN BREEDON: I -- I'm going to
- 19 suggest to you, sir, that Mr. Muncaster didn't provide
- 20 you with any information at all.
- 21 MR. PAUL BONWICK: I'm sure you're
- 22 going to suggest that because it serves the narrative
- 23 that you and your law firm are trying to support for
- 24 the Town of Collingwood. You're just wrong.
- MR. RYAN BREEDON: Thank you very

- 1 much, Your Honour. Those are my questions.
- THE HONOURABLE FRANK MARROCCO: So,
- 3 I'm going to break for lunch. It gives you a -- a
- 4 break and -- and gives us all a break.
- 5 You have the opportunity to clear up
- 6 anything which you will feel has become confused.
- 7 It's on -- because typically if you were represented,
- 8 your lawyer would be able to re-examine you and would
- 9 be able to take you to portions of the evidence that
- 10 he or she thought had become confused, so that you
- 11 could clarify. It -- it's not -- it's limited, in
- 12 other words, to that sort of thing.
- 13 It's not an opportunity to advance a
- 14 new position, for example, because nobody would have
- 15 had the opportunity to question you about it because
- 16 they're hearing -- they're hearing from it at the end.
- So -- so that's the nature of the -- of
- 18 the opportunity and so what I'll let you do is simply
- 19 speak rather than -- because you're -- you're
- 20 representing yourself. There's no one to ask you the
- 21 questions.
- 22 So typically what you would do is
- 23 reflect on any aspects of your testimony that you
- 24 think have become confused or -- or -- as a result of
- 25 the cross-examination, and clarify it.

- 1 Is -- is that --
- 2 MR. PAUL BONWICK: It is.
- THE HONOURABLE FRANK MARROCCO: --
- 4 clear?
- 5 MR. PAUL BONWICK: It is. I had a
- 6 question related to this, and you've -- you've given
- 7 me some -- some help in that regard.
- 8 THE HONOURABLE FRANK MARROCCO: What
- 9 was the question?
- 10 MR. PAUL BONWICK: My question was: if
- 11 -- if, in fact, I had a lawyer here and that lawyer --
- 12 typically they're the one -- in my experience, the
- 13 lawyer representing the witness or the participant, is
- 14 the one that gets to go last. So you're providing me
- 15 that opportunity as well.
- 16 THE HONOURABLE FRANK MARROCCO: Right.
- 17 That's right.
- MR. PAUL BONWICK: But in my
- 19 experience, when -- the lawyer representing the
- 20 participant not only has the ability to revisit
- 21 matters that have been brought up, but they also have
- 22 the ability to question the witness in other areas
- 23 that they think would provide value. Is -- is that
- 24 not --
- 25 THE HONOURABLE FRANK MARROCCO: No. I

- 1 think when Mr. Chen -- no. You -- you can't get into
- 2 other areas that have not been brought up, because
- 3 that would mean everybody -- I'd have -- that would
- 4 mean that none of the people who cross-examined you
- 5 had an opportunity to cross-examine you on that
- 6 assertion because they're hearing it for the first
- 7 time, so it would be unfair in that sense.
- 8 It's restricted to matters that have
- 9 become -- as a result of the questioning, have become
- 10 confused, have become -- are unclear. If -- if in the
- 11 course of testifying you think some aspect of what you
- 12 said has become unclear, distorted, or whatever, I'm
- 13 giving you the opportunity then to say, look, this is
- 14 what -- this is what I said, this is what I meant.
- But -- but it's not an opportunity to
- 16 make closing submissions because you'll have that
- 17 opportunity later on, and it's not an opportunity to
- 18 get into new areas because absolutely that would --
- 19 that would -- that's not what it's for. So it's
- 20 limited. It --
- 21 MR. PAUL BONWICK: I understand that.
- 22 I just -- and obviously you're the judge and I'm
- 23 providing testimony.
- THE HONOURABLE FRANK MARROCCO: No.
- 25 If -- if one (1) of the lawyers tried to do that on

- 1 re-examination and there was an objection, I would put
- 2 a stop to it.
- 3 MR. PAUL BONWICK: Okay. I -- that's
- 4 fine, I mean --
- 5 THE HONOURABLE FRANK MARROCCO: And --
- 6 and, in fact, I might put a stop to it whether there
- 7 was an objection or not. I -- and I -- I would
- 8 do that to say that's not proper re-examination. And
- 9 since I'm in that situation when I'm advancing it, I'm
- 10 going to agree with myself.
- MR. PAUL BONWICK: Right. Tough to
- 12 argue in that realm.
- This isn't re-cross-examination though.
- 14 This is me being cross-examined by my lawyer. That
- 15 was my point and that's why I would have been able --
- 16 I was under the impression I would be able to, had I
- 17 had a lawyer there, say, you know, Mr. Bonwick, do you
- 18 think there was a fundamental question that was missed
- 19 here in terms of how you're dealing with
- 20 confidentiality. I would --
- 21 THE HONOURABLE FRANK MARROCCO: Well -
- 22 well, I think -- I think in that situation, if you
- 23 think that the manner in which you dealt with
- 24 confidentiality has become -- is not clear, has become
- 25 confused as a result of the questioning, you're

- 1 entitled to clear it up.
- MR. PAUL BONWICK: Thank you. You'll,
- 3 I'm sure, shut me down if I'm going somewhere I
- 4 shouldn't.
- 5 THE HONOURABLE FRANK MARROCCO: No,
- 6 no. I -- I -- I will try not to actually.
- 7 MR. PAUL BONWICK: You've been very
- 8 generous in that regard. I was making light.
- 9 THE HONOURABLE FRANK MARROCCO: No.
- 10 no. I -- I wasn't taking it the wrong way, but -- but
- 11 I will try not to interrupt so that you get the
- 12 opportunity to explain the matters you want to
- 13 explain.
- MR. PAUL BONWICK: Thank you.

15

- 16 --- Upon recessing at 12:50 p.m.
- 17 --- Upon resuming at 1:54 p.m.

- 19 THE HONOURABLE FRANK MARROCCO: Mr.
- 20 Bonwick, before you start, I was thinking about our
- 21 exchange at the end, and I think you may be right,
- 22 actually. I was reflecting back on the opportunity
- 23 Mr. Fryer had to -- to respond, in effect.
- 24 So, I don't want you to -- I don't want
- 25 you to delete anything out of your original remarks,

- 1 it's not necessary. And if you need a few minutes to
- 2 put something back in that you took out as a result of
- 3 the exchange, I'm happy to give it to you now before
- 4 you get started.
- 5 But -- but I think, upon reflection,
- 6 you were right, actually, that -- that the way I was
- 7 approaching it would be unduly restrictive given the
- 8 way we approached Mr. Fryer's evidence, so.
- 9 MR. PAUL BONWICK: Thank you, Your
- 10 Honour. Could I have two (2) minutes?
- 11 THE HONOURABLE FRANK MARROCCO: Sure.

12

- 13 --- Upon recessing at 1:55 p.m.
- 14 --- Upon resuming at 1:57 p.m.

15

- 16 THE HONOURABLE FRANK MARROCCO: Go
- 17 ahead, Mr. Bonwick.
- 18 MR. PAUL BONWICK: Thank you, Your
- 19 Honour, for that break.

- 21 PAUL BONWICK, TESTIFIES:
- MR. PAUL BONWICK: Excuse me. Had I
- 23 been sitting over there and questioning me -- so this
- 24 is kind of going to be a bit of humourous in terms of
- 25 the third party side of it.

1 But the first thing that I would have

- 2 raised -- the first matter I would raise as a result
- 3 of the questioning from the various lawyers centers
- 4 around sensitivity of information, confidential
- 5 nature, and disclosure, if I can sort of wrap it up in
- 6 -- in one (1) big bundle like that.
- 7 The -- the overreaching theme -- and as
- 8 has been demonstrated in my response to that would be
- 9 the overreaching theme that's been demonstrated
- 10 through numerous correspondence by way of testimony
- 11 from Mr. Bentz, Mr. Glicksman, there is clear evidence
- 12 that there was full disclosure made.
- 13 While it remains -- the question
- 14 remains, what level of disclosure was provided to the
- 15 city clerk, Ms. Almas, during my meeting. Excuse me.
- 16 She has one (1) recollection of the conversation, I
- 17 have another. Her testimony recognizes that she
- 18 doesn't re -- she didn't include in her notes all the
- 19 parts of the conversation.
- 20 And through cross-examination by me, I
- 21 could not say with absolutely certainty that I used
- 22 the word 'Collus' as part of my disclosure. I felt
- 23 very comfortable in talking about that full disclosure
- 24 had been made, but there seemed to be some sort of
- 25 special focus on was the word 'Collus' actually used

- 1 in that particular -- in that disclosure meeting.
- 2 You've heard my testimony in terms of
- 3 it's the elephant in the room. It could be the only
- 4 thing we were talking about, but I follow up with the
- 5 email where I state in the email -- and in the
- 6 interest of timing, you've seen it enough times, as
- 7 have I.
- 8 In the interest of timing,
- 9 paraphrasing, I used the term that I provided full
- 10 disclosure and that I addressed the matter of conflict
- 11 of interest for the mayor as a result of me being
- 12 engaged by PowerStre -- PowerStream and being her
- 13 sibling.
- 14 The record shows both by Ms. Almas, Mr.
- 15 Bentz, and Mr. Glicksman that everybody had to --
- 16 seemed satisfied with that or, if they weren't
- 17 satisfied with that, they chose not to follow up.
- 18 And so, my position would be how could
- 19 I, under any circumstance, feel that I hadn't done
- 20 what I'm stating I did if somebody that's attached to
- 21 that email doesn't say, well, what do you mean by full
- 22 disclosure, did you mention Collus.
- I would respond, as well, by saying,
- 24 hindsight being 20/20 and lesson learned, the way to
- 25 get around verbal disclosures is to actually walk in,

- 1 and staff or elected officials or Board members don't
- 2 necessarily have to see the monetary section of an
- 3 agreement, so I would argue that that's not relevant
- 4 to any of the parties other than me and PowerStream.
- 5 There was certainly an opportunity to
- 6 say here it is. And so -- but beyond that at that
- 7 time, it is my opinion, and I think all the evidence
- 8 would support, that full disclosure had been made and,
- 9 if it hadn't, nobody raised the issue until eight (8)
- 10 years later.
- I think evidence further supports that,
- 12 depending on which part of the testimony used from Ms.
- 13 Wingrove, that there was a meeting that took place and
- 14 the meeting was about LDCs, generally speaking,
- 15 consolidation, and -- and that's been identified, as
- 16 well.
- 17 And while that wasn't part of the
- 18 disclosure aspects within the agreement, it was me
- 19 being proactive with the CAO. That never had to take
- 20 place. It wasn't a condition of the contract. And it
- 21 wasn't something, quite frankly, that came up in -- in
- 22 a specific form of a request.
- 23 Going to the disclosure again which has
- 24 been talked about at length this morning and over the
- 25 last couple of days, it was also my suggestion to the

- 1 PowerStream team and, more specifically, Mr. Bentz,
- 2 that he in fact, or that the mayor, host a meeting
- 3 with me not participating.
- 4 And my rationale behind that was it may
- 5 make some people that are sitting in that meeting
- 6 uncomfortable to share their opinions about whether or
- 7 not I should or shouldn't be involved with PowerStream
- 8 specifically with any potential Collus transaction.
- 9 That meeting took place. We've heard
- 10 evidence from Mr. Bentz that it's certainly his
- 11 understanding that full disclosure did take place,
- 12 that they spoke about the fact that Paul Bonwick would
- 13 be involved and that Paul Bonwick would be helping.
- 14 And while all I can rely on is the
- 15 testimony of Mr. Bentz and subse -- and the followup
- 16 that took place that afternoon out on the golf course
- 17 and the feedback that I received from Mr. Houghton,
- 18 once he had spoken with his chairperson, Mr.
- 19 Muncaster, the only message that I could have received
- 20 based on what we've heard and what we know is that,
- 21 not only full disclosure had taken place, but there
- 22 was positive feedback to some degree as it related to
- 23 either a local business having to make a living or
- 24 whether it be my involvement may only provide an
- 25 opportunity for greater value for the municipality if

- 1 in fact PowerStream understands the various nuances.
- 2 And that's sort of what I took out of
- 3 that. So, we've had these various levels of
- 4 disclosure. And we seem to get preoccupied, and I'm
- 5 not sure why, but my response would be about the Lloyd
- 6 incident.
- 7 I would say it's unfortunate that that
- 8 even took place. If I had have had a more clear
- 9 understanding from Mr. Bentz in terms of what his
- 10 expectations were as it related to engaging the clerk,
- 11 fast-forward, we would have done exactly what we -- or
- 12 I would have done exactly what I did, and that was to
- 13 set up the meeting and subsequently meet with Ms.
- 14 Almas.
- 15 If it was not my misunderstanding, but
- 16 it was Mr. Bentz who didn't communicate his needs,
- 17 that's never going to be realized by this Inquiry
- 18 other than the fact that I took a step that I felt
- 19 addressed the issue more on a generic level than it
- 20 did on a micro level specific to me.
- 21 But move it aside entirely, the
- 22 relevance is the meeting with the clerk, the meeting
- 23 with the CAO, the meeting that took place with the
- 24 mayor of Barrie, the CEO, and all those participants
- 25 in the room, the fact that -- and the mayor perhaps

- 1 didn't understand every word in the thing. I -- I
- 2 don't know and I can't speak to that.
- But clearly, I had brought this matter
- 4 forward to her. I had disclosed that this was
- 5 underway. Clearly, there was a requirement to get
- 6 something in writing. I drafted it to the best of my
- 7 ability to incorporate everything that had been
- 8 discussed and what PowerStream expected to be
- 9 discussed.
- I give them the draft. They vet it or
- 11 Mr. Nolan vets it or perhaps more than one (1) person
- 12 vets it and comes back and says it's fine. We then
- 13 give it to the mayor. The mayor signs it.
- 14 And, again, I -- I'm not suggesting
- 15 this is semantics, but we seem to get a preoccupation
- 16 with discussing, should future events unfold, the
- 17 disclosure, in my mind, is the disclosure and the only
- 18 future events that would be relevant from the mayor
- 19 would obviously be PowerStream getting involved with
- 20 the LDC.
- 21 I was perhaps a little fickle yesterday
- 22 when I suggested they're not in the business of buying
- 23 libraries or parks or museums. But the reality is
- 24 they only have one (1) focus in the Town of
- 25 Collingwood, and that would have been the acquisition

- 1 of the LDC.
- So, to me, the disclosure side of it
- 3 has been well addressed. And I hope I'm not -- I'm
- 4 hoping I've covered it off in such a way as it's not
- 5 my closing argument but rather addressing something
- 6 that has come up time and time again with various
- 7 lawyers questioning me.
- 8 There is then the matter of the
- 9 confidential nature of the information that I
- 10 collected and forwarded on to PowerStream. If I were
- 11 me standing at the podium there asking the question
- 12 about des -- des -- describe the -- describe the
- 13 environment to the best of your ability, we've heard
- 14 numerous descriptions of the environment, the small
- 15 town, people working together, strong relationships.
- So, I put that in sort of one (1)
- 17 pocket and say it was a -- I would say a relaxed,
- 18 trusting environment. The second pocket that I would
- 19 put forward is it was my opinion and I believe the
- 20 pinion -- the opinion of others that PowerStream was
- 21 view in a very positive light.
- 22 And the last piece or pocket that I
- 23 would identify is we've heard testimony related to the
- 24 sensitivity and confidentiality aspects of this not
- 25 only through various cross-examinations that take

- 1 place with me over the last couple of days, but we've
- 2 heard it from Mr. Houghton.
- 3
 We've heard it from former Mayor
- 4 Cooper. We've heard it from all the ST -- the
- 5 committee members that participated in that process.
- 6 And there seemed to be, in my opinion, assessing it
- 7 back then, a lack of attention brought to the matter
- 8 relating to what's confidential and what's not
- 9 confidential and the importance, understanding that
- 10 Council and staff have varying levels of understanding
- 11 of those aspects.
- I could reflect when -- when I was
- 13 elected in Parliament, they spend three (3) days
- 14 drumming it into your head what you're able to do and
- 15 what you're not able to do. And I look at an agenda,
- 16 and with all due respect to Mr. Longo, he was dictated
- 17 a -- one narrow time band in teaching Council, I think
- 18 he got allocated to half an hour in a one-day seminar,
- 19 a strategic planning exercise, whatever it was, to
- 20 talk about confidentiality and the Municipal Conflict
- 21 of Interest Act.
- We've heard testimony that there was
- 23 very little if any discussion or reference about the
- 24 importance of confidentiality at the beginning of
- 25 every task team. Knowing what we know now, one would

- 1 argue that you might have at the very least had the
- 2 clerk come in and respectfully read everyone the riot
- 3 act or the -- Collus' or the Town's lawyer come in and
- 4 talk about the importance of confidentiality as it
- 5 relates to the integrity of the overall process. But
- 6 that didn't happen.
- 7 I've been cross-examined about
- 8 PowerStream not raising the issue with me as
- 9 information continued to be brought to their
- 10 attention, again whether it was in phone call or
- 11 email.
- 12 One of the points that I think is quite
- 13 relevant from all of our perspectives is the fact that
- 14 I was never provided a copy of the NDA the Town signed
- 15 with PowerStream, and I assume it's the same one.
- 16 There are typically two (2) signatories to it.
- 17 And PowerStream never, as part of my
- 18 documentation, said here's your NDA, here's your
- 19 agreement and here's the -- at some point here's the
- 20 NDA that we signed with the Municipality, please know
- 21 that as our consultant or agent, whichever one you
- 22 want to refer to, you're bound by the same terms as
- 23 that.
- 24 The -- specific to where the
- 25 information came from, I won't go into the history of

- 1 the fact that it's eight (8) years old, everybody
- 2 understands that, but in Mr. Breedon's cross-
- 3 examination he took us down a path where at the
- 4 conclusion of his cross-examination he suggested that
- 5 because Mr. -- sorry, Mr. Muncaster was a highly-
- 6 respected private executive, iconic in the Canadian
- 7 economy, that he gives his opinion and it goes into
- 8 the Court book or the transcript that in fact he
- 9 suggests nothing like that would have taken place.
- 10 And so the only inference to that is
- 11 I'm not telling the truth, the meeting that took
- 12 place, nobody is arguing that it didn't take place,
- 13 the meeting that took place, common sense prevails
- 14 again, would we have spent forty-five (45) minutes,
- 15 half an hour, an hour talking about things unrelated
- 16 to the LDC or the elephant in the room, that's the
- 17 only thing that could have been discussed.
- 18 And as much as I'm very respectful of
- 19 Mr. Muncaster's legacy, he sounds -- for the short
- 20 period that I knew him, he did nothing but impress me
- 21 with regards to his integrity, his knowledge. I think
- 22 Collingwood was fortunate to have him for as long as
- 23 they did.
- But at the end of the day, Mr. Breedon
- 25 doesn't for a moment take into consideration that I've

- 1 been active in this community since the age of 21 or
- 2 22 in various volunteer and political positions
- 3 representing the area for a number of years in
- 4 Canada's Parliament, sitting at the Cabinet table,
- 5 operating various businesses.
- 6 One would hope that people would feel
- 7 that irrespective of what I'm trying to do to make
- 8 money within my businesses, that I always have the
- 9 best interests of the community at heart.
- 10 And so for him to read into the record
- 11 that I was somehow misleading, based on Mr. -- the
- 12 meeting with Mr. Muncaster, quite frankly, I don't
- 13 think that that was reasonable and shouldn't, quite
- 14 frankly, have been allowed.
- We've had significant cross-examination
- 16 related to the solar attic vent. And I'd like to
- 17 break my response up to that into two (2) pieces.
- 18 We've heard testimony again from a
- 19 multitude of different witnesses. I've been cross-
- 20 examined over it -- over the last couple of days,
- 21 specific to this matter and the first point I would
- 22 make is the purpose of the Inquiry, as I understood
- 23 it, is to determine was -- was the process fair? Did
- 24 the process run in a manner that it should have?
- 25 And if it didn't let's identify that

- 1 the weaknesses that were involved in the process so
- 2 that we can avoid those things from happening again.
- 3 As part of that, the -- I think it
- 4 would be reasonable to state that while the -- the
- 5 alliance that was created between Collus and
- 6 PowerStream did create a positive flavour to the
- 7 overall proposal that PowerStream put in, I would
- 8 suggest that anybody would be naive enough to think
- 9 that the solar attic vent somehow was the critical
- 10 piece of the puzzle that allowed Collus to score 40 or
- 11 50 percent higher than just about everybody else, and
- 12 causes them to throw an extra almost \$3 million to
- 13 their next closest one short of Hydro One.
- 14 So the amount of time that's been spent
- 15 on this solar vent in my mind is disproportionate to
- 16 the effect. And I would answer that question if
- 17 somebody had of answered -- asked me it during the
- 18 last couple of days of cross-examination.
- 19 The issue specific to me being -- my
- 20 company being paid for the distribution of the solar
- 21 attic vent and, more specifically, Mr. Houghton's
- 22 involvement in that, and I think Ms. McGrann quite
- 23 frankly did a good job at walking through
- 24 chronologically dealing with each email at a time. I
- 25 can't be more clear in terms of it was my intention,

- 1 and if situations unfolded differently I would have
- 2 continued to pursue it, it was always my intention to
- 3 try and get Mr. Houghton out of his current
- 4 environment and into mine.
- 5 And I've said it on the record before
- 6 and I'll say it again, he continued to not accept
- 7 those -- those offers of encouragement irrespective of
- 8 how I tried to capture it.
- 9 There's been a lot of discussion around
- 10 -- through cross-examination related to information
- 11 specific to the quality a bit, and I would say that's
- 12 the second most important part, and I hope I'm not
- 13 taking too long in addressing these things.
- 14 THE HONOURABLE FRANK MARROCCO: No.
- 15 MR. PAUL BONWICK: But in some of this
- 16 questioning that's gone over -- on over the last two
- 17 days, it would -- you would like to be able to have
- 18 somebody ask the question what was the most important
- 19 objective out of this process.
- 20 And so I think we've heard time and
- 21 time again that while financial considerations were
- 22 important, it was a balancing act with what was best
- 23 in terms of a strategic alliance to build something.
- 24 And I'm confused by why there is not a
- 25 lot of questioning about whether or not that was

- 1 achieved by way of this transaction.
- 2 The third part, that there doesn't --
- 3 and I would throw this back -- there doesn't seem to
- 4 be -- there was no cross-examination on me and so I'm
- 5 -- I'm a little bit sensitive to go there, but I was -
- 6 I would ask the question: Mr. Bonwick, why would
- 7 you not think you were getting questions about how
- 8 this matter came into play? How is it that seven (7)
- 9 years after the fact with all the information we've
- 10 seen read into evidence for the reports that were done
- 11 that led to the Inquiry?
- 12 My response would be I think there
- 13 needs to be more attention, Mr. Bonwick, to what drove
- 14 the Inquiry versus the actual situation itself.
- 15 Because at the end of the day we're spending millions
- 16 of dollars on a transaction that took place eight (8)
- 17 years ago.
- 18 My last point --
- 19 THE HONOURABLE FRANK MARROCCO: Was --
- 20 was the point you were just making that you -- you
- 21 wanted me to understand was that a strategic alliance
- 22 was achieved, that that was the purpose of it and
- 23 that's what was achieved?
- MR. PAUL BONWICK: Yes.
- 25 THE HONOURABLE FRANK MARROCCO: All

- 1 right.
- MR. PAUL BONWICK: And one that, for a
- 3 period of time, seemed to be a very positive thing.
- 4 THE HONOURABLE FRANK MARROCCO: Right.
- 5 MR. PAUL BONWICK: The -- I had one
- 6 last point I wanted to --
- 7 THE HONOURABLE FRANK MARROCCO: I'll
- 8 give you a minute or two (2) to read your notes. Take
- 9 your time.
- 10 MR. PAUL BONWICK: Thank you.
- 11 I -- I'll close off with this. I had
- 12 words written by cross-examination by Mr. McDowell,
- 13 and he used the term -- was it like -- and I could
- 14 bring up the transcript but I'm only interested in two
- 15 words. I think he compared it to the wild west, if
- 16 you'll recall him saying that or not.
- 17 And it would speak to a lot of the
- 18 cross-examination that's taken place. Did you not --
- 19 I was asked on a regular basis did you not feel that
- 20 you were being provided information that was
- 21 sensitive? Did you not feel that you shouldn't be
- 22 passing this information along?
- 23 And I think we've -- we've addressed
- 24 much of that. But the questions that weren't asked to
- 25 me are: What were the rules governing your actions?

- 1 What -- what code of conduct for the Municipality?
- 2 What is in the Municipal Act to address consultants or
- 3 agents that are working on behalf of corporations as
- 4 they engage with municipal or -- municipal governments
- 5 or corporations owned by municipal governments?
- 6 And I was -- I've been surprised
- 7 throughout the process that that question doesn't get
- 8 asked.
- 9 And so while I'm not going to
- 10 completely agree with Mr. McDowell's description, I
- 11 think we need to understand the environment at that
- 12 point in time.
- 13 And I think that lends itself not only
- 14 to -- not that it gives me latitude to act without
- 15 concern for what's right and what's wrong, but because
- 16 these -- the level of regulation and control, and I
- 17 think this community has made significant
- 18 advancements, maybe not far enough yet, but because
- 19 those don't exist, elected officials and staff aren't
- 20 as sensitive to the issues of sharing communications
- 21 or having open discussions.
- 22 And I think that's fair whether it's a
- 23 small town or larger city, but certainly in a smaller
- 24 community if we don't have a set of regulations that
- 25 govern the interactions of private consultants with

- 1 government, then nobody has a -- an understanding of
- 2 beyond what's right and what's wrong in your own moral
- 3 compass how you should be getting information, how you
- 4 should be reporting information, whether or not you
- 5 should be filing a receipt that you take three people
- 6 to a golf course and spend eight hundred dollars
- 7 (\$800) on the day or six hundred dollars (\$600) on the
- 8 day.
- 9 Those things didn't exist. And so you
- 10 know, there's been discussion about the golf thing as
- 11 well, so I think I will just close out with -- with
- 12 those remarks and -- unless you have any questions
- 13 about my earlier cross-examination.
- 14 THE HONOURABLE FRANK MARROCCO: No,
- 15 no, I'm -- I'm -- I don't have any questions.
- Any concluding examination?
- MS. KATE MCGRANN: No.
- 18 THE HONOURABLE FRANK MARROCCO: Thank
- 19 you, Mr. Bonwick.
- 20 MR. PAUL BONWICK: Thank you.
- 21
- 22 (WITNESS STANDS DOWN)
- 23
- 24 THE HONOURABLE FRANK MARROCCO: Who's
- 25 the next witness?

1 MR. JOHN MATHER: The next witness is

- 2 Shirley Houghton.
- 3 THE HONOURABLE FRANK MARROCCO: And
- 4 for the benefit of everybody, that will be the last
- 5 witness for today. We weren't sure how long this
- 6 would take, so.
- 7 MR. PAUL BONWICK: Sorry, Your Honour,
- 8 in fairness to the counsel for the Inquiry, once you
- 9 gave me clear direction, I realized I could condense
- 10 this thing in a much more favourable fashion.
- I, in fairness, suggested to Mr. Mather
- 12 that I could be upwards of an hour or more, and
- 13 obviously that was not the case.
- 14 THE HONOURABLE FRANK MARROCCO: All
- 15 right, that's fine. Thank you.

16

17 SHIRLEY HOUGHTON, Sworn

18

- 19 THE HONOURABLE FRANK MARROCCO: Ms.
- 20 Houghton, the microphone doesn't have a very broad
- 21 range, so please try to speak into it so that we can
- 22 get the transcript of everything.

- 24 EXAMINATION IN-CHIEF BY MR. JOHN MATHER:
- MR. JOHN MATHER: Good afternoon, Ms.

- 1 Houghton. You've provided an affidavit to the
- 2 Inquiry?
- MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: I have.
- 4 MR. JOHN MATHER: Can we please pull
- 5 up AFF10? Can you just confirm that this is the
- 6 affidavit that you've provided?
- 7 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: I do.
- 8 MR. JOHN MATHER: And I understand
- 9 from your counsel, there are some corrections that you
- 10 would like to make to the affidavit.
- Is that correct?
- MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: Yes. I believe
- 13 it was on -- on my number 9.
- 14 MR. JOHN MATHER: Could we go to
- 15 paragraph 9, please.
- 16
- 17 (BRIEF PAUSE)
- 18
- 19 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: The number is
- 20 transposed.
- MR. JOHN MATHER: Which number?
- MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: The deposit
- 23 number, nineteen five thirty (19,530). It should be
- 24 nineteen three-fifty (19,350), as noted right below
- 25 it.

- 1 MR. JOHN MATHER: Right. So if we
- 2 scroll down to paragraph 13, we see that there's the
- 3 nineteen three-fifty (19,350) number there.
- Is that what you're saying, is that
- 5 number should be the same?
- 6 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: Yes, if you go
- 7 up.
- 8 MR. JOHN MATHER: Yeah. So the number
- 9 in paragraph 9, or the number paragraph 13 is the
- 10 right number? Which one is the right number?
- 11 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: Nineteen three-
- 12 fifty (19,350).
- MR. JOHN MATHER: Okay. Great.
- 14 THE HONOURABLE FRANK MARROCCO: So
- 15 then -- so then we'll change the number on number 9 to
- 16 nineteen three-fifty (19,350)? That's the change you
- 17 want to make?
- 18 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: Correct.
- 19 THE HONOURABLE FRANK MARROCCO: Okay.
- 20
- 21 CONTINUED BY MR. JOHN MATHER:
- MR. JOHN MATHER: Any other changes?
- MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: On line number
- 24 13.
- MR. JOHN MATHER: Go ahead.

```
1 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: Mr. Bonwick
```

- 2 rented our place November and December of '11, and
- 3 April and May of '11 -- '12.
- 4 MR. JOHN MATHER: That's the --
- 5 another change you'd like to make?
- MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: Yes, please.
- 7 MR. JOHN MATHER: Are there any other
- 8 changes you'd like to make at this time?
- 9 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: Not that I'm
- 10 aware of.
- 11 MR. JOHN MATHER: Other than those
- 12 changes you have identified, do you confirm that your
- 13 affidavit is accurate, to the best of your ability?
- MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: Yes.
- 15 MR. JOHN MATHER: So if we could
- 16 scroll up to the top of the affidavit, I'm just going
- 17 to do a brief summary, set out what you've spoken
- 18 about in your affidavit.
- 19 The first section, you speak about the
- 20 work you did for Compenso Communications in 2011,
- 21 2012. So if we could scroll down. And then if we
- 22 head to paragraph 11, you also set out your evidence
- 23 with respect to the -- the cheque you received in
- 24 October 2011 in the amount of nineteen thousand three
- 25 hundred and fifty dollars (\$19,350).

- 1 And if we keep scrolling down, you
- 2 provide your evidence on your knowledge of the Collus
- 3 sale and RFP process, and finally, your knowledge with
- 4 respect to the solar attic vents and International
- 5 Solar Solutions.
- In addition to these areas, we have a
- 7 few additional questions for you this afternoon, Ms.
- 8 Houghton. So if we could go to paragraph 3 of your
- 9 affidavit.

10

11 (BRIEF PAUSE)

- MR. JOHN MATHER: So in paragraph 3,
- 14 you discuss that you began working for Compenso in
- 15 January, 2011.
- 16 At that point in time, did you have any
- 17 other form of employment?
- 18 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: The three (3)
- 19 years previous to that, I was working as a supply
- 20 secretary at Jean Vanier High School.
- 21 MR. JOHN MATHER: And did you continue
- 22 acting as a supply secretary while you worked for
- 23 Compenso Communications?
- 24 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: No I did not.
- 25 MR. JOHN MATHER: Prior to being a

- 1 supply secretary, what was your work experience?
- MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: I had thirty
- 3 (30) years of continuous employment.
- 4 MR. JOHN MATHER: I don't need
- 5 details, but can you just give a general sense of what
- 6 the nature of your employment was?
- 7 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: For fifteen
- 8 (15) years, I worked at Pilkington, and then six (6)
- 9 years at the Catholic School Board in Barrie.
- 10 MR. JOHN MATHER: And what were your
- 11 roles at those companies -- or the school board?
- 12 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: It was -- it
- 13 was payroll at Pilkington.
- 14 MR. JOHN MATHER: And -- and at the
- 15 Catholic School Board?
- 16 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: It was payroll
- 17 and benefits administrator.
- 18 MR. JOHN MATHER: So if we --
- 19 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: And then I went
- 20 back to Pilkington for I believe another eight (8)
- 21 years after that.
- MR. JOHN MATHER: Thank you. So if we
- 23 scroll down to paragraph 5 of your affidavit, you talk
- 24 about that on January 19th, 2011, Mr. Bonwick sent you
- 25 a proposal he'd prepared for PowerStream for your

- 1 review. And you say in the last sentence of that
- 2 paragraph that you do not know why he asked me to
- 3 review the proposal.
- Was this the first time that Mr.
- 5 Bonwick had asked you to review anything in relation
- 6 to his business?
- 7 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: Yes.
- 8 MR. JOHN MATHER: So if we go to
- 9 Exhibit A on -- which is on page 5 of the affidavit.
- 10 And this is the email in which he sends you the
- 11 proposal?
- 12 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: Correct.
- MR. JOHN MATHER: If we -- and if we
- 14 scroll down, all Mr. Bonwick says in his email to you
- 15 is, "Please -- please print and comment."
- Other than what's in the email, did he
- 17 say anything else to you before he sent you the
- 18 proposal?
- MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: No.
- MR. JOHN MATHER: Were you surprised
- 21 that he sent you the email?
- MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: Yes, I was.
- MR. JOHN MATHER: After you received
- 24 it, did you speak with Mr. Bonwick about why he sent
- 25 it to you?

- 1 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: Yes. I called
- 2 him and asked him why he sent this to me.
- 3 MR. JOHN MATHER: And what do you
- 4 recall about that conversation?
- 5 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: I said, Hey,
- 6 Paul, it's Shirley. I just received a document on my
- 7 computer, I think you've sent it to me in error.
- 8 MR. JOHN MATHER: And what you
- 9 remember he said -- said in response?
- 10 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: He -- he said,
- 11 Sorry about that, but while I've got you on the line,
- 12 would you mind taking a look at it for me?
- 13 MR. JOHN MATHER: Did he say anything
- 14 else?
- 15 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: Not that I
- 16 recall.
- 17 MR. JOHN MATHER: Did he give you any
- 18 indication of what the scope of the review he wanted
- 19 you to undertake was?
- 20 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: I took it to be
- 21 like a grammar -- grammatical review.
- MR. JOHN MATHER: Did you confirm that
- 23 with him?
- MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: No, but I don't
- 25 know why else he would be asking me to look at it.

1 MR. JOHN MATHER: Is there anything

- 2 else you can remember about that conversation?
- MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: No.
- 4 MR. JOHN MATHER: Did he offer to pay
- 5 you for that work at that point in time?
- MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: No.
- 7 MR. JOHN MATHER: Do you know if he
- 8 ever paid you for that work?
- 9 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: No, I don't
- 10 believe so.
- MR. JOHN MATHER: You didn't submit an
- 12 invoice for it?
- MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: No.
- 14 MR. JOHN MATHER: Mr. Bonwick has
- 15 testified at the Inquiry, and one (1) of the things he
- 16 recalls is he said he recalled speaking with you about
- 17 your work history at a social gathering at some point
- 18 prior to him sending you this proposal.
- 19 Do you recall any conversations along
- 20 those lines?
- MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: I remember him
- 22 saying, you know, what are you up to now that you've
- 23 retired, or where are you working now? Are you
- 24 working? Things along that line, but nothing --
- 25 nothing that went into any big conversation.

1 MR. JOHN MATHER: You were meant -- so

- 2 I take it from that answer, you recall having a
- 3 conversation along those lines with him?
- 4 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: Yes.
- 5 MR. JOHN MATHER: And prior to him
- 6 sending you this email, had he ever sent you anything
- 7 like this before for review and comment?
- 8 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: No.
- 9 MR. JOHN MATHER: And during your
- 10 conversation that -- that you recall when he asked you
- 11 about your work history, did he in that conversation
- 12 ask if you were interested in any part-time work or
- 13 any form of employment?
- 14 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: Sorry, can -- I
- 15 can't hear you.
- 16 MR. JOHN MATHER: Sorry. You -- we --
- 17 we were discussing a conversation you recall having
- 18 with Mr. Bonwick, in which he inquired about your work
- 19 history.
- 20 As part of that conversation, did he
- 21 ask you if you would be interested in doing work for
- 22 him?
- MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: Not that I
- 24 recall.
- 25 MR. JOHN MATHER: So we see in this

- 1 email here that you forwarded Mr. Bonwick's email to
- 2 your husband, Mr. Houghton. Did you then have a
- 3 conversation with Mr. Houghton about this?
- 4 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: No, I didn't
- 5 have a conversation with him. I said, There's an
- 6 email on my computer from Paul.
- 7 MR. JOHN MATHER: And where were you
- 8 when you said that to him?
- 9 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: Probably -- it
- 10 was late at night when I sent it to him.
- MR. JOHN MATHER: And so you said that
- 12 to Mr. Houghton. Did he say anything to you in
- 13 response?
- 14 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: I think he
- 15 said, Can you send it to me?
- 16 MR. JOHN MATHER: And I take it, then,
- 17 that this is you sending it on to him?
- 18 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: M-hm.
- 19 MR. JOHN MATHER: Did you and Mr.
- 20 Houghton have any further discussion about why Mr.
- 21 Bonwick had sent you this proposal?
- MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: No.
- MR. JOHN MATHER: Did you speak to Mr.
- 24 Houghton about the conversation you'd had with Mr.
- 25 Bonwick subsequently, where he had -- where he said, I

Transcript Date June 14, 2019 214 must -- I may have sent it in error, but I'd like you 2 to review it? 3 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: I don't recall. 5 (BRIEF PAUSE) 6 7 MR. JOHN MATHER: If we go to paragraph 8 of your affidavit. THE HONOURABLE FRANK MARROCCO: Just before you do that, I -- I don't know that -- you said 10 11 to Mr. Bonwick that he had -- he must have sent it to 12 you in error, and he said Sorry about that? 13 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: THE HONOURABLE FRANK MARROCCO: 14 All 15 right. And did -- did take from that -- what did you take -- did you take from that that it had been intended for Mr. Houghton? 17 18 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: I didn't take 19 any intention from it. 20 THE HONOURABLE FRANK MARROCCO: All 21 right. 22 23 CONTINUED BY MR. JOHN MATHER:

- MR. JOHN MATHER: To paragraph 8 of
- 25 your affidavit -- sorry, paragraph 15.

1 (BRIEF PAUSE)

- 3 MR. JOHN MATHER: So paragraph 15 of
- 4 your affidavit, you indicate that you first became
- 5 aware of a potential Collus sale at a public
- 6 information session about the RFP process that took
- 7 place on November 21st, 2011. Is that correct?
- MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: Yes.
- 9 MR. JOHN MATHER: I appreciate you
- 10 haven't been at the Inquiry hearings, but the evidence
- 11 before the Inquiry has been that at this point in
- 12 time, November 21st, 2011, Mr. Bonwick had been
- 13 involved in the potential sale for quite a period of
- 14 time up until that point.
- Did he never raise that with you?
- MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: No, he did not.
- 17 MR. JOHN MATHER: At a general level,
- 18 did you and Mr. Houghton discuss his business or his
- 19 work?
- 20 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: We don't
- 21 discuss anything about Collus.
- MR. JOHN MATHER: Was there a reason
- 23 you never discussed anything about Collus?
- 24 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: 'Cause it's
- 25 none of my business.

- 1 MR. JOHN MATHER: Is -- why did you
- 2 think it was none of your business?
- MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: Because that's
- 4 his work and that's confidential.
- 5 MR. JOHN MATHER: Is that something he
- 6 had ever expressed to you?
- 7 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: My husband?
- 8 MR. JOHN MATHER: Yes.
- 9 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: Yes.
- 10 MR. JOHN MATHER: What can you tell me
- 11 about how he expressed that to you?
- 12 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: I never really
- 13 asked him anything about it, so I would usually just
- 14 wait to hear -- if something's in the media, then I
- 15 might ask him a question.
- 16 MR. JOHN MATHER: So, if something was
- 17 in the media about Collus, that might lead you to ask
- 18 him a question?
- 19 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: I might ask
- 20 him, yes.
- 21 MR. JOHN MATHER: And I understood
- 22 from your earlier answers that you had a sense from
- 23 Mr. Houghton that he wasn't in a position to talk to
- 24 about his work because of confidentiality, and I was
- 25 wondering how you formed that impression.

- 1 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: Well, he was
- 2 the head of the Utility and I don't think I would want
- 3 to know something before the rest of the people that
- 4 he works with would know anything.
- 5 MR. JOHN MATHER: So, I take that from
- 6 your perspective. I'm wondering did he say anything
- 7 to you along those lines that you can recall, that I'm
- 8 not in a position to talk to you about my work?
- 9 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: No, I don't
- 10 think so.
- MR. JOHN MATHER: Any other reason
- 12 you had the sense that Mr. Houghton couldn't tell you
- 13 about his work?
- 14 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: No. I just --
- 15 from the office that he held, I just wouldn't put him
- 16 in that position.
- 17 MR. JOHN MATHER: Did it surprise you
- 18 on November 21st, 2011, to learn that Collus was
- 19 undergoing an RFP process?
- MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: I quess I
- 21 didn't think of it.
- 22 MR. JOHN MATHER: Prior to November
- 23 21st, 2011, did you and Houghton have discussions
- 24 about what his plans for the future were in terms of
- 25 whether he planned to work for a num -- a number of

- 1 years, whether he planned to retire?
- MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: Not in 2011, I
- 3 don't think so.
- 4 MR. JOHN MATHER: What was your
- 5 understanding at that time about what your husband's
- 6 intentions were in terms of his employment?
- 7 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: My husband
- 8 loved his job and he would still be working right now
- 9 if things were different.
- 10 MR. JOHN MATHER: After you found out
- 11 about the Collus RFP, did you and Mr. Houghton then
- 12 have discussions about the sale of Collus?
- MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: I don't believe
- 14 so.
- MR. JOHN MATHER: Did you and Mr.
- 16 Houghton ever have discussions about how a sale of
- 17 Collus might affect his employment?
- 18 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: None that I can
- 19 think of.
- MR. JOHN MATHER: Do you recall
- 21 whether you personally in your own mind had any
- 22 questions about whether or not the sale might affect
- 23 what -- his employment, given that there may be a
- 24 different company that has some involvement in -- in
- 25 Collus?

1 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: Can you repeat

- 2 that, please?
- 3 MR. JOHN MATHER: Did you ever turn in
- 4 your own mind to -- did you ever think to yourself
- 5 whether or not the sale may affect his employment? I
- 6 appreciate you maybe didn't speak to him about it, but
- 7 is that something you considered?
- MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: No, not really.
- 9 MR. JOHN MATHER: So, Mr. Bonwick has
- 10 given evidence at the Inquiry that in this time
- 11 period, 2011, he was looking to convince Mr. Houghton
- 12 to retire from Collus and join him in business,
- 13 including in respect of the solar attic vents.
- 14 Were those conversations you were aware
- 15 of in 2011?
- 16 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: No, I don't
- 17 think so.
- 18 MR. JOHN MATHER: And I know you state
- 19 in your affidavit you weren't aware of any business
- 20 conversations that may or may not take place between
- 21 Mr. Bonwick and Mr. Houghton.
- 22 Did you have any sense at all that they
- 23 were ever discussing potential business opportunities,
- 24 either together or Mr. Bonwick proposing things to Mr.
- 25 Houghton?

- 1 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: No.
- MR. JOHN MATHER: If Mr. Houghton was
- 3 having discussions with Mr. Bonwick about potential
- 4 retirement and new opportunities, is that something
- 5 you think he would have spoken to you about?
- MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: Yes.
- 7 MR. JOHN MATHER: What was the nature
- 8 of your relationship with Joan and Dean Muncaster?
- 9 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: I found them
- 10 both to be lovely people. I know that Ed and Dean
- 11 spent a lot of time together, and I've seen them at a
- 12 few social gatherings and I found Joan to be a lovely
- 13 person, talked to her quite a bit, but I really
- 14 haven't seen her since her husband has passed away.
- 15 MR. JOHN MATHER: And -- and then
- 16 prior to that unfortunate event, would you consider
- 17 you and Ms. Muncaster to have been friends?
- 18 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: A bit more than
- 19 acquaintances.
- 20 MR. JOHN MATHER: Would you attend
- 21 social events with Ms. Muncaster, Mr. Houghton, and
- 22 Mr. Muncaster?
- 23 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: During the
- 24 '11/'12 time period?
- MR. JOHN MATHER: Yes.

- 1 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: I remember
- 2 being at one -- one event but I don't recall the date.
- MR. JOHN MATHER: Prior to the '11/'12
- 4 period was there more interaction?
- 5 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: I think we
- 6 might have been to dinner with them once and then once
- 7 at a social event.
- MR. JOHN MATHER: During these events
- 9 where you were -- the four (4) of you were together,
- 10 with Ed and -- sorry, Mr. Houghton and Mr. Muncaster
- 11 discuss business together?
- 12 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: Not that I
- 13 recall.
- 14 MR. JOHN MATHER: Could you please
- 15 pull up TOC249903.1? And scroll to the bottom.

16

17 (BRIEF PAUSE)

- 19 MR. JOHN MATHER: Go to the bottom of
- 20 the email chain.
- 21 So, we can -- we can scroll through
- 22 this, Ms. Houghton, as -- to make sure you're familiar
- 23 and comfortable with it. I'll just describe it.
- It's an email chain, if we scroll up,
- 25 that --

- 1 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: I'm familiar
- 2 with it.
- 3 MR. JOHN MATHER: You're familiar with
- 4 it?
- 5 So, it's an email chain between you and
- 6 Ms. Muncaster, mostly talking about vaca -- vacation
- 7 plans that Ms. Muncaster has, if she'll be in Florida,
- 8 things along those lines. So if we scroll up -- keep
- 9 scrolling up.
- 10 Then we get to an email on November
- 11 28th, 2012, from Ms. Muncaster to yourself. She's
- 12 responding to an invitation you made to her about
- 13 coming and visiting you in Florida, and she talks
- 14 about some of her other plans. And then at the bottom
- 15 of the email marked in red, or just before the red, it
- 16 says:
- "Oh, by the way, there is a rumour
- going around Collingwood that Paul
- Bonwick received \$750,000 for the
- 20 Collus PowerStream deal! I'm still
- 21 laughing!! Small town. I wonder
- 22 what they think I'm doing -- ha ha.
- 23 Hope it's good."
- And then if we can scroll up.
- You then forward that email to Mr.

- 1 Houghton, and write:
- 2 "Read the red."
- MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: M-hm.
- 4 MR. JOHN MATHER: I take it that the
- 5 red you're referring to is the text in red in an email
- 6 below?
- 7 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: Yes.
- 8 MR. JOHN MATHER: And I take it you
- 9 turned that text from black to red to bring it to Mr.
- 10 Houghton's attention?
- 11 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: I don't think
- 12 so. I think it came in red.
- MR. JOHN MATHER: So you think -- your
- 14 recollection is Joan -- when you received this email
- 15 from Ms. Muncaster, that text was already in red?
- MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: Yes.
- 17 MR. JOHN MATHER: Okay. Why did you
- 18 send this email to Mr. Houghton at this point in time?
- 19 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: I thought he
- 20 would like to know about a potential rumour.
- 21 MR. JOHN MATHER: Prior to receiving
- 22 this email from Ms. Muncaster, had -- were you aware
- 23 of any other ru -- rumours in -- in relation to the
- 24 Collus transaction?
- MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: No.

- 1 MR. JOHN MATHER: At this point in
- 2 time, November 2012, the Collus transaction was
- 3 complete. It -- it closed, to use the legal term, in
- 4 July 2012.
- In November 2012, what was your
- 6 understanding about Mr. Bonwick's involvement in the
- 7 Collus PowerStream deal?

8

9 (BRIEF PAUSE)

- 11 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: At what time
- 12 period?
- MR. JOHN MATHER: November 2012, so
- 14 four (4) or so months after the transaction closed.
- MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: I'm sorry, ca -
- 16 can you read the question again?
- 17 MR. JOHN MATHER: Certainly. What was
- 18 your understanding at this point in time of what Mr.
- 19 Bonwick's involvement had been in the Collus and
- 20 PowerStream deal?
- 21 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: I believe I
- 22 knew he was involved and I -- I really don't know to -
- 23 to what extent.
- 24 MR. JOHN MATHER: When did you first
- 25 become aware that he was involved?

- 1 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: I can't
- 2 recollect.
- 3 MR. JOHN MATHER: Can you recall how
- 4 you became aware he was involved?
- 5 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: No.
- 6 MR. JOHN MATHER: Is it possible Mr.
- 7 Houghton told you about his involvement?
- 8 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: I'd only be
- 9 guessing if I answered the question.
- 10 MR. JOHN MATHER: I don't want you to
- 11 guess, so thank you. After you sent this email to Mr.
- 12 Houghton what happened?
- 13 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: I believe he
- 14 read it.
- MR. JOHN MATHER: Did he tell you that
- 16 he read it?
- MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: No.
- 18 MR. JOHN MATHER: Did you have any
- 19 further conversations with him about what Ms.
- 20 Muncaster had written?
- MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: No.
- MR. JOHN MATHER: Did you have any
- 23 conversations with him about Mr. Bonwick's involvement
- 24 in the Collus PowerStream transaction after you
- 25 received this?

1 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: Oh, I think I

- 2 might have said, you know, is this true that he
- 3 received that amount of money.
- 4 MR. JOHN MATHER: Do you recall asking
- 5 him that question?
- 6 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: I think I would
- 7 have asked that question.
- MR. JOHN MATHER: Do you recall -- it
- 9 doesn't -- it's not clear to me if you specifically
- 10 recall asking him the question, but do you recall
- 11 whether Mr. Houghton ever explained to you whether he
- 12 did receive this amount of money?
- MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: I believe Mr.
- 14 Houghton's thoughts were that's crazy.
- MR. JOHN MATHER: And when you say you
- 16 believe, are you recalling having a conversation with
- 17 him about this?
- 18 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: I just re --
- 19 remember the gist of it, you know.
- 20 MR. JOHN MATHER: Did he say anything
- 21 else other than that, That's cray?
- MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: No.
- MR. JOHN MATHER: Did you get the
- 24 sense that this was a piece of information that
- 25 surprised him?

- 1 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: I think he was
- 2 wondering where the rumours are coming from.
- 3 MR. JOHN MATHER: Did he say anything
- 4 to you more about this?
- 5 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: No
- 6 MR. JOHN MATHER: I have some
- 7 questions now about Mr. Bonwick's rental of your
- 8 property in 2011/2012. If we could go to paragraph 11
- 9 of your affidavit.

10

11 (BRIEF PAUSE)

12

MR. JOHN MATHER: Excuse me.

14

15 (BRIEF PAUSE)

- 17 MR. JOHN MATHER: So, in this
- 18 paragraph you describe an interaction you and Mr.
- 19 Bonwick had in which he inquired whether your property
- 20 was for rent in the upcoming winter, give or take.
- In the last sentence of the paragraph
- 22 you say:
- 23 "Mr. Bonwick had his own property on
- 24 the Atlantic coast and said he
- 25 wanted to try somewhere on the gulf

- 1 cost."
- MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: Correct.
- MR. JOHN MATHER: At that point in
- 4 time, how did you know that Mr. Bonwick had a property
- 5 on the Atlantic coast?
- 6 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: I've known that
- 7 Mr. Bonwick has on occasion rented properties on that
- 8 coast.
- 9 MR. JOHN MATHER: Did you know whether
- 10 or not he owned any properties on that coast?
- 11 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: I don't believe
- 12 that I knew that he owned any property over there.
- MR. JOHN MATHER: At that point in
- 14 time, was it your understanding that he was a renter
- 15 or an owner?
- 16 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: A renter.
- 17 MR. JOHN MATHER: And what was the
- 18 basis of that understanding?
- MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: I think I just
- 20 know that he had different locations.
- 21 MR. JOHN MATHER: So, he was staying
- 22 in different places from year to year?
- MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: M-hm. I don't
- 24 know from year to year, but I just know that he's
- 25 moved locations.

1 MR. JOHN MATHER: Did you ever stay at

- 2 any of the properties that Mr. Bonwick rented on the
- 3 Atlantic coast?
- 4 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: I did stay at
- 5 one (1) with my sister.
- 6 MR. JOHN MATHER: Do you remember when
- 7 that was?
- 8 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: It was in
- 9 around 2009.
- 10 MR. JOHN MATHER: Was that the only
- 11 time you stayed at one (1) of Mr. Bonwick's
- 12 properties?
- MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: Yes.
- 14
- 15 (BRIEF PAUSE)
- 16
- 17 MR. JOHN MATHER: Focusing now on this
- 18 period of time, and I understand now that Mr. Bonwick
- 19 rented the property, I just want to make sure I have
- 20 this correct, November and December 2011, and then
- 21 March, April 2012?
- MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: April, May.
- MR. JOHN MATHER: April, May 2012.
- 24 Thank you. Did you know during those two (2) time
- 25 periods how often Mr. Bonwick was at your property in

- 1 Florida?
- MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: No, I do not.
- 3 MR. JOHN MATHER: So, Mr. Bonwick's
- 4 evidence has been that he was seldom actually at the
- 5 property during those periods of time. Today
- 6 indicated -- he indicated he went there perhaps twice
- 7 in the fall for three (3) to four (4) days and
- 8 suggested that he maybe did not go there at all during
- 9 the -- what I'll call the spring portion of the
- 10 rental.
- 11 Were you aware of that?
- 12 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: I think I've
- 13 just became aware of it.
- 14 MR. JOHN MATHER: So, in the course of
- 15 this proceeding?
- MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: Probably before
- 17 the proceedings, yes.
- 18 MR. JOHN MATHER: But you weren't
- 19 aware of it at the time. Is that -- is that --
- MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: No.
- 21 MR. JOHN MATHER: Did Mr. Bonwick ever
- 22 ask you for a refund in respect of the vacation
- 23 rental?
- 24 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: No. But I know
- 25 that he asked Ed for a refund.

- 1 MR. JOHN MATHER: And how did you know
- 2 that he asked Ed for a refund?
- MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: Because Ed told
- 4 me.
- 5 MR. JOHN MATHER: When did Ed tell you
- 6 that?
- 7 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: Probably a
- 8 couple years ago.
- 9 MR. JOHN MATHER: So, when you say, "A
- 10 couple years ago," are you referring to 2016/2017?
- MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: No, probably
- 12 before that.
- MR. JOHN MATHER: Was it in and around
- 14 2011 when Mr. Bonwick was renting the property?
- MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: It was probably
- 16 in around 2012.
- 17 MR. JOHN MATHER: So, sometime in the
- 18 year following?
- MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: Yes.
- 20 MR. JOHN MATHER: Okay. What did he
- 21 say to you when he said that Mr. Bonwick had requested
- 22 a refund?
- MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: He said to go
- 24 speak to Shirley, but he did not approach me for a
- 25 refund.

1 MR. JOHN MATHER: So, is it your

- 2 understanding that Mr. Bonwick had requested the
- 3 refund at some point in 2012?
- 4 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: Yes.
- 5 MR. JOHN MATHER: So, after the -- the
- 6 term of the rental was over?
- 7 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: Correct.
- 8 MR. JOHN MATHER: Okay. Did you stay
- 9 at the property in January, February, March of that
- 10 year when Mr. Bonwick was not renting it?
- MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: I might have
- 12 been there for a small portion of it.
- MR. JOHN MATHER: Did anyone else rent
- 14 the property from you during that per -- period of
- 15 time?
- MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: Not that I'm
- 17 aware of.
- 18 MR. JOHN MATHER: And you would be the
- 19 person who would be aware of who rented the property?
- MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: Hopefully.

21

22 (BRIEF PAUSE)

- 24 MR. JOHN MATHER: Just on that, how do
- 25 you know what months Mr. Bonwick rented the property

- 1 for?
- MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: Because he
- 3 asked me.
- 4 MR. JOHN MATHER: So, it's based on
- 5 your recollection of that conversation with him?
- MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: Yes. Yeah.
- 7 MR. JOHN MATHER: And I understand
- 8 there wasn't any other documentation with respect to
- 9 the rental?
- 10 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: No. When we
- 11 were speaking, he had asked about those months.
- 12 MR. JOHN MATHER: Did you ever visit
- 13 the property while Mr. Bonwick was at the property?
- MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: No.

15

16 (BRIEF PAUSE)

17

- 18 MR. JOHN MATHER: So if we could go to
- 19 Exhibit I, which is at page 26 of your affidavit.

20

21 (BRIEF PAUSE)

- MR. JOHN MATHER: So, this, Ms.
- 24 Houghton, as I'm sure you're familiar, is one (1) in a
- 25 series of documents that you've provided to the

- 1 inquiry to illustrate the amounts you had charged
- 2 renters in the past and after Mr. Bonwick's rental
- 3 period.
- 4 This one (1) is a letter from November
- 5 28th, 2016, and it's -- just to start, it -- it sets
- 6 out a confirmation of the rental. And it looks like
- 7 you've provided us a few letters that are in a similar
- 8 format.
- 9 Is this sort of a standard letter you
- 10 would use for renters?
- 11 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: I think it
- 12 developed a bit year over year. I would add a few
- 13 more lines in.
- 14 MR. JOHN MATHER: But you would return
- 15 to the letters you'd previously used?
- MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: Sorry?
- 17 MR. JOHN MATHER: You would return to
- 18 letters you'd previously used and update them?
- MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: Maybe just add
- 20 in a bit more stuff. I think on this one (1) I added
- 21 in, Our villa's smoke free, no pets allowed, we are
- 22 not liable for anyone residing on our property.
- MR. JOHN MATHER: Do you know why you
- 24 didn't provide this sort of letter to Mr. Bonwick?
- MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: Well, I was

- 1 speaking to him in person. I guess, in hindsight, I
- 2 should have went home and typed him a letter.
- 3 MR. JOHN MATHER: So, at the time
- 4 though, did -- did you think whether or not you should
- 5 send this sort of letter?
- 6 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: No, because I
- 7 was speaking to him in person about it.
- 8 MR. JOHN MATHER: So, we see in this
- 9 letter that it's dated November 28th, 2016, and the
- 10 rental period being contemplated is January 17th to
- 11 February 2018.
- 12 I take it from this that, at least in
- 13 this instance, you were able to find a renter for
- 14 January and November of the year before?

15

16 (BRIEF PAUSE)

- MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: I'm not sure I
- 19 follow your question.
- 20 MR. JOHN MATHER: And -- and perhaps
- 21 it's obvious on the document, but I'm just confirming
- 22 that, in this case, it was November and you were able
- 23 to find a renter for the -- the upcoming January?
- MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: Yes.
- MR. JOHN MATHER: Okay. And so, I

- 1 take it that, had Mr. Bonwick sought a refund after he
- 2 visited only seldom in the fall, and I appreciate you
- 3 didn't know about it, but had he sought a refund at
- 4 that point in time, it -- it was something you might
- 5 have been able to do again, is find a new renter for -
- 6 -
- 7 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: Yes.
- 8 MR. JOHN MATHER: -- the spring?
- 9 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: But he didn't
- 10 let me know in time.
- 11 MR. JOHN MATHER: But just to confirm
- 12 because we spoke over each other, that -- that is
- 13 something you could have done?
- MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: Yes.
- MR. JOHN MATHER: If we could go to
- 16 Exhibit L, which is page 33 of the affidavit. So, Ms.
- 17 Houghton, this is the first of two (2) emails that you
- 18 reference in your affidavit in which Mr. Houghton
- 19 receives an email from Peter Budd that's addressed to
- 20 him and Mr. Bonwick regarding the solar attic vent
- 21 company in which he then forwards on to you.
- So, this one (1) is dated September
- 23 21st, 2011. And if we go down to the -- the body of
- 24 the main email -- sorry. Thank you. Mr. Budd writes
- 25 Mr. Houghton, "I'm working on a marketing" -- sorry,

```
Mr. Houghton and Mr. Bonwick, "I'm working on a
   marketing agreement today." And then he goes on to
 3
   say:
                      "Rather than us sit around
 5
                      discussing fees, insurance, rent,
 6
                      utilities, admin allocations, et
                      cetera, what would you both say
                      about being paid a flat fee per unit
 9
                      reflecting your 35 percent?"
10
                   And then he goes on to say:
11
                      "So, if we sell units at a hundred
12
                      and seventy-five (175) to Ontario
13
                      utilities and the profit is a
14
                      hundred and twenty (120) per unit,
15
                      you are paid a set 35 percent of the
16
                      one twenty (120), or fifty dollars
17
                      ($50) a uni -- unit."
18
                   When Mr. Houghton forwarded the email
19
   to you do you know why he did it?
20
                   MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: He likes to
   read things on -- on the computer versus his
21
22
  BlackBerry.
23
                   MR. JOHN MATHER: And what computer
24 are you referring to?
2.5
                   MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: My computer.
```

1 MR. JOHN MATHER: And where was -- at

- 2 this point in time, was that computer in your home?
- MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: Yes.
- 4 MR. JOHN MATHER: Okay. Do you know
- 5 why he would send emails from his BlackBerry to your
- 6 Gmail account and not to his Gmail account?
- 7 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: I think he
- 8 likes my computer.
- 9 MR. JOHN MATHER: Was there anything
- 10 preventing Mr. Houghton from accessing his Gmail
- 11 account on your computer?

12

13 (BRIEF PAUSE)

- 15 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: Not that I'm
- 16 aware of.
- 17 MR. JOHN MATHER: Are you aware if he
- 18 ever did check his Gmail account on your computer?
- 19 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: I don't think
- 20 he checks it that often.
- 21 MR. JOHN MATHER: Turning back to the
- 22 email here, do you recall if you read the content of
- 23 the email that Mr. Houghton forwarded to you when he
- 24 sent it to you?
- 25 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: No, I -- I did

- 1 not read this one.
- MR. JOHN MATHER: Did you ask Mr.
- 3 Houghton anything about this email when he sent it to
- 4 you?
- 5 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: I didn't read
- 6 it.
- 7 MR. JOHN MATHER: So, I take it from
- 8 that, your answer is, no, you didn't ask him?
- 9 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: No, because I -
- 10 I've not read it.
- MR. JOHN MATHER: So, if we could go
- 12 to the next email you reference in your affidavit,
- 13 which is Exhibit K, paragraph -- sorry, page 30.
- 14
- 15 (BRIEF PAUSE)
- 16
- 17 MR. JOHN MATHER: So, again, this is
- 18 an email. The email chain begins with an email from
- 19 Peter Budd to Mr. Bonwick and Mr. Houghton which is
- 20 then forwarded on to you?
- 21 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: I have seen
- 22 part of the body of this one.
- MR. JOHN MATHER: What do you mean you
- 24 have seen that?
- 25 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: Because it was

- 1 sent to my computer.
- MR. JOHN MATHER: And so, we see that
- 3 above it was sent to your Gmail account. Do you
- 4 recall reading this email at that point in time?
- 5 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: I remember
- 6 scanning, reading it really quickly.
- 7 MR. JOHN MATHER: And what do you
- 8 remember about what you learned when you read and
- 9 scanned it.
- 10 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: If you scroll
- 11 down a wee bit, right in about there. So, I went to
- 12 Ed and I said, Are we in -- are we in this business.
- 13 And he said, No, we are not in this business.
- 14 MR. JOHN MATHER: So, I want to ask
- 15 you a couple questions about that. Why did you get
- 16 the sense -- or why did you ask him, Are we in this
- 17 business? What impression did you get from this
- 18 email?
- 19 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: The sentence
- 20 that starts with, "Then."
- MR. JOHN MATHER: So:
- 22 "Then, with Ed and Paul, the
- inaugural LDC in sight, we
- 24 established an amended sharing
- agreement, the 35-35-30 for TBEH --

- 1 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: Yes.
- MR. JOHN MATHER: -- PB -- and PB.
- 3 So I just want to -- what did you
- 4 understand about that sentence when you read it?
- 5 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: I wanted to
- 6 know if we were in a business.
- 7 MR. JOHN MATHER: Because you got the
- 8 impression from this that that's something that might
- 9 have happened?
- 10 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: Not might have
- 11 happened, no.
- 12 MR. JOHN MATHER: That had happened?
- MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: No.
- 14 MR. JOHN MATHER: So what -- I just
- 15 want to understand what -- what you understood at that
- 16 point in time that led you to ask Mr. Houghton are we
- 17 in this business or are we in a business.
- 18 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: Or a potential
- 19 for a business.
- MR. JOHN MATHER: And Mr. Houghton's
- 21 response to you was no, we're not?
- MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: No, we're not
- 23 in -- in a business.
- 24 MR. JOHN MATHER: Did he say anything
- 25 else to you about it?

- 1 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: He said if we
- 2 were in a business, I would have told you about it.
- 3 MR. JOHN MATHER: Did you have any
- 4 other further discussions with Mr. Houghton about --
- 5 about the solar attic vents, about Mr. Budd, about Mr.
- 6 Bonwick and potential businesses?
- 7 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: At the launch -
- 8 I was at the launch event.
- 9 MR. JOHN MATHER: So you were at the
- 10 launch event and I believe that occurred in August
- 11 2011.
- 12 This email is dated November 2011. In
- 13 August 2011 were you aware that there were -- of any
- 14 discussions between Mr. Houghton, Mr. Bonwick and Mr.
- 15 Budd about a potential business?
- MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: No, just this
- 17 email.
- 18 MR. JOHN MATHER: So this -- this came
- 19 in November so a few months later?
- 20 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: This email?
- MR. JOHN MATHER: This, yes.
- MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: Yes.
- MR. JOHN MATHER: And after this email
- 24 did you have any distribution -- further discussions
- 25 with Mr. Houghton about the solar attic vent company?

1 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: I don't recall

- 2 having any further discussions.
- 3 MR. JOHN MATHER: And how often would
- 4 Mr. Houghton forward emails to your gmail account?
- 5 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: Not that often.
- 6 MR. JOHN MATHER: Would you typically
- 7 read them when you receive them or what would you do?
- 8 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: No, I think he
- 9 would just forward them when he was sitting there.
- 10 MR. JOHN MATHER: So in that sentence
- 11 that you identified, it ends with saying:
- "Cash was fully distributed to
- 13 Compenso and partially to PB and
- 14 TB."
- The evidence before the Inquiry shows
- 16 that on October 3rd, 2011, so about a month or a bit
- 17 longer before this email was sent, that Compenso
- 18 received \$35,000 from the solar attic vent company.
- 19 Was that something that you were aware
- 20 of at the time?
- MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: No.
- MR. JOHN MATHER: Did you have any
- 23 visibility into the finances of Compenso in your role
- 24 as a -- as an administrative helper to Mr. Bonwick?
- MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: No.

1 MR. JOHN MATHER: So if we could go to

- 2 -- actually, one additional question, did you ever
- 3 speak with Mr. Houghton or did Mr. Houghton ever
- 4 inform you that Compenso received any money in respect
- 5 of the solar attic vents?
- MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: No.
- 7 MR. JOHN MATHER: If we go to
- 8 paragraph 48 of the summary document 13. So I'm just
- 9 bringing you here, this is what I referred to earlier
- 10 that the evidence indicates that Compenso deposited a
- 11 \$35,000 cheque on October 3rd, 2011 and Mr. Bonwick's
- 12 evidence was that this represented the 35 percent that
- 13 Compenso was received in relation to the sale of the
- 14 attic vents for the solar launch initiative.
- And then if we go to paragraph 13 of
- 16 your affidavit. So this is where you set out how the
- 17 cheque for the 19.350 was broken down, it was 1,350
- 18 for work you had completed for Mr. Bonwick and then
- 19 18,000 for the rental.
- 20 After you had the conversation with Mr.
- 21 Houghton in November, when you received the second
- 22 email and you asked him if you were involved in the
- 23 business, after that conversation did you ever
- 24 consider whether or not the payment you received for
- 25 the Florida rental was in any way related to what was

- 1 being discussed in that email in terms of distribution
- 2 of profits in respect of solar attic vents?
- MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: No, it was for
- 4 Florida rent and for my invoice.
- 5 MR. JOHN MATHER: If we go to
- 6 paragraph 677 of the Foundation Document.
- 7 THE HONOURABLE FRANK MARROCCO: Just
- 8 before you do that, I -- I was only looking at these
- 9 documents now. I -- I thought the rent on the Florida
- 10 condo was -- was higher than that.
- MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: It was \$4,500 a
- 12 month.
- 13 THE HONOURABLE FRANK MARROCCO: US or
- 14 Canadian?
- 15 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: It was Canadian
- 16 then.

- 18 CONTINUED BY MR. JOHN MATHER:
- 19 MR. JOHN MATHER: So if we could go to
- 20 paragraph 677 of the Foundation Document. And I
- 21 actually wanted to look at table 7-7.
- So this table sets out the payments you
- 23 received from Compenso in 2011 and 2012 and you've
- 24 stated in your affidavit that this -- this table is
- 25 accurate.

- I just have a few questions. We see
- 2 you receive a -- a first payment in March 2011 and
- 3 then there isn't a second payment until June 2011,
- 4 what happened between March and June?
- 5 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: I don't have
- 6 the time sheets, so, I'll have to rely on memory.
- 7 I believe I worked probably 12 hours
- 8 for that first cheque and a lot of it was doing stuff
- 9 for the Lobbyist Registrar website.
- 10 MR. JOHN MATHER: Do you recall not
- 11 having much -- receiving much work from Mr. Bonwick
- 12 from March to June of that year?
- MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: I did a lot of
- 14 congratulatory letters in around the March 3rd time
- 15 period.
- 16 MR. JOHN MATHER: Would that work then
- 17 be reflected in the March 9th, 2011 payment here?
- 18 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: I don't have a
- 19 copy of my invoices, sorry.
- MR. JOHN MATHER: Is that what you
- 21 would need to refresh your memory?
- MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: Yes.
- MR. JOHN MATHER: And then going
- 24 through, there's payments in June, July, August,
- 25 September, October of 2011. And the October one is

- 1 the -- the invoice that we've been looking at for
- 2 19,350. Then there is nothing until August 2012.
- Why was there a gap for roughly ten
- 4 (10) months?
- 5 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: I wasn't really
- 6 doing much work for Mr. Bonwick then.
- 7 MR. JOHN MATHER: Why did the work, at
- 8 least for a period of time, stop at the end -- in
- 9 October 2011?
- 10 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: I -- I don't
- 11 know.
- 12 MR. JOHN MATHER: I take it -- maybe I
- 13 shouldn't take it. When Mr. Bonwick wanted you to do
- 14 work, he would ask you?
- 15 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: Correct.
- MR. JOHN MATHER: Would you ever do
- 17 any work that Mr. Bonwick didn't ask you to do?
- MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: No.
- 19 MR. JOHN MATHER: Do you recall what
- 20 work you did that led to the August 2012 invoice of
- 21 \$2,500?
- MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: He had
- 23 approached me to see if I would do a lot of Christmas
- 24 cards for him, there's probably 5-600 Christmas cards.
- 25 And prior to that I had created a really big database

- 1 of all of the Members of Parliament and he wanted
- 2 Christmas cards to be sent to all these people.
- 3 But I had already given him the
- 4 database back, so I had to retrieve the database from
- 5 him and then I had to review that everyone was still
- 6 at their current address, et cetera.
- 7 And I did the Christmas cards. I had
- 8 to take the database, get the labels printed, get the
- 9 cards done and put the postage on and have them
- 10 mailed.
- 11 So he asked me how much would it cost
- 12 to do all that and so I gave him a rough price of
- 13 \$2,500 for -- for the whole deal.
- MR. JOHN MATHER: Were you surprised
- 15 that you hadn't heard from Mr. Bonwick with respect to
- 16 work for approximately ten (10) months?
- MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: No, I just
- 18 figured my work was based on what contracts he had.
- 19 MR. JOHN MATHER: And after August
- 20 2012, did you expect that you may receive further work
- 21 from Mr. Bonwick?
- MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: No. I think I
- 23 was doing work, golfing, going to Florida a bit more
- 24 often, not as available for work.
- MR. JOHN MATHER: Is that something

- 1 you told him?
- 2 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: No.
- MR. JOHN MATHER: After August 2012,
- 4 did Mr. Bonwick ask you to do any further work?
- 5 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: No.
- 6 MR. JOHN MATHER: With respect to the
- 7 dates in the -- to which Mr. Bonwick rented your
- 8 Florida property, how did you realize the dates in the
- 9 affidavit were incorrect?
- 10 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: Because I knew
- 11 what dates I rented to him.
- MR. JOHN MATHER: Okay. And in term -
- 13 so there was nothing you referenced to realize the
- 14 dates that you had put in the affidavit were
- 15 incorrect?
- 16 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: No, I just
- 17 assumed she took the notes down wrong during the
- 18 witness interview.
- 19 MR. JOHN MATHER: Did you read the
- 20 affidavit before it was sworn?
- MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: Yes.
- MR. JOHN MATHER: Just a few more
- 23 questions. Can we pull up TOC399870.1?
- 24 So this is an email from 2014, it's an
- 25 email from you to Mr. Houghton and you attached two

- 1 (2) attachments, one's called Solar Vent Cash Flows,
- 2 January 3rd, 2014, the other one is called Compost
- 3 Cash Flows January 3rd, 2014.
- 4 And I'd like to open up the solar vent
- 5 cash flows which is the same document ID but with
- 6 another .1. So just to assist you, Ms. Houghton, this
- 7 is what the one (1) attachment --
- 8 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: Yes, I've not
- 9 seen these before.
- 10 MR. JOHN MATHER: Do you know why you
- 11 sent them to Mr. Houghton in 2014?
- MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: I don't recall
- 13 sending them or seeing them.
- 14 MR. JOHN MATHER: Do you have any
- 15 reason to believe that the email showing you sent --
- 16 the email showing that it came from your email to his
- 17 email is -- is inaccurate or it wasn't sent?
- 18 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: I've not seen
- 19 this email before.
- 20 MR. JOHN MATHER: Did Mr. Houghton
- 21 have access to your gmail without your -- did he have
- 22 your password?
- 23 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: I don't think I
- 24 have a password.
- 25 MR. JOHN MATHER: So could be access

- 1 your gmail if he logged onto your computer?
- MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: Yes.
- 3 MR. JOHN MATHER: Did you -- stepping
- 4 aside from this email, did you have any knowledge of
- 5 the solar attic vent business or a compost deodorizer
- 6 business in 2014?
- 7 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: Can you say
- 8 that again?
- 9 MR. JOHN MATHER: The two (2)
- 10 attachments to this email, one (1) is cash flows for
- 11 solar attic vents, business, the other one is a cash
- 12 flow statement for a compost deodorizer.
- 13 Did you have any knowledge of any
- 14 businesses along those lines in 2014?
- MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: No
- MR. JOHN MATHER: Did you know if Mr.
- 17 Houghton had any involvement at that point in time
- 18 with any businesses that Mr. Bonwick was involved in?
- MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: No.
- 20 MR. JOHN MATHER: Those are my
- 21 questions.
- THE HONOURABLE FRANK MARROCCO: All
- 23 right. Mr. Chenoweth, you're going to go last, I
- 24 assume?
- MR. FREDERICK CHENOWETH: Yes, sir.

- 1 THE HONOURABLE FRANK MARROCCO:
- 2 Because it's your witness, Mr. Marron.
- Mr. Watson, who's ---
- 4 MR. MICHAEL WATSON: I quess I will,
- 5 Your Honour, just a -- a very few questions.

6

- 7 CROSS-EXAMINATION BY MR. MICHAEL WATSON:
- MR. MICHAEL WATSON: Ms. Houghton, my
- 9 name is Michael Watson, I'm one of the lawyers for
- 10 Electra, which is the new name for PowerStream.
- 11 By reference, I want to go back to
- 12 Exhibit A -- well, I guess maybe the paragraph in your
- 13 affidavit when you talk about Mr. Bonwick having sent
- 14 you the proposal and you did some thirty (30) minutes
- 15 of review. You remember that?
- 16 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: (NO AUDIBLE
- 17 RESPONSE).
- 18 THE HONOURABLE FRANK MARROCCO: It's
- 19 on the screen, Ms. Houghton. It's on the screen.
- MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: Yeah.

- 22 CONTINUED BY MR. MICHAEL WATSON:
- MR. MICHAEL WATSON: And that was in
- 24 January of 2011?
- MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: Yes.

- 1 MR. MICHAEL WATSON: Yes? All right.
- 2 And if we can look then at the exhibit, and that is --
- 3 sorry, I'm just taking a look here -- yes, Exhibit B.
- 4 And this, I take it, was the proposal that you looked
- 5 at and did some work on?
- 6 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: I don't recall
- 7 that I really did any work on it. I remember reading
- 8 it.
- 9 MR. MICHAEL WATSON: In your
- 10 affidavit, I think that you said something about --
- 11 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: I might have
- 12 made a couple of corrections, just grammatical
- 13 corrections.
- 14 MR. MICHAEL WATSON: All right.
- 15 And -- because I take it that that's what Mr. --
- 16 you're saying Mr. Bonwick asked you to do?
- MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: He asked me to
- 18 print and comment.
- MR. MICHAEL WATSON: Well, that was
- 20 in -- that was in the email, of course, right, that he
- 21 sent to you?
- MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: Yes.
- 23 MR. MICHAEL WATSON: And then my
- 24 understanding is that you were confused about when you
- 25 had got this, why you were getting it?

- 1 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: Correct.
- MR. MICHAEL WATSON: And that you
- 3 spoke with him, and I take it that was almost
- 4 immediately within an hour or something like that?
- 5 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: M-hm.
- 6 MR. MICHAEL WATSON: You'll have to
- 7 answer yes or no for the transcript.
- MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: Yes.
- 9 MR. MICHAEL WATSON: All right. And
- 10 he said, Oh, I'm sorry?
- MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: Sorry about
- 12 that.
- MR. MICHAEL WATSON: Right.
- MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: Yes.
- MR. MICHAEL WATSON: From which you
- 16 took it that he had sent it by mistake.
- MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: Yes.
- 18 MR. MICHAEL WATSON: All right. But
- 19 then at the very same time, he then asked you to look
- 20 it over?
- 21 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: Can you just
- 22 give it a quick read, or something like that.
- MR. MICHAEL WATSON: All right. And
- 24 did you understand then that he was then asking you to
- 25 look for -- well, for what exactly? Read it over for

- 1 what purpose? Did he say?
- MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: Well, I have --
- 3 I wouldn't have any knowledge of this stuff, so it
- 4 would just be grammatical errors.
- 5 MR. MICHAEL WATSON: Did he say what
- 6 he wanted you to do, what he wanted you to look it
- 7 over for?
- 8 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: No.
- 9 MR. MICHAEL WATSON: Did you ask him
- 10 what you were supposed to do? What this looking it
- 11 over for was all about, what he wanted from you?
- MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: No.
- MR. MICHAEL WATSON: And you didn't
- 14 ask.
- MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: Well, I did
- 16 phone him and said you sent this to me in error. And
- 17 he said, can you just take a quick read of it? So I
- 18 just took a quick read of it, and I noticed he'd made
- 19 some spelling mistakes. So --
- MR. MICHAEL WATSON: All right.
- 21 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: -- probably
- 22 from the time I got it to the time I phoned him back,
- 23 it might have been 30 minutes.
- 24 MR. MICHAEL WATSON: Which is what you
- 25 said in your affidavit, thirty (30) minutes.

- 1 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: M-hm.
- MR. MICHAEL WATSON: "Yes"?
- 3 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: Yes. But
- 4 not -- I didn't read it for thirty (30) minutes.
- 5 MR. MICHAEL WATSON: I understand.
- 6 But -- so you assumed when you got it that you got it
- 7 in error, and that's what you told him when you phoned
- 8 him?
- 9 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: Yes.
- 10 MR. MICHAEL WATSON: All right. And
- 11 he said that he was sorry about that?
- MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: Yes.
- 13 MR. MICHAEL WATSON: But then I take
- 14 it, immediately he asked you to look it over?
- MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: Yes.
- 16 MR. MICHAEL WATSON: But he didn't
- 17 tell you to look it over for what, what he wanted you
- 18 to look it over for?
- MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: No.
- MR. MICHAEL WATSON: And you didn't
- 21 ask him.
- MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: No.
- MR. MICHAEL WATSON: Right. And so
- 24 you read it over.
- 25 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: I just quickly

- 1 looked at it.
- 2 MR. MICHAEL WATSON: All right. And
- 3 it was a Word document. Do you see the attachment?
- 4 It was a .doc document, so it was in Word?
- 5 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: Okay.
- 6 MR. MICHAEL WATSON: Do you remember
- 7 that? We can look at the -- at the email.
- 8 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: No. I -- I
- 9 believe you, yes.
- 10 MR. MICHAEL WATSON: All right.
- MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: It was a long
- 12 time ago.
- 13 MR. MICHAEL WATSON: I understand.
- 14 And so you must obviously have opened it up in order
- 15 to take a look at it.
- 16 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: I did open it
- 17 up, yes.
- MR. MICHAEL WATSON: And you made some
- 19 changes, I take it. Not many, but you're saying you
- 20 made some changes?
- 21 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: I believe
- 22 grammatical changes.
- MR. MICHAEL WATSON: Right. And so
- 24 what that means is you must have made some changes in
- 25 the Word document, right?

- 1 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: Yes.
- 2 MR. MICHAEL WATSON: And then saved it
- 3 obviously? Yes?
- 4 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: Probably, yes.
- 5 MR. MICHAEL WATSON: All right. Well,
- 6 did you send him the revised document with the couple
- 7 of grammatical or changes that you made?
- MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: I don't recall.
- 9 Or if I just was speaking to him on the phone.
- 10 MR. MICHAEL WATSON: I see. All
- 11 right. You saw when you opened the document that it
- 12 was a -- well, first of all, that it said
- 13 Compenso Communications at the top, as we can see on
- 14 the screen? Yes?
- MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: Yes.
- 16 MR. MICHAEL WATSON: Had you ever
- 17 heard of Compenso before at that time?
- MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: No.
- 19 MR. MICHAEL WATSON: When you -- and
- 20 so you -- I take it you assumed that it had something
- 21 to do with Mr. Bonwick because he had sent it to your
- 22 Gmail account.
- MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: I thought that
- 24 must be the name of his company.
- MR. MICHAEL WATSON: And you saw then

- 1 that it said "communications and strategic
- 2 acquisitions proposal for PowerStream"? Because
- 3 that's on the front page right in front of us?
- 4 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: Yes, it's on
- 5 the front page.
- 6 MR. MICHAEL WATSON: Yeah. And you
- 7 obviously saw that?
- 8 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: I probably
- 9 looked at communication -- communication --
- 10 communication. I probably thought Paul was in the
- 11 communication business.
- MR. MICHAEL WATSON: Now, you didn't
- 13 have any idea what business he was in before this?
- MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: No.
- MR. MICHAEL WATSON: I see.
- MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: I knew that he
- 17 had been a member of Parliament.
- 18 MR. MICHAEL WATSON: Right. Had you
- 19 ever heard of the name PowerStream before you opened
- 20 this document that day and looked at it?
- MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: No.
- MR. MICHAEL WATSON: Your husband had
- 23 never mentioned PowerStream to you before?
- MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: No.
- MR. MICHAEL WATSON: And you -- you

1 had never heard that name as being an electricity

- 2 distribution company?
- 3 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: No.
- 4 MR. MICHAEL WATSON: I see. Now, as
- 5 at this date, January 19th of 2011, had you ever heard
- 6 the name Brian Bentz?
- 7 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: No.
- 8 MR. MICHAEL WATSON: When did you
- 9 first hear the name Brian Bentz?
- 10 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: I was
- 11 introduced to him at the solar launch.
- 12 MR. MICHAEL WATSON: I take it that
- 13 that was August of 2011, right? And you mentioned
- 14 that in your affidavit?
- MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: Yes.
- MR. MICHAEL WATSON: All right. And I
- 17 take it, therefore, your husband didn't tell you
- 18 anything about a meeting that he had with Mr. Bentz in
- 19 December, i.e. like the month -- about a month and a
- 20 half before you received this from Mr. Bonwick?
- 21 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: No.
- MR. MICHAEL WATSON: You talk about
- 23 the public information centre in your affidavit? That
- 24 was -- remember around November of 2011? We can look
- 25 at it again. Do you remember that? The public

- 1 information centre concerning Collus?
- MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: Yes.
- 3 MR. MICHAEL WATSON: All right. You
- 4 remember that.
- 5 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: Yes.
- 6 MR. MICHAEL WATSON: And I take it you
- 7 remember attending that.
- MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: Yes.
- 9 MR. MICHAEL WATSON: How did you find
- 10 out about that, that it was going to take place?
- 11 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: Are you talking
- 12 about the Leisure Time Club?
- 13 MR. MICHAEL WATSON: No. I'm talking
- 14 about the public information session. Why don't we
- 15 turn up your affidavit.
- MR. FREDERICK CHENOWETH: It took
- 17 place at the Leisure Club.
- MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: At the
- 19 Leisure Time.
- MR. MICHAEL WATSON: Oh, I see.
- 21 MR. FREDERICK CHENOWETH: Yes, yes.
- MR. MICHAEL WATSON: Okay. All right.
- 23 The location. All right. Thank you.
- 24
- 25 CONTINUED BY MR. MICHAEL WATSON:

- 1 MR. MICHAEL WATSON: Yes. They -- why
- 2 don't we -- why don't we just get that up. I'm not
- 3 sure where it is in your affidavit. We'll try to
- 4 catch up on this.

5

6 (BRIEF PAUSE)

- MR. MICHAEL WATSON: Yes, yes, yes.
- 9 Paragraph -- yes -- paragraph 15. All right.
- 10 Thank you.
- 11 All right. I take it that this public
- 12 information session was a session that you attended.
- 13 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: Correct.
- 14 MR. MICHAEL WATSON: All right. How
- 15 did you find out about it?
- MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: Ed told me.
- MR. MICHAEL WATSON: When?
- 18 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: Maybe a week or
- 19 so prior?
- MR. MICHAEL WATSON: What did you tell
- 21 you about it?
- MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: He said that --
- 23 that there was going to be a public information
- 24 centre -- a public information meeting at the centre.
- MR. MICHAEL WATSON: Did he tell you

- 1 what it was going to be about?
- MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: Probably. I
- 3 can't recall his exact words.
- 4 MR. MICHAEL WATSON: I'm not asking
- 5 you for exact words but the nature, the thrust of
- 6 approximately, you know, what -- approximately what he
- 7 told you, what the subject matter was that he told you
- 8 about.
- 9 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: Yes.
- 10 MR. MICHAEL WATSON: What did he tell
- 11 you?
- 12 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: I believe it
- 13 was about a potential sale at Collus.
- 14 MR. MICHAEL WATSON: I see. And --
- 15 and that, of course, was the company by which he was
- 16 employed?
- MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: Yes.
- 18 MR. MICHAEL WATSON: And he was the
- 19 CEO?
- MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: Yes.
- 21 MR. MICHAEL WATSON: All right. And
- 22 did that surprise you?
- MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: That there was
- 24 going to be a public information session?
- MR. MICHAEL WATSON: No, no. That the

- 1 subject matter was that there may be a sale of Collus.
- 2 Did that surprise you to hear that?
- MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: I didn't really
- 4 give it any consideration.
- 5 MR. MICHAEL WATSON: So your husband
- 6 had been employed at Collus for many, many years as
- 7 the CEO? Yes?
- 8 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: M-hm. Yes.
- 9 MR. MICHAEL WATSON: Is that a yes?
- 10 Was this the first time you heard anything whatsoever
- 11 about a possible sale of Collus?
- MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: I believe it
- 13 was.
- 14 MR. MICHAEL WATSON: But you didn't
- 15 give it any thought?
- MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: Well, if he's
- 17 looking after it, there's really no need for me to
- 18 think about it.
- MR. MICHAEL WATSON: Did you ask him
- 20 any questions about it?
- 21 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: Not really.
- MR. MICHAEL WATSON: As in, you know,
- 23 what's this all about?
- 24 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: No. He's very
- 25 competent, so I believe I know what he's doing.

- 1 MR. MICHAEL WATSON: All right. Sc
- 2 when you get to this -- I think it's Exhibit K with
- 3 this email -- and we'll talk about that in just a
- 4 moment -- which you did open up, you said you did go
- 5 and ask him a question about it. Right? And that is,
- 6 are we involved in this business?
- 7 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: I'm sorry.
- 8 Which one are you referring to?
- 9 MR. MICHAEL WATSON: Sure. Why
- 10 don't we -- why don't we go and take a look at that:
- 11 Exhibit K.
- 12
- 13 (BRIEF PAUSE)
- 14
- MR. MICHAEL WATSON: Sorry, it may be
- 16 Exhibit L. Again, we're -- I'm playing catchup on
- 17 this as well. Remember you were asked about
- 18 Exhibit L?
- 19 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: Yes. That's
- 20 the one I believe I didn't read it, but I did read
- 21 this one.
- MR. MICHAEL WATSON: I'm sorry.
- 23 Exhibit L is the one that you opened and looked at?
- 24
- 25 (BRIEF PAUSE)

- 1 MR. FREDERICK CHENOWETH: The document
- 2 the witness said she opened and looked at was
- 3 TOC65379.

- 5 CONTINUED BY MR. MICHAEL WATSON:
- 6 MR. MICHAEL WATSON: So is -- are
- 7 there -- and that's Exhibit K. Is that the one that
- 8 you say you opened and looked at?
- 9 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: This is the one
- 10 that I glanced at, yes.
- MR. MICHAEL WATSON: All right. And
- 12 you glanced at it, and then you say that you went, and
- 13 you asked your husband about that one.
- MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: Yes.
- MR. MICHAEL WATSON: Why did you ask
- 16 your husband about that one? Wasn't he just as
- 17 competent about dealing with business matters as he
- 18 was when he told you that there might be a sale of his
- 19 long-time employer?
- 20 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: Well, Collus is
- 21 confidential, and Ed was very confidential about
- 22 Collus. This would have been about a business, and
- 23 this business would have affected both of us. So
- 24 that's why I asked about this one.
- 25 MR. MICHAEL WATSON: And do I take it

- 1 then that -- now that I have it straight, and thank
- 2 you, Mr. Chenoweth -- the next one, Exhibit L, which
- 3 came after that, is that the one that you did not
- 4 open?
- 5 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: I have not seen
- 6 that one, no.
- 7 MR. JOHN MATHER: Just for the benefit
- 8 of the record, the Exhibit L actually came before
- 9 Exhibit K. Exhibit L's September exhibit -- sorry, it
- 10 could be K September exhibit; L is November.
- MR. MICHAEL WATSON: Thank you.
- 12
- 13 CONTINUED BY MR. MICHAEL WATSON:
- 14 MR. MICHAEL WATSON: So in September,
- 15 you got Exhibit L, and your husband had forwarded that
- 16 to your email address, right, as we can see?
- MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: Sorry. Which
- 18 exhibit is this?
- 19 MR. MICHAEL WATSON: Exhibit L.
- MR. JOHN MATHER: Sorry, I actually
- 21 caused -- this is K. For the benefit of the -- last
- 22 time K. This is L. Okay.
- THE HONOURABLE FRANK MARROCCO:
- 24 Ms. Houghton, I am not surprised if you're confused
- 25 because I'm confused.

- 1 MR. JOHN MATHER: Okay. So --
- THE HONOURABLE FRANK MARROCCO: So can
- 3 we do this again?
- 4 MR. MICHAEL WATSON: Can we find out
- 5 who's on first?
- 6 MR. JOHN MATHER: Yes. So Exhibit L
- 7 is an email dated September 21st, 2011.
- 8 MR. MICHAEL WATSON: Right.
- 9 MR. JOHN MATHER: The exhibit before
- 10 that, which is Exhibit K, is an email dated
- 11 November 2011. I don't recall the specific date.
- MR. MICHAEL WATSON: Okay. All right.
- 13 Fine.
- 14
- 15 CONTINUED BY MR. MICHAEL WATSON:
- 16 MR. MICHAEL WATSON: Is it Exhibit L
- 17 that we're looking at, which is the September 21st
- 18 email -- is that the one that you didn't look at?
- 19 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: I did not look
- 20 at this one.
- 21 MR. MICHAEL WATSON: All right. Did
- 22 you -- did you open it at all when it came?
- MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: I don't recall
- 24 seeing it.
- MR. MICHAEL WATSON: All right.

- 1 And -- and so what? Are you saying that you just
- 2 assumed that your husband did not want you to look at
- 3 it and that he had sent it to your computer just so he
- 4 could look at it on your computer? Is that it?
- 5 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: If I have not
- 6 seen it, I can't make any assumptions.
- 7 MR. MICHAEL WATSON: Well, you're sure
- 8 you didn't see it, right?
- 9 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: I know I didn't
- 10 see this one.
- MR. MICHAEL WATSON: All right. But
- 12 how often did you check email inbox?
- MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: Once a day,
- 14 twice a day?
- MR. MICHAEL WATSON: All right. So
- 16 you would have seen that an email had come in from
- 17 your husband.
- 18 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: This is
- 19 6:40 p.m., so I don't know if I would have seen it.
- 20 It might have got marked as read, like R-E-A-D.
- 21 MR. MICHAEL WATSON: But then if we go
- 22 back then to Exhibit K, which came in a couple of
- 23 months later, this is the one that you did open and
- 24 look at?
- MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: Can you just

- 1 scroll up a little bit? Yes.
- MR. MICHAEL WATSON: And this, again
- 3 was an email that your husband had forwarded to you,
- 4 right? And you saw that?
- 5 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: Can you go down
- 6 just a wee bit? Yes.
- 7 MR. MICHAEL WATSON: And for some
- 8 reason, you did open and look at this one, where you
- 9 hadn't opened and looked at the previous one. Is that
- 10 what you're saying?
- 11 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: That's correct.
- MR. MICHAEL WATSON: What prompted you
- 13 to open this one and not the previous one?
- 14 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: Well, if an
- 15 email's been marked read, I don't -- I usually only go
- 16 to the current emails in my inbox.
- 17 MR. MICHAEL WATSON: All right. I
- 18 want to ask you finally about the rental documents.
- 19 If we could go to -- where is it? Yes. Exhibit D,
- 20 which is the fifteenth page of this 34-page PDF.
- 21 And -- and in your affidavit, you
- 22 identify Exhibit D, and there's several exhibits
- 23 showing documents relating to the rental of your
- 24 property? Right?
- 25 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: Correct.

- 1 MR. MICHAEL WATSON: All right. And
- 2 we see that the first one here is -- if we can go over
- 3 the page -- is Wednesday, February 4th, 2009, right?
- 4 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: Correct.
- 5 MR. MICHAEL WATSON: Okay. Now, we
- 6 see at the top right, it says CJI, and then with a
- 7 number.
- I take it this is not a document that
- 9 you have and turned over to Inquiry counsel from your
- 10 records.
- 11 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: That's correct.
- 12 It is.
- MR. MICHAEL WATSON: Sorry, it is?
- MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: It is.
- MR. MICHAEL WATSON: All right. So
- 16 this is some -- and then so Inquiry -- then the
- 17 Inquiry put that code number on the top right?
- 18 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: Correct.
- MR. MICHAEL WATSON: All right. So
- 20 you -- you took this from your records?
- 21 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: They asked for
- 22 information about our Florida property.
- MR. MICHAEL WATSON: And this document
- 24 then came from your records of the Florida property?
- 25 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: Correct.

- 1 MR. MICHAEL WATSON: And there's
- 2 handwriting on it obviously. "Yes"?
- MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: Yes.
- 4 MR. MICHAEL WATSON: Whose handwriting
- 5 is that?
- MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: Mine.
- 7 MR. MICHAEL WATSON: Did you make that
- 8 at the time, and by "the time," I mean back in 2009?
- 9 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: Probably.
- 10 MR. MICHAEL WATSON: All right. And,
- 11 therefore, I take it then that this is not an
- 12 electronic document that you turned over, but it
- 13 obviously must have been a printout that you put
- 14 handwriting on and you turned over the hard copy to
- 15 the Inquiry?
- MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: Yes.
- MR. MICHAEL WATSON: And -- and do I
- 18 take it, therefore, that you had a file of these
- 19 documents relating to rental?
- 20 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: I do have some
- 21 of the renter information, correct.
- 22 MR. MICHAEL WATSON: In -- in in
- 23 some kind of file then that, I take it, you kept over
- 24 the years?
- 25 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: I had a few

- 1 here and a few in Florida.
- MR. MICHAEL WATSON: I see. Now, one
- 3 of things I noticed here is, first of all, the date,
- 4 2009.
- 5 Was 2009 the first year in which, I'll
- 6 just say you and your husband, if I may, rented your
- 7 property?
- MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: That's correct.
- 9 MR. MICHAEL WATSON: When did you
- 10 acquire that property?
- 11 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: 2008.
- 12 MR. MICHAEL WATSON: And here we see
- 13 that the email is from your husband at his Collus
- 14 email address to somebody.
- Do you see that?
- MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: Yes.
- 17 MR. MICHAEL WATSON: Right. And he
- 18 copied you.
- MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: Yes.
- 20 MR. MICHAEL WATSON: Right. And then
- 21 if we can go to the next one, which is Exhibit E, this
- 22 then is 2012, right?
- MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: Yes.
- MR. MICHAEL WATSON: Right. And if we
- 25 can go down to the bottom, we see -- now this is from

- 1 you, right?
- MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: Yes.
- 3 MR. MICHAEL WATSON: So do I take it
- 4 that Mr. Houghton himself was handling the rentals in
- 5 the first years and then later you did?
- 6 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: No. He is
- 7 listed as the primary renter, so his -- unfortunately
- 8 that email address got stuck up there.
- 9 MR. MICHAEL WATSON: All right. The -
- 10 if -- if we go back and we can take -- take a look
- 11 at the first one. But he was providing information
- 12 and he was responding, right, to -- back in 2009.
- MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: Maybe he did in
- 14 2009.
- MR. MICHAEL WATSON: Right. And so at
- 16 some point that changed to you?
- MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: Yes.
- 18 MR. MICHAEL WATSON: Right. And
- 19 between two -- this is the next one in the chronology.
- 20 Between 2009 and 2012 -- leaving aside the Mr. Bonwick
- 21 situation, between 2009 and 2012 did you rent your
- 22 place at all?
- MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: Yes.
- 24 MR. MICHAEL WATSON: About how many
- 25 times in that three-year period?

- 1 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: Oh, sorry, a
- 2 three-year period?
- MR. MICHAEL WATSON: Between 2009,
- 4 2012, yes.
- 5 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: I think we
- 6 rented it part of each season.
- 7 MR. MICHAEL WATSON: All right. Now,
- 8 this one, March 15th, 2012, says: "Hand delivered,"
- 9 right?
- 10 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: Yes. The lady
- 11 came to our door and asked to rent our property.
- 12 MR. MICHAEL WATSON: Your door where?
- MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: In Florida.
- 14 MR. MICHAEL WATSON: I see, all right.
- 15 And then you typed up -- sorry, did you type this up
- 16 then?
- 17 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: I did.
- 18 MR. MICHAEL WATSON: And you typed up
- 19 all of the terms?
- MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: Yes.
- 21 MR. MICHAEL WATSON: Right. It was
- 22 important to have the terms set out?
- MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: Yes. She was
- 24 quite an elderly lady.
- MR. MICHAEL WATSON: Right. And the

- 1 precise dates, the amount, and so on?
- MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: Correct.
- 3 MR. MICHAEL WATSON: And then it says
- 4 in the third paragraph:
- 5 "Please register with Eagle Creek."
- And I see Eagle Creek at the top right.
- 7 What's Eagle Creek?
- 8 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: That's where
- 9 we live in Florida.
- 10 MR. MICHAEL WATSON: Is that some kind
- 11 of -- I don't know, you know, this sort of, you know,
- 12 group of condominiums or something like that?
- MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: Yes.
- 14 MR. MICHAEL WATSON: And so renters
- 15 have to register with Eagle Creek?
- MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: They don't
- 17 always have to register. They can register if they
- 18 want to use the amenities there.
- 19 MR. MICHAEL WATSON: And then the next
- 20 one, I'm not going to take too much longer on this
- 21 Exhibit F, we see another one, 2014. And this doesn't
- 22 have a full address at the top, just a name. You see
- 23 that?
- MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: Yes.
- MR. MICHAEL WATSON: And this again is

- 1 one that you typed up?
- MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: Yes.
- MR. MICHAEL WATSON: And was this a --
- 4 an American renter?
- 5 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: I believe it
- 6 was, yes.
- 7 MR. MICHAEL WATSON: All right. And
- 8 again you set out all of the details of the rental in
- 9 this, right?
- MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: Yes.
- 11 MR. MICHAEL WATSON: Right. To make
- 12 sure there's no misunderstanding as to the length of
- 13 time and how much it cost and all of that?
- MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: M-hm.
- MR. MICHAEL WATSON: "Yes"?
- 16 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: Correct.
- 17 MR. MICHAEL WATSON: Right. But you
- 18 didn't do that for Mr. Bonwick at all, nothing
- 19 whatsoever.
- MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: No, because I
- 21 was standing in front of him.
- MR. MICHAEL WATSON: As the lady in
- 23 Florida was in 2012?
- MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: She was quite
- 25 an elderly lady and asked me if I would type one up

- 1 for her.
- MR. MICHAEL WATSON: Oh, she asked you
- 3 to type one up for her?
- 4 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: Yes.
- 5 MR. MICHAEL WATSON: I see. Those are
- 6 my questions, Your Honour. Thank you.
- 7 THE HONOURABLE FRANK MARROCCO: Thank
- 8 you. Mr. Breedon...?
- 9 I guess, Mr. Bon -- oh, which order
- 10 we're going to go in. Who's next? You're supposed to
- 11 pick the order.
- MR. RYAN BREEDON: Why don't I go next
- 13 --
- 14 THE HONOURABLE FRANK MARROCCO: Sure,
- 15 go ahead.
- MR. RYAN BREEDON: -- and then Mr.
- 17 Chenoweth can go.
- MR. FREDERICK CHENOWETH: That's my
- 19 understanding, Your Honour.
- 20
- 21 CROSS-EXAMINATION BY MR. RYAN BREEDON:
- MR. RYAN BREEDON: Ms. Houghton, my
- 23 name is Ryan Breeden. I'm counsel for the Town.
- Just a couple of questions about your
- 25 affidavit. It was sworn yesterday, it looks like?

- 1 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: Correct.
- MR. RYAN BREEDON: All right. And you
- 3 understand that it's a sworn statement?
- 4 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: Yes.
- 5 MR. RYAN BREEDON: It's the same as
- 6 giving evidence under oath. It's the --
- 7 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: Yes.
- 8 MR. RYAN BREEDON: -- the same thing.
- 9 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: Yes.
- 10 MR. RYAN BREEDON: And -- and so you
- 11 read it before you swore it, of course?
- 12 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: I did, but
- 13 there was a couple of changes that had to be made.
- 14 MR. RYAN BREEDON: Right. Well, we've
- 15 seen -- we've seen -- one (1) was the transposition.
- 16 That was just a typographical error.
- 17 Can we pull -- pull up the affidavit
- 18 and look at paragraph 9, please?
- 19 And the other change that you wanted to
- 20 make was with respect to -- sorry.
- 21 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: Was the
- 22 transposition number in 9.
- MR. RYAN BREEDON: Right. The
- 24 transposition in 9. And then can we scroll down,
- 25 please? Sorry --

1 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: Number 13.

- 2 Number 13.
- 3 MR. RYAN BREEDON: Right. In number
- 4 13 it's the months, because it says here that Mr.
- 5 Bonwick would rent the property for four (4) months,
- 6 from November 2011 to February 2012, and, as I
- 7 understand it, what you're saying now is that in fact
- 8 he was renting it from -- in November and December of
- 9 2011?
- MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: Yes.
- MR. RYAN BREEDON: And then again in -
- 12 is it April or May?
- MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: April and May
- 14 of '12.
- MR. RYAN BREEDON: And you testified
- 16 that -- Mr. Mather asked you how you knew that, and
- 17 your evidence, as I understand it, was that you
- 18 remembered when you had rented the property?
- 19 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: M-hm.
- MR. RYAN BREEDON: "Yes"?
- 21 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: That's correct.
- MR. RYAN BREEDON: Okay. Presumably
- 23 your memory was the same yesterday when you swore the
- 24 affidavit as it is today?
- MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: I didn't get

- 1 the affidavit until last night, and I had left a note
- 2 at Mr. Chenoweth's house that the dates were incorrect
- 3 on that statement.
- 4 MR. RYAN BREEDON: So you swore the
- 5 affidavit. I just want to understand what the process
- 6 is. You swore the affidavit even though you knew it
- 7 was wrong, but left a note to that effect?
- MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: Well, I was at
- 9 his house last night and he had to leave, and then I
- 10 brought the document back and I noted these two (2)
- 11 changes on there.
- MR. RYAN BREEDON: All right.
- MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: I didn't know
- 14 how else to deal with the situation.
- 15 MR. RYAN BREEDON: Mr. -- Mr. Bonwick
- 16 testified earlier today about when he was using your
- 17 property. And did you watch his evidence?
- MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: No, I did not.
- 19 MR. RYAN BREEDON: Did somebody tell
- 20 you about his evidence?
- MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: No.
- 22 MR. RYAN BREEDON: He testified that
- 23 his understanding was that you and your husband use
- 24 the property yourselves every year.
- MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: Periodically.

1 MR. RYAN BREEDON: Right. And I -- I

- 2 guess in this year, would have used it in the
- 3 January/February/March time period?
- 4 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: We weren't
- 5 there that much that year.
- 6 MR. RYAN BREEDON: Did you use it
- 7 every year?
- 8 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: We used it a
- 9 bit every year, but really not until 2015.
- 10 MR. RYAN BREEDON: Did you use it at a
- 11 consistent time every year? Like, was --
- MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: No.
- MR. RYAN BREEDON: -- there a
- 14 particular week or something that you always tried to
- 15 be there?
- MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: No.
- MR. RYAN BREEDON: You also -- we also
- 18 heard from Mr. Bonwick that during that fall 2011
- 19 period, he was only there for a few days on -- spread
- 20 out over two (2) occasions. And Mr. Mather asked you
- 21 about that earlier today.
- You recall that?
- MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: Yes.
- 24 MR. RYAN BREEDON: All right. And you
- 25 -- you testified that you were aware of that. You

1 were aware that Mr. Bonwick had only used the property

- 2 on those few days?
- 3 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: I was aware
- 4 that he wasn't there a lot, yes.
- 5 MR. RYAN BREEDON: And you testified
- 6 that you had learned that before today, i.e., that it
- 7 -- it wasn't just today that you had learned how
- 8 little Mr. Bonwick had used the property.
- 9 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: No. It was
- 10 probably a few years back.
- MR. RYAN BREEDON: When did you learn
- 12 that?
- 13 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: Sometime in '12
- 14 probably, '12 or '13.
- MR. RYAN BREEDON: Did you have any
- 16 discussions before today with Mr. Bonwick about what
- 17 his evidence was going to be?
- MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: No.
- 19 MR. RYAN BREEDON: Did you ever have
- 20 any discussions with your husband about what Mr.
- 21 Bonwick's evidence was going to be?
- MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: No.
- MR. RYAN BREEDON: Can we look at that
- 24 Exhibit K, please? This is the one at page 31.

2.5

1 (BRIEF PAUSE)

- 3 MR. RYAN BREEDON: Scroll down. Okay.
- 4 So in the -- this is the email that you did have a
- 5 chance to look at. And in what appears to be the very
- 6 bottom paragraph on the screen, the one that starts
- 7 with the words: "Then, with Paul and Ed."
- MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: M-hm.
- 9 MR. RYAN BREEDON: You see that?
- MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: Yes.
- MR. RYAN BREEDON: All right. You
- 12 highlighted that earlier when Mr. Mather was asking
- 13 you about this email.
- 14 And -- and as I understand what you
- 15 said, what you were trying to say, looking at this, it
- 16 prompted you to ask your husband whether he was
- 17 involved in some sort of business with Mr. Budd, the
- 18 author of the email?
- 19 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: Correct.
- MR. RYAN BREEDON: Okay. And that's
- 21 because it certainly sounds like that's what Mr. Budd
- 22 is saying in this email.
- MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: Yes.
- 24 MR. RYAN BREEDON: And -- and your
- 25 evidence was that your husband told you that he was

- 1 not involved in any business.
- MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: He said he was
- 3 not involved in this business. He was interested in
- 4 having this as a utility venture.
- 5 MR. RYAN BREEDON: Okay. And did you
- 6 then ask him why Mr. Budd seemed to think that he was
- 7 -- they were involved in business together?
- 8 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: No. I don't
- 9 recall asking that question. I just know that I asked
- 10 Ed.
- 11 MR. RYAN BREEDON: But -- but didn't
- 12 you wonder why Mr. Budd seemed to think that Ed was in
- 13 business with him?
- 14 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: No, I didn't
- 15 think to ask.
- MR. RYAN BREEDON: Why not?
- 17 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: I think if we
- 18 were in business, we'd have them on our roof. We'd
- 19 have boxes of them around our house. So, I mean,
- 20 there was no evidence of any business.
- 21 MR. RYAN BREEDON: Don't you think
- 22 it's sort of strange that the gentleman who's sending
- 23 this email to your husband and Mr. Bonwick, who was
- 24 your boss at this time, seemed to think that they were
- 25 all in business together?

- 1 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: I didn't give
- 2 it that much consideration. When Ed said we're not in
- 3 the business, so we're not in that business.
- 4 MR. RYAN BREEDON: Thank you very
- 5 much. Those are my questions.
- THE HONOURABLE FRANK MARROCCO: Just -
- 7 Mr. -- Mr. Bonwick, do you have any questions? I
- 8 don't think I asked you.
- 9 MR. PAUL BONWICK: No questions, Your
- 10 Honour.
- 11 THE HONOURABLE FRANK MARROCCO: Thank
- 12 you. Mr. Chenoweth?
- 13
- 14 CROSS-EXAMINATION BY MR. FREDERICK CHENOWETH:
- MR. FREDERICK CHENOWETH: Yes, Mrs.
- $16\,$ Houghton, you were asked a few questions about the --
- 17 about the rental of the Florida premises to Mr.
- 18 Bonwick.
- 19 Can you, if you would, relay the
- 20 circumstances, tell this Commission about the
- 21 circumstances pursuant to which you obtained a cheque
- 22 for \$19,300 from -- from Compenso?
- MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: Well, I was
- 24 downtown and I had --
- 25 MR. FREDERICK CHENOWETH: Downtown

- 1 what?
- MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: Downtown
- 3 Collingwood. And I went up to Mr. Bonwick's office to
- 4 deliver my invoice. He was in the office and we were
- 5 talking and he was asking me if I knew of any places
- 6 on the Gulf Coast of Florida that he could rent, and I
- 7 said that our place was available.
- And, you know, we were talking about
- 9 time frame, price. I said it was \$4,500 a month. I
- 10 asked him which months he was looking for. And that
- 11 seemed to work for him.
- 12 So, during that conversation, I was
- 13 talking about, you know, I can -- I have a key if you
- 14 want a key. Sorry, I'm losing my train of thought.
- 15 I'm not sure where to look.
- 16 THE HONOURABLE FRANK MARROCCO: Well,
- 17 you can probably just look at Mr. Chenoweth since he's
- 18 asking the questions.
- 19 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: Okay, and, you
- 20 know, the instructions on the house, et cetera. And
- 21 after that --
- 22
- 23 CONTINUED BY MR. FREDERICK CHENOWETH:
- 24 MR. FREDERICK CHENOWETH: Did you give
- 25 him the instructions?

- 1 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: I did give him
- 2 the instructions. And I said that there's a lot of
- 3 instructions at our house. So, I said that I would
- 4 talk to him later about it.
- 5 MR. FREDERICK CHENOWETH: You
- 6 mentioned a key. Did you --
- 7 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: Yes.
- 8 MR. FREDERICK CHENOWETH: -- give him
- 9 a key?
- MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: So, I went down
- 11 to Florida a couple weeks later to open up the
- 12 property for Mr. Bonwick, and I brought back the key.
- 13 And, at that point, I gave the key to Mr. Bonwick and
- 14 wished him well, if he needed any further
- 15 instructions, he could let me know.
- 16 MR. FREDERICK CHENOWETH: And on that
- 17 -- on that -- was it day or evening that you were at
- 18 Mr. Bonwick's? Was it at Mr. Bonwick's premises that
- 19 you had this conversation?
- MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: No, it was at
- 21 the Compenso office.
- MR. FREDERICK CHENOWETH: Thank you.
- 23 And what was your practice with respect to -- to
- 24 invoicing Mr. Bonwick? Did you email him, deliver?
- 25 What -- what was your usual practice?

1 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: I usually

- 2 delivered them.
- 3 MR. FREDERICK CHENOWETH: And any
- 4 sense of what time of the day, week, or month that you
- 5 usually delivered your invoices to Mr. Bonwick?
- 6 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: Pretty well the
- 7 end of the month.
- 8 MR. FREDERICK CHENOWETH: All right.
- 9 And you took and gave Mr. Bonwick your invoice on the
- 10 occasion of obtaining this cheque?
- MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: Yes.
- 12 MR. FREDERICK CHENOWETH: And you
- 13 didn't do what you have done with other rentals, i.e.,
- 14 send out a letter with respect to the particulars of
- 15 the rentals.
- 16 Would you have had any familiarity with
- 17 renters who rented your place on other occasions from
- 18 2009 onward?
- 19 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: No. Most of
- 20 them were not from Collingwood, only Paul.
- 21 MR. FREDERICK CHENOWETH: Where --
- 22 where were they from?
- 23 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: Some were from
- 24 New York. I believe two (2) renters were from New
- 25 York and some were from the Kitchener area.

- 1 MR. FREDERICK CHENOWETH: Well, did
- 2 you have any familiarity with these people that you
- 3 rented to and sent letters with details of the rental
- 4 to?
- 5 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: No.
- 6 MR. FREDERICK CHENOWETH: So, I take
- 7 it Mr. Bonwick, unlike your other renters, was someone
- 8 that you knew. Is that fair?
- 9 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: That's correct.
- 10 MR. FREDERICK CHENOWETH: All right.
- 11 He was a Collingwood person?
- MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: Yes
- 13 MR. FREDERICK CHENOWETH: All right.
- 14 And you in fact had been to Mr. Bonwick's home, I
- 15 think your affidavit says?
- 16 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: Yes, at -- at
- 17 an Elvis festival.
- 18 MR. FREDERICK CHENOWETH: All right.
- 19 Thank you. And did you -- you seem to have talked
- 20 about deposits in some of your -- your earlier rental
- 21 letters to other individuals than Mr. Bonwick?
- MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: Correct.
- 23 MR. FREDERICK CHENOWETH: Why wasn't
- 24 that a necessity, in Mr. Bonwick's case, to send a
- 25 letter about that?

- 1 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: Because he was
- 2 going to be renting within four (4) weeks from when we
- 3 were talking.
- 4 MR. FREDERICK CHENOWETH: Did you talk
- 5 about -- in that conversation was there any discussion
- 6 about your usual practice with respect to payments or
- 7 deposits or...
- 8 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: Yes. I said
- 9 you could pay me a down payment, but I -- all the
- 10 renters usually pay me before they enter onto the
- 11 premises.
- 12 MR. FREDERICK CHENOWETH: Okay. And
- 13 as a result of your relaying that to Mr. Bonwick,
- 14 what, if anything, did he do?
- MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: He just said,
- 16 That's fine, I'll just pay it all now, and your
- 17 invoice.
- MR. FREDERICK CHENOWETH: Is that what
- 19 he did?
- MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: Yes.
- 21 MR. FREDERICK CHENOWETH: So, in that
- 22 one (1) visit to his office where you went to deliver
- 23 your invoice for thirteen fifty (1,350), he paid you
- 24 for the full amount of the rental --
- 25 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: Correct.

1 MR. FREDERICK CHENOWETH: -- that you

- 2 had discussed on that occasion and that occasion only?
- MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: Yes.
- 4 MR. FREDERICK CHENOWETH: All right.
- 5 At early times discussed the rental of your premises
- 6 to Mr. Bonwick?
- 7 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: No.
- 8 MR. FREDERICK CHENOWETH: And did you
- 9 -- what -- what did -- what did you do with the
- 10 cheque? How did it get to the bank? Do you have any
- 11 memory of how that occurred?
- 12 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: I deposited it.
- MR. FREDERICK CHENOWETH: Oh. When
- 14 and where did you deposit it?
- MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: I probably
- 16 deposited it that day. I had deposited it into the
- 17 line of credit that I took out for Florida rent.
- 18 MR. FREDERICK CHENOWETH: All right.
- 19 And what bank did you deposit it in? Do you have any
- 20 --
- 21 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: The bank I
- 22 always use.
- MR. FREDERICK CHENOWETH: I beg your
- 24 pardon?
- 25 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: The Bank of

- 1 Nova Scotia.
- MR. FREDERICK CHENOWETH: Okay. And I
- 3 -- I take it you were content with the arrangement
- 4 that you'd made with Mr. Bonwick on that day in that
- 5 you received his payment in full, correct?
- MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: Yes
- 7 MR. FREDERICK CHENOWETH: Thank you.

8

9 (BRIEF PAUSE)

- MR. FREDERICK CHENOWETH: We've looked
- 12 at a number of the rentals that -- that you made
- 13 through the course of your examination and cross-
- 14 examination.
- 15 What did you generally get in or about
- 16 that time for the rental of your premises?
- 17 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: I believe it
- 18 was around four thousand (4,000).
- 19 MR. FREDERICK CHENOWETH: All right.
- 20 Did you ever get forty-five hundred (4,500)?
- MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: Sometimes, yes,
- 22 when I was renting to a US renter.
- MR. FREDERICK CHENOWETH: Did you ever
- 24 get forty-five hundred (4,500) American?
- MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: Yes.

- 1 MR. FREDERICK CHENOWETH: All right.
- 2 And why didn't you get forty-five hundred (4,500)
- 3 American from Mr. Bonwick?
- 4 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: I believe when
- 5 I said forty-five hundred dollars (\$4,500), I should
- 6 have said forty-five hundred (4,500) US.
- 7 MR. FREDERICK CHENOWETH: All right.
- 8 You forgot that little detail, did you?
- 9 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: Yes, I did.
- 10 MR. FREDERICK CHENOWETH: Okay.
- 11 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: New at the
- 12 renting.
- MR. FREDERICK CHENOWETH: Thank you.
- 14
- 15 (BRIEF PAUSE)
- 16
- 17 MR. FREDERICK CHENOWETH: Now, my
- 18 friend took you to a proposal that Mr. Bonwick -- my
- 19 friend, Mr. Watson, took you to a proposal that was
- 20 sent to you by Mr. Bonwick on the 19th of January?
- MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: Correct.
- MR. FREDERICK CHENOWETH: That
- 23 document?
- MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: Yes.
- MR. FREDERICK CHENOWETH: And did you

1 have any idea really of what you were looking at when

- 2 you were looking at the document titled, "Proposal"?
- 3 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: No, I had no
- 4 idea.
- 5 MR. FREDERICK CHENOWETH: You told us
- 6 about a conversation you had with Mr. Bonwick when you
- 7 called him and said, You must have sent this to me in
- 8 error?
- 9 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: Yes.
- 10 MR. FREDERICK CHENOWETH: He asked you
- 11 to look at it?
- MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: Yes.
- MR. FREDERICK CHENOWETH: Mr. Watson
- 14 had an interesting exchange with you in which you
- 15 relayed that he simply asked you to look it over,
- 16 correct --
- 17 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: Correct.
- 18 MR. FREDERICK CHENOWETH: -- Bonwick
- 19 did? Did you make any assumptions as to what he
- 20 wanted you to look it over for?
- 21 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: I might have
- 22 made an assumption that he just wanted another set of
- 23 eyes on it to correct it.
- 24 MR. FREDERICK CHENOWETH: Correct it
- 25 with respect to what?

- 1 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: Just
- 2 grammatical.
- 3 MR. FREDERICK CHENOWETH: All right.

4

5 (BRIEF PAUSE)

- 7 MR. FREDERICK CHENOWETH: You
- 8 mentioned that you attended in Florida, I think you
- 9 mentioned, in sometime mid-October of the year that
- 10 you got Mr. Bonwick's cheque?
- MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: Yes.
- MR. FREDERICK CHENOWETH: And you
- 13 opened up the place for Mr. Bonwick?
- 14 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: I did.
- MR. FREDERICK CHENOWETH: And you were
- 16 opening it up for him to use on that occasion. Is
- 17 that why you were there?
- 18 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: Yes. And I was
- 19 there just for a week's vacation, as well.
- MR. FREDERICK CHENOWETH: Thank you.
- 21 And did you -- we talked about your knowledge of
- 22 whether or not Mr. Bonwick was in the -- in -- in the
- 23 rental or in the facility.
- 24 You mentioned that you learned he was
- 25 not there with any frequency?

- 1 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: Yes.
- 2 MR. FREDERICK CHENOWETH: You learned
- 3 that sometime before this hearing and before these
- 4 matters arose?
- 5 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: Yes
- 6 MR. FREDERICK CHENOWETH: And I think
- 7 you said you learned that in 2012 or 2013?
- MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: Yes.
- 9 MR. FREDERICK CHENOWETH: You earlier
- 10 mentioned that your husband mentioned to you he had
- 11 been -- they had -- he and Mr. Bonwick had discussed
- 12 or Mr. Bonwick had asked for a rebate of some kind?
- MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: Correct.
- 14 MR. FREDERICK CHENOWETH: Can you tell
- 15 me if -- if that's how you came to know that Mr.
- 16 Bonwick hadn't used it a lot?
- 17 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: I believe
- 18 that's how I came to now.
- 19 MR. FREDERICK CHENOWETH: Thank you.
- 20 I'm -- I'm wondering about any other ways you might
- 21 have known of the utility that Mr. Bonwick -- or the
- 22 use Mr. Bonwick made of the prev -- of the premises.
- 23 Ever have a friend drop by or ever receive any phone
- 24 calls or -- or anything of that nature?
- MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: Oh, he did call

- 1 once because he couldn't get the password to work.
- 2 MR. FREDERICK CHENOWETH: Okay. And
- 3 did you give him the password on that occasion?
- 4 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: Yes, I did.
- 5 MR. FREDERICK CHENOWETH: All right.
- 6 And do you -- can you remember whether that was in the
- 7 -- presumably, the November/December period or the
- 8 April/May period or what --
- 9 MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: It was in the
- 10 November period.
- 11 MR. FREDERICK CHENOWETH: -- it might
- 12 have been?
- MS. SHIRLEY HOUGHTON: I think it was
- 14 in the November period.
- MR. FREDERICK CHENOWETH: Very good.
- 16
- 17 (BRIEF PAUSE)
- 18
- 19 MR. FREDERICK CHENOWETH: Those are
- 20 all the questions I have of this witness. Thank you,
- 21 Your Honour.
- 22 THE HONOURABLE FRANK MARROCCO: Thank
- 23 you, Mr. Chenoweth. Concluding examination?
- 24 MR. JOHN MATHER: No re-examination.
- 25 THE HONOURABLE FRANK MARROCCO: Thank

```
299
 1 you very much, Ms. Houghton.
 2
 3
                      (WITNESS STANDS DOWN)
 5
                   THE HONOURABLE FRANK MARROCCO: Well,
 6 that concludes matters for today. And Monday ten
 7 o'clock.
 9 --- Upon adjourning at 3:57 p.m.
10
11 Certified Correct,
12
13
14
15 Wendy Woodworth, Ms.
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
```

Page	300	of	366

~				
\$	34:20	4 160:11	206:2,3,2	
\$10,000	\$4,500	167 : 18	2 227:8	31:15
83:19	245:11	168:5	11/'12	175 96:20
127:10,14	287:9	170:13,21	220:24	
,16		,22 171:9		237:12
, 10	294:5	172:23	221:3	17th 52:12
\$120 97:2	\$40,000	173:1,4	11:18	55:11 , 24
\$15,000	137:4	182:25	112:21	58:2 63:9
127:19				235:10
127:19	\$400,000	186:6,16	11:31	
\$175,000	33:6	191:11,24	112:22	18 14:22
35:1	\$50 97:2	192:16	12 21:3	39:20
410 000	237:17	211:15	27:16,19	122:10
\$18,000		229:5,11	29:24	18,000
134:21	\$540 129:24	233:24	121:25	· ·
\$19,300	\$600 202:7	234:4,20		244:19
286:22	_	236 : 22	206:3	185 3:9
	\$750,000	250:6 , 7	246:7	10 350
\$19,350	222:19	251:10	280:14	19,350
206:25	\$800 202:7	279 : 15	283:13,14	204:24
\$2 171:17	7000 202.7	291:22	12:30	205:3,12,
			165:14	16 247:2
\$2,000	0	1,350		19,530
122:14	0 6:21	244:17	12:50	204:23
\$2,500		291:23	184:16	
131:5	1	1/2 169:2	120	19.350
132:8	1 18:9,10		237:14,16	244:17
247:21	24:2	1:00 165 : 23		1994 40:24
248:13	27:18	1:54 184 : 17	128 61:20	
			129 64:1	1997 40:24
\$20	28:1,22	1:55 185:13		41:2
118:10,16	30:4	1:57 185 : 14	12th 79:5	19th 208:24
\$200,000	31:24	10 10 17	82 : 22	260:5
33:5	32:3,21	10 40:17	13	294:20
	36:4	59:25	205:2,9,2	
\$240 121:22	50:7,9,10	98:9	4	
\$27,475	54:12,18	112:19	244:8,15	2
83:7	57 : 19	115:23	280:1,2,4	2 14:22
	73:6	128:25	283:14	16:14
\$3 197:12	74:24	247:4	203:14	37:8,14
\$30,975	75 : 7	248:16	130 65:20	38:12 , 23
79:17	76:22	10:06 60:1	14 39:19	53:6
	89:10			56:25
\$35,000	91:7	10:17 60:2	14th 1:23	57 : 1
109:1	95:17	100 34:1	158:16	64:25
243:18	96:5	44:8	178:24	65:1 92:4
244:11	137:6	122:15	15 165:22	96:7
\$35,001.75	138:23		208:8	103:11
79:18	139:24	133:22		117:23
86:22		102,000	214:25	129:22
	143:22	21:3	215:3	132:9
\$360 122:10	144:16	11 8:25	262 : 9	133:24
\$366,000	145:9	21:5	15th 275:8	
+555,555	146:3,6,1	21.J		135:3,5

1112011(1	ie collinowo	JD 00-14-2019	rage 301	01 300
138:21	121:5	247:2,20	23rd 5:24	39:24
139:17	124:8	248:20	6 : 20	80:4
149:20	125:24	249:3	10:24,25	106:3
172:17	126:2,15	273:22	12:18	108:19
185:10	127:7	274:20,21	18:12	208:3
194:16	128:12	275:4,8		239:13
196:17	131:11	277:23	24 29:12	252:14
200:8	133:19	280:6	25 7:1	255:23,25
229:24	149:10,11	297:7	118:15	256:4
236:17	151:2,25		131:6	
250:17	206:20,24	2013 15:16		30th 82:5
251:9	207:15	31:15	252 3:13	87 : 8
281:10	208:24	34:21	25th	31 117:8
282:20	215:7,12	297 : 7	64:2,10	283:24
289:24	217:18,23	2013/'17	26 233:19	33 236 : 16
	217:10,23	31:2		33 230:10
20 129:25	219:11,15		26th 82:20	34-page
20/20 68:24	229:20	2014 40:2	27 129:25	270:20
187:24	231:14	249:24	070 2 14	35 79:23
	236:23	250:2,3,1	278 3:14	80:3
2000 20:7	242:11,12	1	27th 65:1	94:14
41:5	,13	251:6,14	82:2	96:15
2003 41:8	243:16	276:21	84:23	97:2,5,9
2003-2004	244:11	2015 39:19	286 3:15	98:19
125:15	245:23	282:9		99:11
	246:2,3,1	2016 234:5	28th 222:11	101:17
2004 124:6	7,25	235:9	234:5	105:13,15
129:19	247 : 9		235:9	108:18,19
2008 273:11	252 : 24	2016/2017	299 3:23	109:15,20
2009 229:9	260:5,13,	231:10	29th 68:1	112:3
	24	2017 32:18	2901 00.1	113:12
271:3 272:8	268:7,11	40:9		116:1
272.8	280:6,9	2018 235:11	3	237:9,15
274:12,14	282:18		3 24:3	244:12
,20,21		2019 1:23	56 : 25	
275:3	2011/2012	35:9	57 : 1	35/35/30
289:18	227 : 8	203 3:12	71:18	105:9
	2012 5:25	2049 132:8	92:4 96:8	35-35-30
2010 8:25	6 : 21		126:18	240:25
20:5 21:5	120:19	20th 62:1	129:9	355 4:3
149:10	121:5	63:10	132:9	
2011 21:2	124:8	21 196:1	139:19	356 4:4
22:25	131:5		147:16	357 4:5
79:5	206:21	21st 93:10	160:12	358 4:6
82:20	222:11	215:7,12	171:20	
93:10	224:2,4,5	217:18,23	172:17	359 4:7
101:15	, 13	236:23	193:13	3rd 6:15
102:18	229:21,23	268:7 , 17	207:8,13,	87 : 11
110:5	231:16	22 196:2	18 230:7	102:18
119:17,20	232:3	23 10:4,10	3:57 299 : 9	112:14
120:8,19	245:23		30 7:1	132:6
			· · -	

			1 agc 302	
243:16	197:11	279:18,22	accept	accurate
244:11	50/50 33:16	,24	198:6	161:10
246:14	36:16	9:04 5:1	acceptable	165:9
250:2,3			69:2,3	169:25
	500 133:14	900,000	·	178:23
4	5-600	128:13	accepting	206:13
4 3:3	247:24	97 1:19	86:1	245:25
45:21,24		9th 70:23	access	achieve
117:23	6	246:17	73:8,11	24:20
126:18	6 124:20	210,11	74:15	26:19
129:6,10	208:8		75 : 3	27 : 7
132:10			145:3	28:23
139:20	6:14 70:23	a.m 5:1	146:4	29:1
173:24	6:40 269 : 19	60:1,2	176:24	92:10
174:3	60-day	112:21,22	177:6	achieved
221:9	134:9	abilities	250:21,25	23:4 27:2
224:14	135:21	76:10	accessible	92:14
230:7		ability	73:14,21	199:1,22,
280:5	677 117:25	136:10		23
291:2	245:6,20	146:13	accessing	
4,000		169:7	74:3,5,18	achieves
293:18	7	181:20,22	,21	26:10
	7 29:12	191:7	238:10	27 : 12
4,500	199:8	192:13	accordance	achieving
293:20,24	70 76:3,4	206:13	121 : 10	30 : 16
201.2	10 /0.5, 4	200.13		30.10
294:2,6			according	
294:2,6 40 197:10	70/30	able 73:8	according	acknowledge
	70/30 103:2,9	able 73:8	79:16	acknowledge d 25:18
40 197:10 45 195:14	70/30 103:2,9 108:13	able 73:8 132:1 136:4	79:16	acknowledge d 25:18 acquaintanc
40 197:10 45 195:14 45-50,000	70/30 103:2,9	able 73:8 132:1 136:4 144:1,11	79:16 account 71:21,22	acknowledge d 25:18 acquaintanc
40 197:10 45 195:14 45-50,000 128:15	70/30 103:2,9 108:13	able 73:8 132:1 136:4	79:16 account 71:21,22 72:9,23	acknowledge d 25:18 acquaintanc
40 197:10 45 195:14 45-50,000	70/30 103:2,9 108:13 7-7 245:21	able 73:8 132:1 136:4 144:1,11 146:6,9	79:16 account 71:21,22 72:9,23 74:1,9,10	acknowledge d 25:18 acquaintanc es 220:19
40 197:10 45 195:14 45-50,000 128:15	70/30 103:2,9 108:13 7-7 245:21 7th	able 73:8 132:1 136:4 144:1,11 146:6,9 147:13	79:16 account 71:21,22 72:9,23 74:1,9,10 ,15 82:9	acknowledge d 25:18 acquaintanc es 220:19 acquire 273:10
40 197:10 45 195:14 45-50,000 128:15 48 244:8	70/30 103:2,9 108:13 7-7 245:21 7th 44:20,24	able 73:8 132:1 136:4 144:1,11 146:6,9 147:13 167:11	79:16 account 71:21,22 72:9,23 74:1,9,10 ,15 82:9 238:6,11,	acknowledge d 25:18 acquaintanc es 220:19 acquire 273:10 acquisition
40 197:10 45 195:14 45-50,000 128:15 48 244:8	70/30 103:2,9 108:13 7-7 245:21 7th 44:20,24 45:25	able 73:8 132:1 136:4 144:1,11 146:6,9 147:13 167:11 180:8,9	79:16 account 71:21,22 72:9,23 74:1,9,10 ,15 82:9	acknowledge d 25:18 acquaintanc es 220:19 acquire 273:10 acquisition 191:25
40 197:10 45 195:14 45-50,000 128:15 48 244:8 4th 271:3	70/30 103:2,9 108:13 7-7 245:21 7th 44:20,24 45:25	able 73:8 132:1 136:4 144:1,11 146:6,9 147:13 167:11 180:8,9 183:15,16	79:16 account 71:21,22 72:9,23 74:1,9,10 ,15 82:9 238:6,11, 18 240:3	acknowledge d 25:18 acquaintance es 220:19 acquire 273:10 acquisition 191:25 acquisition
40 197:10 45 195:14 45-50,000 128:15 48 244:8 4th 271:3	70/30 103:2,9 108:13 7-7 245:21 7th 44:20,24 45:25 46:17	able 73:8 132:1 136:4 144:1,11 146:6,9 147:13 167:11 180:8,9 183:15,16 193:14,15	79:16 account 71:21,22 72:9,23 74:1,9,10 ,15 82:9 238:6,11, 18 240:3 243:4 258:22	acknowledge d 25:18 acquaintanc es 220:19 acquire 273:10 acquisition 191:25 acquisition s 17:21
40 197:10 45 195:14 45-50,000 128:15 48 244:8 4th 271:3 5 5 3:6 10:5,9,10	70/30 103:2,9 108:13 7-7 245:21 7th 44:20,24 45:25 46:17	able 73:8 132:1 136:4 144:1,11 146:6,9 147:13 167:11 180:8,9 183:15,16 193:14,15 198:17	79:16 account 71:21,22 72:9,23 74:1,9,10 ,15 82:9 238:6,11, 18 240:3 243:4 258:22 accountabil	acknowledge d 25:18 acquaintance es 220:19 acquire 273:10 acquisition 191:25 acquisition s 17:21 25:19
40 197:10 45 195:14 45-50,000 128:15 48 244:8 4th 271:3 5 5 3:6 10:5,9,10 40:17	70/30 103:2,9 108:13 7-7 245:21 7th 44:20,24 45:25 46:17	able 73:8 132:1 136:4 144:1,11 146:6,9 147:13 167:11 180:8,9 183:15,16 193:14,15 198:17 235:13,22 236:5	79:16 account 71:21,22 72:9,23 74:1,9,10 ,15 82:9 238:6,11, 18 240:3 243:4 258:22 accountabil ity	acknowledge d 25:18 acquaintance es 220:19 acquire 273:10 acquisition 191:25 acquisition s 17:21
40 197:10 45 195:14 45-50,000 128:15 48 244:8 4th 271:3 5 5 3:6 10:5,9,10 40:17 45:21,24	70/30 103:2,9 108:13 7-7 245:21 7th 44:20,24 45:25 46:17 8 8 8 6:21 154:11	able 73:8 132:1 136:4 144:1,11 146:6,9 147:13 167:11 180:8,9 183:15,16 193:14,15 198:17 235:13,22 236:5 absent 6:22	79:16 account 71:21,22 72:9,23 74:1,9,10 ,15 82:9 238:6,11, 18 240:3 243:4 258:22 accountabil ity 27:8,10,1	acknowledge d 25:18 acquaintanc es 220:19 acquire 273:10 acquisition 191:25 acquisition s 17:21 25:19
40 197:10 45 195:14 45-50,000 128:15 48 244:8 4th 271:3 5 5 3:6 10:5,9,10 40:17 45:21,24 50:6 52:1	70/30 103:2,9 108:13 7-7 245:21 7th 44:20,24 45:25 46:17 8 8 6:21 154:11 162:1	able 73:8 132:1 136:4 144:1,11 146:6,9 147:13 167:11 180:8,9 183:15,16 193:14,15 198:17 235:13,22 236:5 absent 6:22 absolutely	79:16 account 71:21,22 72:9,23 74:1,9,10 ,15 82:9 238:6,11, 18 240:3 243:4 258:22 accountabil ity 27:8,10,1 2,15,17,2	acknowledge d 25:18 acquaintance es 220:19 acquire 273:10 acquisition 191:25 acquisition s 17:21 25:19 259:2
40 197:10 45 195:14 45-50,000 128:15 48 244:8 4th 271:3 5 5 5 3:6 10:5,9,10 40:17 45:21,24 50:6 52:1 98:9	70/30 103:2,9 108:13 7-7 245:21 7th 44:20,24 45:25 46:17 8 8 6:21 154:11 162:1 169:2	able 73:8 132:1 136:4 144:1,11 146:6,9 147:13 167:11 180:8,9 183:15,16 193:14,15 198:17 235:13,22 236:5 absent 6:22 absolutely 17:3 18:6	79:16 account 71:21,22 72:9,23 74:1,9,10 ,15 82:9 238:6,11, 18 240:3 243:4 258:22 accountabil ity 27:8,10,1 2,15,17,2 2 28:23	acknowledge d 25:18 acquaintance es 220:19 acquire 273:10 acquisition 191:25 acquisition s 17:21 25:19 259:2 acronym 20:13
40 197:10 45 195:14 45-50,000 128:15 48 244:8 4th 271:3 5 5 3:6 10:5,9,10 40:17 45:21,24 50:6 52:1	70/30 103:2,9 108:13 7-7 245:21 7th 44:20,24 45:25 46:17 8 8 6:21 154:11 162:1 169:2 188:9	able 73:8 132:1 136:4 144:1,11 146:6,9 147:13 167:11 180:8,9 183:15,16 193:14,15 198:17 235:13,22 236:5 absent 6:22 absolutely 17:3 18:6 24:25	79:16 account 71:21,22 72:9,23 74:1,9,10 ,15 82:9 238:6,11, 18 240:3 243:4 258:22 accountabil ity 27:8,10,1 2,15,17,2 2 28:23 30:12	acknowledge d 25:18 acquaintance es 220:19 acquire 273:10 acquisition 191:25 acquisition s 17:21 25:19 259:2 acronym 20:13 act 41:11
40 197:10 45 195:14 45-50,000 128:15 48 244:8 4th 271:3 5 5 3:6 10:5,9,10 40:17 45:21,24 50:6 52:1 98:9 117:23	70/30 103:2,9 108:13 7-7 245:21 7th 44:20,24 45:25 46:17 8 8 6:21 154:11 162:1 169:2 188:9 195:1	able 73:8 132:1 136:4 144:1,11 146:6,9 147:13 167:11 180:8,9 183:15,16 193:14,15 198:17 235:13,22 236:5 absent 6:22 absolutely 17:3 18:6 24:25 92:19	79:16 account 71:21,22 72:9,23 74:1,9,10 ,15 82:9 238:6,11, 18 240:3 243:4 258:22 accountabil ity 27:8,10,1 2,15,17,2 2 28:23 30:12 accountant	acknowledge d 25:18 acquaintance es 220:19 acquire 273:10 acquisition 191:25 acquisition 5 17:21 25:19 259:2 acronym 20:13 act 41:11 122:24
40 197:10 45 195:14 45-50,000 128:15 48 244:8 4th 271:3 5 5 3:6 10:5,9,10 40:17 45:21,24 50:6 52:1 98:9 117:23 124:20	70/30 103:2,9 108:13 7-7 245:21 7th 44:20,24 45:25 46:17 8 8 6:21 154:11 162:1 169:2 188:9 195:1 199:16	able 73:8 132:1 136:4 144:1,11 146:6,9 147:13 167:11 180:8,9 183:15,16 193:14,15 198:17 235:13,22 236:5 absent 6:22 absolutely 17:3 18:6 24:25 92:19 162:9	79:16 account 71:21,22 72:9,23 74:1,9,10 ,15 82:9 238:6,11, 18 240:3 243:4 258:22 accountabil ity 27:8,10,1 2,15,17,2 2 28:23 30:12 accountant 94:25	acknowledge d 25:18 acquaintance es 220:19 acquire 273:10 acquisition 191:25 acquisition s 17:21 25:19 259:2 acronym 20:13 act 41:11
40 197:10 45 195:14 45-50,000 128:15 48 244:8 4th 271:3 5 5 5 3:6 10:5,9,10 40:17 45:21,24 50:6 52:1 98:9 117:23 124:20 129:7	70/30 103:2,9 108:13 7-7 245:21 7th 44:20,24 45:25 46:17 8 8 6:21 154:11 162:1 169:2 188:9 195:1 199:16 208:20	able 73:8 132:1 136:4 144:1,11 146:6,9 147:13 167:11 180:8,9 183:15,16 193:14,15 198:17 235:13,22 236:5 absent 6:22 absolutely 17:3 18:6 24:25 92:19 162:9 174:18,22	79:16 account 71:21,22 72:9,23 74:1,9,10 ,15 82:9 238:6,11, 18 240:3 243:4 258:22 accountabil ity 27:8,10,1 2,15,17,2 2 28:23 30:12 accountant	acknowledge d 25:18 acquaintance es 220:19 acquire 273:10 acquisition 191:25 acquisition s 17:21 25:19 259:2 acronym 20:13 act 41:11 122:24 193:21
40 197:10 45 195:14 45-50,000 128:15 48 244:8 4th 271:3 5 5 3:6 10:5,9,10 40:17 45:21,24 50:6 52:1 98:9 117:23 124:20 129:7 174:3	70/30 103:2,9 108:13 7-7 245:21 7th 44:20,24 45:25 46:17 8 8 6:21 154:11 162:1 169:2 188:9 195:1 199:16 208:20	able 73:8 132:1 136:4 144:1,11 146:6,9 147:13 167:11 180:8,9 183:15,16 193:14,15 198:17 235:13,22 236:5 absent 6:22 absolutely 17:3 18:6 24:25 92:19 162:9 174:18,22 182:18	79:16 account 71:21,22 72:9,23 74:1,9,10 ,15 82:9 238:6,11, 18 240:3 243:4 258:22 accountabil ity 27:8,10,1 2,15,17,2 2 28:23 30:12 accountant 94:25	acknowledge d 25:18 acquaintance es 220:19 acquire 273:10 acquisition 191:25 acquisition s 17:21 25:19 259:2 acronym 20:13 act 41:11 122:24 193:21 194:3
40 197:10 45 195:14 45-50,000 128:15 48 244:8 4th 271:3 5 5 3:6 10:5,9,10 40:17 45:21,24 50:6 52:1 98:9 117:23 124:20 129:7 174:3 208:23 209:9	70/30 103:2,9 108:13 7-7 245:21 7th 44:20,24 45:25 46:17 8 8 6:21 154:11 162:1 169:2 188:9 195:1 199:16 208:20 214:8,24	able 73:8 132:1 136:4 144:1,11 146:6,9 147:13 167:11 180:8,9 183:15,16 193:14,15 198:17 235:13,22 236:5 absent 6:22 absolutely 17:3 18:6 24:25 92:19 162:9 174:18,22 182:18 186:21	79:16 account 71:21,22 72:9,23 74:1,9,10 ,15 82:9 238:6,11, 18 240:3 243:4 258:22 accountabil ity 27:8,10,1 2,15,17,2 2 28:23 30:12 accountant 94:25 120:10,11	acknowledge d 25:18 acquaintance es 220:19 acquire 273:10 acquisition 191:25 acquisition s 17:21 25:19 259:2 acronym 20:13 act 41:11 122:24 193:21 194:3 198:22 201:2,14
40 197:10 45 195:14 45-50,000 128:15 48 244:8 4th 271:3 5 5 3:6 10:5,9,10 40:17 45:21,24 50:6 52:1 98:9 117:23 124:20 129:7 174:3 208:23	70/30 103:2,9 108:13 7-7 245:21 7th 44:20,24 45:25 46:17 8 8 6:21 154:11 162:1 169:2 188:9 195:1 199:16 208:20 214:8,24	able 73:8 132:1 136:4 144:1,11 146:6,9 147:13 167:11 180:8,9 183:15,16 193:14,15 198:17 235:13,22 236:5 absent 6:22 absolutely 17:3 18:6 24:25 92:19 162:9 174:18,22 182:18	79:16 account 71:21,22 72:9,23 74:1,9,10 ,15 82:9 238:6,11, 18 240:3 243:4 258:22 accountabil ity 27:8,10,1 2,15,17,2 2 28:23 30:12 accountant 94:25 120:10,11 accounts	acknowledge d 25:18 acquaintanc es 220:19 acquire 273:10 acquisition 191:25 acquisition s 17:21 25:19 259:2 acronym 20:13 act 41:11 122:24 193:21 194:3 198:22

		OD 00 14 2013		
28:20	207:7	advantage	270:21	169:3
207:22	244:2	145:7	278:25	199:17
actions	address	advantages	279:17	231:8,10
200:25	70:13	145:10	280:24	257 : 12
	73:7	153:1	281:1,5,6	agreed
active 72:5	201:2		290:15	80:12
128:18	248:6	adverse	affordable	107:12
196:1	267:16	170:7 , 8	136:24	108:1
activities	273:14	advice		111:17
80:25	274:8	18:24	afield	118:9
123:21	276:22	60 : 15	179:7	122:5
actual 6:5		63:18,20,	afternoon	
82:19	addressed	22 143:22	134:4	agreeing
125:18	43:22	144:2,20	138:11	110:7
199:14	187:10	advised	189:16	agreement
	190:19	69:5	203:25	85:9 94:7
actually	192:3	141:13	207:7	106:18
12:25	200:23		afternoons	107:3,18,
41:17	236:19	AFF000010	136:15	19 108:18
43:2	addressing	4:6		114:12
52:24	192:5	AFF10 204:5	afterwards	127:8
64:12	198:13		60:24	143:21
75:5 76:5	adjourning	affect	aga 30:10	174:25
82:22	299:9	218:17,22		188:3,18
102:12		219:5	against 84:16	194:19
138:13	admin 94:11	affected	170:2	237:2
139:12	96:8	266:23		240:25
156:17	237:6	affidavit	age 196:1	agreements
164:12,23	administrat	119:11	agenda	95:19
168:24	ion 126:6	204:1,6,1	193:15	176:7
173:19	administrat	0		178:13
184:6,22	ive 30:25	206:13,16	agent	
185:6	123:7	,18 207:9	194:21	ahead 18:10
186:25	126:20	208 : 23	agents	185:17
187:25	132:18,21	209:9	201:3	205:25
230:4	133:2	214:8,25	aggressive	278:15
244:2	243:24	215:4	5 : 22	Alec
267:8,20		219:19		81:5,7,18
1	administrat	227 : 9	ago 52:15 83:11	86:10
add 142:12	or 132:21	233:19	85:2 86:9	Alectra 2:7
234:12,19	208:17	236:16,18	87:1	-11 <i>i</i>
added 30:21	advance	239:12	93:17	alliance
85:17	180:13	244:16	98:18	41:11
234:20	advanced	245:24	101:16	169:9 197:5
addition	94:24	249:9,14,	102:2	197:5
83:17		20 252:13	102:2	198:23
207:6	advancement	253 : 10	133:4	
	s 201:18	255 : 25	134:16	allocated
additional	advancing	260:14,23	152:23	84:15
83:5	183:9	261 : 15	154:11	193:18
123:4		262 : 3		

	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	OD 00 14 2013	Tage 304	01 300
allocations	amended	254 : 7	216:13	26 : 5
94:11	104:18	answered	217:4,6	applies
237:6	105:1,6	12:25	226:20	27:22
allowed	106:18	38:8	227:3	123:19
117:19	107:17	123:4	238:9	168:14,15
196:14	108:17	142:19	239:3	·
197:10	240:24	197:17	241:24	appointed
234:21	amendment	225:9	260:18	41:7,14
	105:7		264:10	appreciate
alluded		answers	291:14	19:1
11:2	amenities 276:18	216:22	297:24	62:14
Almas 52:11	2/0:18	anticipated	anytime	91:24
59:10	American	21:14	53 : 6	149:11,17
60:7,9,19	277:4	35 : 12	63:17	175:3
62:3,19	293:24	anybody	apologize	215:9
63:7 65:2	294:3	126:6	66:17	219:6
66:5	amongst	148:13,16	93:5	236:2
67 : 15	41:21	157:15		appreciatio
68:1		168:16	apparently	n 90:19
69:10	amount 76:6 83:14	197:8	15:22	ammi and
186:15		anymore	118:19	apprised
187:14	85:9,16,2 2 86:20	74:23	119:11	6:2
190:14	87:4,5	179:12	178:25	approach
already	115:3		179:2	14:14
10:6	118:12	anyone	<pre>appear 8:8</pre>	154:12
12:25	122:11	232:13	35:9,10	159:7
13:4	123:1	234:22	83:12	169:22
45:19,21	125:10	anything	148:19	170:3
51:3	130:22	50:11,13	APPEARANCES	231:24
75:14 , 15	197:14	57 : 15	2:1	approached
100:25	206:24	75:2 78:8		185:8
111:16	226:3,12	85 : 13	appeared	247:23
114:11	276:1	101:5,7	14:23	approaching
115:15	291:24	107:3	appears	185:7
168:10	amounts	142:24	14:2	
179:11	234:1	143:3	15:20	appropriate
223:15		148:22	18:7	48:17
248:3	analysis	150:1,19	60:18	59:23
alternative	27:25	154:24	61:14	74:7,8 112:17
28:17	answer	165:12	64:22	112:17
am 5:15	13:10	169:21	66:2	appropriate
19:4 44:5	24:9	173:21	83:17	ness
51:18	71:10	180:6	84:19	74:18
80:23	77:24	184:25	85:8 , 15	approval
163:4	120:18	209:5,17 210:13	86:6 96:14	14:18
267:24	142:2,16,	210:13	105:6	92:7
amalgamatio	17 151:8	212:6	284:5	approve
n	197:16	212:0		119:7
35:12,15	212:2	215:21,23	appetite	
00.12,10	239:8		17:22	approximate
1	1	i l		ı

	1			
ly 139:16	109:12	Associate	atmosphere	AUDIBLE
248:16	110:4,12	1:7 2:4	14:19	70:15
263:6	114:23	associated	attached	131:7
April 206:3	293:3	86:4	14:11,20	146:18
229:21,22	articulate		176:4	252:16
,23	132:17	association	187:20	August
280:12,13		20:11	249 : 25	129:24
	articulatin	21:19		131:5
April/May	g 158:23	22:1,12	attaching	132:6
135:7	aside 73:20	24:18	81:11	242:10,13
298:8	149:8	38:14	attachment	246:24
area 10:19	190:21	association	81:16	247:2,20
15:15	251 : 4	s 37:18	82:13	248:19
144:5	274:20	assume 9:23	250 : 7	249:3
196:3	aspect	11:15	257 : 3	260:13
289:25	182:11	49:16	attachments	author
areas		76:24	250:1	284:18
120:22	aspects	95:3	251:10	284:18
139:4	180:23	99:12		automatical
181:22	188:18	103:10,19	attempt	ly 41:18
182:2,18	192:24	104:15	114:4	available
207:6	193:11	107:16	attempting	87:18
	assembled	120:2	114:1	135:6
arena	137:4	132:5	attend	248:24
123:12	assertion	176:10,11	47:15	287 : 7
aren't	92:5	194:15	220:20	
201:19	106:11	251 : 24		average
arguably	113:17	assumed	attended	34:25
92:9	163:12	112:2	262:12	avoid 197:2
	179:16	249:17	296:8	aware 8:24
argue 37:12	182 : 6	256:6	attending	18:21
178:4 183:12	assertions	258:20	261:7	19:2,4,15
188:3	114:5	269:2	attention	,18 27 : 6
194:1	114:5		150 : 12	28:1
	assessing	assuming	193:7	29:14
arguing	193:6	11:13	194:10	50:12
195:12	assessment	96:14	199:13	60:8
argument	67 : 21	99:10	223:10	71:11
150:25	asset	105:17,22	attic	114:1
192:5	34:5,13	assumption	196:16	119:5
arm 29:10	·	295:22	197:9,21	176:11
	assets	assumptions	207:4	178:5
arose 60:17	147:13	106:12	219:13	206:10
297:4	assigned	269:6	236:20	215:5
arrangement	126:19	295:19	242:5,25	219:14,19
80:12	assimilated		243:18	223:22
104:19		Atlantic	244:5,14	224:25
105:1	9:21	227:24	245:2	225:4
106:15	assist	228:5	251:5,11	230:11,13
107:12	250 : 6	229:3	201.0,11	,19

INQUIRY re COLLINGWOOD $06-14-2019$ Page 306 of 30	INOUIRY re	COLLINGWOOD	06-14-2019	Paσe	306	of	366
--	------------	-------------	------------	------	-----	----	-----

INQUIRY	re COLLINGWOO	D 06-14-2019	Page 306	OI 366
232:17,19	35:24	225:4	53:21	9:7 36:1
238:16,17	48:8 49:3	230:13	58:18	208:17
242:13	55:21		78:17	
243:19	66:16	become	80:2	Bentz 6:15
282:25	76:10	21:23	100:20	14:5
283:1,3	89:4	47:4	101:5	15:5 , 15
	91:10	71:23	115:18	58 : 7
away 30:8		72:11		61:25
169:3,6	93:15	77:3,8	118:11	62:5,18
220:14	99:13	78:6,11,1	120:10	64:2,19,2
	103:11	4 88:7	131:13,15	3
B	106:12	114:2	149:9	65:12,13,
back-and-	107:10	115:18	153:6	17
forth	114:5	116:22	155:18	67:9,11,2
85:12	117:12	117:4	161:12	2
	119:11	143:4	170:11,12	68:1,12,1
background	120:24	180:6,10,	171:9	9 69:6
88:21	147:17,19	24	192:19	186:11
89:7	, 20	182:9,10,	204:12	187:15
113:22	148:10	12 183 : 24	208:20	189:1,10,
132:18	151:20	224:25	211:10	15
133:1	157:9		218:13	190:9,16
157:23	160:22	becoming	224:21	260:6,9,1
163:10,25	162:19	58:20	225:13	8
Bain 2:8	163:18	77:12	226:13,16	
	164:22	beg 292:23	228:11	best 28:12
balance	168:13,18	beginning	242:10	56:16
110:13	170:2		246:7	93:23
balancing	171:24	175:19	250:15	134:3
198:22	177:2	193:24	257:9,21	152 : 15
	189:20	begins	263:12	165:8
band 193:17	196:11	239:18	264:12,25	178:13
bank 120:14	233:4	behalf	265:20	191:6
121:17,18	248:18	78:23	277 : 5	192:13
127:25	basis 53:11	176:10	289:24	196:9
128:21	56:21	201:3	293:17	198:22
292:10,19	103:9		294:4	206:13
,21,25	126:1	behind 69:7	297 : 17	better
	150:8	73:1	believed	16:25
bar 52:17	160:17	137:6	91:5	68 : 25
53:18	200:19	189:4	91.3 92:15	113:6,8
56:24		belief 57:6		150:18,20
Barrie	228:18	157 : 10	113:11,14	168:4
53:18	basket 91:7	168:1	116:12	169:14,16
190:24	batch 79:12		believes	·
208:9		believe	112:4	betterment
based	battle	9:19 21:6	Belinda 2:8	24:20
8:3,4,5,1	164:2	23:4		beyond 6:10
3 21:21	became	26:13	benefit	8:23 9:17
22:23	41:18	39:16	203:4	21:21
24:23	103:7	45:19,20	267:7 , 21	24:17
32:4	215:4	49:13	benefits	37 : 17
34:4		52 : 25		
1	i l			i

INQUIKI	re COLLINGWOO	00-14-2019	Page 30/	01 300
50:1 51:9	black 223:9	20:9,20,2	56:6,8,12	92:1,15,1
56:1		3	,18 57:7	9
117:22	BlackBerry	21:4,8,17	58:3,10,1	_
164:25	75:1,6	22:8,18	3,17	,19,25
188:6	237:22	23:1	59:11,17,	
202:2	238:5	24:11,25	21	95:3,7,12
	blanks	26:2,12,2	60:5,11,2	
bid 32:1,7	158:6	0	2 61:1,18	
51:13		27:4,9,14	62:12,20	9 97:12
bidder 47:4	board 9:15	28:3,8,24	63:11	98:22
51:4	18:14,18	29:14,19	64:6,8,14	
	19:2,5,7,	30:17,22	,21	,18,23
bidders	20,24	·		
45:22,25	30:5	31:5,10,1	65:4,9,14	100:2,8,1
46:14	37:1,20	7 , 22	,18,25	1,16,24
47:1,12,1	38:2,18,2	32:23	66:6	101:4,8,1
9 169:5	1 132:20	33:2,8	67:5,10,1	
170:22	155:13	34:8,11,2	4 68:4,22	
174:25	188:1	3	69:24	16,19,25
176:21,24	208:9,11,	35:2,7,14	70:15,21	103:5,10,
177:6,23	15	36:11,15	71:1,4,6,	·
bids 31:25	boards	37:5,24	8,16,25	104:1,4,7
51:14	24:18	38:10,19	72:15,25	,15,21,24
	27:19	39:5,9,21	73:9,22	105:11,14
bill 130:7		40:4,10,2	74:4,13,1	,17,20
billed	bodies 7:2	3 , 25	6	106:1,4,7
130:18	body 94:3	41:3,6,9,	75:12 , 20	,11,16,22
billings	236:23	13,23	76:17	107:2,14
128:10,12	239:22	42:1,4,8,	77:4,10,1	
	D 270.0	12,16,18	4 78:7,16	
,13	Bon 278:9	43:1,14,1	79:7,14,1	
bills 126:1	Bonwick	7,20	8,24	
binding	2:11	44:1,4,7,	80:2,6,9,	,17,21
175:8	3:5,9	17,22,25	14,20	110:1,6,1
	5:7,9,11,	45:4,7,12	81:6,9,14	4,16,20,2
bit 10:22	14	46:2,9,15	, 25	3
11:3 70:9	6:3,7,19,	,19,21	82:3,6,11	111:3,7,1
82:23	25	47:2,5,9,	,24	0,13,16,2
83:2	7:6,12,14	13,16,21	83:9,16,2	0
113:3	, 16 8:3	48:6,18	4	112:7,15,
165:4	9:3,10	49:8,15,2	84:4,8,19	24
185:24	10:16	0	85:1,6,11	113:2,7,1
198:11	11:11	50:5,8,18	,24	6 , 25
199:5	12:2,6	,24	86:13 , 23	114:13,18
220:13,18	13:2,9,17	51:5,8,16	87:3,9,13	, 25
234:12,20	,22	,21	,20,24	115:4,10,
240:11	14:2,9	52:13,21	88:5,9,22	17
243:16	15:8,18	53:2,16,2	89:1,12,1	116:2,19,
248:23	16:2,20,2	1	7,21	24 117:12
270:1,6	4 17:9,17	54:3,5,23	90:5,8,11	118:7,11,
282:9	18:6,17,2	55:3,12,2	,14	14,20
	1 19:4,21	5	91:5,21	119:3,9,1
	·			

INQUIR	Y re COLLINGWO	JD 06-14-2019	Page 308	OI 366
4,21,25	,15 148:9	178:18	252:13	79 : 22
120:20	149:15,19	179:4,15,	253:16	81:3
121:6,14,	,25	21	258:21	221:15,19
20,23	151:7,12,	181:2,5,1	260:20	222:14
122:1,7,1	18	0,18	274:20	273:25
		182:21		
2,16,20	152:1,8,1		277:18	284:6
123:23	2,17,21	183:3,11,	280:5	bounce
124:6,9,1	153:8,12,	17	281:15	100:18
4	17,21	184:2,7,1	282:18	bound
125:2,16,	154:5,9	4,20	283:1,8,1	194 : 22
21,25	155:21,25	185:9,17,	6 285:23	
126:16	156:5,10,	18,21,22	286:7,9,1	box 91:13
127:12,17	15,24	189:12,13	8	boxes
,21,24	157:4,7,1	198:15	288:12,13	285:19
128:5,9,2	3,21	199:6,13,	,24	
0	158:5,19	24	289:5,9	boy 54:16
129:1,4,1	159:1,8,1	200:2,5,1	290:7,21	breach 62:8
7	3,16,22,2	0	291:13	178:12,13
130:4,15,	5	202:19,20	292:6	179:9
18,21	160:3,8,1	203:7	293:4	
131:3,7,1	3,23	206:1	294:3,18,	break 40:17
2	161:2,7,1	208:24	20	52:3
132:13,16	8,23	209:5,14,	295:6,18	59:23
133:9,20	162:9,16,	24 211:14	296:13,22	60:6 98:6
134:8,13,	21	212:18	297:11,12	112:17
19,21,24	163:1,17,	213:21,25	,16,21,22	113:9
135:12,25	23	214:11	Bonwick's	165:23
136:5,20	164:4,11,	215:12		180:3,4
137:16,20	25	219:9,21,	12:5,25 213:1	185:19
, 24	165:9,12	24 220:3		196:17
138:3,14,	166:8,13,	222:19	224:6,19	breakdown
17,20	18	227:19,23	225:23	81 : 12
139:13,18	167:8,13,	228:4,7	227:7	
,23	16,22	229:2,18,	229:11	Breeden
140:3,13,	168:14,21	25 230 : 21	230:3	278:23
22	169:1,23	231:14,21	234:2	Breedon
141:7,12,	170:21	232:2,10,	244:11	2:20
17,19,22,	171:2,11,	25 233 : 13	283:21	3:7,14
25	25	234:24	287:3	40:15,16,
142:4,7,1	172:3,7,1	236:1,20	288:18	19,22,23
1,18	0,14,23	237:1	290:14,24	41:1,4,7,
143:6,12,	173:2,5,8	239:19	296:10	10,20,24
24	,13,22	242:6,14	book 195:8	42:2,5,10
144:3,6,1	174:2,10,	243:24	hookkoonom	,13,17,20
3,17,21	15,18,21	244:18	bookkeeper	43:10,15,
145:1,4,9	175:2,6,9	246:11	94:25	18,21
,14,16,19	,14	247:6,13,	119:15	44:2,5,13
,22	176:2,9,1	17	120:2	,18,23
146:1,10,	7,23	248:15,21	125:25	45:1,5,10
18,22	177:4,10,	249:4,7	boss 285:24	,23
147:1,5,8	13,19,24	251:18	bottom	46:5,11,1
1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1	10,19,24	271.10	2000m	10.0,11,1

INQUIRI	TE COTTINGMOO	D 00-14-2019	rage 309	01 300
6,20,23	80:3,7,10	0,13,20,2	136:2,16	13,20
47:3,7,10	,16	4	137:12,18	166:2,3,9
,14,17	81:1,7,10	107:7,24	,21,25	,14
48:4,14	, 15	108:10,15	138:12,15	167:1,9,1
49:6,11,1	82:1,4,7,	,23	,18	4,17
9	12,25	109:10,14	139:11,15	168:12,17
50:3,6,16	83:10,20	,19,22	,21	,23
,21	84:2,5,12	110:2,10,	140:1,11,	169:20
51:1,6,12	,21	15,17,21,	19,23	170:18
,18,25	85:7,18	25	141:10,16	171:1,5,2
52:7,9,10	86:8,18,2	111:5,8,1	,20,24	3
,14,23	4	1,14,18,2	142:1,5,9	172:1,5,8
53:14,19	87:6,10,1	5	,12	,11,20,25
54:1,4,20	5,22	112:11,16	143:14,15	173:3,6,9
,25	88:1,6,19	113:5,6,9	,18,19,25	,14
55:9,22				174:1,5,1
	,23 80.0 14 1	,20 114.8 15	144:4,9,1 5,18,23	1,16,19,2
56:3,7,10	89:9,14,1	114:8,15, 21		3
,14 57:4,22	90:3,6,9,	115:1,7,1	145:2,5,1	
· ·	12		1,15,20,2 3	175:3,7,1 0,22
58:5,12,1 4		4,20	146:5,15,	· ·
=	91:2,18,2	116:13,20 117:6,24	20,23	176:5,12, 19
59:8,14,1	92:11,18,	· ·	· ·	
9 , 22		118:3,8,1	147:2,6,1	177:1,7,1
60:4,5,21 ,25	20,25 93:7,9,13	3,18,25 119:6,10,	2 148:2 149:6,16	2,16,20 178:7,22
61:16,19,		19,0,10,	150:21	179:14,18
24 62:13	,21 94:2,17,2	120:17	151:10,16	
63:2,25	1	121:2,8,1	,23	,25 195:24
64:7,11,1	95:5,10,1	6,21,24	152:2,9,1	278:8,12,
8,24	4 96:3,13	122:3,9,1	4,18	16,21,22
65:6,10,1	97:7,14,2	3,17	153:4,9,1	279:2,5,8
5,19	5	123:20	4,18,25	,10,14,23
66:1,20	98:5,11,1	124:4,7,1	154:7	280:3,11,
67:8,22	4,16,17,2	2,23	155:16,22	15,20,22
68:18	3	125:13,17	156:2,6,1	281:4,12,
69:1	99:3,9,16	,23	1,16	15,19,22
70:3,8,17	,22,25	126:13	157:1,5,8	282:1,6,1
,24	100:6,10,	127:6,15,	,20,25	0,13,17,2
71:2,5,7,	13,22	18,22	158:14,20	4
15,17	101:1,6,1	128:2,7,1	159:2,10,	283:5,11,
72:10,21	0,14,19,2	6,23	14,18,23	15,19,23
73:6,17,2	4	129:2,14,	160:1,5,1	284:3,9,1
5	102:6,11,	23	0,19	1,20,24
74:11,14	17,20	130:12,16	161:1,3,1	285:5,11,
75:17	103:6,12,	,20,24	5,19	16,21
76 : 13	16,22	131:4,9	162:5,15,	286:4
77:1,6,11	104:2,5,1	132:11,14	18,24	
78:4,12,2	0,17,22	133:3,17	163:14,22	Breedon's
5	105:4,12,	134:2,12,	164:3,6,2	195:2
79:8,15,2	15,18,24	15,20,22	2	Brian
0,25	106:2,5,1	135:8,23	165:1,10,	260:6,9
-,		, ,	,,	

		OD 00 14 2013	rage 510	
brief 61:22	244:9	102:14	186:6	259:11,13
64:4 70:6	broad	103:9	Bushey	265:6
75:10	203:20	104:23	88:14	266:17,22
85:4 90:1		105:2	95:2 96:9	, 23
92:23	broader	106:3,17	103:8	284:17
95:25	77:16	107:9,17	104:23	285:1,3,7
96:17	78:1	108:19	105:2,13	,13,18,20
97:17,23	broke 98:1	110:3,7	106:17	, 25 286:3
98:3	broken	111:9,19	107:16	businesses
101:22		112:2,5,1	108:13,18	42:3,11,1
118:1	244:17	3	115:13	4 89:16
147:10	brother	113:10,14		196:5,8
162:23	53:11,22,	, 17 , 20	Bushey's	242:6
165:18	25 55:17	114:23	80:1	251:14,18
204:17	brought	115:12	business	·
206:17	16:1	116:8,11,	6:5 11:23	businessman
207:11	22:21	14	13:19	174:14,17
214:5	23:8,17	236:19,24	15 : 24	businessper
215:1	53:24	239:19	16:17,20	son 49:2
221:17	54:6	242:5,15	17 : 12	
224:9	64:23	284:17,21	33:11	buy 26:7
227:11,15	92:14	285:6 , 12	42 : 22	136:18,21
229:15	117:13	Budd's	72:14	buying
232:22	137:6	78:21	73:4	191:22
233:16,21	149:23	80:8	88:8,25	
235:16	153:2	88:21	89:2,6	
238:13	181:21	101:25	90:13,20,	ca 224:15
239:15	182:2	106:12	24 92:17	
262:6	191:3	111:1	98:10	Cabinet
265:13,25	193:7	115:22	113:24	41:17
284:1	194:9	113:22	115:2,5,6	196:4
293:9	281:10	build	,19,24	calculate
294:15	288:12	157 : 23	135:11,24	93:23
296:5		158 : 12	147:20	94:19
298:17	Budd 70:12	198:23	177:3	
briefings	78:5,8,13	building	189:23	calculation
141:14	,19,24	17 : 7	191:22	86:7,10
	80:4,7		209:6	camera 6:12
bring 10:3	82:10	built	215:18,25	8:7 16:6
15:6,23	86:11	130:14	216:2	Canada
30:24	88:2,4,8,	147:19	219:12,19	137:7
54:14	13,18,24	bullet	,23	139:8
91:11	89:4,10,1	160:20	221 : 11	
115:13	5 90:4	162:7	240:12,13	Canada's
128:21	91:23	bullets	,17	196:4
161:13	93:1 94:5	173:24	241:6,17,	Canadian
200:14	96:14,23	174:3	19,23	41:11
223:9	98:17		242:2,15	195:6
bringing	99:10,20	bunch	244:23	245:14,15
129:21	100:5,23	156:20	251:5,6,1	candid
145:7	101:2	bundle	1	Candid
110.			_	

INQUIRY	re COLLINGWOO	DD 06-14-2019	Page 311	of 366
43:16	catchup	48:21	49:7,10	charged
candidate	265 : 16	73:25	chairperson	234:1
25:22	category	89:12	189:18	charging
48:23	145:17	90:3	ahallanaa	118:24
CAO 188:19		95:11	challenge 35:25	
190:23	Catholic	99:19	54:14	chart 30:25
	132:19 208:9,15	100:14		31:3,9,10
capacity	ŕ	103:17	challenges	CHEC
21:12	Cause 65:13	112:9	59 : 5	20:3,6,17
72:1,12,1	215:24	119:4	60:16	21:2,6,13
8	caused	133:13	Chambers	,18
capital	267:21	139:9	1:18	22:5,15,2
90:19		145:15 147:22	chance	0,25 23:8
capture	causes 197:12	147:22	284:5	24:3,24
198:8		153:5		25:1,2,5,
	centered	170:2	change 74:7	
card	60:14	175:24	86:1	26:10
123:24,25	centers	178:1,4	118:13	27:7
cards	186:3	188:5	205:15,16	
247:24	central	189:10	206:5	6,22
248:2,7,9	27:7 28:2	201:23	279:19	29:10
carry 98:13	39:12	224:17	changed	30:16,20 34:25
_		284:21	11:9	38:13,21
carrying	centre		20:16	
95:15	29:12	certainty	41:16	check 89:7
case 14:3	260:23	186:21	132:15	128:11,21
15:11	261:1	Certificate	274 : 16	238:18
39:14	262:24	3:23	changes	269:12
44:8	cents 86:21	Certified	127:19	checks
84:20	CEO 23:11	299:11	205:22	238:20
104:16	25:2 30:4	cetera	206:8,12	CHEC-member
105:22	72:2,19	94:11	257:19 , 20	37:20
116:12	190:24	103:3	,22,24	38:18
136:9	263:19	113:22	258 : 7	
145:24	264:7	237:7	279:13	CHEC's 21:9
146:11	CEOs 29:24	248:6	281:11	Chen 182:1
150:25		287 : 20	characteris	Chenoweth
157:23	certain		tics	2:17 3:15
203:13 235:22	168:11	CFO	36:13	12:16
290:24	certainly	23:11,19 30:4	37 : 22	251:23,25
	8:3		characteriz	261:16,21
cash	9:19,22	CFOs 29:25	ation	266:1
108:1,25	17:11	chain 82:8	167 : 15	267 : 2
243:12	18:23	221:20,24		278:17,18
250:1,3,5	21:18	222:5	characteriz	286:12,14
251:10,11	22:14	239:18	ed 63:22	, 15 , 25
casual 8:14	23 : 25	chair	66:14	287:17,23
120:25	24:7	155 : 13	charge	, 24
catch 262:4	29:21		84:11	288:5,8,1
	35:19	Chairman		6 , 22

	INQUINI	TE COTTINGMOC	00 14 2019	raye 312	01 300
	289:3,8,1	123:24,25	62 : 8	202:11	179:24
	2,21	247:23,24	clarity	closed	191:25
	290:1,6,1	248:2,7	69:4	224:3,14	195:22
	0,13,18,2	chronologic		224.3,14	222:18
	3	_	clear 11:16	closer	287:3
	291:4,12,	ally	12:2 43:2	165:24	289:20
	18,21	197:24	59:15	closest	290:11
	292:1,4,8	chronology	62:22	197:13	Collus 2:22
	,13,18,23	46:7	72:1		l
	293:2,7,1	274:19	142:25	closing	5:18 18:14
	1,19,23	chuckled	143:3	14:17	24:2,23
	294:1,7,1	155:13	180:5	182:16	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·
	0,13,17,2		181:4	192:5	25:1,11,2 2,25
	2,25	circumstanc	183:24	Club	26:17
	295:5,10,	e 187:19	184:1	261:12,17	28:6
	13,18,24	circumstanc	186:11	coast	30:15
	296:3,7,1	es	190:8	135:15	31:1,6,7
	2,15,20	286:20,21	197:25	227:24	32:19
	297:2,6,9	•	203:9	228:5,8,1	35:5
	,14,19	CIS 20:18	226:9	0 229:3	36:13
	298:2,5,1	29:12	clearly	287:6	37:22
	1,15,19,2	cited 54:12	69:8		39:10,17
	3	city 67:14	173:24	cocktails	40:8 45:2
	Chenoweth's	186:15	191:3,5	54:11	49:7,9,12
	281:2	201:23	·	56:24	,19 71:22
			clerk 63:18	code 201:1	72:2,6,13
	cheque	CJI 271:6	66:24	271:17	,14,19,24
	81:21	CJI0007645	67:14	Coll 169:15	
	86:19	4 : 5	69:25 186:15		0,21 74:2
	87:7	CJI0011186		collect	79:13
	120:24	10:4	190:10,22 194:2	123:1	89:24
	122:6			collected	104:14
	132:8	CJI7644	clerk's	192:10	116:16
	206:23	79:2	66:8	collection	117:20,21
	244:11,17	CJI7645	client	10:11	156:4
	246:8	84:25	128:3,4,6		158:24
	286:21	clarificati	,8 135:25	collectivel	159:6
	289:10	on	136:4	y 24:21	169:17
	292:10 296:10	67:4 , 18	150:19,20	collegial	174:24
	290:10	134:1	162:23	39 : 24	175:8
	Chief 1:7	143:8,10	clients		177:14,21
	Chiefs		125:8,11	Collingwood	186:22,25
	123:17	clarified	128:15,18	1:2,17,20	187:22
		73:10	129:7	2:19	189:8
	chine 74:7	clarify		5:21,25	194:3
	choice	12:6	close 71:12	6:1,9	197:5,10
	168:2	41:13	76:6	8:25 9:8	207:2
	chose 33:19	63:4	113:7	18:15	215:5,21,
	187:17	180:11,25	126:8	26:25 33:18	23 216:17
		clarifying	146:21	39:15	217:18
	Christmas	Crarrrying	200:11	39.13	218:11,12
ı	l				İ

INQUIRY	re COLLINGWOO	JD 06-14-2019	Page 313	01 300
,17,25	158 : 8	201:20	70:1	142:16
219:12	commerciall	206:20	79:16	
222:20		207:23	80:4	complex
223:24	y 155:6	258:13	82 : 20	122:25
224:2,7,1	commission	259 : 1	83:7,15	177:25
9 225:24	54 : 7		84:7,9,24	compost
261:1	85 : 15	communities	85:9,22	250:2
263:13	89:3	137:8	86:20	251:5 , 12
264:1,6,1	286:20	community	101:16	comprised
1		58:21,22	108:2,9,2	21:3
266:20,22	committed	59:2	5	
273:13	17:14	144:10,12	109:1,7,9	27:19
	18:8	146:17	,20 116:9	compromisin
Collus's	committee	148:1	118:5	g 179:10
50:23	45:14	170:7,13,	124:5	computer
colon 105:5	163:11,15	19 173:21		_
	164:16	174:7	125:14,18	
comes 8:19	170:7	196:1,9	,24	98:1
31:11	193 : 5	201:17,24	127:15	210:7
191:12		·	129:16,21	
comfort	common	companies	206:20	237:21,23
25:6,10	111:22	43:11	207:14,23	· ·
comfortable	166:25	91:15	243:13,17	
186:23	195:13	208:11	,23	1,18
	communicate	company	244:4,10,	
221:23	57:9 72:8	43:8	13 245:23	
coming	146:7	58:20,21	258:13,17	269:3,4
33:15,25	190:16	75:5	286:22	con 9:22
222:13	communicate	76:22	288:21	117:14
227:2	d 62:23	80:8	Compenso's	142:24
commencing	66:25	109:8	121:18	concept
5 : 1	161:13	114:2	competent	94:23
	163:6	124:3,10	264:25	96:5
comment		127:14	266:17	137:5
6:10 8:22	communicati	197:20		162.12
16:13	ng 69:20	218:24	competitors	164:16
18:17	communicati	236:21	160:18	
21:8	on 73:23	242:25	complete	concern
26:14	74:19	243:18	29:11	201:15
33:13	143:23	258:24	142:17	concerning
73:24	144:5,7	260:2	178:20	116:15
114:19	177 : 8	263:15	224:3	261:1
152:6	259:9,10,	a a ma a ma a	aammlatad	aanaamna
209:15	11	compared 31:4	completed 34:21	concerns
212:7		200:15	244:18	152:10
253:18	communicati	200:13		concludes
commented	ons 19:13	compass	completely	299:6
26:13	86:14,17	202:3	68:20	concluding
comments	116:8	Compenso	163:19	142:23
8:10	123:16	26:1 42:6	201:10	202:16
36:24	132:4	69:25	completing	298:23
50.27	144:11,19			

		Í		
conclusion	193:20,24	267:24,25	on 23:5	7:21
48:11	194:4	congratulat	25 : 23	10:13
63:12	216:24	ory	35 : 22	13:12
142:22	confirm	246:14	36:2,4,6	19:11
195:4	56:4,15		188:15	36:9,22
conclusions	82 : 17	connected	constantly	38:1,16
49:3	131:14	145:6	76:9	52:9 60:4
	204:5	connection		72 : 4
condense	206:12	146:16	consultant	98:16
151:15	210:22	consensus	26:3	113:5
203:9	236:11	48:21	41:22	114:4
condition	E:		149:4	140:15
188:20	confirmatio	consequence	194:21	143:18
condo	n 234:6	s 116:17	consultants	166:2
245:10	confirmatio	Conservativ	145:17	194:9
	ns 112:9	es 41:11	146:8	198:2,6
condominium	confirmed		201:2,25	205:21
s 276:12	63:20	consider	contact	214:23
conduct	100:24	16:18	177:15	245:18
170:1		18:3 43:7	178:6	252 : 22
201:1	confirming	77:12		261 : 25
	69:12	220:16	contained	266:5
confidence	235:21	244:24	152:19	267:13
76:10	conflict	considerati	153 : 5	268:15
168:1	58:1,25	on 9:23	156:9	287 : 23
confident	61:10	11:18	157:11	continues
153:2	62 : 9	35:16	contemplate	31:2
	02.5	33.10	Concemprace	21.2
confidentia	64:20	36:4,7	d 235:10	36:20
confidentia		36:4,7 195:25	d 235:10	
1	64 : 20	36:4,7	d 235:10	36:20 73:12
1 140:24,25	64:20 66:15	36:4,7 195:25	d 235:10 content 60:14	36:20 73:12 continuous
1	64:20 66:15 67:19	36:4,7 195:25 264:4	d 235:10 content 60:14 238:22	36:20 73:12 continuous 208:3
1 140:24,25 141:5 149:13,18	64:20 66:15 67:19 68:14	36:4,7 195:25 264:4 286:2 considerati	d 235:10 content 60:14 238:22 293:3	36:20 73:12 continuous 208:3 continuousl
1 140:24,25 141:5 149:13,18 151:5,6,2	64:20 66:15 67:19 68:14 69:17,18,	36:4,7 195:25 264:4 286:2 considerati ons	d 235:10 content 60:14 238:22 293:3 contention	36:20 73:12 continuous 208:3 continuousl y 125:14
1 140:24,25 141:5 149:13,18	64:20 66:15 67:19 68:14 69:17,18, 22 187:10	36:4,7 195:25 264:4 286:2 considerati ons 198:21	d 235:10 content 60:14 238:22 293:3	36:20 73:12 continuous 208:3 continuousl
1 140:24,25 141:5 149:13,18 151:5,6,2 2,25	64:20 66:15 67:19 68:14 69:17,18, 22 187:10 193:20	36:4,7 195:25 264:4 286:2 considerati ons 198:21 considered	d 235:10 content 60:14 238:22 293:3 contention	36:20 73:12 continuous 208:3 continuousl y 125:14
1 140:24,25 141:5 149:13,18 151:5,6,2 2,25 154:24	64:20 66:15 67:19 68:14 69:17,18, 22 187:10 193:20 conflicts	36:4,7 195:25 264:4 286:2 considerati ons 198:21	d 235:10 content 60:14 238:22 293:3 contention 38:3	36:20 73:12 continuous 208:3 continuousl y 125:14 131:10
1 140:24,25 141:5 149:13,18 151:5,6,2 2,25 154:24 175:11	64:20 66:15 67:19 68:14 69:17,18, 22 187:10 193:20 conflicts 54:16	36:4,7 195:25 264:4 286:2 considerati ons 198:21 considered	<pre>d 235:10 content 60:14 238:22 293:3 contention 38:3 CONTENTS 3:1</pre>	36:20 73:12 continuous 208:3 continuousl y 125:14 131:10 contract
1 140:24,25 141:5 149:13,18 151:5,6,2 2,25 154:24 175:11 186:4	64:20 66:15 67:19 68:14 69:17,18, 22 187:10 193:20 conflicts 54:16 57:15	36:4,7 195:25 264:4 286:2 considerati ons 198:21 considered 219:7	<pre>d 235:10 content 60:14 238:22 293:3 contention 38:3 CONTENTS 3:1 contest</pre>	36:20 73:12 continuous 208:3 continuousl y 125:14 131:10 contract 72:16
1 140:24,25 141:5 149:13,18 151:5,6,2 2,25 154:24 175:11 186:4 192:9	64:20 66:15 67:19 68:14 69:17,18, 22 187:10 193:20 conflicts 54:16 57:15 60:16 62:24	36:4,7 195:25 264:4 286:2 considerati ons 198:21 considered 219:7 considering	<pre>d 235:10 content 60:14 238:22 293:3 contention 38:3 CONTENTS 3:1 contest 97:20</pre>	36:20 73:12 continuous 208:3 continuousl y 125:14 131:10 contract 72:16 117:1,2,1
1 140:24,25 141:5 149:13,18 151:5,6,2 2,25 154:24 175:11 186:4 192:9 193:8,9	64:20 66:15 67:19 68:14 69:17,18, 22 187:10 193:20 conflicts 54:16 57:15 60:16 62:24 confused	36:4,7 195:25 264:4 286:2 considerati ons 198:21 considered 219:7 considering 31:21 140:9	<pre>d 235:10 content 60:14 238:22 293:3 contention 38:3 CONTENTS 3:1 contest 97:20 context</pre>	36:20 73:12 continuous 208:3 continuousl y 125:14 131:10 contract 72:16 117:1,2,1
1 140:24,25 141:5 149:13,18 151:5,6,2 2,25 154:24 175:11 186:4 192:9 193:8,9 216:4 266:21	64:20 66:15 67:19 68:14 69:17,18, 22 187:10 193:20 conflicts 54:16 57:15 60:16 62:24 confused 46:10	36:4,7 195:25 264:4 286:2 considerati ons 198:21 considered 219:7 considering 31:21 140:9 consistent	<pre>d 235:10 content 60:14 238:22 293:3 contention 38:3 CONTENTS 3:1 contest 97:20 context 15:10</pre>	36:20 73:12 continuous 208:3 continuousl y 125:14 131:10 contract 72:16 117:1,2,1 8 120:4,20
1 140:24,25 141:5 149:13,18 151:5,6,2 2,25 154:24 175:11 186:4 192:9 193:8,9 216:4 266:21 confidentia	64:20 66:15 67:19 68:14 69:17,18, 22 187:10 193:20 conflicts 54:16 57:15 60:16 62:24 confused 46:10 97:4	36:4,7 195:25 264:4 286:2 considerati ons 198:21 considered 219:7 considering 31:21 140:9 consistent 57:20	d 235:10 content 60:14 238:22 293:3 contention 38:3 CONTENTS 3:1 contest 97:20 context 15:10 78:2	36:20 73:12 continuous 208:3 continuousl y 125:14 131:10 contract 72:16 117:1,2,1 8 120:4,20 121:4
1 140:24,25 141:5 149:13,18 151:5,6,2 2,25 154:24 175:11 186:4 192:9 193:8,9 216:4 266:21 confidentia lity	64:20 66:15 67:19 68:14 69:17,18, 22 187:10 193:20 conflicts 54:16 57:15 60:16 62:24 confused 46:10 97:4 113:23	36:4,7 195:25 264:4 286:2 considerati ons 198:21 considered 219:7 considering 31:21 140:9 consistent 57:20 282:11	<pre>d 235:10 content 60:14 238:22 293:3 contention 38:3 CONTENTS 3:1 contest 97:20 context 15:10</pre>	36:20 73:12 continuous 208:3 continuousl y 125:14 131:10 contract 72:16 117:1,2,1 8 120:4,20 121:4 126:4,12,
1 140:24,25 141:5 149:13,18 151:5,6,2 2,25 154:24 175:11 186:4 192:9 193:8,9 216:4 266:21 confidentia lity 174:25	64:20 66:15 67:19 68:14 69:17,18, 22 187:10 193:20 conflicts 54:16 57:15 60:16 62:24 confused 46:10 97:4 113:23 142:25	36:4,7 195:25 264:4 286:2 considerati ons 198:21 considered 219:7 considering 31:21 140:9 consistent 57:20 282:11 consoli	d 235:10 content 60:14 238:22 293:3 contention 38:3 CONTENTS 3:1 contest 97:20 context 15:10 78:2	36:20 73:12 continuous 208:3 continuousl y 125:14 131:10 contract 72:16 117:1,2,1 8 120:4,20 121:4 126:4,12, 14 127:2 188:20
1 140:24,25 141:5 149:13,18 151:5,6,2 2,25 154:24 175:11 186:4 192:9 193:8,9 216:4 266:21 confidentia lity 174:25 175:25	64:20 66:15 67:19 68:14 69:17,18, 22 187:10 193:20 conflicts 54:16 57:15 60:16 62:24 confused 46:10 97:4 113:23 142:25 143:4	36:4,7 195:25 264:4 286:2 considerati ons 198:21 considered 219:7 considering 31:21 140:9 consistent 57:20 282:11	d 235:10 content 60:14 238:22 293:3 contention 38:3 CONTENTS 3:1 contest 97:20 context 15:10 78:2 107:20	36:20 73:12 continuous 208:3 continuousl y 125:14 131:10 contract 72:16 117:1,2,1 8 120:4,20 121:4 126:4,12, 14 127:2 188:20
1 140:24,25 141:5 149:13,18 151:5,6,2 2,25 154:24 175:11 186:4 192:9 193:8,9 216:4 266:21 confidentia lity 174:25 175:25 176:7	64:20 66:15 67:19 68:14 69:17,18, 22 187:10 193:20 conflicts 54:16 57:15 60:16 62:24 confused 46:10 97:4 113:23 142:25 143:4 180:6,10,	36:4,7 195:25 264:4 286:2 considerati ons 198:21 considered 219:7 considering 31:21 140:9 consistent 57:20 282:11 consoli	d 235:10 content 60:14 238:22 293:3 contention 38:3 CONTENTS 3:1 contest 97:20 context 15:10 78:2 107:20 continue	36:20 73:12 continuous 208:3 continuousl y 125:14 131:10 contract 72:16 117:1,2,1 8 120:4,20 121:4 126:4,12, 14 127:2 188:20 contraction 109:4
1 140:24,25 141:5 149:13,18 151:5,6,2 2,25 154:24 175:11 186:4 192:9 193:8,9 216:4 266:21 confidentia lity 174:25 175:25 176:7 178:13	64:20 66:15 67:19 68:14 69:17,18, 22 187:10 193:20 conflicts 54:16 57:15 60:16 62:24 confused 46:10 97:4 113:23 142:25 143:4 180:6,10, 24 182:10	36:4,7 195:25 264:4 286:2 considerati ons 198:21 considered 219:7 considering 31:21 140:9 consistent 57:20 282:11 consoli 29:6	d 235:10 content 60:14 238:22 293:3 contention 38:3 CONTENTS 3:1 contest 97:20 context 15:10 78:2 107:20 continue 72:22	36:20 73:12 continuous 208:3 continuousl y 125:14 131:10 contract 72:16 117:1,2,1 8 120:4,20 121:4 126:4,12, 14 127:2 188:20 contraction 109:4 contractors
1 140:24,25 141:5 149:13,18 151:5,6,2 2,25 154:24 175:11 186:4 192:9 193:8,9 216:4 266:21 confidentia lity 174:25 175:25 176:7 178:13 179:1	64:20 66:15 67:19 68:14 69:17,18, 22 187:10 193:20 conflicts 54:16 57:15 60:16 62:24 confused 46:10 97:4 113:23 142:25 143:4 180:6,10, 24 182:10 183:25	36:4,7 195:25 264:4 286:2 considerati ons 198:21 considered 219:7 considering 31:21 140:9 consistent 57:20 282:11 consoli 29:6 consolidate	d 235:10 content 60:14 238:22 293:3 contention 38:3 CONTENTS 3:1 contest 97:20 context 15:10 78:2 107:20 continue 72:22 77:21	36:20 73:12 continuous 208:3 continuousl y 125:14 131:10 contract 72:16 117:1,2,1 8 120:4,20 121:4 126:4,12, 14 127:2 188:20 contraction 109:4
1 140:24,25 141:5 149:13,18 151:5,6,2 2,25 154:24 175:11 186:4 192:9 193:8,9 216:4 266:21 confidentia lity 174:25 175:25 176:7 178:13	64:20 66:15 67:19 68:14 69:17,18, 22 187:10 193:20 conflicts 54:16 57:15 60:16 62:24 confused 46:10 97:4 113:23 142:25 143:4 180:6,10, 24 182:10	36:4,7 195:25 264:4 286:2 considerati ons 198:21 considered 219:7 considering 31:21 140:9 consistent 57:20 282:11 consoli 29:6 consolidate d 21:24	d 235:10 content 60:14 238:22 293:3 contention 38:3 CONTENTS 3:1 contest 97:20 context 15:10 78:2 107:20 continue 72:22 77:21 114:6	36:20 73:12 continuous 208:3 continuousl y 125:14 131:10 contract 72:16 117:1,2,1 8 120:4,20 121:4 126:4,12, 14 127:2 188:20 contraction 109:4 contractors

	NQUIRI	TE COLLINGWO	JD 00-14-2013	rage 313	01 300
248:1	8	288:19	corporate	108:14	291:25
contrac	tual	291:5	24:7	109:3,18,	293:5
126:1		295:6	29:20	21	294:21
		conversatio	72:9	111:10,13	295:16,17
contrad		ns 66:18	74:10	112:15	,23,24
on 39	:6	77:19,20	120:7	119:9,21	297:13
contrib	utin	151:21	corporation	122:12,16	299:11
g 76:	5	154:20	2:8,23	123:10	corrections
		155:9	80:1 84:9	130:15	204:9
contrib		160:16	102:3	131:3	253:12,13
n 83:	18	168:8	178:14	134:19	İ
control		170:17		137:23,24	
28:18		172:17	corporation	141:19	78 : 22
176:1	4	211:19	s 23:15	143:24	88:3
177:2	1	219:14,20	201:3,5	144:3,6,1	106:6
201:1	6	225:19,23	Corr 160:8	7 , 22	corresponde
controv	orei	·		146:22	nce 63:4
al 57		conveyed	correct	152:1 , 17	186:10
		141:9	6:18	153:8	cost
conveni	ent	149:12	13:21	156:5 , 15	
40:18		152 : 20	17:8	157 : 4	30:7,25
52:3		153 : 6	26:11	158:19	34:20,21
convers	atio	convince	28:7	159:1,9	228:1
n 8:1		219:11	31:21	160:9,23	248:11 277:13
48:7	_	convincing	32:22	166:3	
50:2,	4	53 : 9	33:1	167:8,13,	
60:23			35:6,13 36:10	16 171:25	effective
63:23		Cooper 2:13	36:10 37:22	172:7,10	29:4
67:18		61:6	41:23	173:2,5,8	costs 31:9
68:11	<u> </u>	193:4	42:1,4,12	, 13	84:15
75:21		cooperative	,16 43:20	204:11	86:4 96:9
111:2		39 : 25	44:1,4,5,	205:18	103:3
125:4		copied	17 45:4	209:12	couched
154:1	1	273 : 18	47:2,9,13	215:7	59 : 3
155:5			,16 51:18	228:2	39:3
157:1	5	copies	56:15	229:20	council
161:1	1	119:12,13	58:13	232:7	1:18
166:2	4	120:1	61:18	247:15	5:21,25
167:7		сору	76:18	254:1	6:1,10,12
168:2		65:8,12	77:10	262:13	8:10,20,2
170:1	,11	67:1,6,23	79:19	270:11,25	5 9:14,17
186:1	6,19	150:14	80:9,15,1	271:4,11,	10:24
210:4		155:12	8 82:6	18,25	16:3 17:1
211:2	, 25	194:14	83:15	272:21	18:15,18
212:3		246:19	97:11	273:8	19:5,20,2
11,17	,20	272:14	101:18	276:2	5
213:3	,5,2	Cor 77:10	104:4	277:16 279:1	39:15,20
4 226			105:14	280:21	40:24
233:5		corner	106:1,4	280:21	41:8
244:2		79:22	107:9	290:9,22	55:8,21
287:1	2			230.3,22	57:14
I				Ī	i

INQUIR	TE CONTINGUO	JD 00-14-2019	rage 310	01 300
69:21	81:24	39:2	cross-	221:2
147:21	course	creative	examined	260:5
193:10,17	14:17	129:18	182:4	268:11
councillor	17:6		183:14	273 : 3
6:22 9:1	31:25	credit	194:7	dated 79:5
11:4,14	63:20	292 : 17	cross-	82 : 21
12:3	73:15	credits	examining	235:9
13:3,15,1	143:4	120:15	47:23	236:22
9,23	145:24	Creek		242:12
16:10	147:20	276:5,6,7	cross-	268:7,10
41:19	154:12	,15	sharing	dates 45:17
61:5	166:4		19:8	
63:21	167:18	critical	culprit	50:20 66:13
councillors	182:11	15:16	7 : 15	68:15
8:14 9:12	189:16	17:13	cultural	69:14
16:7 19:6	202:6	18:13		249:7,8,1
	230:14	29:22	25:10,15, 16	
Council's	253:20	30:9	10	1,14 276:1
9:8	263:15	171:15	culture	281:2
counsel	279:11	197:9	14:18	
2:3,5,11,	293:13	cross 195:2	cultured	day 28:11
15 64:22	Court 195:8	196:19	24:5	32:13
203:8		293:13		41:16
204:9	courtesy	cross-	cumulation	56 : 7
271:9	50:14	examinati	132:9	84:22,24
278:23	covered	on	current	94:7
counter	5:19	3:6,7,13,	198:3	136:13
53:3	192:4	14,15	248:6	141:1
	cray 226:21	5 : 13	270:16	152:5
couple	Cray 220.21	40:22	customer	154:15
43:22,23	crazy	180:25	30 : 25	195:24
62:1	226:14	186:20	137:2	199:15
126:25	create 9:20	195:4	cuts 86:19	202:7,8
138:7	23:21	196:15	Cuts 00:19	259:20
155:17	24:6,16	197 : 18		269:13,14
188:25	28:17	198:10	D	288:17 289:4
193:1	37:17	199:4	daily 49:23	289:4
196:20	115:6	200:12,18	data 92:7	293:4
197:18	117:4	202:13	database	
231:8,10	197:6	252 : 7	123:12,15	days 43:23
240:15	created	278:21	,20	53:13
253:12	22:12	286:14	,20 247:25	55 : 17
258:6 269:22	123:15	cross-	248:4,8	62:1
269:22	197:5	examinati	·	64:25
278:24 279:13	247:25	ons 143:5	date 45:9	65:1
288:11		192:25	46:4	90:18
	creating	194:43	47:22,25	117:8
courier	20:19	cross-	56:1,4	138:18,21
87:17	30:7	examine	64:12	139:12,14
I				
couriered	37:12	182:5	80:11	,19,20 152:23

111001111				
188:25	280:8	35:19	4 63:7,8	71:9
193:1,13	December/	delivered	65 : 22	167:11
196:20	·	119:11	66:3	208:5
197:18	January	275:8	67 : 25	277 : 8
198:17	134:7		69:17 , 20	290:3
230:7	decent	289:2,5	154:21	4-4
282:19	128:5 , 7	delivering		determinati
283:2	decided	29:3	derogatory	on 48:13
dantiman	109:24	delivery	21:25	determine
daytimer 45:9		30:7	22:15	164:8
45:9	decision	35 : 20	des 192:12	196:23
deal 14:17	5:21,25	107:4	describe	determined
30:2 91:4	14:1 60:7		68:25	37:1
103:1,8	72:22	demonstrate	192:12	
104:11,13	145:3,24	31:11,23	221:23	develop
108:12	146:3	73:3	227:18	136:23
109:24,25	decision-	93:20		developed
118:21	making	152 : 22	described	234:12
122:23	16:3	demonstrate	54:21	
136:4		d 141:8	89:13,22	development
142:18	decks 6:9	163:5	179:11	129:11
222:20	declared	164:9	describes	135:14
224:7,20	117:16	186:8,9	158 : 5	DFO 129:11
248:13	declaring	·		dictate
281:14	69:11	deodorizer	describing	111:22
dealing 7:1		251:5 , 12	68:6,7,8	
_	deductions			dictated
57.13		depended	description	
57:13 58:1	126:11	depended 127:1	description 4:2	193:16
58:1	126:11	<u>-</u>	_	
58:1 183:19	126:11 deemed	127:1 176:14	4:2	193:16
58:1 183:19 197:24	126:11 deemed 69:15	127:1 176:14 depending	4:2 88:12,16	193:16 dictates 166:25
58:1 183:19 197:24 266:17	126:11 deemed 69:15 definitely	127:1 176:14 depending 16:9 26:5	4:2 88:12,16 89:5	193:16 dictates 166:25 different
58:1 183:19 197:24 266:17 deals 152:4	126:11 deemed 69:15	127:1 176:14 depending 16:9 26:5 125:5,7,1	4:2 88:12,16 89:5 119:4	193:16 dictates 166:25 different 10:11
58:1 183:19 197:24 266:17 deals 152:4 158:17	126:11 deemed 69:15 definitely	127:1 176:14 depending 16:9 26:5 125:5,7,1 9 128:14	4:2 88:12,16 89:5 119:4 179:6 201:10	193:16 dictates 166:25 different 10:11 13:8
58:1 183:19 197:24 266:17 deals 152:4 158:17 160:6	126:11 deemed 69:15 definitely 168:3	127:1 176:14 depending 16:9 26:5 125:5,7,1 9 128:14 188:12	4:2 88:12,16 89:5 119:4 179:6 201:10 description	193:16 dictates 166:25 different 10:11 13:8 27:19
58:1 183:19 197:24 266:17 deals 152:4 158:17	126:11 deemed 69:15 definitely 168:3 definition 129:21	127:1 176:14 depending 16:9 26:5 125:5,7,1 9 128:14 188:12 deposit	4:2 88:12,16 89:5 119:4 179:6 201:10 description s 192:14	193:16 dictates 166:25 different 10:11 13:8 27:19 28:9,10
58:1 183:19 197:24 266:17 deals 152:4 158:17 160:6	126:11 deemed 69:15 definitely 168:3 definition 129:21 degree	127:1 176:14 depending 16:9 26:5 125:5,7,1 9 128:14 188:12 deposit 204:22	4:2 88:12,16 89:5 119:4 179:6 201:10 description s 192:14 desire 9:1	193:16 dictates 166:25 different 10:11 13:8 27:19 28:9,10 37:14
58:1 183:19 197:24 266:17 deals 152:4 158:17 160:6 161:5	126:11 deemed 69:15 definitely 168:3 definition 129:21 degree 17:17	127:1 176:14 depending 16:9 26:5 125:5,7,1 9 128:14 188:12 deposit	4:2 88:12,16 89:5 119:4 179:6 201:10 description s 192:14	193:16 dictates 166:25 different 10:11 13:8 27:19 28:9,10 37:14 42:14
58:1 183:19 197:24 266:17 deals 152:4 158:17 160:6 161:5 dealt 59:4 183:23	126:11 deemed 69:15 definitely 168:3 definition 129:21 degree 17:17 189:22	127:1 176:14 depending 16:9 26:5 125:5,7,1 9 128:14 188:12 deposit 204:22	4:2 88:12,16 89:5 119:4 179:6 201:10 description s 192:14 desire 9:1	193:16 dictates 166:25 different 10:11 13:8 27:19 28:9,10 37:14 42:14 44:10
58:1 183:19 197:24 266:17 deals 152:4 158:17 160:6 161:5 dealt 59:4 183:23 Dean	126:11 deemed 69:15 definitely 168:3 definition 129:21 degree 17:17 189:22 delete	127:1 176:14 depending 16:9 26:5 125:5,7,1 9 128:14 188:12 deposit 204:22 292:14,19	4:2 88:12,16 89:5 119:4 179:6 201:10 description s 192:14 desire 9:1 92:3	193:16 dictates 166:25 different 10:11 13:8 27:19 28:9,10 37:14 42:14 44:10 86:10
58:1 183:19 197:24 266:17 deals 152:4 158:17 160:6 161:5 dealt 59:4 183:23 Dean 220:8,10	126:11 deemed 69:15 definitely 168:3 definition 129:21 degree 17:17 189:22	127:1 176:14 depending 16:9 26:5 125:5,7,1 9 128:14 188:12 deposit 204:22 292:14,19 deposited	4:2 88:12,16 89:5 119:4 179:6 201:10 description s 192:14 desire 9:1 92:3 desired 61:12	193:16 dictates 166:25 different 10:11 13:8 27:19 28:9,10 37:14 42:14 44:10 86:10 89:16
58:1 183:19 197:24 266:17 deals 152:4 158:17 160:6 161:5 dealt 59:4 183:23 Dean 220:8,10 debits	126:11 deemed 69:15 definitely 168:3 definition 129:21 degree 17:17 189:22 delete	127:1 176:14 depending 16:9 26:5 125:5,7,1 9 128:14 188:12 deposit 204:22 292:14,19 deposited 87:11	4:2 88:12,16 89:5 119:4 179:6 201:10 description s 192:14 desire 9:1 92:3 desired 61:12 destroyed	193:16 dictates 166:25 different 10:11 13:8 27:19 28:9,10 37:14 42:14 44:10 86:10 89:16 93:16
58:1 183:19 197:24 266:17 deals 152:4 158:17 160:6 161:5 dealt 59:4 183:23 Dean 220:8,10	126:11 deemed 69:15 definitely 168:3 definition 129:21 degree 17:17 189:22 delete 184:25	127:1 176:14 depending 16:9 26:5 125:5,7,1 9 128:14 188:12 deposit 204:22 292:14,19 deposited 87:11 244:10 292:12,16	4:2 88:12,16 89:5 119:4 179:6 201:10 description s 192:14 desire 9:1 92:3 desired 61:12 destroyed 121:10	193:16 dictates 166:25 different 10:11 13:8 27:19 28:9,10 37:14 42:14 44:10 86:10 89:16 93:16 122:22
58:1 183:19 197:24 266:17 deals 152:4 158:17 160:6 161:5 dealt 59:4 183:23 Dean 220:8,10 debits	126:11 deemed 69:15 definitely 168:3 definition 129:21 degree 17:17 189:22 delete 184:25 deliberatio ns 15:1	127:1 176:14 depending 16:9 26:5 125:5,7,1 9 128:14 188:12 deposit 204:22 292:14,19 deposited 87:11 244:10 292:12,16 depositing	4:2 88:12,16 89:5 119:4 179:6 201:10 description s 192:14 desire 9:1 92:3 desired 61:12 destroyed 121:10 detail	193:16 dictates 166:25 different 10:11 13:8 27:19 28:9,10 37:14 42:14 44:10 86:10 89:16 93:16 122:22 124:15
58:1 183:19 197:24 266:17 deals 152:4 158:17 160:6 161:5 dealt 59:4 183:23 Dean 220:8,10 debits 120:15	126:11 deemed 69:15 definitely 168:3 definition 129:21 degree 17:17 189:22 delete 184:25 deliberatio ns 15:1 deliver	127:1 176:14 depending 16:9 26:5 125:5,7,1 9 128:14 188:12 deposit 204:22 292:14,19 deposited 87:11 244:10 292:12,16 depositing 127:25	4:2 88:12,16 89:5 119:4 179:6 201:10 description s 192:14 desire 9:1 92:3 desired 61:12 destroyed 121:10 detail 67:13	193:16 dictates 166:25 different 10:11 13:8 27:19 28:9,10 37:14 42:14 44:10 86:10 89:16 93:16 122:22 124:15 139:4
58:1 183:19 197:24 266:17 deals 152:4 158:17 160:6 161:5 dealt 59:4 183:23 Dean 220:8,10 debits 120:15 decade 31:25	126:11 deemed 69:15 definitely 168:3 definition 129:21 degree 17:17 189:22 delete 184:25 deliberatio ns 15:1 deliver 23:24	127:1 176:14 depending 16:9 26:5 125:5,7,1 9 128:14 188:12 deposit 204:22 292:14,19 deposited 87:11 244:10 292:12,16 depositing 127:25 deposits	4:2 88:12,16 89:5 119:4 179:6 201:10 description s 192:14 desire 9:1 92:3 desired 61:12 destroyed 121:10 detail 67:13 68:23	193:16 dictates 166:25 different 10:11 13:8 27:19 28:9,10 37:14 42:14 44:10 86:10 89:16 93:16 122:22 124:15 139:4 145:17
58:1 183:19 197:24 266:17 deals 152:4 158:17 160:6 161:5 dealt 59:4 183:23 Dean 220:8,10 debits 120:15 decade 31:25 December	126:11 deemed 69:15 definitely 168:3 definition 129:21 degree 17:17 189:22 delete 184:25 deliberatio ns 15:1 deliver 23:24 24:21	127:1 176:14 depending 16:9 26:5 125:5,7,1 9 128:14 188:12 deposit 204:22 292:14,19 deposited 87:11 244:10 292:12,16 depositing 127:25 deposits 87:25	4:2 88:12,16 89:5 119:4 179:6 201:10 description s 192:14 desire 9:1 92:3 desired 61:12 destroyed 121:10 detail 67:13 68:23 70:14	193:16 dictates 166:25 different 10:11 13:8 27:19 28:9,10 37:14 42:14 44:10 86:10 89:16 93:16 122:22 124:15 139:4 145:17 148:12
58:1 183:19 197:24 266:17 deals 152:4 158:17 160:6 161:5 dealt 59:4 183:23 Dean 220:8,10 debits 120:15 decade 31:25 December 131:20	126:11 deemed 69:15 definitely 168:3 definition 129:21 degree 17:17 189:22 delete 184:25 deliberatio ns 15:1 deliver 23:24 24:21 287:4	127:1 176:14 depending 16:9 26:5 125:5,7,1 9 128:14 188:12 deposit 204:22 292:14,19 deposited 87:11 244:10 292:12,16 depositing 127:25 deposits 87:25 290:20	4:2 88:12,16 89:5 119:4 179:6 201:10 description s 192:14 desire 9:1 92:3 desired 61:12 destroyed 121:10 detail 67:13 68:23 70:14 148:4	193:16 dictates 166:25 different 10:11 13:8 27:19 28:9,10 37:14 42:14 44:10 86:10 89:16 93:16 122:22 124:15 139:4 145:17 148:12 149:12
58:1 183:19 197:24 266:17 deals 152:4 158:17 160:6 161:5 dealt 59:4 183:23 Dean 220:8,10 debits 120:15 decade 31:25 December 131:20 133:23	126:11 deemed 69:15 definitely 168:3 definition 129:21 degree 17:17 189:22 delete 184:25 deliberatio ns 15:1 deliver 23:24 24:21 287:4 288:24	127:1 176:14 depending 16:9 26:5 125:5,7,1 9 128:14 188:12 deposit 204:22 292:14,19 deposited 87:11 244:10 292:12,16 depositing 127:25 deposits 87:25	4:2 88:12,16 89:5 119:4 179:6 201:10 description s 192:14 desire 9:1 92:3 desired 61:12 destroyed 121:10 detail 67:13 68:23 70:14 148:4 171:9	193:16 dictates 166:25 different 10:11 13:8 27:19 28:9,10 37:14 42:14 44:10 86:10 89:16 93:16 122:22 124:15 139:4 145:17 148:12 149:12 156:13,20
58:1 183:19 197:24 266:17 deals 152:4 158:17 160:6 161:5 dealt 59:4 183:23 Dean 220:8,10 debits 120:15 decade 31:25 December 131:20 133:23 206:2	126:11 deemed 69:15 definitely 168:3 definition 129:21 degree 17:17 189:22 delete 184:25 deliberatio ns 15:1 deliver 23:24 24:21 287:4 288:24 291:22	127:1 176:14 depending 16:9 26:5 125:5,7,1 9 128:14 188:12 deposit 204:22 292:14,19 deposited 87:11 244:10 292:12,16 depositing 127:25 deposits 87:25 290:20	4:2 88:12,16 89:5 119:4 179:6 201:10 description s 192:14 desire 9:1 92:3 desired 61:12 destroyed 121:10 detail 67:13 68:23 70:14 148:4	193:16 dictates 166:25 different 10:11 13:8 27:19 28:9,10 37:14 42:14 44:10 86:10 89:16 93:16 122:22 124:15 139:4 145:17 148:12 149:12 156:13,20 157:2
58:1 183:19 197:24 266:17 deals 152:4 158:17 160:6 161:5 dealt 59:4 183:23 Dean 220:8,10 debits 120:15 decade 31:25 December 131:20 133:23	126:11 deemed 69:15 definitely 168:3 definition 129:21 degree 17:17 189:22 delete 184:25 deliberatio ns 15:1 deliver 23:24 24:21 287:4 288:24	127:1 176:14 depending 16:9 26:5 125:5,7,1 9 128:14 188:12 deposit 204:22 292:14,19 deposited 87:11 244:10 292:12,16 depositing 127:25 deposits 87:25 290:20 291:7	4:2 88:12,16 89:5 119:4 179:6 201:10 description s 192:14 desire 9:1 92:3 desired 61:12 destroyed 121:10 detail 67:13 68:23 70:14 148:4 171:9	193:16 dictates 166:25 different 10:11 13:8 27:19 28:9,10 37:14 42:14 44:10 86:10 89:16 93:16 122:22 124:15 139:4 145:17 148:12 149:12 156:13,20

INQUIRY	re COLLINGWOO	DD 06-14-2019	Page 318	of 366
196:19	24 175:11	59 : 9	283:16,20	division
218:9,24	186:5,12,	60:12 , 13	disjoint	79:11
228:20,22	14,22,23	62:2 63:8	15:21	doc 257:4
differently	187:1,10,	64:19	18:8	
169:13	22	65 : 7		document
198:1	188:8,18,	66:5,21,2	disproporti	l
	23	4 67:9	onate	82:19
difficult	189:11,21	76:3,24	197:15	97:20
9:10,18	190:4	85:21 , 25	dispute	117:25
168:9	191:17	87:1,4	52 : 16	210:6
dinner	192:2	93:15	disrespect	235:21
221:6	disclosures	100:7,11	171:13	244:8
direct	187 : 25	102:3		245:6,20
99:21	4:	116:11	disseminate	
	disconnect	124:25	149:25	257:3,4,2
directed	40:1	125:3	disseminate	5
140:12	discovery	137:1	d 177 : 22	258:6,11
177:8,14	34:3	140:5		259:20
direction	discuss	149:24	disseminato	
8:22 69:5	17:15	154:2	r 178:3	271:8,23
109:23	18:15	155:19	distorted	272:12
138:23	76:19	168:19	182 : 12	281:10
163:13	162:6	179:16	distortion	294:23
164:17	207:14	193:23	178:21	295:2
168:11	215:18,21	198:9		documentati
203:9	221:11	202:10	distributed	on 194:18
directly		213:20	108:2,25	233:8
18:4 61:8	discussed	291:5	109:1	documents
62:25	60:9	discussions	243:12	123:8
76:25	156:12	8:25	distributio	
	191:8,9	13:14	n 85:14	245:9
director	195:17	16:6	86:5	270:18,23
23:12,19,	215:23	17:18,24	197:20	272:19
20 43:3,4	245:1	25:3	242:24	
directors	292:2,5	83:13	245:1	dollar
30:5	297:11	84:15	260:2	86:21
disagree	discussing	85:12	diversity	dollars
30:18	94:9	116:14	22:13	30:1
35:15	169:21	148:14		32:14
	171 : 12	152:25	dividend	33:4,6
disappeared	191:16	156:23	32:3,20,2	34:20
39:18	212:17	157:2,17	2	35:1
disbursemen	219:23	160:22	33:14,20,	115:24
t 81:12	237:5	164:19,23	25	118:10,16
82:20	discussion	167:10	34:6,7,14	137:4
83:6	17 : 18	201:21	, 15 83 : 25	171:17
	53:17	217:23	dividends	199:16
disclosed	55 : 21	218:12,16	32 : 3	202:6,7
191:4	57:5,17,2	220:3	33:22	206:25
disclosure	5 58:7	242:4,14,	83:23	237:16
69:11,12,		24 243:2		

	. IC COHHINGWO	OD 00-14-2019	rage 319	01 300
294:5	199:13	52:19	edge 26:25	122:10
domain	drumming	53:1	education	either 6:12
24:14	193:14	55:10	148:21	52:19
done 32:25	Drummond	56:17	Edwin 2:17	63 : 18
75:15	35:20	57:6		68 : 6
97:10		67:24	effect	71:12
120:21	due 193:16	80:16	41:18	83:18
132:1	during 5:16	108:6	61:12	86:25
138:5	8:25	125:1	166:11	87 : 21
139:4	18:12	167:23	184:23	116:14
151:20	25:2 32:4	202:13	197:16	134:6
163:10	45:13	216:22	281:7	137:13
168:6	49:10	244:9	effectively	167:10
187:19	57:10	281:16	30:1,14	177:14
190:11,12	120:15	282:21	·	189:23
199:10	124:15	284:12	effects	219:24
236:13	125:19	290:20	73:7	elderly
248:9	126:17	297:9	efficiencie	275:24
289:13	128:17	early 11:17	s	277:25
	133:6,10,	19:23	23:3,17,2	
door 25:12	18	26:6	2	elected
275:11,12	138:15,19	90:18	24:7,16,1	41:1
double	143:4	127:7	7 26:10	48:22
32:25	148:11	292:5	28:18,19	59:1 61:9
downtown	173:11	earnings	29:7 30:7	68:13
286:24,25	186:15	117:16	33:11	188:1
287:2	197:17		37:12,17	193:13
	212:9	easier 7:10	39:2	201:19
dozen 28:19	220:23	158:15	efficient	Electra
29:7	221:8	economy	31:11	252:10
draft	229:24	195:7		electric
191:10	230:5,8	Ed 88:11	efforts	11:19
drafted	232:14	89:13,24	127:2	
191:6	249:17	103:24	egging	electricity
	282:18	104:2,6	54:21	260:1
draw 48:10	287 : 12	109:6,8,1	eggs 91:6	electronic
49:2	dwell 36:9	2,16		272 : 12
63:12		154:11,23	eight 6:21	element
drink 55:18	E	171:18	23:9	17 : 5
drive 15:23	Eagle	220:10	53:23	
136:8	1	221:10	154:11	elephant
	276:5,6,7	230:25	162:1	187:3
driven	,15	231:2,3,5	169:2	195:16
33:14	earlier	240:12,22	188:9	elimination
driving	8:16 11:3	262:16	195:1	171 : 24
35:22	16 : 15	266:21	199:16	else 74:15
	20:22	284:7	202:6	157:15
drop 167:11	21:2	285:10 , 12	208:20	173:21
297:23	37:19	286:2	eighteen	197:11
drove	50:19		14:22	209:17
				207.11

	. IC COHHINGWO	00 11 2019	1 agc 320	01 300
210:14,25	112:1,9,1	60:9	employment	127:7 , 8
211:2	2,14	emails 72:7	72:16	291:10
226:21	132:3	73:1,8,11	117:1,2	entered
232:13	136:11	,13,20	126:3	95 : 20
241:25	138:5		207:17	
281:14	150:8	74:3,5	208:3,6	174:24
771	160:24	75:18	212:13	entire
Elvis	187:5,21	76:15,17,	218:6,17,	120:16
290:17	194:11	20	23 219:5	160:21
email	197:24	77:1,7,22		entirely
52:10,12	209:10,14	, 25	enamoured	8:11
59:10	,16,21	78:4,17,2	163:11,16	163:1
60:7,19	212:6	2 83:17	164:16	190:21
61:11,25	213:1,6	93:19,21,	encourage	190.21
62:2,18	221:20,24	22 94:1	72 : 4	entirety
63:5	222:5,10,	100:19	76 : 21	131:24,25
64:12,16	15,25	114:9,10,	77 : 22	entitled
65:2,13,1	223:5,14,	17		116:1
6 66:12	18,22	115:22,25	encourageme	184:1
67:2,24,2		141:14	nt 198:7	
5	225:11	236:17	energy	entity
68:10,18,	236:19,24	238:5	80:4,7	9:20,22
20	237:18	243:4	89:11,20,	25:13 , 23
70:10,19	238:22,23	270:16	23	envelopes
71:20,22	239:3,12,	email's		133:14
72:9	18	270:15	engage	
73:14	240:4,18		67:14	environment
74:9,10	242:12,17	embargoed	201:4	77:16
78:9,12	,20,23	148:15	engaged	148:25
79:1 81:4	243:17	embedded	41:17	192:13,14
82:5,8,9	244:22	46:7	125:7	,18 198:4
85:14	245:1		149:3	201:11
86:9,14,1	249:24,25	emphasis	187 : 12	EP 31:12
	250:15,16	166:19		TDGOD 01 15
7 92:25	, 17 , 19	175:19	engagement	EPCOR 31:15
94:3	251:4,10	employed	67:15	32:8,18
96:12	253:20	72 : 17	76:20	EPCOR's
99:1,13,1	257:7	74:23	133:13	31 : 12
7	265:3	132:24	138:2	equity 43:8
100:1,15,	267:16	263:16	engaging	
23	268:7,10,	264:6	147:24	error 84:9
101:2,3,2	18		190:10	210:7
5	269:12,16	employee	enjoyed	214:1,12
102:1,14	270:3	126:2,11,		255:16
104:9	273:13,14	12	33:10,11	256:7
107:11	274:8	employees	enquiring	279:16
108:16	284:4,13,	125:18,22	60:15	295:8
110:8,13,	18,22	,24	61:3	errors
17,18,22	285:23	126:14	ensure	255:4
111:1,2,4	288:24	employer	176:20	
,6,7,12,1	emailed	266:19		especially
9		200.19	enter 5:22	24:13

INQUIRY	re COLLINGWOO	D 06-14-2019	Page 321	of 366
57:13	120:14	284:25	180:14	270:22
essentially	121:7	285:20	exception	exist 62:24
24:9	191:7	evidenced	142:23	201:19
26:11	203:22	31:9	161:9	202:9
28:4	evidence			
83:23	9:4 10:6	evident	exchange	existed
	11:3	66:8	62:3,18	176:11
established	20:22	82:17	63:6,13	existence
104:18	21:2 26:9	evolved	65:2,8	24:24
105:1	29:5	48:12	66:2	existing
106:14,18	30:23	172:16	184:21	77 : 25
,21,22	31:23	exact 31:23	185:3	160:7
107:17	32:6,19	56:1,4	295:14	
240:24	35:4	58:18	Excuse	exists
et 94:11	37 : 20	138:21	112:24	34:15
103:3	39:23	170:10	185:22	expanded
113:22	43:24	263:3,5	186:15	30:20
237:6	46:24	•	227:13	expect 7:2
248:6	52:20,22	exactly	executive	248:20
287:20	117:7	12:24	174:22	240:20
evening	121:3	14:9	195:6	expectation
288:17	133:5	26:14		22:24
	140:25	29:16	executives	expectation
event 44:14	146:2	69:8 70:2	24:19	s 8:23
57:5	147:3	171:4	exercise	190:10
220:16	148:17	190:11,12	193:19	
221:2,7	149:10	254:25	exercising	expected
242:8,10	153:19	examination	19:13	6:24 7:23
events 8:4	157:9	6:15 14:5		69:6
44:10,16	160:1	142:24	exhibit 4:2	191:8
51:23	166:15	143:5	209:9	expecting
59:12	174:13	195:3	233:19	69:9
191:16,18	176:15,18	202:16	236:16	expenses
220:21	178:8,9	203:24	239:13	83:5
221:8	180:9	293:13,14	252:12	127:11
everybody	185:8	298:23	253:2,3	130:7,14
98:9	186:11	Examination	265:2,11,	·
169:11	188:7,11	-in-Chief	16,18,23	experience
179:1	189:10	3 : 12	266:7	58:1 59:6
182:3	199:10		267:2,8,9	63:15
187:15	206:22	examined	,10,15,18	89:6
195:1	207:2	34:18	,19	177:3
197:11	215:10	196:20	268:6,9,1	181:12,19
203:4	219:10	example	0,16	208:1
	230:4	54:13	269:22	experienced
everyone	243:15	94:18	270:19,22	49:1
194:2 248:5	244:10,12	130:8	273:21	174:14
40:3	279:6	140:14,16	276:21	experiences
everything	280:17	158:9,10	283:24	49:4 89:6
50:11	281:17,20	163:4	exhibits	
103:2,9	283:17,21	168:5	3:3 4:1	explain

INQUIRY	re COLLINGWOO	00-14-2019	Page 322	OI 366
58:14	27:16	103:20	271:3	186:22
114:20	35:6	122:25	280:6	190:18
119:1	62:22	163:3		
184:12,13	66:15,19,		February/	festival
	23 68:2	fairness	March	290:17
explained	71:3,11	25:17	135:20	fickle
10:2	80:18	99:19	federal	191:21
34:24	109:6	146:11	120:7	fifteen
226:11	113:10	160:13	124:1	
explanation	116:15	203:8,11		165:22
70:18	117:9	fall 139:14	federally	208:7
156:12	146:2	230:7	84:10	fifteenth
	147:17	236:2	fee 94:13	270:20
exploring	150:3,11	282:18	95 : 18	fifth 102:7
139:10	181:11		96:5 , 7	
express	183:6	familiar	97 : 10	fifty
22:6	189:2,12	19:23	98:19	205:12
expressed	190:1,18,	20:6	99:6	206:25
9:1	25 194:13	84:25	237:8	237:16
216:6,11	195:1,8	116:25	feedback	291:23
	199:1,8	122:24	8:14	figure
expression	280:7	135:15		34:22
22:17	290:14	221:22	88:11,15 123:4	84:16
extension		222:1,3	170:2	
25:25	factor 9:8	233:24	189:17,22	figured
	39 : 18	familiarity	109.11,22	248:18
	39.10	ramititaticy		
extensive	factors	289:16	feel 179:8	figures
extensive 147:18		- 1	180:6	figures 130:14
147:18 extent	factors	289:16 290:2	180:6 187:19	_
147:18 extent 51:19	factors 21:21 178:10	289:16 290:2 families	180:6 187:19 196:6	130:14 file 82:19
147:18 extent	factors 21:21 178:10 failure	289:16 290:2 families 146:24	180:6 187:19	130:14 file 82:19 119:18
147:18 extent 51:19	factors 21:21 178:10	289:16 290:2 families 146:24 family	180:6 187:19 196:6	130:14 file 82:19 119:18 120:3,25
147:18 extent 51:19 136:11	factors 21:21 178:10 failure	289:16 290:2 families 146:24	180:6 187:19 196:6 200:19,21	130:14 file 82:19 119:18 120:3,25 123:6
147:18 extent 51:19 136:11 224:23 extra	factors 21:21 178:10 failure 31:7	289:16 290:2 families 146:24 family	180:6 187:19 196:6 200:19,21 feeling	130:14 file 82:19 119:18 120:3,25 123:6 126:19,22
147:18 extent 51:19 136:11 224:23 extra 197:12	<pre>factors 21:21 178:10 failure 31:7 fair 36:8</pre>	289:16 290:2 families 146:24 family 146:21	180:6 187:19 196:6 200:19,21 feeling 48:2 169:3	130:14 file 82:19 119:18 120:3,25 123:6 126:19,22 149:3
147:18 extent 51:19 136:11 224:23 extra 197:12 extrapolate	factors 21:21 178:10 failure 31:7 fair 36:8 43:10 48:14 55:2	289:16 290:2 families 146:24 family 146:21 fashion	180:6 187:19 196:6 200:19,21 feeling 48:2 169:3 feelings	130:14 file 82:19 119:18 120:3,25 123:6 126:19,22 149:3 272:18,23
147:18 extent 51:19 136:11 224:23 extra 197:12	factors 21:21 178:10 failure 31:7 fair 36:8 43:10 48:14	289:16 290:2 families 146:24 family 146:21 fashion 73:13	180:6 187:19 196:6 200:19,21 feeling 48:2 169:3 feelings 49:3	130:14 file 82:19 119:18 120:3,25 123:6 126:19,22 149:3 272:18,23 filed
147:18 extent 51:19 136:11 224:23 extra 197:12 extrapolate	factors 21:21 178:10 failure 31:7 fair 36:8 43:10 48:14 55:2 84:18 92:2 95:9	289:16 290:2 families 146:24 family 146:21 fashion 73:13 106:9	180:6 187:19 196:6 200:19,21 feeling 48:2 169:3 feelings	130:14 file 82:19 119:18 120:3,25 123:6 126:19,22 149:3 272:18,23
147:18 extent 51:19 136:11 224:23 extra 197:12 extrapolate d 163:18	factors 21:21 178:10 failure 31:7 fair 36:8 43:10 48:14 55:2 84:18 92:2 95:9 110:1	289:16 290:2 families 146:24 family 146:21 fashion 73:13 106:9 163:3	180:6 187:19 196:6 200:19,21 feeling 48:2 169:3 feelings 49:3 feels 99:13	130:14 file 82:19 119:18 120:3,25 123:6 126:19,22 149:3 272:18,23 filed 120:6,8
147:18 extent 51:19 136:11 224:23 extra 197:12 extrapolate d 163:18	factors 21:21 178:10 failure 31:7 fair 36:8 43:10 48:14 55:2 84:18 92:2 95:9 110:1 145:1,4,2	289:16 290:2 families 146:24 family 146:21 fashion 73:13 106:9 163:3 179:11 203:10	180:6 187:19 196:6 200:19,21 feeling 48:2 169:3 feelings 49:3 feels 99:13 fees 94:10	130:14 file 82:19 119:18 120:3,25 123:6 126:19,22 149:3 272:18,23 filed 120:6,8
147:18 extent 51:19 136:11 224:23 extra 197:12 extrapolate d 163:18 eyes 295:23	factors 21:21 178:10 failure 31:7 fair 36:8 43:10 48:14 55:2 84:18 92:2 95:9 110:1 145:1,4,2 2 147:3	289:16 290:2 families 146:24 family 146:21 fashion 73:13 106:9 163:3 179:11 203:10 fast-	180:6 187:19 196:6 200:19,21 feeling 48:2 169:3 feelings 49:3 feels 99:13 fees 94:10 237:5	130:14 file 82:19 119:18 120:3,25 123:6 126:19,22 149:3 272:18,23 filed 120:6,8 files 121:7 125:7
147:18 extent 51:19 136:11 224:23 extra 197:12 extrapolate d 163:18 eyes 295:23	factors 21:21 178:10 failure 31:7 fair 36:8 43:10 48:14 55:2 84:18 92:2 95:9 110:1 145:1,4,2 2 147:3 149:14,15	289:16 290:2 families 146:24 family 146:21 fashion 73:13 106:9 163:3 179:11 203:10 fast- forward	180:6 187:19 196:6 200:19,21 feeling 48:2 169:3 feelings 49:3 feels 99:13 fees 94:10 237:5 felt 14:21	130:14 file 82:19 119:18 120:3,25 123:6 126:19,22 149:3 272:18,23 filed 120:6,8 files 121:7 125:7
147:18 extent 51:19 136:11 224:23 extra 197:12 extrapolate d 163:18 eyes 295:23 F face 82:22 116:16	factors 21:21 178:10 failure 31:7 fair 36:8 43:10 48:14 55:2 84:18 92:2 95:9 110:1 145:1,4,2 2 147:3 149:14,15 167:15	289:16 290:2 families 146:24 family 146:21 fashion 73:13 106:9 163:3 179:11 203:10 fast- forward 190:11	180:6 187:19 196:6 200:19,21 feeling 48:2 169:3 feelings 49:3 feels 99:13 fees 94:10 237:5 felt 14:21 15:11	130:14 file 82:19 119:18 120:3,25 123:6 126:19,22 149:3 272:18,23 filed 120:6,8 files 121:7 125:7 126:22,25 128:19
147:18 extent 51:19 136:11 224:23 extra 197:12 extrapolate d 163:18 eyes 295:23 F face 82:22 116:16 facilitator	factors 21:21 178:10 failure 31:7 fair 36:8 43:10 48:14 55:2 84:18 92:2 95:9 110:1 145:1,4,2 2 147:3 149:14,15 167:15 196:23	289:16 290:2 families 146:24 family 146:21 fashion 73:13 106:9 163:3 179:11 203:10 fast- forward 190:11 favourable	180:6 187:19 196:6 200:19,21 feeling 48:2 169:3 feelings 49:3 feels 99:13 fees 94:10 237:5 felt 14:21 15:11 24:9	130:14 file 82:19 119:18 120:3,25 123:6 126:19,22 149:3 272:18,23 filed 120:6,8 files 121:7 125:7 126:22,25 128:19 filing
147:18 extent 51:19 136:11 224:23 extra 197:12 extrapolate d 163:18 eyes 295:23 F face 82:22 116:16	factors 21:21 178:10 failure 31:7 fair 36:8 43:10 48:14 55:2 84:18 92:2 95:9 110:1 145:1,4,2 2 147:3 149:14,15 167:15 196:23 201:22	289:16 290:2 families 146:24 family 146:21 fashion 73:13 106:9 163:3 179:11 203:10 fast- forward 190:11 favourable 169:5	180:6 187:19 196:6 200:19,21 feeling 48:2 169:3 feelings 49:3 feels 99:13 fees 94:10 237:5 felt 14:21 15:11 24:9 80:22	130:14 file 82:19 119:18 120:3,25 123:6 126:19,22 149:3 272:18,23 filed 120:6,8 files 121:7 125:7 126:22,25 128:19 filing 202:5
147:18 extent 51:19 136:11 224:23 extra 197:12 extrapolate d 163:18 eyes 295:23 F face 82:22 116:16 facilitator	factors 21:21 178:10 failure 31:7 fair 36:8 43:10 48:14 55:2 84:18 92:2 95:9 110:1 145:1,4,2 2 147:3 149:14,15 167:15 196:23	289:16 290:2 families 146:24 family 146:21 fashion 73:13 106:9 163:3 179:11 203:10 fast- forward 190:11 favourable	180:6 187:19 196:6 200:19,21 feeling 48:2 169:3 feelings 49:3 feels 99:13 fees 94:10 237:5 felt 14:21 15:11 24:9 80:22 88:14	130:14 file 82:19 119:18 120:3,25 123:6 126:19,22 149:3 272:18,23 filed 120:6,8 files 121:7 125:7 126:22,25 128:19 filing 202:5 filings
147:18 extent 51:19 136:11 224:23 extra 197:12 extrapolate d 163:18 eyes 295:23 F face 82:22 116:16 facilitator 178:3	factors 21:21 178:10 failure 31:7 fair 36:8 43:10 48:14 55:2 84:18 92:2 95:9 110:1 145:1,4,2 2 147:3 149:14,15 167:15 196:23 201:22	289:16 290:2 families 146:24 family 146:21 fashion 73:13 106:9 163:3 179:11 203:10 fast- forward 190:11 favourable 169:5	180:6 187:19 196:6 200:19,21 feeling 48:2 169:3 feelings 49:3 feels 99:13 fees 94:10 237:5 felt 14:21 15:11 24:9 80:22 88:14 90:15,24	130:14 file 82:19 119:18 120:3,25 123:6 126:19,22 149:3 272:18,23 filed 120:6,8 files 121:7 125:7 126:22,25 128:19 filing 202:5
147:18 extent 51:19 136:11 224:23 extra 197:12 extrapolate d 163:18 eyes 295:23 F face 82:22 116:16 facilitator 178:3 facility 296:23	factors 21:21 178:10 failure 31:7 fair 36:8 43:10 48:14 55:2 84:18 92:2 95:9 110:1 145:1,4,2 2 147:3 149:14,15 167:15 196:23 201:22 290:8	289:16 290:2 families 146:24 family 146:21 fashion 73:13 106:9 163:3 179:11 203:10 fast- forward 190:11 favourable 169:5 203:10	180:6 187:19 196:6 200:19,21 feeling 48:2 169:3 feelings 49:3 feels 99:13 fees 94:10 237:5 felt 14:21 15:11 24:9 80:22 88:14 90:15,24 113:18	130:14 file 82:19 119:18 120:3,25 123:6 126:19,22 149:3 272:18,23 filed 120:6,8 files 121:7 125:7 126:22,25 128:19 filing 202:5 filings
### 147:18 extent	factors 21:21 178:10 failure 31:7 fair 36:8 43:10 48:14 55:2 84:18 92:2 95:9 110:1 145:1,4,2 2 147:3 149:14,15 167:15 196:23 201:22 290:8 fairly	289:16 290:2 families 146:24 family 146:21 fashion 73:13 106:9 163:3 179:11 203:10 fast- forward 190:11 favourable 169:5 203:10 February	180:6 187:19 196:6 200:19,21 feeling 48:2 169:3 feelings 49:3 feels 99:13 fees 94:10 237:5 felt 14:21 15:11 24:9 80:22 88:14 90:15,24 113:18 115:4	130:14 file 82:19 119:18 120:3,25 123:6 126:19,22 149:3 272:18,23 filed 120:6,8 files 121:7 125:7 126:22,25 128:19 filing 202:5 filings 120:3,13
### 147:18 extent	factors 21:21 178:10 failure 31:7 fair 36:8 43:10 48:14 55:2 84:18 92:2 95:9 110:1 145:1,4,2 2 147:3 149:14,15 167:15 196:23 201:22 290:8 fairly 12:13	289:16 290:2 families 146:24 family 146:21 fashion 73:13 106:9 163:3 179:11 203:10 fast- forward 190:11 favourable 169:5 203:10 February 131:15,16	180:6 187:19 196:6 200:19,21 feeling 48:2 169:3 feelings 49:3 feels 99:13 fees 94:10 237:5 felt 14:21 15:11 24:9 80:22 88:14 90:15,24 113:18 115:4 154:24	130:14 file 82:19 119:18 120:3,25 123:6 126:19,22 149:3 272:18,23 filed 120:6,8 files 121:7 125:7 126:22,25 128:19 filing 202:5 filings 120:3,13 filled
### 147:18 extent	factors 21:21 178:10 failure 31:7 fair 36:8 43:10 48:14 55:2 84:18 92:2 95:9 110:1 145:1,4,2 2 147:3 149:14,15 167:15 196:23 201:22 290:8 fairly 12:13 20:16	289:16 290:2 families 146:24 family 146:21 fashion 73:13 106:9 163:3 179:11 203:10 fast- forward 190:11 favourable 169:5 203:10 February 131:15,16 ,18,21	180:6 187:19 196:6 200:19,21 feeling 48:2 169:3 feelings 49:3 feels 99:13 fees 94:10 237:5 felt 14:21 15:11 24:9 80:22 88:14 90:15,24 113:18 115:4	130:14 file 82:19 119:18 120:3,25 123:6 126:19,22 149:3 272:18,23 filed 120:6,8 files 121:7 125:7 126:22,25 128:19 filing 202:5 filings 120:3,13 filled 124:22

INQUINI	TE COTTINGMO	JD 00-14-2019	raye 323	01 300
finally	149:21	Florida	force 35:23	16:1,21
140:17	158:17,23	131:2	forced	17:13
207:3	167 : 5	133:8	35:12,15,	65 : 16
270:18	182:6	135:13	22 36:3	75:6 82:9
finances	186:1,2	136:3,14,		103:20
171:19	196:21	19,22	Ford 61:5	116:10
243:23	206:19	138:1,6,1	forecast	117:13
	209:4	9	33:23	191:4
financial	215:4	139:6,10,	forever	192:19
40:8	224:24	12	46:7	222:25
119:20	236:17	222:7,13		243:4,9
120:9	246:2,8	230:1	forgot	forwarded
198:21	258 : 12	244:25	294:8	60:12,20
financing	260:9	245:4,9	form 24:10	65:15
15:25	264:10	248:23	159:4	66:12,16
fine 82:13	268:5	249:8	188:22	110:19,24
102:13	271:2	271:22,24	207:17	192:10
127:13	273:3,5	273:1	212:13	213:1
150:24	274:5,11	275 : 13	format	237:18
155:14	Fisher 2:9	276:9	162:23	238:23
174:5	fit	277 : 23	169:18	239:20
183:4	48:17,24	286:17	234:8	267 : 15
191:12	•	287:6		270 : 3
203:15	fitted 22:1	288:11	formed	forwarding
268:13	five 23:18	292:17	20:15	86:15
291:16	45:21,24	296:8	216:25	
finished	50:6	flow 251:12	former	forwards
39:8	86:21	flowing	126:24	64:25
154:16	98:9	160:16	193:3	65:2 236:21
	117:23		forming	
finite	124:20	flows	20:7	Foundation
129:13	129:7	250:1,3,5		61:20
firm 125:6	133:14	251 : 10	Fort	117:25
179:23	174:3	fly 134:10	135:15,16	245:6,20
firms 149:3	204:23	138:6,10	136:18	founded
	fix 45:17	focus	forth 23:20	25 : 1
first 12:7	flags 50:13	91:12,24	53:9 94:1	125:14
32:4	_	116:8	100:19	frame 31:20
43:23	flat 94:13	186:25	134:10	32:17
44:6,8	95:18	191:24	154:25	287:9
53:2 62:4	96:5 , 7	Focusing	168:2	
64:15	97:10	229 : 17	fortunate	Frank 1:7
66:3	98:19		195:22	5:3 7:8
79:12	99:6	followup	forty 137:3	10:8
81:13 99:4	237:8	189:15	_	12.1,10,2
	flavour	follow-up	forty-five	0 13:6
121:17,21 122:5	197 : 6	173:4	195:14	18:19,25
122:5	floor	forays	293:20,24	
124:4	149:23	57:10	294:2,5,6	38:5
137:15,18	117.40	J / • I U	forward	40:14
13/113,10				

INQUIRY re COLLIN	IGWOOD 06-14-2019	Page 324	of 366
-------------------	-------------------	----------	--------

INQUINI	re collingwoo	D 00-14-2019	raye 324	01 300
52:4	286:14,15	126:5	36:8,12,2	183:18
59:24	, 25	259:3 , 5	2,23	funds 107:4
97:19	287:23 , 24	277 : 21	37:19 , 25	
98:7,12	288:5,8,1	fruition	38:7,16,1	funny 55:1
112:18	6,22	15:23	7,22	future
113:1	289:3,8,1		39:4,7,10	18 : 15
142:14,20	2,21	Fryer 2:15	40:3,6,12	19:18
143:9,13	290:1,6,1	3:6	, 15	77:9,13
165:15,21	0,13,18,2	5:4,5,13,	184:23	78:1,6,15
180:2	3	14,15	Fryer's	110:11,12
181:3,8,1	291:4,12,	6:4,7,14,	12:11	191:16 , 18
6 , 25	18,21	20	36:19	217:24
182:24	292:1,4,8	7:4,14,18	185:8	
183:5,21	,13,18,23	,21,22		G
184:5,9,1	293:2,7,1	8:24	fulfilling	Gajos 2:22
9	1,19,23	9:6,24	76:7	_
185:11,16	294:1,7,1	10:10,13,	full 11:18	gap 124:22
198:14	0,13,17,2	14,18	19:5	247:3
199:19,25	2,25	12:22	51:19	gathering
200:4,7	295:5,10,	13:12,13,	69:2,16	211:17
202:14,18	13,18,24	18,24	71:13	gatherings
,24	296:3,7,1	14:4	76 : 2	220:12
203:3,14,	2,15,20	15:2,12,1	90:19	
19	297:2,6,9	9	91:24	Gemba 42:7
205:14,19	,14,19	16:16,22	92:14	general
214:9,14,	298:2,5,1	17:4,11,2	129:6	5 : 20
20	1,15,19	5	186:12,23	50 : 14
245:7,13	free 136:24	18:7,20,2	187:9,21	57 : 16
251:22	234:21	3	188:8	61:4,6
252:1,18	freedom	19:11,12	189:11,21	152 : 25
267:23	73:18	20:1,13,2	276:22	163:12
268:2		21:1,5,12	291:24	208:5
278:7,14	frequency	22:3,16,2	293:5	215:17
286:6,11	296:25	3 24:8,22	full-time	generalized
287:16	Friday	25:24	126:7,8,1	67:21
298:22,25	81:22	26:9,16,2	1 133:12	
299:5	82:5	3	fully 6:1	generally
frankly	87:17 , 21	27:6,11,2	108:2	5:19 9:14
11:20	friend	4 28:4,21	114:1	14:20
68:16	136:21	29:9,16,1	119:4	62:21
188:21	294:18,19	9	243:12	73:2
196:12,14	297:23	30:10,19,		162:13
197:23		23	fulsome	163:7
Frederick	friends	31:6,14,1	151:14	169:25
2:17 3:15	43:25	8	fun 57:12	188:14
12:16	57:10	32:16,24	fund	293:15
251:25	146:21	33:3	170:14,19	generated
261:16,21	147:7	34:2,9,10	173:21	82:23
266:1	220:17	,16,24	174:7	Generation
278:18	front 16:18	35:3,11		20:15
			fundamental	

11120111.	T IC COMMINGNO		rage 323	
generic	gives 94:18	132:24	189:25	gulf 137:10
190:19	180:3,4	146:12	Green 42:6	227:25
generous	195:7	172 : 15		287:6
184:8	201:14	175 : 15	grew 135:21	guy 23:23
	giving	178:10	Grimsby	126:22,23
gentleman	12:13	198:16	30:21	171:16
285:22	141:5	gonna	gross 81:12	
gentlemen	153:13	159:16		guys
52:18	182:13	Gosh 129:4	group	54:13,21
geographica	279:6	GOSH 129.4	20:3,8	91:17
lly	mlancad	govern	21:2,13,1	
26:18,21,	glanced 266:10,12	201:25	4 22:20	Н
25	200:10,12	governance	23:7,8	ha 222:22
	glass	15 : 25	24:3 25:5	half 101:17
George 2:13	132:22		30:2,3	165:20
gets 123:4	glasses	<pre>governing 200:25</pre>	34:25 276:12	169:2
124:10	93:6	200:25	2/0:12	193:18
181:14	112:25	government	groups	195:15
getting		124:1	54:12	260:20
5:20	Glicksman 34:19	202:1	grow 9:21	Hall 1:17
11:21	186:11	governments	35 : 6	
20:5	187:15	201:4,5	115:5	hand 66:7
49:25		grab 134:11	growing	127:3
53:5,10	Glicksman's	139:3	35:4	275 : 8
116:7	61:13	139:3		handled
139:1	gmail 70:13	grammar	growth 5:22	124:17
150:5	71:21	210:21	6:2,17	handling
154:21	73:7	grammatical	9:7	274:4
155:8	74:1,9	210:21	17:2,19	
191:19	75:6 82:9	253 : 12	19:14	handwriting
199:7	238:6,10,	255:4	20:2 28:5	272:2,4,1
202:3	18 240:3	257 : 22	30:14	4
253 : 25	243:4	258 : 7	Guardhouse	handwritten
gist 226:19	250:21	296:2	9:1	123:25
given 7:25	251:1	grammatical	11:4,12,1	happen
10:23	258:22	ly 123:10	4 12:4	19:16
34:9,12	goal 26:17	-	13:3,16,2	35:18
116:15	35:5	grander 72:20	0,23	84:22
121:6	golf 83:19		guess 40:5	110:12
138:1	189:16	great 139:8	217:20	116:3
156:12	202:6,10	169:8	225:11	155:22
157 : 9		205:13	235:1	167 : 7
159:4	<pre>golfing 139:25</pre>	greater	252:4,12	194:6
176:7,21	248:23	23:3	278 : 9	happenchanc
181:6		24:6,16	282:2	e 20:14
185:7	gone 33:23	27:17	guessing	
218:23	64:21	29:7	225:9	happened
219:10	89:24	37 : 17	guidelines	17:21 19:19
248:3	112:8	175:19	62:9	33:15,18
	129:15		02.5	33.13,18

INQUIRY	re COLLINGWO	OD 06-14-2019	Page 326	of 366
52:18,25	149:9,24	192:13,23	17:3	207:20
55:10,23	155:9	193:2,3,4	helping	higher 31:9
56:16	157 : 2	,22	189:13	32:9,20
57:6	164:20	196:18		107.11
60:18	170:16	198:20	helps 38:20	197:11
85:8	173:10	248:15	71:13	245:10
87:19	189:23	258:17	Hence	highest
119:23	201:21	259:19	175 : 14	31:24
155:19	212:2,17	260:1,5	1/3.14	highlight
167:5	220:3	264:10	here's	10:19
168:20	226:16	282:18	85:17	10:19
225:12	243:2		86:5	highlighted
241:9,11,	246:11	hearing	100:21	284:12
12 246:4	252:13	141:1	106:18	highly
	285:4	152 : 6	130:22,23	31:12
happens		180:16	158:12,13	89:3
68:20	head 11:21	182:6	160:24	195:5
75:24	151 : 2	297 : 3	161:12	
86:19	193:14	hearings	167:5	hindsight
happy 52:1	206:22	215:10	194:18,19	68 : 24
165:14	217:2		he's 11:5	187:24
185:3	header	heart 196:9	13:20	235:1
	10:24	Heather 2:9	38:8	hire 122:5
hard 120:1		he'd	50:0 52:25	
272:14	hear 7:10	13:2,25	72:17	hired 149:4
haven't	12:11	75:15	96:3,4,11	historicall
77:5	173:16	208:25	97:5,12	y 33:21
101:5,7	212:15	255:18	98:23	history
112:12	216:14		100:16	76:10
215:10	260:9	heightened	103:6,13	146:24
220:14	264:2	35:21	•	194:25
having	heard 13:25	held 1:16	105:17,21	211:17
10:20	14:16	18:14	,22 106:13,16	212:17
1	22:9	25:3,4		·
13:14 16:17	23:24	89:24	107:10,18	Hogg 47:23
1	46:25	217:15	, 20	hold 139:3
17:6 27:18	48:19		108:8,11,	164:6
	63:19	help 38:13	20,21	
29:7,17 30:21	117:7	61:3 63:3	109:4,11, 17 114:8	hole 71:18
1	138:4	82:18		75:22
32:11 51:22	140:12,24	123:6	171:16	holes 57:20
1	141:10	150:18,20	228:24	home 132:1
56:24	148:11,17	161:16	264:16,24	135:13
57:25 62:23	149:2,20	169:16	,25 287:17	136:25
1	150:3	181 : 7		138:9,11
85:12,25	169:8	helped	hey 65:12	235:2
87:4	172:18	122:23	210:5	238:2
100:7,9	173 : 15	helper	hide 75:2	290:14
103:19	174:13	243:24		Z 3U•14
117:7	176:13,15		high 25:3,4	homeowner
140:5	187 : 2	helpful	89:25	91:12
148:5	189:9,20	16:25	127:4	
1	·			i

INQUIRY	re COLLINGWOO	D 06-14-2019	Page 32/	OI 366
homes	200:4,7	78:5,10,1	155:3,6,2	8
137:11	202:14,18	3,19 82:9	0	219:1,8,1
	,24	86:11	156:7,17,	1,16,21,2
honest	203:3,14,	88:3,11	21	5
43:13	19	89:3,22	157:6 , 12	220:1,2,6
Honor	205:14,19	91:23	161:2,8	,9,18,21,
165:13	214:9,14,	93:1 94:6	166:10	23
Honour	20	96:6,15	167:4	221:1,5,1
12:7,16	245:7,13	97:15	170:4	0,12,22
40:20	251:22	98:20,25	173:9,15	222:1
52:1 98:6	252:1,18	99:5,10,1	174:9	223:1,3,7
112:25	267:23	3	178:23	,11,16,18
142:19	268:2	101:2,10	189:17	,19,25
143:7,16	278:7,14	102:15,24	193:2	224:11,15
152:23	286:6,11	103:7	198:3	,21
180:1	287:16	104:3,23	203:2,17,	
185:10,19	298:22,25	105:16	20	,8,12,13,
203:7	299:5	108:20	204:1,3,7	
252 : 5	hope 116:5	109:6,8,1	,12,19,22	
278:6,19	192:3	2,16,24	205:6,11,	
286:10	196:6	110:19	18 , 23	2 227:1,5
298:21	198:12	112:3,6,8	206:1,6,9	
HONOURABLE	222:23	,10,13	,14	1,16,19,2
5:3 7:8	hoped 139:1	113:11,15	207:8,18,	3
10:8	_	114:1,10,	24	229:4,8,1
12:1,10,2	Hopefully	11	208:2,7,1	
0 13:6	232:20	115:13,21	2,16,19	230:2,12,
18:19,25	hoping	, 24	209:7,12,	
36:18	71:23	116:4,5,1 5	19 , 22	231:3,7,1
38:5	140:7		210:1,5,1 0,15,20,2	1,15,19,2 3
40:14	192:4	117:9,14, 20,21	4	232:4,7,1
52 : 4	host 189:2	118:5,9,1	211:3,6,9	1,16,20
59:24		9	,13,21	233:2,6,1
97:19	Houghton	119:10,16	212:4,8,1	0,14,24
98:7 , 12	2:17 3:11	,17	4,23	234:11,16
112:18	14:5	121:15,22	213:2,3,4	
113:1	17:7,12	122:18,20	,9,12,14,	235:6,18,
142:14,20	18:2 22:3,10	,21,23	18,20,22,	24
143:9,13	25:3	124:25	24	236:7,9,1
165:15,21	36:25	130:1,7	214:3,13,	4,17,18,2
180:2	46:12	131:10,13	17 , 18	5
181:3,8,1	48:16,19	,16	215:8,16,	237:1,18,
6,25	49:17,23	132:17	18,20,24	20,25
182:24	70:12,20	133:7,18	216:3,7,9	238:3,7,1
183:5,21	71:11,25	134:6,9	,12,19,23	0,15,19,2
184:5,9,1	72:11,18	140:6	217:1,9,1	3 , 25
9	74:1	147:7	2,14,20,2	239:3,5,9
185:11,16 198:14	75 : 19	152:6,10	3	,19,21,25
199:19,25	76:15	153 : 15	218:2,7,1	240:5,10,
100.10,20	77:2,7,8	154 : 3	1,13,16,1	19

	INQUIRY	re COLLINGWOO	DD 06-14-2019	Page 328	OI 366
	241:1,5,1	2,17,20,2	288:1,7,1	122:11,15	294:2,5,6
	0,13,16,1	3	0,20	129:25	
	8,22	264:3,8,1	289:1,6,1	130:1,8,1	Hurontario
	242:1,4,7	2,16,21,2	1,19,23	9 131:6	1:19
	,14,16,20	4	290:5,9,1	132:9	hurricane
	,22,25	265:7,19	2,16,22	246:7	137:9
	243:1,4,5	266:9,14,	291:1,8,1		harah an d
	,8,21,25	200.3/11/	5,20,25	house	husband
	244:3,6,2	267:5,17,	292:3,7,1	138:15,22	213:2
	1	24	2,15,21,2	281:2,9	216:7
	245:3,11,	268:19,23	5	285:19	218:7
	15	269:5,9,1	293:6,17,	287 : 20	220:14
	246:5,13,		21,25	288:3	259:22
		3,18,25	294:4,9,1	housing	260:17
	18,22	270:5,11,	· ·	135:14	264:5
	247:5,10,	14,25	1,21,24	136:24	266:13,16
	15,18,22	271:4,11,	295:3,9,1	139:5	267:15
	248:17,22	14,18,21,	2,17,21		269:2,17
	249:2,5,1	25	296:1,11,	HST 79:17	270:3
	0,16,21,2	272:3,6,9	14,18	84:6,11	273:6,13
	5	,16,20,25	297:1,5,8	85 : 17	281:23
	250:6,8,1	273:8,11,	,13,17,25	hub	283:20
	1,12,18,2	16,19,23	298:4,9,1	26:18,24	284:16,25
	0,23	274:2,4,6	3 299:1	27 : 1	285:23
	251:2,7,1	,13,17,23	Houghton's	158:25	297:10
	5,17,19	275:1,5,1	10:3 11:5	159:6	husband's
	252:8,16,	0,13,17,2	70:13	Hull 6:22	218:5
	19,20,25	0,23	71:21	Hull 0.22	Hydro 25:17
	253:6,11,	276:2,8,1	72:16	human	152:4
	17,22 254:1,5,8	3,16,24	89:5 92:2	23:13,19	155:23
		277:2,5,1	116:16,25	humorous	158:9,17,
	,11,14,17	0,14,16,2	117:18	54 : 15	23
	,21	0,24	119:24		159:5 , 20
	255:2,8,1	278:4,22	121:13	humour 55:6	160:6
	2,15,21	279:1,4,7	134:18	59:4	
	256:1,3,9	,9,12,21	138:13	humourous	161:5,16
	,12,15,19	280:1,10,	197:21	185 : 24	162:3
	,22,25	13,19,21,	223:10	hundred 9:2	163:13
	257:5,8,1	25	226:14	11:8	164:1,17, 21 170:1
	1,16,21	281:8,13,	241:20	33:4,5,6	197:13
	258:1,4,8	18,21,25	hour 98:8	34:5,13,1	197:13
	,15,18,23	282:4,8,1	118:10,16		
	259:4,8,1	2,16,23	165:20	9 , 25	I
	4,16,21,2	283:3,9,1	193:18	59:17	i.e 260:19
	4	3,18,22	195:15	122:14	283:6
	260:3,7,1	284:8,10,	203:12	129:3,25	289:13
	0,15,21	19,23	254:4	131:6	iconic
	261:2,5,8	285:2,8,1		133:14	195:6
	,11,18	4,17	hours	202:6,7	
	262:13,16	286:1,16,	118:23	206:25	I'd 122:21
	,18,22	23	120:24	237:11,14	126:16
	263:2,9,1	287:2,19	121:25	293:20,24	127:24
1					

TNOUTRY	re	COLLINGWOOD	06-14-2019	Page	329	οf	366

INQUIRY	re COLLINGWOC	D 06-14-2019	Page 329	OI 366
128:10,11	246:6	104:7,24	232:16	195:20
,20 182:3	273:5	105:21	233:24	
196:16	291:16	106:6	235:18,21	impressed
214:1		107:7,15	236:25	162:13
225:8	illustrate	108:6	237:1	impression
250:4	234:1	110:7	238:15	12:14
	I'm 5:6	113:13	244:8	183:16
ID 250:5	7:6,14,15	114:21	252:9	216:25
idea 16:5	10:18	115:25	253:3	240:17
35:22,24	11:13	121:8	254:10	241:8
55:1 58:6	12:7	132:5,6,1	261:13	
76:11	13:24	7 133:21	262:2	impressive
87:9 88:7	16:6 18:9	134:4	263:4	174:17
115:15	19:7,23	135:1,4,6	265:7,16,	inaccurate
137:5	20:1,9	,23 138:6	22 267:25	250 : 17
142:21,22	23:22	145:12	276:20	inaccuratel
144:10	30:6,8,13			
176:20	31:13	150:1,18 153:1	278:23	y 68:7,8
177:21	33:22		287:14,15	inaugural
259:13	34:12	154:10	297:20	104:11
295:1,4	35:8	155:3,12	immediately	240:23
	36:15	158:1	254:4	in-between
ideal 25:22	37:2	159:16 161:23	256:14	122:18
38:25	38:2,17,1		impact	
39:1	9,22 40:4	164:15	31:15,19	inbox
identified	42:20	165:14	•	269:12
69:9	45:12,17	166:21	impacted	270:16
188:15	46:2,3,5	170:9,10,	31:8	Inc 78:20
206:12	48:1,25	11,15	implementat	IN-CHIEF
243:11	49:8,16	171:6,13, 15	ion 17:5	203:24
identify	51:10		18:13	
11:14	52:1,2,11	179:18,21 180:3	importance	incident
192:23	53:2		30:8	190:6
196:25	54:7,12	182:12,22 183:9	148:22	include
270:22	56:3,5,15	184:3	166:20	145:25
	57 : 9	185:3	176:3	186:18
ignored	63:2,4	187:20	193:9,24	:14:
86:25	64:9,15,2	190:4	194:4	including
I'11 25:7	5 66:7,12	191:14	194.4	29:11
29:23	68:15	192:3	important	47:3
77:24	69:13	195:11,18	12 : 23	219:13
81:15	70:22	196:7	17 : 5	income
136:23	71:8	198:12,24	150:10	120:6
138:9	74:17,22,	199:4,5	155:11	incorporate
142:18	25 75:4	200:14	175:17,24	124:5
143:7	76:18	201:9	176:20,24	191:7
180:18	82 : 17	201:9	177 : 5	
198:6	89:2	202:15	198:12,18	incorporate
200:7,11	90:15	217:6,7	, 22	d 130:10
221:23	93:6 97:4	222:1,20,	275 : 22	incorrect
230:9	103:14	22 224:15	impress	107:9
		~~ ~~ ~	-	

111001111	TO COLLINGWOO	JD 00 14 2013	rage 330	01 300
249:9,15	124:11	152:19	124:25	81:22
281:2	individuals	153:5,13,	initially	instruction
incorrectly	14:11	20	127:10	s
78:18	160:2,12	154:4,19,		287:20,25
	162:20	22 155:8	initials	288:2,3,1
increased	290:21	156:8,22	103:11	5
38:1		157:11,16	initiating	
increases	industries	158:7,10	16:17	insurance
38:4	41:25	159:9,11	initiative	94:10
incumbent	industry	160:14	16:17	237 : 5
6:16	31:13	162:19,22	26:7	integrity
24:18	35:25	163:2,18,	139:5	163:6
	37:7	24 165:6	244:14	164:9
incurred	164:10	166:5,12,		194:5
122:4	inference	16,20,23	initiatives	195:21
indeed	195:10	168:10	18:8	intelligenc
145:19		171:8,19	inquired	e 144:25
independent	inferred	172:12,16	212:18	
63 : 19	174:8	175:12	227:19	intelligent
	influence	176:15,22	inquiry 1:3	90:7 , 15
125:20,22	5:18	, 25	2:3,4	113:21
independent	13:20	177:6,22	37:6 54:7	intended
ly 28:20	influential	178:3,4,1	57:3	214:17
29:8	9:8	2	71:14	intention
in-depth		179:2,20	75:23	
164:9	inform	186:4	119:15	197:25
	244:4	192:9	148:11	198:2 214:19
indicate	information	194:9,25	151:13	214:19
215:4	9:13	198:10	190:17	intentions
indicated	16:4,13,2	199:9	196:22	218:6
230:6	5 19:8	200:20,22	199:11,14	interaction
indicates	29:2 37:7	202:3,4	203:8	19:5,20
244:10	50:15	215:6	204:2	49:9
	59:6	226:24	211:15	51:19,23
indication	72:23	260:23	215:10,11	55 : 23
17:1	73:19	261:1,14 262:12,23	219:10	131:24
114:3	74:21	·	234:1	136:6
210:18	86:2 92:6	,24 263:24	243:15	172 : 21
indigenous	120:10,11	271:22	271:9,16,	173:11
137:8	123:2	271:22	17 272 : 15	221:4
indirectly	140:24	274:11		227:18
61:8	141:1,2,6		inside	interaction
62:25	,13,17,21	informed	138:24	s 56:22
	,23	58:19	insignifica	
individual	148:3,8,1	65 : 22	nt 53:17	201:25
9:11	4,24	164:12	54:9	interest
16:6,7,10	149:11,20	initial	instance	58 : 25
63:21	150:5,7,1	57 : 2	235:13	62 : 9
66:15	8,19	85 : 14		113:12
68:12	151:3,5,1	87 : 5	instead	115:21
	9,24			116:17
		,		

INQUIKI	re contingwoo	00-14-2019	rage 331	01 300
117:10	interview	15 : 22	196:7	173:11
187:6,8,1	249:18	16:3 17:6	198:7	201:20
1 193:21	interviewed	33:12	isn't 40:7	it'd 155:14
interested	34:18	42:3,8	66:20	10.14
14:7,23	34:18	47:8	104:5	Item
15:6	introduce	58:20	163:20	10:5,9,10
69:16,19	91:15	71:23	183:13	items 8:19
88:17	introduced	72:3,11,1	246:3	it'll 7:9
117:19,20	88:4 , 7	9		10:20
139:9	260:11	77:3,8,12	iss 117:3	
200:14	introducing	78:6,13,1	ISSI 42:7,9	
212:12,21	91:13,14	4,19,21	72:11,14,	8:18
285:3	·	80:17,23	23	23:24
	introductio	88:8	77:3,8,12	
interesting	n 88:18	89:15	78:6,14,2	
12:17 155:14	invented	90:17	0 79:4	56:1
295:14	170:24	95:8	80:13,17,	57:18
	investor	103:8	22 , 23	63:13,22
interests	43:3	115:9	81:8	66:11
69:11		116:22	83:18	67:12
178:14	invitation	127:5	84:24	68:5,11,2
196:9	222:12	155:10	86:19	3 72:16 73:9
interface	invoice	169:11	87:7	100:24
117:19	84:24	189:7,13 191:19	104:13	116:24
internal	85:16,17,	197:19	113:12	117:17
66:9	20	215:13	116:18	135:17
	86:6,7,20	224:22,25	117:10	138:9
Internation	87:5	225:4	issue 16:11	139:3
al 207:4	116:9	244:22	34:12	146:12
internet	120:1	251 : 18	53:5 55:7	147:16
162:25	132:7	265:6	58:9,25	148:11
164:8	211:12	284:17	63:14,17	151 : 17
interpret	245:4	285:1,3,7	71:3	157 : 21
99:19	247:1,20	involvement	107:15	158:6
107:15	287:4	176:8	117:3	166:22
	289:9	189:24	120:23	167:23
interpretat	291:17,23	197:22	141:15 188:9	172:18
ion 110:9	invoices	218:24	190:19	177:10
interpretin	118:19	224:6,19	190:19	178:20,21
g 99:17	119:7,12,	225:7,23	194:8	179:6,11
106:6,8	13,16,18,	251 : 17		192:4
interrupt	24 120:19		issued	194:7
142:21	121:4,9,1	irregular	122:6	195:25
184:11	2 246:19	150:7,8	issues	196:19
	289:5	irrelevant	53 : 10	198:5
interruptin	invoicing	69:15	54:14	201:6
g 168:15	288:24	irrespectiv	57 : 13	210:11
intervening	involved	e 61:4	58 : 1	220:11
85:19	6:11	116:11	84:24	228:6 230:12
			155 : 6	230.12
I	1			Ī

INQUINI	ic collingwoo	00 14 2017	1 agc 332	01 300
239:10	204:4,8,1	229:1,6,1	joint 42:22	259:16
250:8,18	4,21	0,17,23	judge	280:16
	205:1,8,1	230:3,14,	182 : 22	281:6
	3,21,22,2	18,21	182:22	287:5
January	5	231:1,5,9	JUDICIAL	290:8
_	206:4,7,1	,13,17,20	1:3	11-41-1
5:24 6:20	1,15	232:1,5,8	July	knowledgabl
10:25	207:13,21	,13,18,24	44:20,24	e 21:9
12:18	,25	233:4,7,1	45:25	knowledge
18:12	208:4,10,	2,18,23		22:24
52:12	14,18,22	234:14,17	46:12,17	89 : 5
55:11,24	209:8,13,	,23	47:19	164:9
58:2 62:1	20,23	235:3,8,2	48:3	195:21
63:9,10	210:3,8,1	0,25	122:14,19	207:2,3
64:2	3,17,22	236:8,11,	224:4	251:4,13
122:4	211:1,4,7	15 237:23	246:24	255:3
125:1			June 1:23	296:21
131:15,20	,11,14 212:1,5,9	238:1,4,9 ,17,21	6 : 15	
133:23	,16,25	239:2,7,1	70:23	knowledgeab
207:15	213:7,11,	1,17,23	122:10,18	le
208:24	16,19,23	· · ·	246:3,4,1	90:10,13,
232:9		240:2,7,1	2,24	24
235:10,14	214:7,23, 24	4,21		known 49:21
,23		241:2,7,1	jurisdictio	176:6
250:2,3	215:3,9,1	2,14,20,2	n 95:20	228:6
252:24	7,22	242:3,9,1	Justice 1:7	297:21
260:5	216:1,5,8 ,10,16,21	8,21,23	5:5 12:22	KPMG
294:20	217:5,11,	243:3,6,1		177:9,15
January/	17,22	0,22	K	178:6
February	218:4,10,	244:1,7	<u>Kate 2:3</u>	170.0
133:21	15,20	245:5,18,	202:17	
134:7	219:3,9,1	19		L
135:19	8	246:10,16	key	labels
Tamus /	220:2,7,1	,20,23	145:3,24	248:8
January/	5,20,25	247:7,12,	287:13,14	labour
February/	221:3,8,1	16,19	288:6,9,1	120:5,20,
March	4,19	248:14,19	2,13	25
282:3	222:3	,25	kinds 17:24	labourers
Jean 207:20	223:4,8,1	249:3,6,1	168:8	121:5
Joan	3,17,21	2,19,22	175 : 12	
220:8,12	224:1,13,	250:10,14	Kitchener	lack 14:6
223:14	17,24	,20,25	289:25	17:20
	225:3,6,1	251:3,9,1		193:7
job 163:8	0,15,18,2	6,20	knew	lady
169:16	2	267:7,20	89:10,14,	275:10,24
197:23	226:4,8,1	268:1,6,9	18,19,22	277 : 22 , 25
218:8	5,20,23	298:24	144:1	land 9:16
John 2:4	227:3,6,1		154:14	Tana 9:10
3:12	3,17	join 219:12	195:20 224:22	language
203:1,24,	228:3,9,1	joined	224:22	155 : 7
25	3,17,21	103:1	249:10	laptop
			249:1U	- 1 E

INQUIRI	. IE COLLINGWOC	D 00-14-2019	raye 333	01 300
132:2	101:17	191:20	leave	let's 11:24
large 19:7	134:4	192:1	156:20	70:3 88:1
33:25	142:19	195:16	281:9	98:13
91:14	164:11	240:23	leaving	140:23
132:22	182:17	LDCs	41:21	196:25
	188:10	17:19,22	274:20	letter
larger 9:22	242:19	20:4,7,11		234:4,9,2
25:13	269:23	21:19	led 36:5	4
27:18	274:5	23:6,10	38:1	235:2,5,9
91:12	288:4,11	24:5 26:8	199:11	289:14
201:23	Latin	27:16	241:16	290:25
largest	129:21	28:7 29:7	247:20	
32:3		30:4	legacy	letters
136:10	latitude	35:16	195 : 19	123:9
last 12:4	201:14	36:1,5		234:7,15,
13:9	laughing	91:7	legal 42:21	18 246:14
	222:21	117:23	62:7	290:3,21
18:10	launch	168:6	63:19	level 25:6
31:25		188:14	65:23	76:20
43:23	242:7,8,1		66:4,8,9,	125:10
74:24	0 244:14	LDC's 28:11	23	127 : 4
129:15	260:11	lead 25:22	67:2,6,11	167:25
131:4	law 179:23	216:17	68:3,5	176:3
155:17	lawyer		224:3	186:14
162:7	89:11,23	leading 8:1	legislature	190:19,20
163:4	113:21	31:8	8:20	201:16
181:14	175:21	51:11	123:18	215:17
188:25 192:22	180:8	57:2	Leisure	
192:22	181:11,13	107:22	261:12,17	levels
	,19	124:15	,19	190:3
196:20 197:18	183:14,17	135:3		193:10
	194:3	Leaf 42:6	lend 55:6	liable
198:16		learn 20:10	113:3	234:22
199:18	lawyers	90:25	lends	liberal
200:6	84:13	217:18	201:13	12:13
203:4	182:25	283:11		
209:1 227:21	186:3		length 16:7	liberties
251:23	192:7	learned	277:12	179:10
251:23	252:9	20:10		libraries
281:1,9	LCDs 21:3	116:17	lens	191:23
	LD 30:2	187:24	148:12,24	life 74:8
lastly		240:8	lense 35:8	
145:3	LDC 20:19	283:6,7		light 48:10
late 140:6	21:21,24	296:24	Leonard	163:3
213:10	27:16	297:2,7	139:7	169:5
later 16:14	32:7	least	less 27:15	184:8
	37:20	132:10	133:13	192:21
61:17	38:13,18	161:20	139:20	likely 26:4
64:25	39:12,14	194:1	lesson	45:13
65:1	91:8	235:12	187:24	144:12
82:23	104:11	247:8		
1	i I			i

INQUIRY	re COLLINGWOO	D 06-14-2019	Page 334	OI 366
168:20	53:5,13	261:23	173:10	145:3,24
1::	54:10	1 +	174:13	
limited	55:20	locations	176:15	man 113:21
91:9	56:20	228:20,25	198:9,25	management
131:12,24	57:9 , 25	LOF 132:22	200:17	25:8
157:14	58:8,15	logged	220:11	mandate
172:21	59:10,12,	251 : 1	246:8,13	21:10
180:11	15,20		247 : 23	21.10
182:20	60:13,19	long 6:16	283:4	manner
line 81:13	61:5	50:4	288:2	22 : 15
93:2 97:4	62:2,19,2	52 : 15	297:16	179:10
105:8	4	85 : 2		183:23
205:23	63:7,8,16	134:11	lots 37:6,7	196:24
210:11	64:25	139:15	56:23	manufacture
211:24	65:2,7,11	146:24	148:17	d 136:25
292:17	,17	195:22	loud 7:15	
	66:10,16,	198:13	1 1 010 0	manufacture
lines	22	203:5	loved 218:8	r 132:23
211:20	67:3,25	257 : 11	lovely	manufacturi
212:3	68:7	longer	220:10,12	ng 137:2
217:7	146:21	14:23	low 31:2	_
222:8	147:4	76:5		March
234:13	154:21	98:13	L's 267:9	131:16,18
251:14	156:22	132:24	lucrative	229:21
list 3:3	156:22	135:22	115:8	232:9
4:1 23:14		139:24		246:2,4,1
29:25	160:21	165:2,16	lunch	2,14,17
146:12	166:4	243:17	143:10	275 : 8
listed	170:4 171:13	276:20	165:24	mark 45:8
274:7	173:7,16		180:3	50 : 19
	· ·	Longo 63:20		74:25
listened	174:9 190:5	193:16	M	marked
149:9	190:5	long-term	mail 130:9	
little 7:15	Lloyd's	15 : 22	mailed	222:15
10:22	53:3 60:6	17:5 26:6	248:10	269:20
11:2 70:9	62 : 2			270:15
83:2	lobby	<pre>long-time 266:19</pre>	main 236:24	market
98:13	122:23	∠00:19	maintain	92:14
139:24	123:21	loosely	30:13	marketing
191:21		22:1	37:11 , 15	78 : 20
193:23	lobbyist	lose 48:20	120:8	94:7
199:5	123:5		maintained	95 : 19
270:1	124:8,10	losing	33 : 9	102:3
283:8	246:9	287:14		103:3
294:8	local	lot 8:9	maintaining	236:25
live 276:9	144:24	16:11	38:25	237:2
	189:23	50:1	major	
living	locate	103:19	35:13 , 22	marketplace
189:23	10:19	115:16	maker 146:3	145:21
Lloyd		138:4		Marrocco
52:11,14	location	140:24	makers	1:7 5:3,6
,				

	INQUIN	ie eddinewee	00-14-2019	1490 333	01 300
	7:8 10:8	Mather 2:4	227:3,6,1	282:20	248:20
	12:1,10,2	3 : 12	3,17	284:12	264:1
	0,23 13:6	203:1,11,	228:3,9,1	298:24	265:15
	18:19,25	24,25	3,17,21		272.6
	36:18	204:4,8,1	229:1,6,1	matter 5:15	280:12,13
	38 : 5	4,21	0,17,23	69:21	·
	40:14	205:1,8,1	230:3,14,	97:8	maybe 18:20
	52:4	3,21,22,2	18,21	116:23	44:10
	59:24	5	231:1,5,9	117:11	52 : 19
	97:19	206:4,7,1	,13,17,20	170:5	55 : 6
	98:7,12	1,15	232:1,5,8	186:2	57 : 18
	112:18	207:13,21	,13,18,24	187:10	59 : 22
	113:1	,25	233:4,7,1	191:3	66 : 22
	142:14,20	208:4,10,	2,18,23	192:8	121:10
	143:9,13		234:14,17	193:7	128:13
	165:15,21	14,18,22	,23	196:21	129:6
	180:2	209:8,13,		199:8	132:10
		20,23	235:3,8,2	263 : 7	165:3,20
	181:3,8,1	210:3,8,1	0,25	264:1	168:6
	6 , 25	3,17,22	236:8,11,	matters	173:3
	182:24	211:1,4,7	15 237:23	181:21	175:4,22
	183:5,21	,11,14	238:1,4,9	182:8	178:4
	184:5,9,1	212:1,5,9	,17,21	184:12	201:18
	9	,16,25	239:2,7,1	266:17	219:6
	185:11,16	213:7,11,	1,17,23	297:4	230:8
	198:14	16,19,23	240:2,7,1	299:6	234:19
	199:19,25	214:7,23,	4,21		247:12
	200:4,7	24	241:2,7,1	maximize	252:12
	202:14,18	215:3,9,1	2,14,20,2	90:22	262:18
	, 24	7,22	4	may 12:17	274:13
	203:3,14,	216:1,5,8	242:3,9,1	20:23	mayor 61:5
	19	,10,16,21	8,21,23	35:17,18,	62:7,19,2
	205:14,19	217:5,11,	243:3,6,1	20 44:13	4 63:7,8
	214:9,14,	17,22	0,22	58 : 23	65:22
	20	218:4,10,	244:1,7	63 : 3	66:3
	245:7,13	15,20	245:5,18,	80:22	67 : 25
	251:22	219:3,9,1	19	135:1,2	69:20
	252:1,18	8	246:10,16	139:24	154:21
	267:23	220:2,7,1	,20,23	141:25	187:11
	268:2	5,20,25	247:7,12,	149:9	189:2
	278:7,14	221:3,8,1	16,19	158:10	190:24,25
	286:6,11	4,19	248:14,19	162:10	191:13,18
	287:16	222:3	, 25	163:4,10,	193:3
	298:22,25	223:4,8,1	249:3,6,1	15 , 17	
	299:5	3,17,21	2,19,22	171:4	mayor's
	Marron 2:13	224:1,13,	250:10,14	184:21	69:17
	252:2	17,24	,20,25	189:4,24	McDowell
	matches	225:3,6,1	251:3,9,1	206:3	2:19
	86:6	0,15,18,2	6 , 20	214:1	200:12
		2	267:7,20	218:23	McDowell's
	materials	226:4,8,1	268:1,6,9	219:5,20	201:10
	46:24	5,20,23	280:16	229:22,23	201.10
ı					į

INQUINI	Te COLLINGWOO	00-14-2019	rage 330	01 300
McGrann 2:3	9:4 11:6	136:12	73:17	0,13,16,2
118:5	12:19	148:19	259 : 23	0,23
197:22	21:6	166:6,12	260:13	257:2,6,1
202:17	44:21,24	171:22	288:6	0,13,18,2
	45:6,11,1	178:12	296:8,9,2	3
Meaford	9 46:17	member 19:7	4 297:10	258:2,5,1
124:21	47:18,24	30:12	menu 29:11	0,16,19,2
mean 8:17	48:9	37:20	menu 29.11	5
21:25	49:12	38:2,17,2	mergers	259:6,12,
26:2 35:8	50 : 22	1 69:21	17:21	15,18,22,
46:6	52 : 24	167:18	message	25
47:19,20	53 : 4	259:17	189 : 19	260:4,8,1
49:19	55:10,14,			2,16,22
51:2	15 57 : 19	members 8:9	messaging	261:3,6,9
105:25	69:10	25:10	99:23	,13,20,22
128:3,9,2	150:9	26:10	met 21:10	, 25
4 129:5	154 : 14	27 : 20	25 : 1	262:1,8,1
132:16	155:1,18,	30:20	44:6,9,19	4,17,20,2
136:6	23 156:3	150:4	45:2	5
143:25	159 : 21	160:4	47:22	263:4,10,
144:9,15	161:13	162:6,11	49:23	14,18,21,
145:5,12	163:21,24	165:6	90:4	25
150:23	167:23,24	188:1	155:15	264:5,9,1
154:13	, 25	193:5	178:10	4,19,22
161:8	168:22	248:1	M-hm 39:4	265:1,9,1
171:2	170:12,14	memo	213:18	5 , 22
182:3,4	173:1	152:4,11,	223:3	266:5,6,1
183:4	175:20	16,20	228:23	1,15,25
187:21	178 : 25	153:6	254:5	267:11,13
239:23	179:5	155:24	256 : 1	,14,19
272:8	186:15	156:9	264:8	268:4,8,1
285:19	187:1	157 : 11	277:14	2,15,16,2
means 71:14	188:13,14	158:1,2,1	280:19	1 , 25
95:16	189:2,5,9	6 159:3,9	284:8	269:7,11,
107:16	190:13,22	160:9,20	Miami	15 , 21
257 : 24	, 23	162:1,23		270:2,7,1
meant 12:14	195:11,13	178:24	135:11,24	2,17
26:23	196:12	memory	136:1,8,9	271:1,5,1
38:20	260:18	246:6,21	mic 7:10	3,15,19,2
163:20	262:24	280:23	Michael 2:7	3
182:14	meetings	292:11	3 : 13	272:1,4,7
212:1	8:5,7,13		252:4,7,8	,10,17,22
	18:14	mental 45:9	,9,22,23	273:2,9,1
measure	19:2,15,1	170:8	253:1,9,1	2,17,20,2
107:22	8,24	mention	4,19,23	4
media	45:19,21,	130:6	254:2,6,9	274:3,9,1
216:14,17	24,25	187 : 22	,13,15,18	5,18,24
meet 136:7	46:1,12,2	mentioned	,23	275:3,7,1
190:13	5	10:6 45:8	255:5,9,1	2,14,18,2
	47:8,12,1	63:13	3,20,24	1,25
meeting 6:5	5,19,20	00.10	256:2,5,1	276:3,10,
1 1			<i>''</i>	

	TO COMMINGNO			01 900
14,19,25	Ministers	190:15	226:3,12	222:6
277:3,7,1	123:17	277 : 12	244:4	mouth 91:20
1,15,17,2	minute 13:9	misundersto	month 56:25	149:7
2 278:2,5	50:7,9,10	od	57 : 2	167:3
micro	79:1	80:21,23	127:10,14	move 11:24
190:20	97:21	mode 99:15	,16,19	15:14
microphone	200:8		128:15	18:10
203:20	minutes	model 5:23	130:22	24:17
	50:6	6 : 2	133:24	56:1 70:3
mid-2011	59:25	14:6,24	135:3,5	117:2
127:8	98:9	17:23	138:7	190:21
mid-October	112:19	22:25	243:16	
296:9	163:21	24:17	245:12	moved 39:19
million	165:22	28:5 31:7	260:19	69:8
32:14	185:1,10	136:24	287:9	228:25
197:12	195 : 14	161:16	289:4,7	moving
	252:14	models 29:6	monthly	16:21
millions	255 : 23 , 25	37:16	128:1	17:4 52:2
29:25 115:24	256:4	moment	months	117:21
199:15	miraculousl	81:16	14:22	MP 41:1
	y 33:24	83:11	53:1,7	MPP 126:24
mind 23:16	_	86:9 87:1	55:10,24	
24:18	mischaracte	88:2	56 : 17	MPPs 123:17
28:15	rized	93:16	57 : 6	Mueller
43:1	68:5	98:18	129:9,10	161:21
45:17,18	114:23	101:16	131:13 , 15	164:8,12
48:22	mischaracte	107:10	132:9	multiple
50:10	rizing	133:4	133:6,10	154:9
66:13	66 : 7	134:16	135:18	155:9
69:3 72:6	misinterpre	195:25	140:16	
74:20 78:2	ted	265:4	224:14	multitude
115:10	161:14	moments	232:25	196:19
150:6		102:2	233:11	Muncaster
169:14	mislead	109:2	242:19	43:23,25
170:24	43:19	momentum	247:4	45:3,11
175:20,21	misleading	17:7	248:16	46:13
191:17	196:11		269:23	47:18,22,
197:15	missed	Monday	280:4,5	24
210:12	183:18	87:12,21	287:10	48:11,25
218:21		138:10	moral 202:2	49:14,22,
219:4	mission	299:6	morning 5:5	25 51:20
minds 9:11	129:13	monetary	40:17	155:1,4,1
	mistake	188:2	93:6	9
46:7	254:16	money	188:24	156:3,23
mine 136:21	mistakes	76:4 , 6		157:12
198:4	255:19	115:3,16	mornings	160:24
272:6		116:10	136:14	167:18,25
Minister	misundersta	140:10	mostly	168:19,22 ,24
41:15	nding	196:8	150:8	,24 169:6,22
	61:14			109.0,22

	. IC COHHINGWO		rage 330	01 000
170:4	135:15	s 65:16	notes 10:4	2:8,19,22
171:10	narrative	Niagara	11:5	nuances
172:2,13,	158 : 12	126:24	186:18	190:1
21	179 : 22		200:8	
173:17,19		night 52:19	249:17	num 217:25
,23	narrow	138:11	nothing	numerous
174:7,12,	91:23	213:10	195:9,20	14:10
13 176:6	193:17	281:1,9	211:24,25	55 : 5
177:2,5	nature 19:3	nights	247:2	59:4,5
178:11,24	51:24	52 : 19	249:13	186:10
179:5,8,1	120:23	nineteen	277:18	192:14
9 189:19	132:19	204:23,24		
195:5	151:22	205:3,11,	notice	0
196:12	178:5	16 206:24	117:3	oath 5:8
220:8,17,	180:17		noticed	279:6
21,22	186:5	nobody	255:18	
221:10	192:9	74:15	273:3	objection
222:6,7,1	208:6	112:5	notwithstan	8:16
1	220:7	149:17,22		183:1,7
223:15,22	263:5	151 : 5	ding	objections
225:20	297:24	180:14	178:9	8:9
Muncaster's	Nature's	188:9	179:1	ahia ahiasa
195:19	79:23,25	195 : 12	Nova 293:1	objective
	·	202:1	November	20:18
municipal	NDA 150:13	Nolan	102:18	27:7,25 30:11
44:10	194:14,18	191:11	110:5	198:19
73:14	,20		112:4,14	198:19
193:20	necessarily	non 54:5	206:2	objectives
201:2,4,5	9:15 49:2	none 84:12	215:7,12	21:7,10,1
municipalit	60:23	149:2	217:18,22	1 28:2,22
y 39:13	90:18	162:24	222:10	obtained
61:9 63:1	114:25	182:4	224:2,5,1	66 : 4
189:25	174:6	215:25	3 229:20	159:11
194:20	188:2	216:2	234:4	286:21
201:1	necessary	218:18	235:9,14,	
museums	15:9 92:6	non-elected	22	obtaining
191:23	185:1	48:22	242:12,19	141:21
	103.1		244:21	289:10
Myers	necessity	nor 18:18	260:24	obvious
135:15,16	290:24	179:8,9	267:10	235:21
136:18	negatively	normal	268:11	obviously
myself 5:16	31:8,19	121:11	280:6,8	61:11
9:11,18	·	note	298:10,14	67 : 20
29:24	negotiating	12:12,13,	November/	133:12
183:10	86:1	17 45:9	•	147:4
	negotiation	17 43.9	December	162:10
	s 85:13	281:1,7	135:2,4	166:22
<u>naive</u> 197:8	network	·	137:14,17	176:10
	147:18	noted	138:19	182:22
Naples		204:24	298:7	191:19
133:16,18	nevertheles	281:10	np	
1	I			l

INQUIRY re	COLLINGWOOD	06-14-2019	Page	339	of	366
------------	-------------	------------	------	-----	----	-----

INQUINI	TE CONTITUOMOO	00-14-2019	rage 339	01 200
203:13	92:8	8:24 9:6	111:5	271:5
257:14	offer 211:4	15 : 2	118:8,18	280:22
258:3		17 : 25	121:21	284:3,20
259:7	offered	20:1 22:3	122:13	285:5
272:2,13	91:25	27:14	124:12	287:19
occasion	offers	29:9	128:16	291:12
22:11	198:7	31:17	129:14	293:2
45:3	office	34:24	130:20	294:10
228:7	29:1,11,2	35:2,3,11	132:11	298:2
289:10	29:1,11,2 1 44:20	36:8	134:2,12	old 195:1
292:2	45:2	37 : 25	136:2	
296:16	49:12,18,	39:10,21	137:12	OMERS 71:13
298:3	49:12,18,	40:12	140:23	76:5
	81:24	43:10	142:4,11	one-day
occasions	85:16	44:13	144:23	193:18
54:11,24	124:18	45:10	145:23	ones 25:20
55:16	132:3	46:19	146:15	42:9
58:11 59:5	133:15	51:6,25	147:6	113:8
	217:15	55:9	148:2	
63:16 75:21	287:3,4	57:22	149:16	one's
138:22	288:21	59:22	150:21	161:17
138:22	291:22	60:21	151:23	250 : 1
,23		61:19	152:2	ongoing
282:20	officers	62:13	153:14,18	84:14
289:17	87:18	63:2,25	,25 154:7	138:1
	official	64:6,24	155:14,16	online
occur 35:12	59:1 61:9	65:19	156:2	123:2
occurred	68:13	70:24 71:7,16	157:1,5,2 0 158:14	
242:10	officials	80:16	159:2,10,	onsite
292:11	188:1	82:3,12,2	23	137:4
o'clock	201:19	3 83:10	162:5 , 15	Ontario
299:7	off-season	84:21	165:10	1:20
	135:3	87:10	166:3	20:15
October		88:1,6	167:4,17	237:12
87:11	oh 7:12	89:14	170:18	onto 251:1
130:25	38:19	92:20	172:11	291:10
131:11 134:16	57:1	93:7	173:14	onward
206:24	68:19	94:21	174:5,11	289:18
243:16	102:12	96:1,3,13	183:3	
244:11	143:15	98:11	205:13,19	OPA 92:8
246:25	148:15	100:22	223:17	open 201:21
247:9	222:17 226:1	101:10,14	231:20	250 : 4
	254:10	, 19	232:8	257 : 16
October/	261:20	102:6,11	235:25	265:4
November	275:1	105:12	238:4	267 : 4
135:1	278:2,9	106:2,10,	249:12	268:22
137:14	292:13	20 107:7	257 : 5	269:23
odd 150:9	297:25	108:23	261:22	270:8,13
OEB 14:18		109:10,22	267:22	288:11
17.10	okay 6:14	110:15	268:1,12	opened

111001111	- IC COLLINGWO	00 14 2013	rage 340	01 300
257:14	193:6	39:11,17	43:12	259:3 , 5
258:11	195:7	40:7	Ottawa	270:20
259:19	opinions	options	123:13,19	271 : 3
265:23	38:24	139:10	126:23	283:24
266:2,8	189:6		140:15,16	paid
270:9		order 26:7	·	32:20,22
296:13	opportuniti es 21:23	30:14 48:12	outcome 5:18	79 : 16
opening	219:23	77 : 22		83:6,14,2
296:16	220:4	90:21	outline 6:6	3
operated		157:23	outlined	85:10 , 22
125:14	opportunity	257:14	85:14	94:12
	9:20	278:9,11	outside	95 : 17
operating	24:23	·	58:21	96:6,21
29:8 96:9	25:24,25	organizatio	63:19	97:1
100:17 196:5	28:10	n 24:13	117:21	98:19
190:5	48:11	27:18		99:6
operation	73:5	32:10,15	overall	109:6,9,2
29:10	92:12,17 99:20	42:23	194:5	0 116:9
operations	113:18	90:20 178:2	197:7	119:8
23:12,20	115:16		overly	120:2
OPG 20:13	117:22	organizatio	168:9	140:21
	135:14	nal 23:22	overreachin	197:20 211:8
opinion	136:17	organizatio	g 186:7,9	237:8,15
8:12	139:2,3,8	ns 23:15		291:23
21:22	143:3	24:1,19	overstated	
22:6	180:5,13,	28:20	57 : 18	paper 116:4
23:2,25	15,18	organized	oversteppin	
39:22	181:15	20:8	g 162:10	119:1
40:11 48:8 62:7	182:5,13,	22:5,9	Owen 124:21	paragraph
65:23	15,17	•	ormod 201.E	61:20
66:4,8,9,	184:12,22	original	owned 201:5 228:10,12	62:3 64:1
23	188:5	86:7	220.10,12	65:20 , 21
67:2,6,11	189:25	184:25	owner	94:8,18
,23	opposed	originally	228:15	96:2
68:3,5	21:24	108:12		98:21
69:17,22	71:22	118:15	P	102:7
77:15	144:20	originated	p.m 70:23	103:23
91:8,10	173:6	20:18	184:16,17	117:25 204:15
100:17,19	opposite	others	185:13,14	204:13
103:21	8:21	13:2,14	269:19	206:22
107:8	31:23	42:7	299:9	207:8,13
148:20		48:22	page 3:2	208:23
151 : 18	optimum 29:3	49:3 53:6	4:2	209:2
153:24		55 : 18	10:4,10,2	214:8,24,
164:5	option 9:16	160:15	5 162:8	25 215:3
166:25	28:16	171 : 20	209:9	227:8,18,
178:20	36:10,20,	192:20	233:19	21 239:13
188:7	25 37:3	otherwise	236:16	244:8,15
192:19,20	38:4,9	0 0.101 11106	239:13	245:6,20
	I			•

	TE COLLINGWO	00 00 11 2013	rage 341	01 300
252:12	39:14	14:1	13:17 , 22	,21
262:9	53 : 4	19:18	14:2,9	52:13 , 21
276:4	55:7 , 22	26 : 17	15:8 , 18	53:2,16,2
279:18	57 : 5	33:1 35:5	16:2,20,2	1
284:6	104:8	36:14 , 17	4 17:9,17	54:3,5,23
	123:5	42:21,24	18:6,17	55:3,12,2
paraphrase	125:12	43:2	19:4,21	5
161:20	133:11	169:8	20:9,20,2	56:6,8,12
paraphrasin	141:2	partnership	3	,18 57 : 7
g 187:9	144:4	s 18:16	21:4,8,17	58:3,10,1
pardon	149:3		22:8,18	3 , 17
50:22	168:5	42:19	23:1	59:11,17,
292:24	187:1	part-time	24:11,25	21
	282:14	126:12	26:2,12,2	60:11,22
Park 123:13	particularl	212:12	0	61:1,18
124:1	_	party	27:4,9,14	62:12,20
parks	y 145:6	185 : 25	28:3,8,24	63:11
191:23	149:10		29:14,19	64:6,8,14
Parliament	particulars	passed	30:17,22	,21
8:21	289:14	220:14	31:5,10,1	65:4,9,14
147:20	parties	passing	7 , 22	, 18 , 25
193:13	15:21	141:2	32:23	66:6
196:4	110:4	200 : 22	33:2,8	67:5 , 10
248:1	123:18	password	34:8,11,2	68:4,22
259:17	129:22	250:22,24	3	69:24
	188:4	298:1,3	35:2,7,14	70:15,21
Parliamenta		·	36:11,15	71:1,4,6,
ry	partly	past 17:22	37:5,24	8,16,25
41:14,16	131:1	63 : 13	38:10,19	72:15,25
partially	partner	106:21,22	39:5,9,21	73:9,22
108:3	32:11	107:4,5	40:4,10,2	74:4,13,1
243:13	33:16	150:12	5	6
participant	43:5	234:2	41:3,6,9,	75:12 , 20
181:13,20	48:17	path 33:24	13,23	76:17
·	80 : 22	36 : 6	42:1,4,8,	77:4,10,1
participant	114:2	172:15	12,16,18	4 78:7,16
s 148:21	116:6	195:3	43:1,14,1	
190:24	partnering	Patrick	7 , 20	8,24
participate	139:6	2:22	44:1,4,7,	
d 193:5			17,22,25	14,20
	partners	Paul 2:11	45:4,7,12	
participati	31:4 42:15	3:5,9	46:2,9,15	, 25
ng 189:3		5:9,11	,19,21	82:3,6,11
particular	43:9,11,1	6:3,7,19,	47:2,5,9,	· ·
6:4 7:3	3,16,19 78:11	25	13,16,21	83:9,16,2
10:19	92:4	7:6,12,16	48:6,18	4
15:15,21	99:14	8:3	49:8,15,2	
16:11		9:3,10	0	85:1,6,11
20:3	partnership	10:16	50:5,8,18	· ·
21:13	5:22	11:11	, 24	86:13,23
22:11	11:22	12:6	51:5,8,16	87:3,9,13

INQUIRY re COLLINGW	OOD 06-14-2019	Page 342	of 366
---------------------	----------------	----------	--------

	i ie edhlindwed	D 00 11 2019	1 age 342	01 300
,20,24	, 25	3,17,21	,14	232:22
88:5,9,22	115:4,10,	145:1,4,9	176:2,9,1	233:16,21
89:1,12,1	17	,14,19,22	7 , 23	235:16
7,21	116:2,19,	146:1,10,	177:4,10,	238:13
90:5,8,11	24 117:12	18,22	13,19,24	239:15
,14	118:7,11,	147:1,5,8	178:18	262:6
91:5,21	14,20	,15 148 : 9	179:4,15,	
92:1,15,1	119:3,9,1	149:15,19	21	284:1
9	4,21,25	151:7,12,	181:2,5,1	293:9
93:4,8,12	120:20	18	0,18	294:15
,19,25	121:6,14,	152:1,8,1	182:21	296:5
94:16,20	20,23	2,17,21	183:3 , 11	298:17
95:3,7,12	122:1,7,1	153:8,12,	184:2,7,1	22.2
,22	2,16,20	17,21	4	pay 33:3
96:1,11,1	123:23	154:5,9	185:9,18,	118:9
9 97:12	124:6,9,1	155:21,25	21,22	127:4
98:22	4	156:5,10,	189:12,13	211:4
99:2,8,12	125:2,16,	15,24	198 : 15	291:9,10,
,18,23	21,25	157:4,7,1	199:24	16
100:2,8,1	126:16	3,21	200:2,5,1	paying
1,16,24	127:12,17	158 : 5 , 19	0 202:20	127:10,14
101:4,8,1	,21,24	159:1,8,1	203:7	, 15
3,18	128:5,9,2	3,16,22,2	210:6	147:14
102:4,10,	0	5	213:6	payment
16,19,25	129:1,4,1	160:3,8,1	222:18	84:7 97:9
103:5,10,	7	3,23	240:22	101:16
14,18,24	130:4,15,	161:2,7,1	259:10	121:22
104:1,2,4	18,21	8 , 23	284:7	122:10,14
,6,7,15,2	131:3,7,1	162:9,16,	286:9	130:25
1,24	2	21	289:20	131:5
105:11,14	132:13,16	163:1,17,	PAUSE 61:22	
, 17 , 20	133:9,20	23	64:4 70:6	244:24
106:1,4,7	134:8,13,	164:4,11,	75:10	246:2,3,1
,11,16,22	19,21,24	25	85:4 90:1	7 291:9
107:2,14	135:12,25	165:9,12	92:23	293:5
108:5,14,	136:5,20	166:8,13,	95 : 25	
21	137:16,20	18	96:17	payments
109:3,5,8	,24	167:5,8,1	97:17,23	118:4
,12,13,16	138:3,14,	3,16,22	98:3	122:19 245:22
,17,21	17,20	168:14,21	101:22	245:22
110:1,6,1	139:13,18	169:1,23	118:1	291:6
4,16,20,2	,23	170:21	147:10	291:0
3	140:3,13,	171:2,11,	165:18	payroll
111:3,7,1	22	25	204:17	120:22
0,13,16,2	141:7,12,	172:3,7,1	207:11	126:10
0	19,22,25	0,14,23	214:5	208:13,16
112:7,15,	142:4,7,1	173:2,5,8	215:1	PB 241:2
24	1,18	,13,22	221:17	243:13
113:2,7,1	143:6,12,	174:2,10,	224:9	
6,25	24	15,18,21	227:11,15	PB/TB 108:3
114:13,18	144:3,6,1	175:2,6,9	229:15	PDF 81:11
	1			

INQUINI	. le COLLINGWOC	00 14 2019	Page 343	01 300
270:20	237:8,14	122:4	235:1,7	255 : 22
peak 135:19	percent 9:2	126:17	290:11	256 : 7
_	11:9	130:2	personal	phonetic
pension	33:4,5	133:6	63:15	139:7
71:13	34:1,5,6,	134:23	71:21	
76:3	7,13,14	135:6,21	72:8,12,2	phoning
people 8:18	44:8	137:18	3 75:3	111:19
11:17	59:18	138:16,19	89:5	phrase
12:13,14	76:3,4	139:19		18:22
13:8	79:23	173:12	<pre>personally 124:13</pre>	pick 111:23
14:19	80:4	195:20		130:7
25:17	94:14	200:3	218:21	146:7,13
36:5	96:15	215:13	perspective	154:13,17
42:21	97:2,5,9	219:11	5:20 7:25	,22
43:7	98:19	220:24	10:1	172 : 18
54:2,12	99:11	221:4	21:18	278:11
56:23	101:17	224:12	24:7	
74:17,21,	105:13,15	229:18	28:12	picked
24 82:18	106:3	232:14	31:20	100:4,20
115:9	108:18,19	234:3	47:1	picture
120:22	109:15,20	235:10	60:14	32:19
124:17	112:3	246:15	90:24	piece 116:4
125:6	113:12	247:8	151:14	167:11
126:19	116:1	274:25	217:6	173:20
148:1	133:22	275:2	perspective	
151:3	197:11	282:3,19	s 37:8,15	197:10
153:6	237:9,15	298:7,8,1	38:12	226:24
154:12	244:12	0,14	194:13	
155:10	percentage	Periodicall	Peter 88:4	pieces
156:13,20	80:24	y 281:25		119:1
157:3,6		periods	106:17 107:17	149:20
162:13	perhaps	135:22	236:19	196:17
163:7	12:21	229:25	230:19	Pilkington
164:20,23	41:15	230:5		208:8,13,
168:9	48:22		pets 234:21	20
170:17	68:24	permits	phone	pillars
182:4 189:5	91:23 125:18	129:11	100:4,20	39:12
192:15	190:25	person	111:23	1-+ 00.2
196:6	191:11,21	11:15	138:5	pilot 92:3
202:5	230:6	23:13	146:7,13	pinion
217:3	235:20	68:9 , 14	150:9	192:20
220:10		74:23	154:13,17	pinpointed
248:2	period	76 : 23	, 23	54:18
290:2	18:13	126:6,21	172:18	
	19:19,25	144:20	194:10	pitching
per 30:25	51:14	151:14	255:16	161:6
53:4	83:13	178:2	258:9	places
94:13	85:19	191:11	297:23	228:22
97:2	93:18	220:13	phoned	287 : 5
118:10	120:16	232:19	111:4	plain
232:14	121:10,12			

INQUIRY	re COLLINGWO	DD 06-14-2019	Page 344	OI 366
107:11	279:18,25	201:12	117:16	132:3
-1 6. F	283:24	207:16	124:21	133:15
plan 6:5		211:5,17	133:12	1
13:19	pleased	215:11,14	150:19,20	postage
15:24	22:12	223:18	161:17	248:9
16:17,21,	163:7	224:1,18	162:4	potential
23 17:12	plus 79:17	228:3,13	176:7	9:21
planned	127:10	232:3	180:14	18:2,15
217:25	pocket	236:4	187:18	45:22,24
218:1	192:17,18	238:2	216:23	54:15
planning	·	240:4	217:8,16	58 : 25
98 : 5	, 22	241:16	•	60:16
	podium	251:17	positioned	69 : 17
138:1	192:11	274:16	38:24	73:4
193:19	point 12:23	288:13	positions	77 : 23
plans	19:22		196:2	90:16,22
217:24	20:10	points		92:14,16
222:7,14	30:18	194:12	positive	115:16,18
play 55:15	51:9	poke 57:20	8:11,18	189:8
90:21	61:14	_	39:25	215:5,13
96:22	66:11	poking	48:10	219:23
144:12	68:17	168:3	64:9	220:3
199:8	69:1	policies	133:22	223:20
199:0	71:19	73:23	170:12,15	241:18
playing	76:9	political	189:22	242:6,15
265:16	77:8,12,1	7:2	192:21	263:13
please 7:17	7 84:14	123:12	197:6	
61:20	88:20	124:18	200:3	potentially
64:1 70:4	108:16,17	196:2	positively	91:3 92:7
75:8	115:11		22:20	115:2
79:2,9	116:10	politician	possession	Power
81:3 82:8	117:1,18	57 : 21	120:12	20:8,15
83:2 85:2	126:3	politicians		79:23,25
92:21	127:13,20	123:25	possibiliti	PowerStre
94:23	131:22,23	147:24	es 91:25	187:12
101:20	132:25	politics	possible	
110:18	133:5	41:21	22:2	PowerStream
117:25	135:18		28:13	2:22 6:1
148:16	143:8	poor 40:8	130:13	8:1,2
149:25	155 : 17	portion	134:10	18:14
150:1	160:6,20	134:17	136:15	25:12,14,
158:21	161:4,12	230:9	163:2	18 26:18
175:20,21	163:5,20	232:12	170:23	28:6
194:20	170:22		225:6	30:15
203:21	177:15	portions	264:11	31:1,7
204:4,15	178:2,6	180:9	nossihl	32:11,19
206:6	183:15	position	possibly	33:12,15
209:15	194:19	21:15,16	54:3	34:17
219:2	196:21	40:9	87:21	35:6
221:14	199:18,20	63 : 21	92:3	39:11,17
276 : 5	200:6	72:2 76:8	159:13	40:8 45:6
			post 14:21	46:17
1	i	1		i l

	I IC COLLINGWOO	OD 00 11 2019	1age 343	01 300
48:9,16,2	50:22	24:10	prevails	75 : 25
3	51:13	28:16	195:13	124:19
49:9,13,1	64:22	47:23	prevented	174:22
6 50:12	69:3	53:20,22,	175:11	195:6
51:3	169:22	25 54 : 2	1/3:11	201:25
58:24	PR 144:20	presentatio	preventing	privileged
61:13	PR 144.20	_	238:10	16:4
66:3,25	practice	n 10:23	previous	
67:1,16	100:18	158:11	83:4	148:16
69:16	121:11	162:7,14	207:19	privy 9:3
70:2	288:23,25	163:8,9	270:9,13	41:8,19
79:13	291:6	164:10,13	·	proactive
104:14	pre 136:24	168:20	previously	188:19
127:9	-	presentatio	3:5 5:11	
128:17	pre-2011	ns 6:12	68:2,21	probable
138:2	37 : 22	158:3,6	134:17	15 : 25
141:3,4,1	precise	presented	234:15,18	probably
1 143:20	276:1	6:6,9 9:5	price 137:2	46:7
144:11,24		·	248:12	141:1
145:8	predicated	13:19,23 36:2	287:9	152:5,20
147:13	107:6	36:2 139:8		213:9
148:4	preference	159:5	primary	230:16
150:4,13	168:10	164:17	116:8	231:7,11,
152:16,20	preferred	171:4	274:7	15 246:7
153:7,13	51:4	1/1.4	Prime 41:15	247:24
154:16,18		presenting	principle	255:21
159:3	premise	169:16	61:6	258:4
168:1,7,2	33:9	presents		259:8,10
0	premises	28:9	print	263:2
169:4,15	286:17		209:15	272:9
170:8	288:18	president	253 : 18	283:10,14
177:14	291:11	23:10,19	printed	287:17
179:10	292:5	25:2	248:8	292:15
187:12	293:16	72:2,13,1	printout	procedure
188:4	297:22	9	272:13	16:19
189:1,7	preoccupati	press		
190:1	on 191:15	165:14,22	prior	proceed
191:8,19		presumably	36:13 , 16	16:1
192:10,20	preoccupied	109:23	44:12,16	proceeding
194:8,15,	190:4	280:22	132:20	230:15
17	preparation	298 : 7	207:25	proceedings
197:6,7	5:24		211:18	5:16
208:25	prepared	presume	212:5	31:20
222:20	50:15	42 : 7	217:22	32:18
224:7,20	170:25	pretty	220:16	32:18 42:6
225:24	208:25	89 : 25	221:3	230:17
252:10		135:1	223:21	
259:2,19,	preparing	172 : 21	247:25	process
23	123:9	289:6	262:19	14:11
PowerStream	present	prev 297:22	private	19:23
's 44:20	12:8		74:9,15	44:6
	1			

INQUIRY re COLLINGWOOD	06-14-2019	Page 346 of 366)
------------------------	------------	-----------------	---

	. ie collingwod	JD 00 14 2017	Page 340	<u> </u>
45:11	237:13	231:14	136:11	182:23
48:12,15	profits	232:9,14,	144:19	274:11
50:25	79:12	19 , 25	153:1	province
51:2,9,10	84:16	233:13	155:12	20:14
95:9	245:2	234:22	166:5,11	
123:3	243.2	249:8	169:7,8	Provincial
137:22	profit-	270:24	179:19	123:18
171:24	sharing	271:22 , 24	181:23	provinciall
175:25	93:20,24	273:7,10	189:24	y 84:10
176:8,13	progress	275:11	207:2	_
177:8,25	17:20	280:5,18	234:24	psychic
178:15	D	281:17,24	provided	166:21
193:5	Progressive	283:1,8	9:13	<pre>public 6:12</pre>
194:5	41:10	288:12	16:14	8:5,7,13
196:23,24	project	proposal	25:8 62:6	19:7
197:1	71:24	161:6	66:9	24:13
198:19	72:12	197:7	88:15,18	51:23
201:7	92:3	208:25	108:9	75 : 25
207:3	103:8	209:3,11,	119:22	215:5
215:6	prominent	18 211:18	120:10,11	260:23,25
217:19	89:11	213:21	,13,14	261:14
281:5		252:14	132:1	262:11,23
prodding	promote	253:4	166:16	,24
168:3	137:9	259:2	176:18	263:24
	147:23	294:18,19	178:11	pull 126:16
product	prompted	295:2	179:6	127:24
14:15	59:9		186:14	128:11
90:16,22	124:24	proposed	187:9	158 : 15
91:1,3,11	125:3	85:20 86:3	194:14	204:4
,13,14,15	270:12	96:12	200:20	221:15
,25 92:9,13,1	284:16	107:18	204:1,6	249:23
6 115:5	proper	123:21	233:25	279:17
136:23	16:18	170:19	234:7	purchase
	183:8		provider	117:23
profile	nmonom1	proposing	26:19	
124:3	properly 63:23	78:19	27:2	purporting
147:25		94:19		105:23
profit	properties	96:5	provides	purports
80:12,19,	228:7,10	97:10,13	29:10	12:3
24 81:12	229:2,12	98:18	37:8	81:11
83:24	property	109:18	123:3	purpose
84:2	131:2,17,	160:7 219:24	providing	50:10
85:22	19	219:24	69:11	73:1
86:5	134:5,6,2	protocols	119:5	76 : 24
92:13	3 135:10	73:23	132:21	123:16
93:15	227:8,19,	provide	141:14,17	143:11
96:21	23	29:6 69:3	143:20	150:16
99:14	228:4,12	75 : 23	144:16,24	196:22
108:8	229:19,25	92:6,16	148:3,7	199:22
109:5	230:5	133:25	151:8	255:1
115:9			181:14	

Page	347	of	366

	. IC CODDINGWO	00 11 2019	rage 347	01 300
purposes	71:10	180:1,21	38:1,3,8,	49:4
76:3	76:13	199:7	12,24	53 : 17
137:1,10	77:24	200:24	39:1,3,11	74:6
pursuant	83:21	202:12 , 15	, 16 40:7	80:24
286:21	93:23	207:7	quote 12:3	94:9
200.21	96:23	218:22	48:20	100:18
pursue	98:1	227:7	161:16,20	109:9
198:2	99:20	240:15	,24 162:2	120:22
pursuing	105:21	246:1	·	151:15
14:24	121:2	249:23	quoting	164:13
puts 145:16	129:15	251:21	61:24	180:19
puts 145:16	139:11	252 : 5		192:5
putting	141:8	264:20	R	237:4
67:19	151:8,13	278:6 , 24	rabbit	rating
69:14	180:15	286:5,7,9	71:18	137:9
123:11	181:6,9,1	, 16	75 : 22	
126:10	0,22	287 : 18	raise 155:6	rationale
158:7	183:18	298 : 20	186:2	189:4
162:23	186:13	quick	215:15	re 186:18
puzzle	192:11	254 : 22		226:18
197:10	197:16	255:17,18	raised 8:9	reached
	198:18	·	63:14,17	58:7
	199:6	quickly	64:19	61:13
qualified	201:7	20:16	95:1,16	76:2
71:13	216:15,18	69:15 240:6	141:15	114:12
	224:16	256:25	152:10	
qualify	225:9		153:15	reaching
150:5	226:5,7,1	quite 11:20	186:2	58:4
quality	0 235:19	14:12	188:9	151:20
198:11	244:2	16:9	raising	160:16
quarter	265:5	21:19	34:12	R-E-A-D
165:23	285:9	55:20	53:10	269:20
	questioned	68:16	55 : 8	reading
Queen's	149:22	80:18	194:8	12:3,8
123:12	questioner	149:20	range 21:21	64 : 15
124:1	7:9	175:16	31:2	107:11
query		188:21	203:21	114:16
154:23	questioning	194:12	rate 118:23	240:4,6
question	182:23	196:12,13 197:22		253 : 7
8:17 11:8	183:25	215:13	ratepayer	reads 110:8
12:11,25	185:23	220:13	29:5	
13:4,10	186:3	275:24	30:2,3	ready 81:22
15:3,4,13	192:7	277:24	31:8	reality
18:11	198:16,25		ratepayers	191:23
32:17	· ·	quo 9:15	21:3	realize
36:19	questions	24:10	28:13	175:18
38:6	5:17	33:10,14	rather	249:8,13
56:15	40:13	36:9,16,2	20:19	·
58:15	57:23	0,25	27:18	realized
64:20	123:4	37:2,10,1	28:16	190:17
	142:2	1,15	20.10	

INQUINI	TE COLLINGWOO	70 00 14 2019	raye 340	01 300
203:9	reasonably	130:1	202:5	184:16
really	38:23	133:18	receive	185:13
6:10,13	153:2	134:25	226:12	recipients
8:15,22	164:1	138:20,21	243:7	99:1
16:10,13	reasoning	, 22	246:2	
49:25	14:6	139:13,25	248:20	recognition
55:18	14.0	140:4,5	297:23	44:9
60:14	reasons	153:10 , 12		recognized
128:11	24:4	,22,24	received	51 : 9
171:21	25:21	154 : 21	16 : 5	
216:12	96:4 99:4	155 : 2,5	31:24	recognizes
219:8	136:3	156:1	32:2,8,13	186:17
220:13	rebate	158:17	33:20	recognizing
224:22	297:12	166:7	59 : 6	22:13
240:6		167:22	60:15	23:4
	recall 14:8	168:22	65:17	recollect
247:5,25	15:4,9,17	169:2,21	80:24	225:2
253:7	18:5	170:10	87 : 7	
264:3,17,	20:21	174:2,6	101:16	recollectio
21 282:9	21:1 22:8	200:16	162:22	n 56:16
295:1	26:16	210:4,16	189:17,19	57:19
realm 34:3	31:3	211:19	206:23	111:19,21
183:12	34:18,22	212:2,10,	209:23	134:3,5
reappear	36:24	17,24	210:6	152:16
97:20	37 : 23	214:3	222:19	154:1
	45:7 46:4	217:7	223:14	172:6
reason	47 : 21	218:20	225:25	186:16
25:11	49:15	221:2,13	226:3	223:14
35:13	50:1,18	225:3	243:18	233:5
40:7	51 : 17	226:4,8,1	244:4,13,	recommendat
72:10	52:17,18	0 238:22	21,24	ion
84:6 99:4	53:5,8,12	240:4	245:23	175:23
113:14	, 15 , 25	243:1	260:20	
135:9	55:4,10,2	246:10	293:5	recommendin
140:18	5 57:5	247:19	receives	g 70:12
150:17	58:3,18,2	250:12	178:24	record 5:15
175:14	4 66:18	253:6	236:19	11:7,13
215:22	67:10,12	258:8		65:5 86:2
217:11	70:22	263:3	receiving	100:3,14
250:15	71:9	268:11,23	80:19	112:8
270:8	78:7,8	282:22	151:2,25	173:25
reasonable	85:11,25	285:9	223:21	187:14
68:9 72:7	86:16	recalled	246:11	196:10
76:23	87:2,3,23	211:16	recently	198:5
78 : 2	89:25		30:21	267:8
114:6	100:8	recalling	reception	recorded
122:2,8	102:5	226:16	126:6	158:22
144:14	103:19	recalls		158:22
149:1	111:24	211:16	recessing	
196:13	119:3		60:1	records
197:4	129:20	receipt	112:21	118:16

	. IC COHHINOWO	OD 00 11 2013	1 age 347	01 300
119:20	63:6 66:4	regarding	147:4	5 70:1
120:8	223:5	34:16	regulation	109:7
271:10,20	231:10	58:25	201:16	147:24
,24	237:24	236:20		178:16
re-cross-	265:8	regardless	regulations	220:8
examinati	reflect	42:24	201:24	relationshi
on 183:13	19:22		reimbursing	ps 147:18
	47:24	regards	140:9	192:15
recruit	48:6	25:19	reinforces	
70:19	150:10	28:25	68:11	relatively
74:6	161:25	170:13		23:10,15
red 50:12	166:21	195:21	related	92:8
222:15	180:23	region	17 : 21	120:23
223:2,5,9	193:12	20:12	25:11 , 16	125:5
,12,15		126:24	57 : 14	relaxed
reduction	reflected	136:22	60:15	192:17
83:11	83:22	137:10	70:1	relay
	246:17	161:17	86:17	286:19
re-elected	reflecting	162:4	91:7 94:1	
41:4	94:13	regional	115:12	relayed
re-	154:10	17:23	123:8	295:15
examinati	184:22	21:24	125:10	relaying
on	237:9	25:23	144:5	291:13
183:1,8	reflection	27:16	171:19	relevance
298:24	185:5	144:7	174:4	66:13
		158:23,25	181:6	68:17
re-examine	reflects	159:6	189:22	190:22
180:8	157:16		190:10	
refer 68:2	refresh	register	192:23	relevant
144:7	246:21	123:2	196:16	104:8
194:22	refund	276:5,15,	198:10 244:25	149:21
reference	140:20	17		188:3
13:1,13	230:22,25	registered	relates	191:18
23:8	231:2,22,	84:9	54 : 15	194:13
121:18	25 232:3	123:5	83:18	relinquishi
193:23	236:1,3	124:8,10	131:1	ng
236:18	regard	Registrar	194:5	27:8,10,1
239:12	25:4,5	5:7 123:3	relating	2 28:23
252:11	29:2	246:9	73:24	30:11
referenced	50:13		193:8	reluctance
150:14	57:16	registratio	270:23	116:21,22
249:13	78:21	n	272 : 19	·
	85:13	122:24,25	relation	rely 16:12
referred	89:25	regular	209:5	189:14
67:24	123:6	53:11	223:23	246:6
102:2	181:7	56 : 21	244:13	remain
244:9	184:8	160:17		33:19
referring		200:19	relationshi	remained
51:10	regarded	regularly	p 39:25	31:1
62 : 22	31:12	49:23	43:6	
			44:3,12,1	remains

INQUIRY	re COLLINGWOC	D 06-14-2019	Page 350	OI 366
186:13,14	292:17	291:10	188:22	195:6
remarks	rental	renting	requested	respectful
184:25	140:17	134:23	120:12	173:23
202:12	227:7	135:10	231:21	195:18
remember	230:10,23	137:13	232:2	respectfull
6:18	232:6	231:14	required	y 194:2
47:25	233:9	232:10	90:20	_
49:24	234:2,6	280:8	127 : 2	respond
51:22	235:10	291:2		86:12
52:20,21,	244:19,25	293:22	requirement	100:1
24 53:18	270:18,23	294:12	191:5	110:22
57:24	272:19	repeat 7:17	requirement	111:1,4
100:6	277 : 8	58 : 4	s 81:21	184:23
158:2	286:17	219:1	research	187:23
168:24	290:3,20	repeating	16:8,11	responded
169:3	291:24	29:23	26:6	114:24
210:9	292:5	40:4	162:25	115:22
211:2,21	293:16			162:7
221:1	296:23	rephrase	researched	responding
226:19	rentals	36:23	88:20	86:14
229:6	274:4	replacing	reserve 7:2	100:3
240:5,8	289:13,15	137:10	residence	101:2
252:15	293:12	report	134:18	111:11
253:7	rented	35 : 20		112:13
257:6	131:17,19	120:4	residing	222:12
260:24,25	135:17		234:22	274:12
261:4,7	206:2	reporting	resources	responds
265:17	228:7	159:3	17 : 6	155:15
298:6	229:2,19	202:4	23:13,19	
remembered	232:19,25	reports	respect	response
173:24	249:7,11	123:9	15 : 10	57:23
280:18	273:6	199:10	145:8	60:20
reminds	275 : 6	representat	160:7	70:16
178:25	280:18	ions	193:16	100:14 131:8
	289:17	35 : 25	206:23	146:19
removed	290:3		207:4	186:8
84:6	renter	represented	219:13	190:5
rent 94:10	228:14,16	21:23	230:22	196:17
134:18,20	235:13,23	92:8	233:8	199:12
135:18,20	236:5	180:7 244:12	244:4	210:9
140:20	272:21	244.12	245:2	213:13
227:20	274:7	representin	248:15	241:21
232:13	277 : 4	g 5:15	249:6	252:17
237:5	293:22	21:3	279:20	
245:4,9	renters	180:20	288:23	responsibil
274:21	234:2,10	181:13,19	289:14	ities
275:11	276:14	196:3	291:6	24:15
280:5	289:17,24	request	295 : 25	responsibil
287 : 6	290:7	73 : 19	respected	ity 24:14

11000111	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	OD 00 14 2013	rage 331	01 300
123:11	retiring	243:23	132:3	67:8,22
responsible	18:3	roles	rural 144:7	68:18
23:13	retrieve	208:11	Ryan 2:20	70:3,8,17
37:10	248:4	roll 78:1	3:7,14	, 24
rest 62:15	return	178:15	40:19,22,	71:2,5,7,
217:3	234:14,17		23	15,17 72:10,21
		roll-out	41:1,4,7,	73:6,17,2
restricted	revenue	17:7	10,20,24	5
182:8	127:23	19:14	42:2,5,10	74:11,14
restrictive	review	roof 285:18	, 13 , 17 , 20	75 : 17
185:7	82:10	roofing	43:10,15,	76:13
result 7:3	209:1,3,5	91:14	18,21	77:1,6,11
32:10	210:18,21	room 30:9	44:2,5,13	78:4,12,2
33:15	212:7	90:25	,18,23	5
52:16	214:2	164:24	45:1,5,10	79:8,15,2
62 : 25	248:5 252:15	187:3	,23	0,25
80:24		190:25	46:5,11,1	80:3,7,10
81:20	reviewed	195:16	6,20,23	,16
180:24	18:1	rough	47:3,7,10	81:1,7,10
182:9	28:21	248 : 12	,14,17 48:4,14	,15
183:25	30:11		49:6,11,1	82:1,4,7,
185:2 186:2	153:23	roughly	9	12,25
187:11	161:9	126:15	50:3,6,16	83:10,20
291:13	revised	247:3	,21	84:2,5,12 ,21
	258:6	round	51:1,6,12	85:7,18
resuming	revisit	130:17,21	,18,25	86:8,18,2
60:2	181:20	,22 153:3	52:7,9,10	4
112:22 184:17	RFP 128:17	ru 223:23	,14,23	87:6,10,1
185:14	137:22	rule 61:6	53:14,19	5,22
	176:13,20		54:1,4,20	88:1,6,19
retail 18:3	,24	rules 72:17	, 25	,23
137:2	177:8,25	200:25	55:9,22	89:9,14,1
retain	207:3	rumour	56:3,7,10	9
171:14	215:6	222:17	,14 57:4,22	90:3,6,9,
retainer	217:19	223:20	58:5,12,1	12
143:21	218:11	rumours	4	91:2,18,2
retire	Rick 172:18	223:23	59:8,14,1	2 92:11,18,
75:19	riot 194:2	227 : 2	9,22	20,25
76:16		run 44:14	60:4,5,21	93:7,9,13
218:1	road 115:23	128:10	, 25	,21
219:12	116:5	130:9	61:16,19,	94:2,17,2
retired	role 5:17	133:15	24 62:13	1
211:23	8:1 28:6	136:11	63:2 , 25	95:5,10,1
	41:16	196:24	64:7,11,1	4 96:3,13
retirement	49:10	running	8,24	97:7,14,2
117:3 132:25	72:5,24	117:22	65:6,10,1	5
220:4	76:7 116:16	128:19	5 , 19	98:5,11,1
220.7	110.10	129:5	66:1 , 20	4,16,17,2
1	1			

	INQUINI	TE COLLINGWOO!	D 00-14-2019	rage 332	01 300
	3	125:13,17	156:2,6,1	15,19,22	29:1
	99:3,9,16	, 23	1,16	282:1,6,1	scanned
ı	, 22 , 25	126:13	157:1,5,8	0,13,17,2	240:9
ı	100:6,10,	127:6,15,	,20,25	4	
ı	13,22	18,22	158:14,20	283:5,11,	scanning
ı	101:1,6,1	128:2,7,1	159:2,10,	15,19,23	240:6
ı	0,14,19,2	6,23	14,18,23	284:3,9,1	scenario
ı	4	129:2,14,	160:1,5,1	1,20,24	35:16
ı	102:6,11,	23	0,19	285:5,11,	69:2
ı	17,20	130:12,16	161:1,3,1	16,21	schedule
ı	103:6,12,	,20,24	5 , 19	286:4	136:12
ı	16,22	131:4,9	162:5,15,		
ı	104:2,5,1	132:11,14	18,24	S	scheduled
	0,17,22	133:3,17	163:14,22	sake 29:23	19:24
ı	105:4,12,	134:2,12,	164:3,6,2	sale 5:18	55:15
ı	15,18,24	15,20,22	2	79:12	64:9
ı	106:2,5,1	135:8,23	165:1,10,	207:3	school
ı	0,13,20,2	136:2,16	13,20	215:5,13	132:20
ı	4	137:12,18	166:2,3,9	218:12,16	207:20
ı	107:7,24	,21,25	,14	,22 219:5	208:9,11,
	108:10,15	138:12,15	167:1,9,1	244:13	15
	,23	,18	4,17	263:13	scope 91:24
	109:10,14	139:11,15	168:12,17	264:1,11	210:18
ı	,19,22	,21	,23	266:18	
	110:2,10,	140:1,11,	169:20		score
	15,17,21,	19,23	170:18	sales	197:10
ı	25	141:10,16	171:1,5,2 3	86:3,4	scoring
ı	111:5,8,1 1,14,18,2	,20,24 142:1,5,9	172:1,5,8	103:3	14:15
	5	,12	,11,20,25	Sandra 2:13	Scotia
	112:11,16	143:15,18	173:3,6,9	Sarah 68:1	293:1
ı	113:5,6,9	,19,25	,14		
ı	,20	144:4,9,1	174:1,5,1	sarcasm	screen
ı	114:8,15,	5,18,23	1,16,19,2	55 : 7	101:12
	21	145:2,5,1	3	sat 6:8	252:19
ı	115:1,7,1	1,15,20,2	175:3,7,1	148:5	258:14 284:6
ı	4,20	3	0,22	satisfied	
ı	116:13,20	146:5,15,	176:5,12,	187:16,17	scroll
	117:6,24	20,23	19	save 10:20	10:14
ı	118:3,8,1	147:2,6,1	177:1,7,1	165:3	64:1
ı	3,18,25	2 148:2	2,16,20		65:20
ı	119:6,10,	149:6,16	178:7 , 22	saved 258:2	70:8 79:9
ı	19,23	150:21	179:14,18	saw 10:24	81:2
	120:17	151:10,16	, 25	91:3	82:8,25
ı	121:2,8,1	,23	278:12,16	258:11,25	83:1 85:1
	6,21,24	152:2,9,1	,21,22,23	259:7	94:2
	122:3,9,1	4,18	279:2,5,8	270:4	101:24 102:12
	3 , 17	153:4,9,1	,10,14,23	scale 26:19	
	123:20	4,18,25	280:3,11,	27:2,7,11	110:18
	124:4,7,1	154:7	15,20,22	,13 28:23	158:20
	2,23	155:16,22	281:4,12,	,10 20.20	100.20
-					

	. IC CODDINGWO			01 300
205:2	secure 26:7	8:8,13,18	semi-	164:20
206:16,21	69:21	11:3	retiremen	166:25
208:23	securing	13:20,25	t 132:25	172 : 4
209:14	_	42:5		182:7
221:15,21	172:16	72:16	send 59:10	195:13
,24	seeing	77:5 78:9	67:3 , 25	208:5
222:8,24	20:14	84:23	71:21	216:22
240:10	86:16	85 : 19	123:24	217 : 12
270:1	102:5	86:11	152 : 16	219:22
279:24	173:7	93:3	160:24	226:24
284:3	250:13	101:5,7	213:15	240:16
	268:24	112:12	223:18	289:4
scrolling	seek	127:9,19	235:5	
207:1		138:9	238:5	sensitive
222:9	63:18,19	150:14	258:6	154:23
se 53:4	143:7	152:5	289:14	155 : 7
searches	seeking	173:10	290:24	171 : 18
	88:11	175:10	sending	178:5
129:20	seem 72:7	177:11	70:22	199:5
season	93:22,25	187:6	72:22	200:21
131:23	101:11	199:10	73:1	201:20
135:19	122:1	220:11,14	123:16	sensitiviti
275:6	190:4	239:21,24	211:18	es 25:19
second 25:7	191:15	250:9,18	212:6	
64:16	199:3	267:5	213:17	sensitivity
70:25	290:19	269:6,16,	250:13	35:17,21
94:8		19 279:15	285:22	186:4
98:21	seemed 8:10			192:24
192:18	21:20	seldom	sends	sent 52:16
198:12	22:11,21	230:4	209:10	60:19
244:21	148:25	236:2	senior	61:25
246:3	163:8	selected	23:13	70:19
	186:24	51 : 3	24:19	71:5 82:2
secretary	187:16	selection	123:25	84:23
41:14	193:6		147:25	86:3,10
207:20,22	200:3	51:10,11, 15	174:21	93:10
208:1	285:6,12,	13	sense 5:20	101:11
secretary's	24 287:11	sell 5:25	8:15	102:14,17
41:16	seems 31:10	9:1 96:20	21:25	152:3,6
section	44:23	97 : 1	22:15,22	208:24
158:17	52:15	145:13	24:5	209:17,21
165:3	59:9	147:13	25:16	,24
188:2	82 : 22	237:11	61:4	210:2,7
206:19	84:22	selling	77:21	212:6
	87:18	11:19	78:3	213:10,21
sector	93:14		86:23	214:1,11
75:25	110:3	semantics	87:14 , 16	225:11
76:1	111:25	41:15	104:25	238:24
89:11,20,	112:2,5	191:15	111:22	239:3
23 124:19	113:10	seminar	127:23	240:1,3
174:22	seen	193 : 18	127:23	243:17
	26611		120.3,24	

	. ie collingwoc		rage 334	<u> </u>
248:2	61:12	86:21	shares 43:9	2,19,22
250:11,15	served	237:12	sharing	205:6,11,
, 17	40:24	several	20:18	18 , 23
252:13	40.24	32:13		206:1,6,9
253:21	serves	42:3	29:1,8	,14
254:16	179:22		34:17	207:18,24
255:16	service	54:19,23	56:24	208:2,7,1
258:21	26:19	58:10	61:7	2,16,19
269:3	27:1 29:4	75:21	80:13	209:7,12,
290:3	30:8	170:17	83:24	19,22
294:20	34:20,21	270 : 22	84:3	210:1,5,6
295:7	119:4	share 5:18	85:22	,10,15,20
	143:20	8:12	93:15	,24
sentence	147:19	50:15	99:11,15	211:3,6,9
64:15		77:21	104:18	,13,21
209:1	services	79:16	105:1,6	212:4,8,1
227:21	19:22	80:19	106:18	4,23
240:19	20:18	103:9	107:12,17	213:4,9,1
241:4	23:24	116:1	,18	4,18,22
243:10	24:21	148:13,16	108:8,17	214:3,13,
separate	26:11	150:1	109:5	18
72:24	29:8,13	155:3,4	112:3	215:8,16,
Contombon	34:17	167:10	115:9	20,24
September	119:5	168:10	150 : 7	216:3,7,9
47:11,20 48:2 79:5	132:14,21	189:6	154:24	,12,19
	136:11	shared	166:20	217:1,9,1
82:2,20	144:16	17:12	171:18	4,20
87:7 93:10	servicing		201:20	218:2,7,1
101:15	31:11	22:10 26:11	240:24	3,18
101:13		109:15	She'd	219:1,8,1
112:1	session	148:25	130:21	6
129:25	215:6	151:19	sheets	220:1,6,9
152:3	261:14	158:11		,18,23
153:16	262:12	162:12	246:6	221:1,5,1
157:11	263:24	163:3	she'll	2 222:1
158:16	sets 99:4	166:23	132:17	223:3,7,1
178:24	105:6		222 : 7	1,16,19,2
236:22	234:5	shareholder	she's	5
246:25	245:22	6:16	133:15,25	224:11,15
267:9,10,	setting	28:14	222:11	,21
14	73:20	31:19,24	ah: ft	225:1,5,8
268:7,17	96:4	32:2,8,13	shift	,13,17,21
	149:8	35:5	115:11	226:1,6,1
series		39:14,18	Shirley	3,18,22
46:1,12	seven 23:9	40:1	3:11	227:1,5
233:25	29:12	43:3,4	118:5	228:2,6,1
serious	199:8	84:1	138:22	1,16,19,2
116:16,23	seventeen	shareholder	140:12,14	3
117:10	30:20	s 42:23	, 19	229:4,8,1
serve 28:12	seventy-	43:12	203:2,17	3,22
	five 35:1		204:3,7,1	230:2,12,

INQUIR	I LE COLLINGWOO	JD 00-14-2019	rage 333	01 300
16,20,24	256:1,3,9	280:1,10,	31:3	23:17
231:3,7,1	,12,15,19	13,19,21,	32:24	51 : 22
1,15,19,2	,22,25	25	39:23	66:14
3,24	257:5,8,1	281:8,13,		73:5 91:8
232:4,7,1	1,16,21	18,21,25	showing	92:13,17
1,16,20	258:1,4,8	282:4,8,1	10:6	115:2,6,1
233:2,6,1	,15,18,23	2,16,23	120:15	9 117:5
0,14	259:4,8,1	283:3,9,1	250:15,16	123:1,11
234:11,16	4,16,21,2	3,18,22	270:23	133:10,11
,19,25	4	284:8,10,	shown 30:24	148:20
235:6,18,	260:3,7,1	19,23	35 : 4	196:15
24	0,15,21	285:2,8,1	86:20	201:17
236:7,9,1	261:2,5,8	4,17	88:10	
4	,11,18	286:1,23	118:17	significant
237:20,25	262:13,16	287:2,19	146:2	ly 25:13
238:3,7,1	,18,22	288:1,7,1		32 : 8
5,19,25	263:2,9,1	0,20	shows 20:22	signing
239:5,9,2	2,17,20,2	289:1,6,1	32:20	81:20
1,25	3	1,19,23	65:5	87 : 18
240:5,10,	264:3,8,1	290:5,9,1	79:11	
19			83:1,3	signs
241:1,5,1	2,16,21,2 4	2,16,22	121:22	191:13
0,13,18,2	265:7,19	291:1,8,1	187:14	Simcoe-Grey
2	266:9,14,	5,20,25	243:15	41:2
242:1,7,1	200.9,14,	292:3,7,1 2,15,21,2	shut 184:3	similar
6,20,22	267:5,17	5	si 115:17	9:14
243:1,5,8	268:19,23	293:6,17,		23:16
,21,25	269:5,9,1	21,25	sibling	24:5 30:3
244:6	3,18,25	294:4,9,1	62:25	37:21
245:3,11,	270:5,11,	1,21,24	68:13	58:9 83:3
15	14,25	295:3,9,1	187:13	106:8
246:5,13,	271:4,11,	2,17,21	sibling's	122:11
18,22	14,18,21,	296:1,11,	59:1	234:7
247:5,10,	25	14,18	sic 60:13	
15,18,22	272:3,6,9	297:1,5,8		similarly
248:17,22	,16,20,25	,13,17,25	sides 27:23	112:12
249:2,5,1	273:8,11,	298:4,9,1	sidetracked	144:24
0,16,21	16,19,23	3	129:15	160:5
250:8,12,	274:2,6,1	_	a i ab b	176:13
18,23	3,17,23	short 50:5	sight	simple
251:2,7,1	275:1,5,1	139:19	104:12	37 : 18
5,19	0,13,17,2	145:13	240:23	94:23
252:16,20	0,23	195:19	signatories	96:8
,25	276:2,8,1	197:13	175 : 17	140:18
253:6,11,	3,16,24	shortly	194:16	Simplicity
17,22	277:2,5,1	60:10	signed	93:2
254:1,5,8	0,14,16,2	152 : 12	150:13	
,11,14,17	0,24	showed	194:14,20	simply 9:4
,21	278:4	15 : 25		10:7
255:2,8,1	279:1,4,7	21:2	significant	24:14
2,15,21	,9,12,21	30:25	8:16	34:4,7
		50.20	14:13	36 : 6

INQUIN	I LE COLLINGWOO)D 00 14 2013	rage 330	01 300
47:25	198:1	72:12,20	177:15	64 : 15
49:3	six 124:20	79:13	187:20	65:1 70:9
54:13		88:11	197:17	71:1,8
61:8	202:7	196:16	198:18	78 : 20
180:18	208:8	197:9,15,	273:14	86:16
295:15	sixty-six	20	281:19	95 : 22
	34:19	207:4,5		102:12
singling	size 21:21	219:13	somehow	110:16,25
146:11	22:13	236:20	96:15	130:5
singularity	24:2 30:3	242:5,25	113:23	142:21
27:13		243:18	166:22	143:13
30:13	sized	244:5,14	196:11	159:22
sink 16:10	128:5,7	245:2	197:9	168:15
SINK 10:10	slices	250:1,4	someone	195:5
sir 121:9	77:16	251:5,11	290:7	203:7
179:19		260:11	+ 1 1 -	
251:25	slide 6:9		something's	212:14,16
sister	10:23	sold 32:7	216:14	212:14,16
67:19	slight	95:18	sometime	221:10
145:25	83:10	96:7 99:6	63:9	224:15
146:7,12	109:4	sole-source	88:17	234:16
229:5	small 21:19	32 : 7	231:17	236:24,25
			283:13	230:24,23
sit 23:7,9	23:10,15	solicit	296:9	246:19
94:9	24:6 36:1	72:4	297:3	253:3
150:11	92:9 117:22	soliciting	somewhat	254:10,11
167:4	120:23	100:17,19	14:14	256:11
237:4	120:23	solicitor	15:18	265:7,15,
sitting	128:3	62:6,14	28:20	203.7,13,
53:12	192:14	63:24	48:12	267:9,17,
54:7			125:1	20 271:13
57:21	201:23	solidify		275:1,15
107:15	222:21	161:16	somewhere	279:20,25
133:15	232:12	162:4	40:2	287:14
151:14	smaller	solution	137:3	
154:1	23:6	38:25	184:3	sort 17:19
185:23	25 : 20	39:2	227 : 25	21:20
189:5	27:16	72:20	Sophisticat	44:9,14
196:4	28:20	Solutions	ed 174:20	69:14
243:9	201:23	207:5	sorry 5:6	73:19
situation	smoke		_	79:12
34:4 48:1	234:21	somebody	7:6,12,16	91:16
62:10		75:24	16:20	98:8
75:6	social 44:3	76:2,21	20:23	122:11
138:25	211:17	81:4,8	26:21 29:19	124:3,24
183:9,22	220:12,21	113:2	36:15	127:4
199:14	221:7	120:24	38:19	129:12
274:21	socialize	127:4	39:7	130:2,4
281:14	56:20	149:3	42:19	135:16
	147:4	159:11,14	42:19	137:13,22
situations	solar 71:24	, 19	49:20 57:1	144:11
138:9		162:12	J / • 1	149:13
1			i l	1

INQUIRY	re COLLINGWOO)D 06-14-2019	Page 35/	OI 366
161:6	180:19	197:19	49:14	100:17
167:21	191:2	198:11	58 : 16	234:9
169:21	200:17	268:11	63 : 25	
172:19	203:21		64 : 1	standing
175:11	206:19	specificall	65 : 11	192:11
178:16	209:24	y 16:13	89:3	277 : 21
180:12	213:23	136:6	157:21	STANDS
186:5,24	219:6	154:22	160:4	202:22
190:3,24	231:24	157 : 14	168:16	299:3
190:2	244:3	170:25	171:21	
234:9,24		172:12	189:12	start 5:19
235:5	speaking	173:22	236:12	111:6
276:11	13:1,15	189:1,8	254:3	131:11
	14:20	197:21	254:3	184:20
284:17	22:9 73:2	226:9	spoken	234:5
285:22	156:13,20	specifying	13:3,8	started
sorts	162:11,13	42:21	189:18	20:7
132:12	163:7		206:17	48:15
sought 27:3	188:14	speculate	220:5	88:10,16
236:1,3	211:16	33:17	spread	185:4
230:1,3	233:11	speculating	282:19	
sound	235:1,7	170:10	282:19	starting
124:21	258:9		spring	115:11
145:12		speculative	140:2,4,5	starts 94:5
sounds	special	14:25	230:9	240:20
195:19	186:25	speech	236:8	284:6
284:21	specific	142:5,7	st 47:3	state 70:11
	17:18,22		193:4	132:7
source	25:11	spell 69:8		149:25
126:10	55:4	spelling	<pre>stable 31:1</pre>	155:5
156:8	62:21	255 : 19	staff 16:12	
157:10	63:12	spend 55:13	123:17	187:5
sources	66:18	193:13	124:2,16	197:4
9:13	67 : 15	202:6	147 : 25	219:18
149:12	69:10,23,	202.0	160:7	stated
154 : 9	25 109:8	spending	177:14	68:24
155:9	111:21	199:15	188:1	70:22
157:19,22	121:15	spent	193:10	88:10
·	123:12	132:19	201:19	116:25
south	126:19	195:14		147:17
131:16,22	129:9	197:14	stage 71:12	245:24
135:16	133:1	220:11	stakeholder	statement
136:22	147:16		s 149:5	
speak 6:13	158:11	spin 165:7		11:4
13:14	164:21	splitting	stand	12:4,9
72:15	171:19	96:15	111:22	15:5,11
78 : 23	172:6	113:11	113:19	79:4,9,17
110:6	174:4		149:22	80:21
114:14	188:22	spoke	standalone	82:16,19
140:14	190:20	22:14,19	32:10,15	83:4,6
176 : 10	194:24	25:15	42:19	84:7
179:4	196:21	29:20	standard	86:25
	100.21	34:19	Standard	92:2 95:9
i l				

1112011(1	. IC CODDINGNO	OD 00 14 2019	rage 330	01 300
110:1	251:3	30:14	255 : 3	91:1
121:17	sticks	143:23	subject	sudden 8:19
128:22	169:14	144:5,8	73:18	33:25
143:1		Street 1:19	93:2	
145:1	stood		263:7	suggest
165:9	160:18	strength	264:1	9:12 29:6
251:12	stop 52:6	132:18		32:7 , 12
279:3	69:2	stressful	submission	37:9
281:3	70:10,24	24:1	51:13	45:13
statements	95:2		submissions	63:3 , 5
93:16	141:5,17,	strictly	182 : 16	74:6
120:15	20 153:25	16:12		83:25
	183:2,6	string	submit	90:23
121:19	247:8	78 : 17	27 : 17	93:22
127:25		a+man a	76:23	113:13
states	stores	strong 21:15	211:11	114:9,10,
11:12	91:14		submitted	22
stating	straight	29 : 5 38:23	51 : 14	179:19,22
187:20	103:20			197:8
	267:1	167:25	subse	suggested
status 9:15		192:15	189:15	9:7 58:19
24:10	strange	stronger	subsequent	71:20
33:10,14,	285:22	113:3	14:18	75:16
19	strategic	structural	41:18	117:14
36:9,16,2	5:22	28:18	61 : 12	140:13
0,25	26:17	20.10	63:4	150:4
37:2,9,11	35:4	structure	88:16	191:22
,15,25	45:14,18,	11:23	subsequentl	
38:3,8,12	20 148:18	15 : 25	y 60:18	203:11
, 24	158:4	23:16,22	y 60.18 69:7	230:8
39:1,3,11	159:12 , 15	29:20	85:16	
,16 40:7	, 19	89:3	190:13	suggesting
stay 127:5	161:22	115:12	213:25	18:2
229:1,4	162:6,11	structured		71:11
232:8	165:7	21:24	substantial	74:17 , 25
	166:6,12	42:25	32 : 6	75:4 , 19
stayed 26:3	167:19	125 : 19	39:23	76:15
124:19	169:9		success	77:2,7,25
134:13	171:22	struggling	14:6,12,1	78:5 , 10
139:24	175:19	68:15	3,21	109:4
229:11	193:19	69:13	33:12	113:23
staying	198:23	STT 47:12	34 : 17	191:14
76:7	199:21	159:5	35 : 13	suggestion
228:21	259:1	164:10	176:14	188:25
steam 129:6	strategy	178:25		
	5:23	stuck 274:8	successful	suggests
Stec 126:3	6:2,17		15:13	64:13
step 72:5	9:7	stuff 8:7	16:15	85:21
190:18	17:2,19	130:10	19:17	195:9
	19:13,14	138:5,23	28:5	summary
stepping	20:3 28:5	234:20	39:13	206:17
	20.3 20.3	246:8		
•				

INQUIRI	Te COLLINGWOO	00-14-2019	rage 339	01 300
244:8	134:4	64:10	210:12	187:4
summation	135:23	sustainable	253:3	195 : 15
162:22	158:2	22:25	talk 58:8	222:6
102.22	161:23	23:2	88:2	261:11 , 13
summer	169:24	24:9,12,1	110:11	287:5,8,1
131:11	171:13,14	5,17	111:15	3 291:3
Sunday	176:12	J, 1/	130:5	talks
138:11	179:21	switch 20:2	140:23	110:13
	184:3	swore		
suppliers	185:11	279:11	159:18	158:2
121:4	190:5	280:23	193:20	222:13
supply	203:5	281:4,6	194:4	tangent
207:19,22	221:22	·	208:23	142:15
208:1	229:19	sworn	216:23	target
	233:24	3:5,11	217:8	21:14
support	235:18	5:11	252:13	55:20
6:23 9:9	262:3	203:17	260:22	57:11
11:9 25:7	265:9	249:20	265:3	
29:11,21	269:7	278 : 25	288:4	targeted
68:20	277:12	279:3	291:4	20:3 28:7
122:21	278:14	synergies	talked	task
164:13	287:15	22:1,21	15 : 16	45:14,18,
179:23			26:3	20 148:18
188:8	surprise	system	29:17	154 : 14
supported	22:17	123:1	124:23	157:15,17
13:21	31:12	177:25	140:25	158:4
supports	217:17		146:23	159:12,19
188:11	263:22	T	188:24	160:4
	264:2	table 3:1	220:13	161:22
supposed	surprised	57 : 21	290:19	162:6,12
177:15	22:4,19	118:4	296:21	165 : 7
255:10	31:13	121:17	talking	166:6,12
278:10	54 : 12	129:24	29 : 25	167 : 19
sure 16:6	175 : 16	153:3	30:6	171 : 22
20:9	201:6	196:4	45 : 25	175:20
33:22	209:20	245:21,22	46:18	193:25
46:3 49:9	226:25	,24	52:11,25	tasked
52 : 7	248:14	takeaway	55:23	123:10
60:25	267:24	164:19	60:6	123:10
70:22	surrounding	167:24	62 : 17	tasks 133:2
75:2	53:4	170:13	103:13	tax 84:12
76:18	153:1		108:8	120:3,6,1
82:18		taking	113:10	3
88:19	suspect	17:13	128:24	
90:15	40:10	30:8 48:8	129:2	taxes 120:7
104:7	49:4	77:20	148:22	TB 243:14
106:6	54:19	98:6	150:1	TB/EH-PB/PB
107:5	55:5	117:21	156:3	105:9
113:1	56:19	169:3	164:15	
123:8	59:3	179:9	175:13	TB/PB 103:2
132:17	63:22	184:10	186:23	TBEH 240:25
		198:13		

	. Te COLLINGWO	02 00 11 2015		01 300
teaching	232:6	80:10	35 : 11	there'll
124:21	249:12	131:1	40:14,19	175:23
193:17	terminated	134:17	51:25	
		135:9	79:10,21	thereof
team	19:22	150:23	83:2 94:4	17 : 20
45:14,18,	termit	152:3,15	113:8	there's
20 148:18	117:2	166:4,10	143:6,12,	27 : 15
150:4	terms 14:13	167:23	15 179:25	29:1,5
154:14	16:5	211:15	184:2,14	32 : 6
157:15,17		280:15	185:9,18	34:14
158:4	17:20	281:16,22	200:10	37 : 14
159:12,20	22:13	282:25	202:18,20	38:23 , 25
160:4	23:23	283:5	203:15	39:22
161:22	25:7,10,2		208:22	55 : 16
162:7,12	3 29:3	Testifies	225:11	62 : 8
165:7	32:1 39:6	3:9	229:24	77 : 25
166:6,12	43:2	185 : 21	236:24	78 : 12
167:19	50:12	testify	261:23	83:21
171:22	68:12	138:4	261:23	100:22
175:20	72:1	167:19		101:1
189:1	77:25		267:1,11	102:3
193:25	88:12	testifying	278:6,7	105:5
technical	110:8	182:11	286:4,11	111:6
23:23	115:11	testimony	288:22	114:18
74:2	116:4,7	9:5	290:19	123:2
	133:11	14:10,16	293:7	139:2
telephone	139:2	18:1	294:13	149:2
49:14	141:14	23:25	296:20	157:22
136:12	171 : 12	37 : 6	297:19	170:8
173:4	172:15	48:19	298:20,22	173:1,20
television	173:23	50:19	, 25	180:20
8:6	178:14	53 : 3	thanks	198:9
	179:7	117:13	61 : 2,7	
ten 59:24	183:19	146:2	141:7	202:10
98:9	185:24	155:2	theirs	205:2
112:19	187:2	179:7	48:20	213:5
115:23	190:9	180:23	48:20	246:24
128:24	194:22	182:23	theme	247:24
247:3	197:25	186:10,17	186:7,9	264:17
248:16	198:23	187:2	themselves	270:22
299:6	217:24	188:12	37:13	272:1
tended	218:6	189:15	169:16	277:12
57:20	245:1	192:23		288:2
	275:19,22	193:22	thereafter	they're
tense	testified	196:18	88:18	28:12
106:23	44:19		152 : 13	37 : 12
term 6:17	45:2	text	there'd 6:5	39:2
127:1	49:13	223:5,9,1	therefore	113:3
129:9,13	52:15	5		120:23
187:9	56:5	thank 5:6	63:8	127:13
200:13	57:23	12:22	260:17	128:22
224:3	60:8	14:4 31:6	272:11,18	130:16
	00.0			

158:13 171:16	201:7 throw	32:16,24 33:3	237:2	town 1:2,17
	throw	33.3	000 04	,
		J3:3	280:24	2:19
180:16	197:12	34:2,10,1	281:16	14:7,23
181:12	199:3	6 , 24	282:21	15 : 5
182:6		35:3,11	283:6,7,1	40:24
191:22	thrust	36:8,12,2	6 299:6	178:14
they've	263:5	2,23	Tom 94:25	179:24
84:6	Thursday	37:19 , 25	95:2,7,8	191:24
	81:22	38:7,16,1	106:17	192:15
third 65:21	138:10	7	107:16	194:14
185:25	tie 74:25	39:4,7,10	108:1	201:23
199:2		40:3,6,12		222:21
276:4	tier 25:8	Timothy	top 23:16	278:23
thirteen	Tillsonburg	2:15	83:22	Town's 62:6
291:23	30:21		89:23	63:23
thirty 7:1		titled	101:12	194:3
39:24	Tim 3:6	295:2	206:16	
86:20	5:5,13,14	TOC0060090	258:13	trade
204:23	, 15	4:3	271:6,17	112:25
204:23	6:4,14,20	TOC0060091	276:6 , 22	traditional
252:14	7:4,14,18	4:4	topic	ly 135:17
255:25	,21,22 8:24		52:2,5	trailer
256:4		TOC0249903.	55 : 20	137:11
	9:6,24 10:10,13,	0001 4:7	topics	
thirty-one	14,18	TOC249903.1	10:11	train 59:12
117:8	12:22	221:15		83:17
Thomas 47:4	13:12,13,	TOC399870.1	Toronto	91:16
thoughts	18,24	249:23	126:25	110:7
226:14	14:4		144:20,21	287:14
	15:2,12,1	TOC49530	total	transaction
thousand	9	70:4	79:19,20	107:6
33:4,6	16:16,22	TOC59013	128:10	145:8
34:20	17:4,11,2	158 : 15	totally	189:8
35:1	5 18:7,23	TOC59599	78 : 2	199:1,16
86:21	19:11,12	92:21	135:24	223:24
137:3	20:1,13,2			224:2,14
206:24	1	TOC60090	touch 43:21	225:24
293:18	21:1,5,12	81:2	touched	transaction
three-fifty	22:3,16,2	TOC60091	134:16	s 107:22
204:24	3 24:8,22	82:13	Tough	132:4
205:3,16	25:24	TOC65379	183:11	
three-year	26:9,16,2	101:20		transcribed
274 : 25	3	266:3	tournament	11:5
275 : 2	27:6,11,2		83:19	transcript
	4 28:4,21	today 37:4	towards	3 : 23
throughout	29:9,16	80:17	22:15	12 : 18
14:11	30:10,19,	119:12	23:5	14:3 15:6
20:12	23	147:3	38:12	195:8
93:8 148:18	31:6,14,1	154:1	50 : 25	200:14
140:18	8	203:5	51 : 2	203:22
		230:5		

INQUIRY	re COLLINGWOC)D 06-14-2019	Page 362	OI 366
254 : 7	truth	82 : 2	131:18,19	121:9
transcripts	195:11	138:10	135:19,20	133:4
150:24	4	turn 148:2	136:8	135:24
150:24	try		138:6	148:21
transition	43:14,17	158:1	180:7,22	153:19
76:12,22	73:2	219:3	181 : 12	154:12
126:8,9	75 : 13	261:15	194:16	160:19
132:4	134:10	turned	243:6	162:3
transitione	136:13	223:9		167:20
d	139:3	271:9	typographic	171:4,6,7
	148:23	272:12,14	al 279:16	173:18
124:18,20	151 : 13	Mumping.		175:15
transpire	157 : 23	Turning	U	176:16,17
139:1	160:17	238:21	ultimately	177:5,17
transpired	169:19	turns 8:17	47 : 4	178:1,8
8:6 16:5	178:1	twelve	86 : 19	182:21
70:2	184:6,11	27:19		191:1
	198:3	29:24	unable	199:21
transposed	203:21	121:25	52 : 17	
204:20	227:25	121.23	unanimous	201:11
transpositi	262:3	twenty	6:23 7:23	204:8
on	trying 9:25	118:10,16		229:18
279:15,22	28:16	237:14,16	unaware	233:7
,24	45:17	twenty-five	166:16	241:4,15
	46:6 53:3	6 : 25	unclear	254:24
treated	57:9	118:15	182:10,12	256:5
73:13	70:19		uncomfortab	257:13
treating	70:19	twenty-four	le 117:15	279:3
126:11	75:2	29:12	189:6	280:7,17
	76:21	twice		281:5
trends 23:4		139:14	undergoing	284:14
trepidation	77:15	230:6	217:19	understandi
25:16	91:16 98:8	269:14	understand	ng 6:13
tried 38:11		.	5:8 9:25	19:6 25:1
55:6	114:9	two-year	16 : 23	27:5
147:23	115:13	18:13	27:10,21	28:11
152:22	117:1	19:19,25	35:10	46:22
	121:8	type 14:24	38:13	47:5 57:8
182:25	123:22	275:15	46:6,24	62 : 23
198:8	129:11,17	277 : 25	49:1	63 : 15
282:14	137:7,9	278:3	52:23	73:10,12
trouble	145:12	typed 235:2	56:20	74:2
53:10	146:3	275:15,18	70:18	80:15
true 226:2	150:18	277:13,18	71:14	90:16
	151:20	2//•1	75:24	109:11
trust	162:3	types 23:16	77:22	118:20
39:13,18	171:6,7,1	typically	88:3	148:25
trusted	1,15	118:22	96:23	154:6,16
147:23	179:23	120:1,21	105:25	162:19
	196:7	126:7,9	103:23	189:11
trusting	284:15	128:22	117:6,11	190:9
192:18	Tuesday	129:6	117:6,11	193:9,10
	_	127.U	1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1	10.0,10

	1			
202:1	unfolded	unto 37:12		21:19
218:5	198:1	upcoming	V	varying
224:6,18	unfolding	227:20	vaca 222:6	193:10
228:14,18	8:4	235:23	vacation	
232:2			222:6	vendor
253:24	unfolds	update	230:22	177:21
278:19	6:17	234:18	296:19	vent 71:24
281:23	unfortunate	uphill		72:12
understands	190:7	164:2	vague 66:17	88:11
77:18	220:16	upon 5:1	Vaguely	196:16
190:1	unfortunate	59 : 13	34:23	197:9,15,
195:2	ly 138:25	60:1,2	valuations	21 236:20
	274:7	112:21,22	14:15	242:25
understood		184:16,17		243:18
9:14	unhear	185:5,13,	value 29:4	250:1,4
14:10 66:22	152:24	14 299:9	32:9,14	251:5
	uni 237:17		38:1,4	vents 79:13
68:2 78:21		upwards	75:23	207:4
91:11	uniqueness	203:12	91:11	219:13
92:2	14:13	usual	158:24	242:5
95:11	unit 94:13	288:25	181:23	244:5,14
103:17	95:18	291:6	189:25	245:2
110:4	96:7 97:3	usually	Vanier	251 : 11
116:20	99:6	216:13	207:20	
161:21	237:8,14,	270:15	variation	venture
164:1	17	289:1,5	110:11	73:4
165:8	units 96:20	291:10		115:8,19
177:2	237:11		variety	285:4
196:22		usurp	41:24,25	verbal
216:21	unless	28:6,16	89:15	187 : 25
241:15	73:15 80:20	30:15	122:22	Verbatim
	202:12	usurps 28:9	various 6:8	169:1
undertake		utilities	7:1 8:19	
210:19	unlike	2:7 36:12	9:12	Veridian
underway	290:7	94:10	20:11	152:5
191:5	unpack	237:6,13	22:21	155:24 165:3
undisclosed	133:3	•	26:8	170:20,24
117:9	unnnagadant	utility 9:2	• = 3	
	unprecedent ed 14:14	11:19	35:24	Veridian's
unduly	ea 14:14	27:12	42:13	172:19
185:7	unread	30:12	46:13	version
uneducated	152:24	38:2 40:2	57:12	82:16
23:25	unrelated	217:2	63:15	versus 9:21
unfair	68:20	285:4 297:21	149:4	25:11
48:19	163:19		186:3	27:16
182:7	195:15	utilized	190:1,3	34:1 66:8
	unsolicited	157 : 23	192:6,25	67:18
unfold	68:10	utilizing	196:2,5	72:9
80:15		140:8	various-	74:10
191:16	unsure 19:8		sized	77:16
				, , , 10

INQUINI	ie collingwo	JD 00-14-2013	Page 304	01 300
115:13	voting	250:17	266:5,6,1	wee 240:11
126:12	16:1,18	266:16	1,15,25	270:6
199:14	10.1,10	283:4,7	267:11,13	
237:21		290:23	,14,19	week 56:19
	W		268:4,8,1	101:17
vet 191:10	wade 84:13	watch 7:10	2,15,16,2	1.54:11
vets	wages 30:1	8 : 5	1,25	262:18
191:11,12	_	281:17		282:14
	wait 216:14	watched 6:8	269:7,11,	289:4
via 76:20	walk 187:25		15,21	weekends
111:4	11	watching	270:2,7,1	134:11
138:5	walking	32 : 5	2,17	
viable	197:23	Watson 2:7	271:1,5,1	
36:10,20	warrants	3 : 13	3,15,19,2	71:18
37:3	179:16	57 : 24	3	148:6
73:3,4	wasn't 9:3	252:3,4,7	272:1,4,7	100.12
	12:4,8	,8,9,22,2	,10,17,22	1
view	· ·	3	273:2,9,1	200.11
6:16,17	14:7,25	253:1,9,1	2,17,20,2	291:2
8:4 13:20	15:3,5	4,19,23	4	week's
192:21	16:2,4,14	254:2,6,9	274:3,9,1	296:19
viewed 48:9	18:18	,13,15,18	5,18,24	
68:9	20:14	,23	275:3,7,1	we'll 12:12
169:4	21:9 23:2	255:5,9,1	2,14,18,2	13:10
	24:9,12	3,20,24	1 , 25	16:9
vigour	27:24	256:2,5,1	276:3,10,	40:16
97:25	32:16		14,19,25	52:5
villa's	40:7 42:8	0,13,16,2	277:3,7,1	71:15,17
234:21	53:4,24	0,23	1,15,17,2	79:1
visibility	55 : 15	257:2,6,1	2 278:2,5	107:9
243:23	62:14	0,13,18,2	294:19	111:5
243:23	66:13	3	295:13	134:4
vision	90:18	258:2,5,1	waving	165:23
15:22	116:2	0,16,19,2	115:25	205:15
28:9	117:19	5	116:4	262:3
visit	126:1,20	259:6,12,	110:4	265:3
233:12	133:7	15,18,22,	ways 122:22	well-
291:22	140:6,8,1	25	297:20	
	8 146:3	260:4,8,1	weak 21:15	connected
visited	150:6	2,16,22		89:20
236:2	155 : 7	261:3,6,9	weaknesses	well-
visiting	157:14	,13,20,22	197:1	organized
222:13	159:4	, 25	website	21:6
	162:11	262:1,8,1	246:9	Monde
volunteer	163:16	4,17,20,2		Wendy
196:2	178:5	5	we'd 8:7	299:15
vote 6:21	184:10	263:4,10,	78:16	we're 30:17
7:23	188:17,20	14,18,21,	128:21	45:25
8:1,17,20	, 21	25	285:18	61:15
18:12	216:23	264:5,9,1	Wednesday	98:9
	233:8	4,19,22	138:10	99:14
votes 8:21	247:5	265:1,9,1	271 : 3	106:8
57:15		5 , 22		
1	i		Ī	Ī

125:5	279:14,15	235:4	249:18	215:19
199:15	293:11	244:24	252:2	216:4,24
241:21,22		284:16	266:2	217:8,13,
265:16	whatever	296:22	298:20	25 244 : 18
268:17	117:8	298:6	299:3	246:11,16
278:10	121:11			247:6,7,1
286:2,3	182:12	whichever	witnessed	4,17,20
1	193:19	194:21	8:10	248:16,18
west 200:15	whatsoever	whoever	witnesses	,20,23,24
we've 12:13	264:10	17 : 13	141:9	249:4
14:16	277:19	whole 10:20	150:22	253:5,7
25:15			196:19	287:11
39:19	wheelhouse	96:2		298:1
42:5 46:6	137:22	248:13	wonder	
63:19	whenever	whom 36:11	222:21	worked
64:21	122:5	uho la	285:12	42:14
84:23	1 1.	who's	wondered	43:7
85:19	whereby	202:24	7:4,25	89:24
85:19	140:15	252:3	·	107:1,5,1
	whether	268:5	wondering	3,19,21,2
111:16	8:20	278:10	216:25	3
113:22	12:12	285 : 22	217:6	108:7,24
114:16	18:21	Whose 272:4	227 : 2	132:20
119:21,22	33:13		297:20	207:22
120:21	35:17	wife 101:11	Woodworth	207:22
121:6	37:15,16	110:19,24	299:15	246:7
127:9,19	42:22,23	wild 200:15		240.7
129:15	43:11		wording	working
140:25	57:14	William	58:18	18:3 33:8
141:10		2:19	work 9:25	39 : 25
148:6,17	61:5	window	22:2	42:22
149:19	64:20	133:24	30:15	43:6
150:3	69:22	134:9	54:11	44:15
152:5	83:21	135:3	58:22	61:8
169:8	97:15			62:25
171:6	98:20	windshield	59:1	94:6
172:15,25	107:8,22	132:22	107:23	119:15
173:10,15	127:3	Wingrove	115:12	124:16
174:13	150:8	188:13	121:25	125:8
175:1,12,	153:10		122:11	126:21,22
15 176:15	164:8	winter	123:7	,23,24
178:10	183:6	131:23	125:10,11	131:10
189:9,20	189:6,24	133:6,10,	131:25	133:7
190:3	194:10	19 140:6	132:1	140:7
	198:25	227:20	136:14	
192:13,23	201:22	wish 129:5	149:4	192:15
193:1,3,4	202:4		163:10	201:3
,22	217:25	wished	206:20	207:14,19
196:15,18	218:1,21,	288:14	208:1	211:23,24
198:20	22 219:5	witness	211:5,8,1	218:8
199:9	226:11	181:13,22	7	236:25
200:23	227:19	202:22,25	212:11,12	237:1
247:1	1 ' • /	•		İ
	228 • 9	203:1,5	,18,21	works
	228:9	203:1,5	,18,21	works

INQUIRY	re COLLINGWOO	טט טט–14–2019 ———	Page 36	06 OI 366	
108:24	88:10	281:24			
151:11	124:24				
217:4	135:9	you've 6:7			
	152:19	10:2,6			
world 21:22	191:21	11:3 23:9			
53:24	278 : 25	29:24			
91:8	280:23	46:25			
178:19		54:16			
worried	yet 201:18	59:4,15			
115:23	York	60:7			
worry 81:17	289:24,25	65 : 15			
_	you'll	70:13 93:3			
worth 30:1	19:21				
115:2,24	43:12	115:14			
wrap 186:5	62:4 67:5	130:3,25 134:17			
wringer	75:17				
54:16	76:14	138:3			
	82:15	149:2			
write 65:21	83:1 93:4	152:3,15			
120:25	94:5	156 : 12			
223:1	96:23	157:9 160:21			
writes	99:20	161:15			
236:24	113:16,18	165:5			
	121:17	174:8			
writing	129:24	175:25			
114:24	131:14	176:13			
191:6	148:6	181:6			
written	150:24	184:7			
100:14	154:11	187:2,6			
200:12	155:2	204:1,6			
225:20	158:17	204:1,6			
wrong 93:5	182:16	210:7			
179:24	184:2	211:22			
184:10	200:16	233:25			
201:15	254 : 6	233.23			
202:2	yourself	245:23			
249:17	yourself 17:6	210,20			
281:7	17:6 54:16				
	70:13				
wrote 62:5	70:13	zero 6:21			
162:1	94:6				
	102:15				
Y	102:13				
yesterday	108:20				
5:19 18:1	125:19				
45:8	180:20				
57 : 23	219:4				
70:11,18	222:11				
73:18					
79:4	yourselves				
80:11	26:1				