



## **FOUNDATION DOCUMENT PART II: FUNDING THE RECREATIONAL FACILITIES AT CENTRAL PARK AND HERITAGE PARK**

**Chapter 7: BLT and Green Leaf Negotiate a Contract and Prepare Budgets for the Arena and Pool; Preparations for August 27, 2012 Council Meeting; The EMC Drafts Staff Report about the Arena and Pool**

**Commissioner: The Honourable Frank N. Marrocco, Associate Chief Justice, Superior Court of Justice, Ontario**

**Please note that the statements in this Foundation Document have not been tested for the truth of their contents. The contents may be tested, challenged, supplemented, proven false, or discredited through the evidence called and the submissions made at the Inquiry. It will be for the Commissioner to consider all the evidence before ascribing any weight to anything contained in the Foundation Document**

## Chapter 7: BLT and Green Leaf Negotiate a Contract and Prepare Budgets for the Arena and Pool; Preparations for August 27, 2012 Council Meeting; The EMC Drafts Staff Report about the Arena and Pool

### 7.1 BLT and Green Leaf Negotiate an Intermediary Contract Including Provisions Regarding BLT Payments to Green Leaf; Green Leaf Applies to Open a Bank Account

316. On August 13, 2012, Abby Stec emailed Dave Barrow and Paul Bonwick, writing,

...As promised, attached is a copy of the Intermediary Contract between BLT and Green Leaf for review...If you find that the document contained is in order, please sign and return to our office by the end of the week...

*Email chain including Abby Stec, Dave Barrow, Mark Watts, and Paul Bonwick, August 13 and 17, 2012, [CJI0007097](#)*

317. Paul Bonwick emailed Abby Stec, Mark Watts and Dave Barrow at 1:12 pm on August 15, 2012, subject "Contract", writing, "Can we organize a call later in the morning if all available?"

*Email from Paul Bonwick to Dave Barrow, Abby Stec, and Mark Watts, August 15, 2012, [CJI0007094](#)*

318. On August 17, 2012, Mark Watts emailed Abby Stec, Dave Barrow, and Paul Bonwick with proposed revisions to the intermediary contract provisions relating to Green Leaf's compensation. Mr. Watts wrote:

The following language should be incorporated.

...

5. Compensation to Green Leaf by BLT

add

a) above and beyond the agreed fixed fee from BLT.

Change to:

b) Compensation is due to Green Leaf within two business days of BLT receiving its first draw or deposit from the third party. If the compensation is greater than 30% of the deposit then the balance will be paid out of 30% of each subsequent progress claim paid by the Third Party. The parties agree that if the fee compensation falls

outside of this formula then an agreement will be entered into based on each specific project in which Green Leaf and BLT collaborates on.

*Email chain including Abby Stec, Dave Barrow, Mark Watts, and Paul Bonwick, August 13 and 17, 2012, [CJI0007097](#)*

319. Abby Stec replied, "...Paul and I will look at it this afternoon and get back to you."

*Email chain including Abby Stec, Dave Barrow, Mark Watts and Paul Bonwick, August 13 and 17, 2012, [CJI0007097](#)*

320. On August 19, 2012, Abby Stec sent the intermediary contract between Green Leaf and BLT to Dave Barrow, Mark Watts, and Paul Bonwick, writing:

...We have made the changes you asked for pertaining to the holdover and compensation section (b). Paul has had preliminary discussions with Ed regarding the first draw and it will be substantial enough to cover both the compensation and your initial operation costs. For this reason, 5(b) was left as it was.

Everything is moving forward as planned in Collingwood. As expected there have been some efforts on behalf of the co-chair of the Town's Parks, Recreation and Culture committee who has attempted to spark up a lobbying group to convince Council to go ahead with the 35 million dollar option in Central Park. He has demonstrated this type of approach before. There is a process in place for committees to report to Council. It appears that when Council does not follow his recommendations he goes to the media in an attempt to organize support in the community against Council.

We are managing the situation in a straightforward manner and it is expected that the said gentleman will be asked to step down from his position on Monday.

Enjoy the rest of the weekend and we look forward to receiving the quotes for the two facilities on Monday.

Regards,

Abby

*Email and attachment from Abby Stec to Dave Barrow, Mark Watts, and Paul Bonwick, August 19, 2012, [CJI0007098](#) and [CJI0007098\\_0001](#)*

321. The Intermediary Contract attached to Abby Stec's email described the services to be provided by Green Leaf Distribution to BLT:

2. Green Leaf agrees to provide the following service(s):

- a) Providing to BLT the name and contact information (phone, fax, email addresses) of one or more third parties that Green Leaf believes would benefit from the services and materials that BLT has to offer
- b) The third parties party(ies) that Green leaf will furnish to BLT will be third parties which to Green Leaf's knowledge and belief have not had a prior business relationship or ongoing business relationship or ongoing business discussions with respect to the business deal that Green Leaf proposes
- c) through Green Leaf's third party prospect research and inventory of leads, Green Leaf will also provide to BLT a brief description of the needs of the third party and how BLT should be able to meet needs with services BLT provides those the materials and
- d) if BLT is interested in doing work for the third party, Green Leaf will assist in putting the third party and BLT together to discuss the suitability of the matching
- e) if the third party and BLT are interested in proceeding with a formal contract whereby BLT will be providing materials and or services to the third party, Green Leaf will assist BLT in formulating the applicable contract(s)

*Intermediary Contract between Green Leaf and BLT, undated, [CJ10007098 0001](#)*

322. With respect to compensation, the intermediary contract provided:

5. Compensation to Green Leaf by BLT

- a) BLT shall pay compensation to Green Leaf in an amount that Green Leaf in its discretion determines appropriate above and beyond the agreement fixed fee from BLT
- b) Compensation is due to Green Leaf upon signing the of the contract between BLT and the third party and BLT receiving their first draw from the third party.
- c) Compensation is not to be paid to Green Leaf by way of direct or re-directed deposit or advance by the third party, it is to be paid by BLT from BLT
- d) Compensation is to be paid by way of bank draft or bank transfer deposit
- e) HST is "in addition" to any compensation

*Intermediary Contract between Green Leaf and BLT, undated, [CJ10007098 0001](#)*

323. Paul Bonwick sent Abby Stec an email on August 24, 2012 at 11:57 am with the subject line "Terms", writing, "I believe we have been acting in good faith up to this point and will continue to do so however if they are receiving a 25 or 30% deposit we will require our payment at the same time. Two days is not relevant in banking terms." At 12:11

pm, Ms. Stec forwarded this email to Dave Barrow of BLT, writing, "I have forwarded Paul's response which we feel is reasonable. Please let me know if we can sign as is."

*Email chain including Paul Bonwick, Abby Stec and Dave Barrow, August 24, 2012, [CJ10007208](#)*

324. Dave Barrow responded to Abby Stec at 1:28 pm with, "I am waiting reply from Mark but we dont want to be in the position that the city takes 3 weeks for the deposit and were obligated to pay you immediately. I have worked for the city and usually it's a process."

*Email chain including Paul Bonwick, Abby Stec and Dave Barrow, August 24, 2012, [CJ10007208](#)*

325. At 1:51pm, Abby Stec replied,

Can you let me know when you are back in the office. I just want to confirm compensation totals with you after breaking out the totals. When I was speaking to Ed this morning he asked me to confirm that the garage type doors which open up the pool are include. We did not see them on the budget, or maybe were looking for the wrong heading.

*Email chain including Paul Bonwick, Abby Stec and Dave Barrow, August 24, 2012, [CJ10007208](#)*

## 7.2 WGD Provides Report Comparing Pre-Engineered Structure to Fabric Membrane

326. On August 16 and 17, WGD sent Marta Proctor and David McNalty reports and information comparing certain features of a pre-engineered building to a fabric membrane building, including expected energy usage, expected lifespan, mechanical systems, development timelines and cost. This correspondence is described in [Summary Document 2-4](#).

*[Summary Document 2-4](#): WGD's Interaction with Collingwood Staff, Council and Residents (July-October 2012), chapter 1.6*

327. On August 17, 2012, Richard Dabrus of WGD forwarded Marta Proctor a preliminary budget for the arena that had been prepared by Ingersoll & Associates Inc. In the covering email to Mr. Dabrus, Tom Ingersoll wrote:

... The fabric building is considerably less than a pre-engineered building to purchase and install. That said, some of the drawbacks to a fabric structure would be life cycle costs, maintenance costs, possible cooling requirements for use during the summer

months and fire protection. The foundations would be slightly less as well. Based on my review, I feel the overall savings to use a fabric structure would be in the \$450,000 to \$550,000 range.

*Email chain including Tom Ingersoll, Richard Dabrus, Marta Proctor, Dave McNalty and Brian Gregersen, August 17 - 20, 2012, [TOC0201994](#)*

328. The budget estimated the construction costs for a new Collingwood arena to be \$7,498,902.34. The total cost of the project including contractor fees, winter protection, building permit fees and a 5% contingency came out to \$8,796,405.29, excluding HST.

*Email chain and attachment including Tom Ingersoll, Richard Dabrus, Marta Proctor, Dave McNalty and Brian Gregersen, August 17 - 20, 2012, [TOC0201218](#) and [TOC0201219](#)*

329. At 4:23 pm on August 17, 2012, WGD sent Marta Proctor and Dave McNalty a revised report titled “Central Park New Arena Options” (the “WGD Report”), which contained the information comparing pre-engineered buildings to fabric membrane buildings. With respect to cost, the WGD Report stated:

- h. Building Costs – Pre-Eng. Building Option A - \$7,632,124.29
- i. Building Costs – Fabric Structure Option B - \$7,132,124.29

*Email and attachment from Michael Thier to Dave McNalty, Marta Proctor, Richard Dabrus and Brian Gregersen, August 17, 2012, [TOC0201265](#) and [TOC0201266](#)*

330. Marta Proctor forwarded the WGD report to Ed Houghton, Marjory Leonard, and Sara Almas at 5:01 pm. Mr. Houghton replied three minutes later: “Is this for Central Park? I was under the impression we told Dave they were to work on Eddie Bush only?” Ms. Proctor replied at 5:11 pm, “I wasn’t aware of that and from my discussions with Dave, I don’t think he was either.”

*Email chain including Michael Thier, Dave McNalty, Richard Dabrus, Brian Gregersen, Marta Proctor, Ed Houghton, Sara Almas, and Marjory Leonard, August 17, 2012, [TOC0201311](#)*

331. The next day, August 18, 2012, Ed Houghton forwarded the email chain to Dave McNalty at 2:53 pm, writing: “I think you and I need to have a discussion and get moving in the same direction”. Mr. McNalty replied at 7:02 pm:

...I agree that we should discuss it. I'm not sure how you want to present this, and there is already a draft report from Marjory.

No one said that we still didn't want the costs of a bricks, mortar and steel arena...

I worked on the financial comparison template this morning and will expect to finish it tomorrow morning with plugged numbers for the Sprung option. I think I do understand how the numbers might turn out, but have structured so that we can manipulate it as required. Or is a comparison not advisable? Give me a call tomorrow morning sometime if you like, otherwise suggest a time and place. I have some commitments tomorrow afternoon.

*Email chain including Michael Thier, Dave McNalty, Richard Dabrus, Brian Gregersen, Marta Proctor, Ed Houghton, Sara Almas and Marjory Leonard, August 17 and 18, 2012, [EHH0000031](#)*

### 7.3 Treasurer Marjory Leonard Circulates a Draft Staff Report about the Arena and Pool (the "Pool/Arena Report") Without Pricing Information from Sprung

332. Marta Proctor, Sara Almas, Marjory Leonard and Dave McNalty arranged to meet on August 17, 2012 to discuss the "Central Park Recommendations report". Later that day, Marjory Leonard sent Ed Houghton an email that said, "Ed, we are having a discussion about the staff report. We have not received any information from Sprung/BLT. Could you contact them and ask for the information asap." Mr. Houghton responded that he would.

*Calendar Invitation from Marta Proctor to Sara Almas, and Marjory Leonard, "Central Park Recommendations report", August 14, 2012, [TOC0199344](#), [TOC0199345](#)*

*Email chain including Marta Proctor, Sara Almas, Marjory Leonard, and Dave McNalty, August 17, 2012, [TOC0201124](#)*

*Email chain including Marjory Leonard, Ed Houghton, Sara Almas, Dave McNalty, and Marta Proctor, August 17, 2012, [TOC0517088](#)*

333. On August 18, 2012 at 10:34 am, Marjory Leonard sent a draft staff report regarding the Centennial Pool and Single Pad Arena (the "Pool/Arena Staff Report") to the EMC, Marta Proctor, and Dave McNalty, writing:

This is the first attempt at the report. There are several items (particularly the cost estimates, pros, cons and other considerations) that most definitely need flushing out since we don't have all of them yet...

... In terms of the operating costs I would like to break these into fixed and variable....

...I envision the recommendation section to contain the various options – do nothing; do nothing but establish a reserve for future construction; do nothing but EBMA [Eddie Bush Memorial Arena]; do nothing but EBMA and establish a reserve for future construction; do nothing at CP [Central Park], do Centennial Pool and EBMA etc. There are a significant number of permutations on these recommendations that should be discussed with Council or some members of Council before the 27th.

The effect on Town Finances section will include using the \$1.5m in reserve, debentures, hydro money and any other funds we can brainstorm. I will also have to provide them with an updated annual repayment calculation in the event they choose debenture financing. I have no idea how to broach the subject of using hydro money since Council committed to a public process before using this money ...

*Email and attachment from Marjory Leonard to Ed Houghton, Larry Irwin, Sara Almas, Marta Proctor and Dave McNalty, August 18, 2012, [TOC0201377](#) and [TOC0201378](#)*

334. Marjory Leonard's draft of the Pool/Arena Staff Report did not include any Staff recommendations.

*Email and attachment from Marjory Leonard to Ed Houghton, Larry Irwin, Sara Almas, Marta Proctor and Dave McNalty, August 18, 2012, [TOC0201377](#) and [TOC0201378](#)*

335. The August 18, 2012 draft Pool/Arena Staff Report included design specifications for fabric buildings for both the pool and the single-pad arena, which the draft said would form the basis of RFP's to "obtain final design and costing". The draft also noted:

- j. That Staff was not aware of another pool in Ontario with "this construction";
- k. That "there are a limited number of suppliers of this type of constructed building"; and
- l. That staff had investigated three kinds of construction for the arena and noted that certain costs were dependent on the arena location on the site.

*Email and attachment from Marjory Leonard to Ed Houghton, Larry Irwin, Sara Almas, Marta Proctor, and Dave McNalty, August 18, 2012, [TOC0201377](#) and [TOC0201378](#)*

336. The August 18, 2012 draft also discussed renovations to the Eddie Bush Memorial Arena:

Regardless of the decision made this evening, the EBMA is in need of significant renovation and upgrading. Staff have prepared and submitted a grant application for CIIF funds to assist with funding of these upgrades. The estimates received for the necessary remediation to this facility are in the range of \$3.1m. The maximum funding available from the Federal program is \$1m. The remaining \$2.1m will need to be found...

*Email and attachment from Marjory Leonard to Ed Houghton, Larry Irwin, Sara Almas, Marta Proctor, and Dave McNalty, August 18, 2012, [TOC0201377](#) and [TOC0201378](#)*

#### 7.4 Council Receives Emails from Residents Both in Support of and Opposed to a MURF

337. Between August 18 and 23, 2012, Deputy Mayor Lloyd and Councillors Ian Chadwick and Dale West received emails from Collingwood residents expressing a desire that Council not spend \$35 million dollars on a Multi-Use Recreational facility. Meanwhile, on August 22, 2012, Councillor Dale West had a conversation with president of the Collingwood Minor Hockey Association Jason Henry in which Mr. Henry emphasized Collingwood's need for a second ice surface. Council also received an email from a resident who expressed disappointment that Council was considering an "expensive band-aid solution" and instead urged Council to continue to work with the Steering Committee to build a MURF. These email exchanges are further detailed in [Summary Document 2-5](#).

*[Summary Document 2-5](#): Council, Staff, and Public Discussions Related to the Town's Recreational Facilities*

#### 7.5 Deputy Mayor Rick Lloyd Asks Ed Houghton to Put a Positive Spin on Treasurer Marjory Leonard's Draft of the Pool/Arena Staff Report; Marjory Leonard Provides Deputy Mayor Lloyd with a Revised Draft

338. On August 19, 2012 at 11:29 am, Acting CAO Ed Houghton forwarded Treasurer Marjory Leonard's email discussing the draft Pool/Arena Staff Report to Deputy Mayor Rick Lloyd, writing, "Take a look at this. I've not read it yet but will but I'm gonna ask Marjory to flip it to you as well."

*Email chain including Ed Houghton, Rick Lloyd, Marjory Leonard, Larry Irwin, Sara Almas, Marta Proctor, and Dave McNalty, August 18-19, 2012, [TOC0517810](#)*

339. Deputy Mayor Rick Lloyd replied that he did not like the phrase, "IF COUNCIL CHOOSES TO PROCEED" and said, "Take that out as it leaves the impression that maybe we shouldn't proceed. Still reading it though lol."

*Email chain including Ed Houghton, Rick Lloyd, Marjory Leonard, Larry Irwin, Sara Almas, Marta Proctor, and Dave McNalty, August 18-19, 2012, [TOC0517810](#)*

340. Ed Houghton replied, "I have suggested to Marj to copy you but I have had some minor resistance. She will send by tomorrow however."

*Email chain including Ed Houghton, Rick Lloyd, Marjory Leonard, Larry Irwin, Sara Almas, Marta Proctor, and Dave McNalty, August 18-19, 2012, [TOC0517810](#)*

341. Deputy Mayor Lloyd wrote back at 11:29 am:

Good I also see some other areas that need reworded

le "no other pools in Ontario of this construction" I would rather indicate that there are many pools, in north america with this construction.

I find there is a little negative spin on some of her report.

I don't think it is intentionally done that way but it needs the Ed Houghton positive spin in a redraft.

She writes like an accountant.

As well we must be careful not to give too much information

*Email chain including Ed Houghton, Rick Lloyd, Marjory Leonard, Larry Irwin, Sara Almas, Marta Proctor, and Dave McNalty, August 18-19, 2012, [TOC0517810](#)*

## 7.6 Dave McNalty Sends Acting CAO Ed Houghton a Chart Comparing the Costs of the Recreation Construction Options and Revisions to the Draft Pool/Arena Staff Report

342. On August 19, 2012 at 8:05 pm, Dave McNalty sent Ed Houghton his comments on the draft Pool/Arena Staff Report and a chart comparing the costs of a twin ice pad and community centre, a pre-engineered steel building, and an insulated fabric membrane structure. In his email, Mr. McNalty wrote:

Two attachments:

1. A working spreadsheet that summarizes the options and budget information that we have so far. (Don't hold me to the numbers yet! Obviously, I made some of them up.) It compares the current initiatives to the Central Park Redevelopment Project so that we make sure we're not out of line with our suggestions. It is not intended to be an appendix or anything, just for our own use.

2. My edits to Marjory's draft staff report (so far). Look in the body of the report and please let me know if this direction is what you intend before I get further along.

I have not distributed this elsewhere at this point pending your approval and suggestions.

*Email and attachments from Dave McNalty to Ed Houghton, August 19, 2012, [TOC0201563](#), [TOC0201564](#) and [TOC0201565](#)*

343. The comparison chart included "grand totals" for each of the three options:

- a. Twin ice pad and community centre, including a YMCA addition, relocating four baseball diamonds and a 20% contingency fee: \$35,251,965.11;
- b. Pre-engineered steel building, including \$1.15M in "recommended upgrades", \$2.082M in renovation costs for the Eddie Bush Memorial Arena, the relocation of one baseball diamond, and a 10% contingency fee: \$13,374,174.38; and
- c. Insulated fabric membrane structure, including no optional upgrades, \$2.082M in renovation costs for the Eddie Bush Memorial Arena, the elimination of one baseball diamond and a 5% contingency fee: \$14,602,318.19.

*Ice and Water Cost Comparisons, no date, [TOC0201565](#)*

344. In his revisions to the draft Pool/Arena Staff Report, Dave McNalty included the following information about the pool:

PRELIMINARY

<b>CENTENNIAL POOL INSULATED FABRIC MEMBRANE COVER</b>	\$ 4,000,000.00	
SUBTOTAL		\$ 4,000,000.00
SITE WORK	\$ 400,000.00	
DESIGN FEES/PERMITS (ALLOWANCE)	\$ 50,000.00	
CONTINGENCY (5%)	\$ 220,000.00	
SUBTOTAL		\$ 670,000.00
<b>TOTAL</b>		<b>\$ 4,670,000.00</b>

The Insulated Fabric Membrane Cover researched for this report would be provided as a turn-key solution for covering the existing outdoor pool. The cost includes the demolition of the existing pool change house and mechanical room and reconstruction of a more modern facility within the new structure.

A significant advantage to this approach is that the complete design and engineering works are included in the cost of the project and are fully quantified at the time of order. This allows the project to carry a minimal contingency and a relatively small allowance for permits and fees. Additionally, the proposal may be limited to the supply and construction of the Insulated Fabric Membrane Cover and the interior components allowing the Town to contract the remaining site works independently as funds become available, or to complete portions of the work in-house. This may represent significant savings relative to traditional building construction projects.

*Staff Report, EMC 2012-01, August 27, 2012, Last Modified August 19, 2012, [TOC0201564](#)*

345. In the revised report, Dave McNalty described the “Pros” for the pool as including the construction materials for the “Insulated Fabric Membrane Cover” and revised Ms. Leonard’s language to read that “There are several successful swimming pool applications utilizing this type of construction identified across North America”.

*Staff Report, EMC 2012-01, August 27, 2012, Last Modified August 19, 2012, [TOC0201564](#)*

346. With respect to the arena, Dave McNalty revised Marjory Leonard’s language to indicate that two types of construction were investigated and to state that the Sprung membrane has the LEEDS Silver Accreditation requirements set in its basic design. He included the following information regarding the arena’s capital cost requirements:

## PRELIMINARY

<b>PRE-ENG STEEL BUILDING</b>	\$ 6,856,157.26		<b>INSULATED FABRIC MEMBRANE STRUCTURE</b>	\$ 6,000,000.00	
<i>Single Ice Pad with potential to be twinned in the future. Placement of the arena in the park determines displaced amenities and future evolution towards the complete multi-use complex.</i>			<i>Single Ice Pad with layout planned for future additional arena. Placement of the arena in the park determines displaced amenities.</i>		
SUB TOTAL		\$ 6,856,157.26	SUB TOTAL		\$ 6,000,000.00
<b>RECOMMENDED UPGRADES</b>			<b>OPTIONAL UPGRADES</b>		
Green Roof	\$ 100,000.00				
Sub Floor Heating	\$ 50,000.00				
Radiant Floor Heating	\$ 600,000.00				
Cistern and Dual Plumbing System	\$ 100,000.00				
Structure to Support Photo-Voltaics	\$ 100,000.00				
Building Automation System	\$ 200,000.00				
Upgrade Insulation??					
SUB TOTAL		\$ 1,150,000.00			
<b>SITE AND PARK DEVELOPMENT</b>	\$ 1,164,281.00		<b>SITE AND PARK DEVELOPMENT</b>	\$ 1,000,000.00	
DESIGN FEES/PERMITS/MISCELLANEOUS (5%)	\$ 458,521.91		DESIGN FEES/PERMITS (ALLOWANCE)	\$ 100,000.00	
CONTINGENCY (10%)	\$ 962,896.02		CONTINGENCY (5%)	\$ 350,000.00	
SUB TOTAL		\$ 2,585,698.93	SUB TOTAL		\$ 1,450,000.00
<b>TOTAL</b>		<b>\$ 10,591,856.19</b>	<b>TOTAL</b>		<b>\$ 7,450,000.00</b>

Two (2) building construction types were investigated to provide an additional ice surface in the preferred location of Central Park. The Pre-Engineered Steel Building or the Insulated Fabric Membrane Structure may be positioned within the park to limit the immediate displacement of existing amenities. At the expense of more existing amenities, the Pre-Engineered Steel type arena may be positioned to be the first phase of the full Multi-Use Recreational Complex envisioned by the Central Park steering committee.

Each of the arenas proposed would qualify for a LEED Silver accreditation, however the Insulated Fabric Membrane Structure has the requirements set in its basic design and the traditionally industrial pre-engineered building must be modified to meet the requirements leading to additional engineering costs and custom components.

Similarly as with the Centennial Pool enclosure, the Insulated Fabric Membrane Structure researched for this report would be provided as a turn-key design build arena solution, so the full costs of engineering and design would be fully known and committed to at the time of order. A minimal allowance for permits, fees and site design would be carried with the project. Since the contract would include the supply and construction of the arena only, further site development may be designed and contracted and constructed independently by the Town leading to considerable cost savings on the project.

...

A significant advantage to the Insulated Fabric Membrane Structure arena is the time to complete. The purpose built packaged facility investigated is typically designed and constructed within a six (6) to eight (8) month period. Traditional

construction methods are usually subject to a significant design and procurement period followed by the construction. A Pre-Engineered Steel arena would be expected to develop over sixteen (16) to eighteen (18) months to completion.

*Staff Report, EMC 2012-01, August 27, 2012, Last Modified August 19, 2012, [TOC0201564](#)*

347. Dave McNalty included the following information about the capital costs for the Eddie Bush Memorial Arena renovations:

Capital Cost Estimate

PRELIMINARY

<b>EDDIE BUSH MEMORIAL ARENA</b>		
PRIORITY RENOVATIONS	\$ 1,780,000.00	
<i>New ice plant, dressing rooms, ice slab, refrigerant piping, dasher boards</i>		
SOFT COSTS: Permits, Fees, Design Costs (12%)	\$ 213,600.00	
EXTENDED RENOVATIONS	\$ 755,290.00	
<i>Roof replacement, interior finishes, mechanical and electrical system upgrades</i>		
SOFT COSTS: Permits, Fees, Design Costs (12%)	\$ 90,634.80	
CONTINGENCY (10%)	\$ 283,952.48	
SUB TOTAL		\$ 3,123,477.28
POTENTIAL INFRASTRUCTURE FUNDING	\$ (1,041,159.09)	
SUB TOTAL		\$ (1,041,159.09)
<b>TOTAL</b>		<b>\$ 2,082,318.19</b>

The above estimate has been provide by WGD Architects as a synopsis of the upgrades required at the Eddie Bush Memorial Arena (EBMA) that will allow continued operation for the next ten (10) year envelope. The ice plant infrastructure is reaching the end of its life and there is a likelihood that the TSSA will require conformance with standards within that time frame. The estimate includes . . . . . There are also issues of privacy, ventilation and inadequate washroom facilities in the dressing room areas, as well as life safety egress. The estimate also includes for the replacement of the ice surface piping and concrete slab. With the eventual provision of a twelve (12) month additional ice arena in Central Park, the intent is to prepare the EBMA for transition towards winter ice

arena use and a transition to year round events that will contribute to the vibrancy of the downtown core.

*Staff Report, EMC 2012-01, August 27, 2012, Last Modified August 19, 2012, [TOC0201564](#)*

## 7.7 Treasurer Marjory Leonard Polishes the Draft Pool/Arena Staff Report and Sends it to Deputy Mayor Rick Lloyd

348. On August 20, 2012, Marjory Leonard sent Deputy Mayor Lloyd a copy of the draft Pool/Arena Staff Report, writing, “I did some polishing on the report but I still don’t have any numbers. Let me know what you think!” Marjory Leonard’s August 20, 2012 draft did not incorporate Dave McNalty’s August 19, 2012 revisions.

*Email and attachment from Marjory Leonard to Rick Lloyd, August 20, 2012, [TOC0517080](#) and [TOC0517081](#)*

349. In the Discussion section on enclosing the outdoor pool with a fabric building, Marjory Leonard added the comment that there were “many [pools of this construction] in the U.S. and other areas of the world”. She also included commentary about the “many advantages to becoming an early adopter or trendsetter for new concepts”. She wrote that,

[t]he building, as priced, represents a turnkey operation. The main consideration here is that we do not have experience operating a pool of this size as a year round facility. We may find that it is more economical and efficient...if we were to partner with the Y in some manner for operation of the facility.

*Staff Report, EMC 2012-01, August 27, 2012, Last Modified August 20, 2012, [TOC0517081](#)*

350. Under the consideration for a new single pad arena, Marjory Leonard added a new paragraph:

Council, staff and the public should be aware of the fact that the construction of a single pad arena at Central Park does not renege on the acceptance in principle of the Central Park grand vision nor does it negate in any way the work of the Steering Committee. It is a prudent first step, an affordable phase 1 of the grand vision.

*Staff Report, EMC 2012-01, August 27, 2012, Last Modified August 20, 2012, [TOC0517081](#)*

## 7.8 Certain Council Members and Acting CAO Ed Houghton Attend the AMO Conference in Ottawa; Paul Bonwick Travels to Ottawa

351. The Association of Municipalities of Ontario (“AMO”) 2012 Conference took place in Ottawa from August 19 to August 22, 2012. Mayor Sandra Cooper, Deputy Mayor Rick Lloyd, Councillors Ian Chadwick, Kevin Lloyd, Dale West and Mike Edwards, and Acting CAO Ed Houghton attended. Paul Bonwick also went to Ottawa that weekend.

*Email chain including Paul Bonwick and Ian Chadwick, August 17, 2012, [CJI0000648](#)*

*Email and attachment from Pam Hogg to Paul Bonwick, July 9, 2012, [TOC0181690.0001](#) and [TOC0181690.0001.0001](#)*

*Town of Collingwood Councillor Expenses, December 31, 2012, [CBB0000174](#)*

352. A Collus PowerStream/Solutions Employee Expense Report dated December 31, 2012 noted that, in August 2012, Ed Houghton charged \$668.38 to a “water” credit card for a purchase at “the Shore Club in Ottawa (during an AMO meeting)” and charged \$611.44 to the same credit card for a purchase at “Mamma Teresa in Ottawa (AMO meeting).”

*Collus PowerStream / Solutions Employee expense reports and Visa, December 31, 2012, Note 3, [CBB0000164](#)*

## 7.9 Ameresco and Greenland Ask to Make a Deputation to Council

353. On August 20, 2012, Mark Palmer of Greenland emailed Sara Almas, writing:

Last week, Ameresco and Greenland staff spoke with Deputy-Mayor Rick Lloyd.

The Deputy Mayor agreed that our Ameresco-Greenland team should make a formal presentation to Town Council at its next meeting. I understand the next opportunity is Monday, August 27 2012...

*Email from Mark Palmer to Sara Almas, Mike Edwards, Kevin Lloyd, Ian Chadwick, Sandy Cunningham, Joe Gardhouse, Anthony Da Silva, Terry Geddes, Jim Hartman, Ken Hale, Frank Miceli, Sandra Cooper, Rick Lloyd, Keith Hull, Dale West, Ed Houghton, and Marta Proctor, August 20, 2012, [TOC0201679](#)*

354. Deputy Mayor Rick Lloyd replied directly to Sara Almas, writing,

It almost looks like I organized this!

After meeting with them and telling them that I don't think they are a good fit. And that we don't need their financing and I am not sure they have anything to offer.

They insisted they get an audience with council so I told them to contact you.

*Email chain including Mark Palmer, Sara Almas, Mike Edwards, Kevin Lloyd, Ian Chadwick, Sandy Cunningham, Joe Gardhouse, Anthony Da Silva, Terry Geddes, Jim Hartman, Ken Hale, Frank Miceli, Sandra Cooper, Rick Lloyd, Keith Hull, Dale West, Ed Houghton, and Marta Proctor, August 20, 2012, [TOC0201970](#)*

355. On August 22, 2012, Clerk Almas confirmed acceptance of Greenland and Ameresco's deputation request by email. The next day, Greenland's Mark Palmer submitted a slide presentation to be used during their deputation to the Town.

*Email chain and attachment including Mark Palmer, Sara Almas, Anthony Da Silva, Mike Edwards, Kevin Lloyd, Ian Chadwick, Sandy Cunningham, Joe Gardhouse, Terry Geddes, Jim Hartman, Ken Hale, Frank Miceli, Sandra Cooper, Rick Lloyd, Keith Hull, Dale West, Ed Houghton, Marta Proctor, Megan Schollenberger, Becky Dahl, and Larry Irwin, August 20-21, 2012, [TOC0203642](#) and [TOC0203643](#)*

## 7.10 Green Leaf and BLT Work Towards Final Pricing for the Sprung Proposal; BLT Adjusts its Budgets After Discussions with Green Leaf

356. On August 20, 2012, Abby Stec emailed Dave Barrow: "I was wandering if you had a chance to get the pricing nailed down for the two facilities. Can you please let me know." Mr. Barrow responded, "You will have it today."

*Email chain including Abby Stec and Dave Barrow, August 20, 2012, [CJI0007223](#)*

357. Abby Stec sent a follow-up email to Dave Barrow on August 21, 2012 at 8:10 am, writing, "Do you have the numbers for us? Please let me know ASAP." Mr. Barrow replied at 8:55 am, "Need one hour and half I need 1 item clarified with structural engineer. Sorry came up yesterday in review."

*Email chain including Abby Stec and Dave Barrow, August 21, 2012, [CJI0007101](#)*

358. On August 21, 2012 at 10:46 am Dave Barrow emailed construction budgets for the arena and pool to Paul Bonwick and Abby Stec, writing, "Here are the numbers for both locations arena and pool. Let me know what you wish to adjust too and I will re-submit

to send to Ed.” The attached budgets totalled \$3,467,731.50 for the pool (the “August 21 Pool Budget”) and \$7,157,191.00 for the arena (the “August 21 Arena Budget”).

*Email and attachments from Dave Barrow to Paul Bonwick, Abby Stec, and Mark Watts, August 21, 2012, [CJI0007116](#), [CJI0007116 0001](#), and [CJI0007116 0002](#)*

359. Paul Bonwick responded to Dave Barrow’s email at 11:17 am, writing:

...Please let me know if you have time for a call at 2pm.

The situation is very fluid at this time and requires our attention and input by end of day if we are to achieve a favourable outcome Monday. There is a considerable movement wanting a deferral providing an opportunity for a third party to make a recommendation, ie.... architect.

*Email chain including Dave Barrow, Paul Bonwick, Abby Stec, and Mark Watts, August 21, 2012, [CJI0007115](#)*

360. At 11:42 am on August 21, 2012, Dave McNalty sent Ed Houghton the July 16, 2012 Sprung estimates. The July 16, 2012 budgets priced a “Sprung Performance Arena” at \$4,925,000.00, an “Outdoor Arena Cover” at \$3,775,000.00, and the "Centennial Pool Cover” at \$2,385,904.00, all excluding HST.

*Email chain and attachment including David MacNeil, Rick Lloyd, Sandra Cooper, Dave McNalty, Tom Lloyd, Patrick Mills and Ed Houghton, July 16 and August 21, 2012, [TOC0202338](#) and [TOC0202340](#)*

361. Ed Houghton forwarded Dave McNalty’s email with the July 16, 2012 budgets to Paul Bonwick without comment at 11:43 am on August 21, 2012. At 1:10 pm on August 21, 2012, Mr. Bonwick forwarded Mr. Houghton’s email to Dave Barrow and Abby Stec, writing:

Please review the original numbers that were sent to the Town. Unless there is some significant explanation (three million dollars higher than original) they will undoubtedly take the view that we are trying to gouge as a result potential sole source. This is a deal breaker in the current format!

I look forward to chatting at 3pm.

*Email chain and attachments including Paul Bonwick, Abby Stec, Dave Barrow, Dave McNalty, David MacNeil, Rick Lloyd, Sandra Cooper, Tom Lloyd, Patrick Mills, and Ed Houghton, July 16 and August 21, 2012, [CJI0007217](#) and [CJI0007217 0001](#)*

362. At 2:53 pm, Dave Barrow emailed Paul Bonwick, Mark Watts, and Abby Stec, explaining that “we have a few items added in ours compared to that budget” and setting out a list of 12 items related to the second floor of the arena that were not included in the July 16 budgets.

*Email chain and attachments including Paul Bonwick, Abby Stec, Dave Barrow, Dave McNalty, David MacNeil, Rick Lloyd, Sandra Cooper, Tom Lloyd, Patrick Mills, and Ed Houghton, July 16 and August 21, 2012, [CJI0007248](#), [CJI0007248.0001](#), [CJI0007248.0002](#) and [CJI0007248.0003](#)*

363. At 4:58 pm on August 21, 2012, Abby Stec emailed Dave Barrow:

Thanks for taking the time to participate in both calls today and getting the numbers back to us. Once you have put the numbers in the format Ed suggested, please put 6½ percent across the board on all the number reflecting the Green Leaf compensation. At that point the numbers can be sent to Ed.

If you are OK with the BLT/Green Leaf agreement please sign it and send it back to us at your earliest convenience. Thank you so much.

*Email from Abby Stec to Dave Barrow, August 21, 2012, [CJI0007218](#)*

364. At 8:18 am on August 24, 2012, Abby Stec of Green Leaf emailed Tom Lloyd and David MacNeil of Sprung and Dave Barrow of BLT:

Ed is going into several meetings today to share information regarding Sprung. I have armed him with the power point...and hard copies of the power point, pool and arena projects. The only missing component is the cost comparison between traditional buildings, arenas and pool. If you could source out any numbers from existing projects for me this morning, it would be fabulous. When I did work with the school with both Yeardon and the Farley group, they has proformas for a diversity of their projects. Does Sprung have anything like that?

*Email from Abby Stec to Tom Lloyd, David MacNeil, Dave Barrow, August 24, 2012, [CJI0007210](#)*

365. At 8:27 am, Tom Lloyd of Sprung wrote, “Hi Abby, Thanks for doing that. Attached is what we have. Dave Barrow, can you give Abby anything further?” Dave Barrow responded to Tom Lloyd, Ms. Stec, and David MacNeil twenty minutes later: “I don’t have comparisons, I believe you Tom had this data.” Ms. Stec replied to Dave Barrow, “Thanks Dave. I thought it would come from Sprung but don’t seem to be getting it from Tom??”

*Email chain including Tom Lloyd, Dave Barrow, Abby Stec and Dave MacNeil, August 24, 2012, [CJ10007207](#)*

## 7.11 The Town Department Heads Discuss the Status of the Draft Pool/Arena Staff Report

366. The agenda for the August 21, 2012 Department Head meeting was distributed on August 17, 2012. The agenda indicated that the Department heads were to discuss the “Central Park Follow Up Report”, which was to be circulated.

*Email and attachment from Megan Schollenberger to Department Heads, Brian Macdonald, Marcus Firman, Lynda Reid, Becky Dahl, Mandy Long, Pam Hogg, Shelley Fuhre, Rose Madigan, Debbie Rowbotham, Amanda Norris, Kay Blakely and Monica Gal, August 17, 2012, [TOC0201199](#) and [TOC0201200](#)*

367. According to the August 21, 2012 Department Head meeting minutes, the Clerk noted with respect to the August 27, 2012 Council meeting agenda that a Central Park Follow-up Report would be included in the agenda, and that it was expected that Ameresco would provide a deputation. The minutes further noted that the Central Park Follow-up Report was to be circulated as soon as it was ready.

*Department Head Meeting Minutes, August 21, 2012, [TOC0549006](#)*

## 7.12 Treasurer Marjory Leonard Circulates Revised Drafts of the Pool/Arena Staff Report and Inquires into the Status of the Sprung Pricing

368. At 3:25 pm on August 21, 2012, Marjory Leonard emailed Dave McNalty a revised draft of the Pool/Arena Staff Report, writing: “...this is where I’m at now. Any word on the Sprung pricing yet?” Mr. McNalty replied, “Just before noon, Ed asked me for the Sprung estimates from July. Nothing since, but perhaps there are discussions happening”.

*Email and attachment from Marjory Leonard to Dave McNalty, August 21, 2012, [TOC0202500](#) and [TOC0202501](#)*

*Email from Dave McNalty to Marjory Leonard, August 21, 2012, [TOC0202588](#)*

369. Marjory Leonard’s August 21, 2012 draft Pool/Arena Staff Report incorporated Dave McNalty’s August 19th comments along with additional revisions.

*Staff Report, EMC 2012-01, August 27, 2012, Last Modified August 21, 2012, [TOC0202501](#)*

370. Marjory Leonard's August 21, 2012 draft:

- a. Included information about the advantages of the insulated fabric membrane;
- b. Included items related to the second floor of the arena that were previously identified as "Additional Options to be considered" in the list of "basic design components";
- c. Stated that Staff had researched the cost of a "bricks and mortar" arena and determined that it would cost approximately \$550,000 more than a pre-engineered steel arena;
- d. Stated that the fabric membrane arena would be a turnkey solution with the costs of engineering and design "fully known and committed at the time of the order"; and
- e. Stated that each of arenas proposed would qualify for a LEED Silver accreditation and that, in order to receive the accreditation, there would be additional 'commissioning' costs. The report continued that difference in the two buildings is that the Insulated Fabric Membrane structure has the LEED requirements built into its basic design whereas, the traditional industrial pre-engineered building must be modified to meet the requirements leading to additional engineering costs and custom components.

*Staff Report, EMC 2012-01, August 27, 2012, Last Modified August 21, 2012, [TOC0202501](#)*

371. The August 21, 2012 draft of the Pool/Arena Report also included revisions to the discussion about the Eddie Bush Memorial Arena. It removed the statement that "The estimates received for the necessary remediation to the facility are in the range of \$3.1m. The maximum funding available from the Federal program is \$1m. The remaining \$2.1m will need to be found" and included the following table and discussion:

PRELIMINARY

<b>EDDIE BUSH MEMORIAL ARENA</b>		
<b>PRIORITY RENOVATIONS</b>	<b>\$ 1,780,000.00</b>	
<i>New ice plant, dressing rooms, ice slab, refrigerant piping, dasher boards</i>		
<b>SOFT COSTS: Permits, Fees, Design Costs (12%)</b>	<b>\$ 213,600.00</b>	
<b>EXTENDED RENOVATIONS</b>	<b>\$ 755,290.00</b>	
<i>Roof replacement, interior finishes, mechanical and electrical system upgrades</i>		
<b>SOFT COSTS: Permits, Fees, Design Costs (12%)</b>	<b>\$ 90,634.80</b>	
<b>CONTINGENCY (10%)</b>	<b>\$ 283,952.48</b>	
<b>SUB TOTAL</b>		<b>\$ 3,123,477.28</b>
<b>POTENTIAL INFRASTRUCTURE FUNDING</b>	<b>\$ (1,041,159.00)</b>	<b>(000.00)</b>
<b>SUB TOTAL</b>		<b>\$ (1,041,159.00)</b>
<b>TOTAL</b>		<b>\$ 2,082,318.28</b>

The intent is to prepare the EBMA for transition from a year round arena to a winter arena and summer event hub that will contribute to the vibrancy of the downtown core. Although no detailed design has been completed, this budget has been incorporated into the Ontario Community Infrastructure Improvement Fund (CIIF) application submitted on August 24, 2012.

*Staff Report, EMC 2012-01, August 27, 2012, Last Modified August 21, 2012, [TOC0202501](#)*

372. At 4:36 pm, Marjory Leonard forwarded a substantially similar draft Pool/Arena Staff Report to Ed Houghton, writing, “This is where we sit today. I believe the numbers Dave has given for EBMA and the pre-engineered steel building are accurate. The Sprung numbers are made up.” Mr. Houghton forwarded Ms. Leonard’s email to Deputy Mayor Rick Lloyd approximately ten minutes later with no comment.

*Email chain including Marjory Leonard, Ed Houghton and Rick Lloyd, August 21, 2012, [TOC0202601](#) and [TOC0202602](#)*

### 7.13 Acting CAO Ed Houghton Asks Sprung and BLT to Present at Council Meeting; EMC Member Larry Irwin Inquires About a “Two Envelope Submission”

373. At 4:41 pm on August 21, 2012, Ed Houghton emailed the EMC, writing:

I just got off the line with Sprung BLT and was talking to them about their pricing. They finally have all of the prices and I wanted to let you know what form I have asked them to provide to us.

I have asked for a price for the two buildings which would include the mezzanine in the arena but an option price for one in the pool. I have asked for a price for the non-building items that are the same for all applications such as zamboni, drop down score board, big screen tv's etc. I have then asked for a total turn key price for both buildings and the non-building items.

I have no clue what the price is because I didn't want them to tell me until it is in the form we want.

Finally, I have asked them to prepare a presentation for Monday night that will take place after the other delegations are complete.

Let me know if this meets with your approval...

*Email chain including Ed Houghton, Sara Almas, Marjory Leonard, and Larry Irwin, August 21, 2012, [TOC0202596](#)*

374. Marjory Leonard replied, “Ok by me.” Larry Irwin replied to Mr. Houghton’s email, asking, “Is there any benefit for them to submit in a 2 envelope fashion? I.e. Item in one and price in the other?” Mr. Houghton responded, “Not a bad thought. Let me mull that over.”

*Email chain including Ed Houghton, Sara Almas, Marjory Leonard, and Larry Irwin, August 21, 2012, [TOC0202596](#)*

*Email chain including Ed Houghton, Sara Almas, Marjory Leonard, and Larry Irwin, August 21, 2012, [TOC0202611](#)*

### 7.14 Director of Parks and Recreation Marta Proctor Goes on Vacation While Pool/Arena Staff Report is Drafted

375. Marta Proctor took vacation from August 22 – 24, 2012 and August 29 – 31, 2012.

*Email from Marta Proctor to Megan Schollenberger and Mandy Long, August 21, 2012, [TOC0202578](#)*

*Email from Marta Proctor to Denis Seymour, Wendy Martin, Michelle Kusiar, Karen Cubitt, Mandy Long, Marjory Leonard, Kay Blakely, Susan Churchward, August 21, 2012, [TOC0202597](#)*

376. At the end of the day on August 21, 2012, Ed Houghton emailed the EMC, writing,

Dale West just told me that Marta was feeling left out of the Central Park solution we are putting together. I told him that she advised us that she would be away for 2 weeks during this time and in fact was planning to be off on the 27th. This really upsets me that we are scrambling to do what Council has asked and she tells another Councillor that we are leaving her out.

*Email chain including Ed Houghton, Marjory Leonard, Sara Almas, and Larry Irwin, August 21, 2012, [EHH0000010](#)*

377. Larry Irwin replied to Ed Houghton's email, stating that he understood that she was "...stepping back based on her 2 week vacation." Ms. Almas replied that there had been "a million mtgs with her on this!" Mr. Houghton responded, "It is disappointing..."

*Email chain including Ed Houghton, Marjory Leonard, Sara Almas, and Larry Irwin, August 21, 2012, [EHH0000010](#)*

## 7.15 The Town Receives an Expression of Interest from a Dome Company Which is Not Circulated

378. On August 22, 2012, PRC Administrative Assistant Mandy Long forwarded Marta Proctor and Penny Skelton a letter dated July 30, 2012 from the Great Lakes Dome Company seeking to make a presentation about its monolithic domes for Collingwood's recreation needs. Ms. Long asked, "Should I circulate full copy to the committee as correspondence? Or keep it as promotional material for products much like other material we receive?" Ms. Skelton responded,

I was contacted after an appearance at Council by these folks. I forwarded their contact information and website on to the Mayor and Deputy-Mayor as they were discussing the possibility of covering the Centennial Pool.

I think that we just keep it as promotional material , and keep it on file in the office, no need to circulate.

*Email and attachment from Mandy Long to Marta Proctor and Penny Skelton, August 22, 2012, [TOC0202971](#) and [TOC0202972](#)*

*Email chain including Mandy Long, Penny Skelton, and Marta Proctor, August 22, 2012, [TOC0203042](#)*

## 7.16 BLT Provides “Final Numbers” for the Arena and Pool to the Town

379. On August 22, 2012 at 8:40 am, Abby Stec emailed Dave Barrow, copying Paul Bonwick, and said: “As per my voicemail please get the numbers to Ed ASAP”.

*Email from Abby Stec to Dave Barrow and Paul Bonwick, August 22, 2012, [CJI0007212](#)*

380. At 1:29 pm on August 22, 2012, Marjory Leonard emailed Dave McNalty, and asked if he had received anything from Sprung yet. Mr. McNalty answered “not yet.” Ms. Leonard replied, “I guess we won’t have this report ready for noon tomorrow!”

*Email chain including Marjory Leonard and Dave McNalty, August 22, 2012, [TOC0517073](#)*

381. At 1:39 pm on August 22, 2012, Dave Barrow emailed Ed Houghton, writing “Here are the final Numbers for both arena and pool buildings...Please review and let me know.” The budgets provided detailed information on a line item basis, including for a number of “options.” The Centennial Pool budget provided a “grand total less options” of \$3,225,660.82. The Collingwood Arena budget provided a “grand total less options” of \$7,392,047.62.

*Email and attachments from Dave Barrow to Ed Houghton, August 22, 2012, [CJI0007135](#), [CJI0007135\\_0001](#), and [CJI0007135\\_0002](#)*

382. Ed Houghton responded to Dave Barrow at 1:49 pm on August 22, 2012: “Thanks Dave can you give me the totals? le) pool, mezzanine for pool; ice pad, accessories and then the overall total.” Mr. Barrow responded at 2:06 pm, “I will do right away.”

*Email chain including Ed Houghton and Dave Barrow, August 22, 2012, [TOC0202913](#)*

383. At 2:35 pm on August 22, 2012, Marjory Leonard emailed Ed Houghton: “Ed any word yet?” Mr. Houghton replied, “I have something but getting clarification.”

*Email chain including Ed Houghton and Marjory Leonard, August 22, 2012, [TOC0202950](#)*

384. At 2:56 pm on August 22, 2012, Dave Barrow sent Ed Houghton pool and arena budgets. The arena budget provided a \$7,392,047.62 total without options, and a with-options

total of \$7,896,303.82 (the “August 22 Arena Budget”). The pool budget provided a \$3,225,660.82 total price without options, and a total budget of \$3,734,113.12 with options included (the “August 22 Pool Budget”). The budgets did not include HST. Mr. Houghton forwarded Mr. Barrow’s email to Marjory Leonard, who forwarded it to Dave McNalty. Mr. McNalty replied the next morning, “I will soon have a budget for a second floor mezzanine/lounge for the steel arena.”

*Email from Dave Barrow to Ed Houghton, August 22, 2012, [TOC0202989](#), [TOC0202990](#), [TOC0202991](#)*

*Email chain including Ed Houghton, Marjory Leonard and Dave McNalty, August 22-23, 2012, [TOC0203337](#)*

## 7.17 Comparison of BLT’s August 21 and August 22 Budgets for the Pool and Arena

385. [Summary Document 2-6](#) compares the August 21 Pool Budget and the August 21 Arena Budget that Dave Barrow emailed to Abby Stec at 10:46 am and the August 22 Arena Budget and August 22 Pool Budget that Dave Barrow emailed Ed Houghton at 2:56 pm. Except as set out in the Summary Document, the unit price for the items listed in the budgets increased by 6.5% from August 21 to August 22.

*[Summary Document 2-6](#): Central Park Arena and Centennial Pool: August 21 and August 22 Budget Comparisons*

## 7.18 Deputy Mayor Rick Lloyd Contacts Paul Bonwick about a Sprung Meeting with the Mayor of Wasaga; Paul Bonwick Raises Deputy Mayor Lloyd’s Concerns with Sprung and BLT

386. At 9:29 pm on August 22, 2012, Deputy Mayor Rick Lloyd emailed Paul Bonwick stating:

I must say that I was rather surprised to hear from your Cousin Wasaga Mayor Cal Patterson that he had a meeting last week with Sprung. Cal told us this when he overheard you speaking about our plans for Monday night and the proposed Sprung building. I must say that I was disappointed that you had not informed me about this presentation because if Cal wasn't supportive he could have caused us a great deal of embarrassment especially when he grew up in Collingwood and as County Warden.

*Email chain including Rick Lloyd, Paul Bonwick, Tom Lloyd, Mark Watts, David MacNeil, Dave Barrow, and Abby Stec, August 22, 2012, [CJI0007255](#)*

387. At 9:46 pm on August 22, 2012, Paul Bonwick forwarded the above email to Dave Barrow, Mark Watts, Tom Lloyd, Dave MacNeil, and Abby Stec. He wrote:

Can someone help me respond to this e-mail I received from the Deputy Mayor of Collingwood?

I would suggest, if it's true, that there are discussions taking place with Wasaga Beach officials at this critical juncture in time we all look uncoordinated at best and incompetent at worst. The Mayor of Wasaga Beach (also County Warden) is a cousin of the Mayor of Collingwood and best friends with Councillor Edwards. Imagine if Mayor Patterson wasn't impressed or felt Collingwood should put the brakes on and look at combing their efforts with Wasaga! Anyone of these or other scenarios could have a detrimental effect at this stage of the process.

My understanding was we were attempting to create a model as one team that we could emulate in other jurisdictions, specifically Simcoe County and other municipalities.

*Email chain including Rick Lloyd, Paul Bonwick, Tom Lloyd, Mark Watts, David MacNeil, Dave Barrow, and Abby Stec, August 22, 2012, [CJI0007255](#)*

388. At 10:43 pm, Dave Barrow responded:

Is this the same incident we talked about the other day? I'm not sure what we can do at this point other than what we suggested last conversation. Stop all talks with any regions until deal is sealed. That was what I got from our conversation. Tom you need to get your boys and let them all know no conversations or deals until we sign this deal and resolve tomorrow on conference.

*Email chain including Rick Lloyd, Paul Bonwick, Tom Lloyd, Mark Watts, David MacNeil, Dave Barrow, and Abby Stec, August 22, 2012, [CJI0007255](#)*

389. At 10:58 pm, Abby Stec responded, "Agreed."

*Email chain including Rick Lloyd, Paul Bonwick, Tom Lloyd, Mark Watts, David MacNeil, Dave Barrow, and Abby Stec, August 22, 2012, [CJI0007255](#)*

390. On August 23, 2012 at 7:38 am, Paul Bonwick responded to Dave Barrow's email, writing:

Hi Guys... I spoke to Abby and in turns out I excused myself from the discussion prior to this topic being addressed.

Abby informed me that everyone was caught off guard and that it appears to be just a regular sales call...

All that said, I believe it would be beneficial for all concerned to stand down for one week until we get these two put to bed.

I would recommend we meet shortly after Monday night Council and discuss further opportunities and approach.

*Email chain including Rick Lloyd, Paul Bonwick, Tom Lloyd, Mark Watts, David MacNeil, Dave Barrow, and Abby Stec, August 22-23, 2012, [CJ10007211](#)*

## 7.19 Paul Bonwick Sends an Article Criticizing a Public Private Partnership Funded Arena to Mayor Sandra Cooper and Deputy Mayor Rick Lloyd and Suggests that Treasurer Marjory Leonard Distribute it

391. On August 23, 2012, Paul Bonwick emailed a link to a Toronto Life article to Mayor Sandra Cooper, Deputy Mayor Rick Lloyd and Ed Houghton, writing, "...this may be a useful article to read for members of Council and Staff. It would be very useful to have Marjory send it out as an example of how an expensive private partnership can go wrong!"

*Email from Paul Bonwick to Sandra Cooper, Rick Lloyd, and Ed Houghton, August 23, 2012, [TOC0203329.0001](#)*

*"Apparently the Mastercard Centre for Hockey Excellence is a financial sinkhole", <https://torontolife.com/city/toronto-politics/ice-rink-sinkhole/>, John McGrath, Toronto Life, June 14, 2011, [CJ10011192](#)*

392. The article, dated June 14, 2011 and titled "Apparently the Mastercard Centre for Hockey Excellence is a financial sinkhole", was about the Mastercard Centre for Hockey Excellence, a private four-pad ice hockey arena in Etobicoke. The article reported that city hall had provided \$35.5 million in capital guarantees for the arena, and that the investors could not make the related loan payments. Mr. Bonwick commented, "Classic example of what happens when you over build."

*Email from Paul Bonwick to Sandra Cooper, Rick Lloyd and Ed Houghton, August 23, 2012, [TOC0203329.0001](#)*

*"Apparently the Mastercard Centre for Hockey Excellence is a financial sinkhole", <https://torontolife.com/city/toronto-politics/ice-rink-sinkhole/>, John McGrath, Toronto Life, June 14, 2011, [CJ10011192](#)*

## 7.20 Councillor Kevin Lloyd Replies to Concerns from the Public about Central Park; Councillor Joe Gardhouse Requests a Copy of the Pool/Arena Staff Report

393. On August 23, 2012, Councillor Kevin Lloyd exchanged emails with a citizen about the Central Park projects. Town Council was copied on this email exchange, which is described in [Summary Document 2-5](#). Among other things, Councillor Lloyd wrote:

A report will be presented on Monday that enables us to proceed with the vision, constructing an affordable, high quality, state of the art (Silver Leeds) ice pad at Central Park. There is nothing substandard or temporary about the building.

*Email from Kevin Lloyd to Member of the Public, Town Councillors, Mayor Sandra Cooper, Ed Houghton, Sara Almas, Marjory Leonard, and Larry Irwin, August 23, 2012, [TOC0203438](#)*

[Summary Document 2-5](#): Council, Staff, and Public Discussions Related to the Town's Recreational Facilities, chapter 1.5

394. Councillor Joe Gardhouse forwarded Councillor Lloyd's email to Council, asking for a copy of the staff report that Councillor Lloyd referenced. Various councillors, Ed Houghton and members of the EMC exchanged emails that evening regarding Councillor Gardhouse's request. Councillor Gardhouse subsequently wrote that the Mayor had advised him there was no staff report, adding: "I'll call Ed & find out what catalogues I should be reading.... As well as what a Sprung Building Is..."? These emails are detailed further in [Summary Document 2-5](#).

*Email chain including Joe Gardhouse, Kevin Lloyd, Sandra Cooper, Ed Houghton, Sara Almas, Marjory Leonard, Larry Irwin, Marta Proctor, Town Councillors and Member of the Public, August 23, 2012, [TOC0203841](#)*

[Summary Document 2-5](#): Council, Staff, and Public Discussions Related to the Town's Recreational Facilities, chapter 1.5

## 7.21 The EMC and Dave McNalty Continue to Revise the Draft Pool/Arena Staff Report

395. Dave McNalty sent Marjory Leonard an email at 9:30 am on August 23, 2012 with the subject line, "Arena and Pool", providing a spreadsheet titled "Ice and Water Cost Comparisons" and advising that he would, "call to discuss attached". Ms. Leonard responded, "Ready anytime." The Ice and Water Cost Comparisons document was a

spreadsheet comparing “Twin Ice Pad and Community Centre Budget”, “Pre-Eng Steel Building”, and “Insulated Fabric Membrane Structure”.

*Email and attachment from Dave McNalty to Marjory Leonard, August 23, 2012, [TOC0203363](#) and [TOC0203364](#)*

*Email chain including Dave McNalty and Marjory Leonard, August 23, 2012, [TOC0203365](#)*

396. Marjory Leonard sent the EMC and Dave McNalty another draft of the Pool/Arena Staff Report at 12:02 pm on August 23, 2012, writing “Can we perhaps discuss this one shortly after lunch? I am just about written out!” Mr. Irwin responded at 2:30: “Sorry Marj, Just saw this are we still meeting with regard to this today or am I too late.” Ms. Leonard replied, “I hope we are meeting sometime today.”

*Email and attachment from Marjory Leonard to Ed Houghton, Larry Irwin, Sara Almas, and Dave McNalty, August 23, 2012, [TOC0203550](#) and [TOC0203551](#)*

*Email chain including Marjory Leonard, Ed Houghton, Larry Irwin, Sara Almas, and Dave McNalty, August 23, 2012, [TOC0203664](#)*

397. The August 23, 2012 draft of the Pool/Arena Staff Report included detailed capital cost estimates for the pool, the arena and the Eddie Bush Memorial Arena, with a total combined minimum capital costs requirement of \$16,234,490 and a total maximum capital costs requirement of \$20,255,505, with an additional \$1 million in site preparation costs that it said would be incurred no matter which type of building was chosen.

*Email and attachment from Marjory Leonard to Ed Houghton, Larry Irwin, Sara Almas, and Dave McNalty, August 23, 2012, [TOC0203550](#) and [TOC0203551](#)*

398. The August 23, 2012 draft of the Pool/Arena Staff Report revised the capital costs of the single pad arena. The draft added the \$995,037.02 cost of a 2<sup>nd</sup> Floor Mezzanine/Lounge to the cost of a pre-engineered steel building. The cost of the insulated fabric membrane structure was increased to \$7,534,800.22. The capital costs were presented in the below table:

<b>PRE-ENG STEEL BUILDING</b>	\$ 6,856,157.26	<b>INSULATED FABRIC MEMBRANE STRUCTURE</b>	\$ 7,534,800.22
<i>Single Ice Pad with potential to be twinned in the future. Placement of the arena in the park determines displaced amenities and future evolution towards the complete multi-use complex.</i>		<i>Single Ice Pad with layout planned for future additional arena. Placement of the arena in the park determines displaced amenities.</i>	
SUB TOTAL	\$ 6,856,157.26	SUB TOTAL	\$ 7,534,800.22
<b>RECOMMENDED UPGRADES</b>		<b>OPTIONAL UPGRADES</b>	
Green Roof	\$ 100,000.00		
Sub Floor Heating	\$ 50,000.00		
Radiant Floor Heating	\$ 600,000.00		
Cistern and Dual Plumbing System	\$ 100,000.00		
Structure to Support Photo-Voltaics	\$ 100,000.00		
Building Automation System	\$ 200,000.00		
Upgrade Insulation??			
2nd Floor Mezzanine/Lounge	\$ 995,037.02		
SUB TOTAL	\$ 2,145,037.02		
<b>SITE AND PARK DEVELOPMENT</b>	\$ 1,164,281.00	<b>SITE AND PARK DEVELOPMENT</b>	\$ 1,164,281.00
DESIGN FEES/PERMITS/MISCELLANEOUS (5%)	\$ 508,273.76	DESIGN FEES/PERMITS (ALLOWANCE)	\$ 100,000.00
CONTINGENCY (10%)	\$ 1,067,374.90	CONTINGENCY (5%)	\$ 434,954.06
SUB TOTAL	\$ 2,739,929.67	SUB TOTAL	\$ 1,699,235.06
<b>TOTAL</b>	\$ <b>11,741,123.94</b>	<b>TOTAL</b>	\$ <b>9,234,035.28</b>

*Email and attachment from Marjory Leonard to Ed Houghton, Larry Irwin, Sara Almas, and Dave McNalty, August 23, 2012, [TOC0203550](#) and [TOC0203551](#)*

399. The August 23, 2012 draft of the Pool/Arena Staff Report also provided projected annual additional operating costs of \$270,000 for the pool and \$92,300 for the combined operation of the Eddie Bush arena, the new arena, and the curling club.

*Email and attachment from Marjory Leonard to Ed Houghton, Larry Irwin, Sara Almas, and Dave McNalty, August 23, 2012, [TOC0203550](#) and [TOC0203551](#)*

400. The August 23, 2012 draft of the Pool/Arena Staff Report included the following information about the "Effect on Town Finances":

We have the following funds available:

Reserve	\$1,500,000
County – purchase of Poplar Sideroad	\$1,300,000
COLLUS	\$8,000,000
Potential DC – Heritage Park – parking/landscaping (22%)	\$ 88,000
Potential DC – Central Park – arena enclosure (18%)	<u>\$ 821,488</u>
Total available	<u>\$11,709,488</u>

This would leave a minimum of \$4,525,000 and a maximum of \$8,546,000 requiring long term financing.

Current debenture repayment amounts for the above calculate to:

Term	Interest Rate	\$4,525,000	\$8,546,000
5 Yrs	2.2%	\$960,651	\$1,814,303
10 Yrs	2.87%	\$523,752	\$989,169
15 Yrs	3.28%	\$384,356	\$721,901
20 Yrs	3.55%	\$317,915	\$600,420

*Email and attachment from Marjory Leonard to Ed Houghton, Larry Irwin, Sara Almas, and Dave McNalty, August 23, 2012, [TOC0203550](#) and [TOC0203551](#)*

401. Dave McNalty emailed the EMC at 5:59 pm on August 23, 2012, advising that he was, “Working on another draft. Same information but a different approach to the report. You should have it in the morning.” Ms. Almas replied at 6:49 pm, asking “Do you want me to still work on a couple ‘recommendation’ scenarios?” Mr. McNalty responded, “I would wait...”

*Email chain including Dave McNalty, Ed Houghton, Sara Almas, Marjory Leonard, and Larry Irwin, August 23, 2012, [TOC0203834](#)*

402. Dave McNalty emailed Ed Houghton at 7:08 pm on August 23, 2012, asking, “Is your thinking that the procurement is done? Or that we still need to go through the process of an RFP or something?”

*Email chain including Dave McNalty, Ed Houghton, Sara Almas, Marjory Leonard, and Larry Irwin, August 23, 2012, [TOC0203834](#)*

403. Marjory Leonard emailed Dave McNalty and the EMC at 8:27 pm on August 23, 2012, writing:

Dave, I think we have done our due diligence for procurement purposes already.

We supplied our wish list to BLT/Sprung and they were aware that they were competing against two other forms of construction. Nobody possesses the Tedlar technology; nobody else can prove that they have done this type of construction without collapse; nobody else can provide the LEED components in their basic construction.

*Email from Marjory Leonard to Dave McNalty, Ed Houghton, Sara Almas, and Larry Irwin, August 23, 2012, [TOC0517069](#)*

404. Dave McNalty sent a revised draft Staff Report to the EMC at 11:45 pm on August 23.

*Email and attachment from Dave McNalty to Ed Houghton, Marjory Leonard, Sara Almas, and Larry Irwin, August 23, 2012, [TOC0203890](#) and [TOC0203891](#)*

405. Dave McNalty's August 23, 2012 draft Pool/Arena Staff Report included the following recommendations:

...

**THAT** Council provides direction to staff on the option of a year round Insulated Fabric Membrane cover for the existing Outdoor Pool,

And,

**THAT** Council provides direction to staff on the preferred approach to the construction of a year round Single Pad Ice Arena in Central Park.

*Email and attachment from Dave McNalty to Ed Houghton, Marjory Leonard, Sara Almas, and Larry Irwin, August 23, 2012, [TOC0203890](#) and [TOC0203891](#)*

406. Dave McNalty's draft Pool/Arena Staff Report did not mention the use of Requests for Proposals. It moved the detailed list of design components to the Report's appendices.

*Email and attachment from Dave McNalty to Ed Houghton, Marjory Leonard, Sara Almas, and Larry Irwin, August 23, 2012, [TOC0203890](#) and [TOC0203891](#)*

407. With respect to the pool, Dave McNalty's draft Pool/Arena Staff Report included the statement that, "We are only aware of one (1) supplier of the type of Insulated Fabric

Membrane structure that would allow for satisfactory year round swimming pool use...”  
The draft did not include the statement that Staff was not aware of other pools of this construction in Ontario.

*Email and attachment from Dave McNalty to Ed Houghton, Marjory Leonard, Sara Almas, and Larry Irwin, August 23, 2012, [TOC0203890](#) and [TOC0203891](#)*

408. Regarding the arena, the draft report did not include any reference to staff investigating a “bricks and mortar” option. It stated:

Staff is confident, on the basis of the research into options for a Single Pad Ice Arena in Central Park, that the most cost effective and time-efficient option for construction is an Insulated Fabric Membrane structure. The technology utilized in this building system is innovative and presents well for energy efficiency and the environment. The arena will not only satisfy the immediate ice needs of the community but will also further enhance the Town’s image as a leader in the adoption of new technologies.

*Email and attachment from Dave McNalty to Ed Houghton, Marjory Leonard, Sara Almas, and Larry Irwin, August 23, 2012, [TOC0203890](#) and [TOC0203891](#)*

409. Dave McNalty’s draft Pool/Arena Staff Report removed the detailed staff estimates for the capital costs of the pool and arena, and the estimated operating costs. It also removed site and park development costs of \$1,164,281, the design fees and permits allowance of \$100,000, and the 5% contingency of \$434,954.06 from the cost of the Insulated Fabric Membrane option.

*Email and attachment from Dave McNalty to Ed Houghton, Marjory Leonard, Sara Almas, and Larry Irwin, August 23, 2012, [TOC0203890](#) and [TOC0203891](#)*

410. Ed Houghton circulated a further revised draft of the Pool/Arena at 7:34 am on August 24, 2012, writing, “A few changes and I’m sure a few more. “

*Email chain and attachment including Ed Houghton, Dave McNalty, Larry Irwin, Marjory Leonard and Sara Almas, August 23-24, 2012, [TOC0203896](#) and [TOC0203897](#)*

411. Mr. Houghton’s August 24, 2012 draft Pool/Arena Staff Report included the following information about the capital costs:

Total Pool Enclosure Cost	- \$3,225,000
Site Servicing Allowance (same for all options)	- \$ 200,000

Total Single Pad Arena Costs	- \$7,476,000
Accessories such as Zamboni & Score Board Costs	- \$ 316,000
Site Servicing Allowance (same for all options)	- \$ 200,000

*Email chain and attachment including Ed Houghton, Dave McNalty, Larry Irwin, Marjory Leonard and Sara Almas, August 23-24, 2012, [TOC0203896](#) and [TOC0203897](#)*

412. Ed Houghton also changed the reference to an “Insulated Fabric Membrane” to refer to a “Insulated Architectural Membrane”.

*Email chain and attachment including Ed Houghton, Dave McNalty, Larry Irwin, Marjory Leonard and Sara Almas, August 23-24, 2012, [TOC0203896](#) and [TOC0203897](#)*

413. On August 24, 2012, at 10:46 am, Marjory Leonard sent Dave McNalty and the EMC an email with the subject line “procurement section”, writing:

In terms of our procurement process, staff have exercised due diligence in the research of potential forms of construction and feel that there would be no additional advantage to be gained from a further tender process for the following reasons:

Element of competition was included in the gathering of estimates: the manufacturers of the Architectural Membrane structure knew that they were in competition with the more traditional forms of construction; WGD Architects knew that they were in competition with the Architectural Membrane structure when producing estimates.

Cost effectiveness and benefit to the Town: through the investigative process, it has been determined that the Architectural Membrane structure would provide the most cost effective and all inclusive solution to our needs.

Sole Source: again, through our research, it has been determined that there is only one supplier that can meet the specifications staff developed for the facilities.

If one of the more traditional forms of construction had been determined to provide the most cost effective solution there would have been a further need to issue an RFP for construction since there are many companies capable of providing this service.

*Email from Marjory Leonard to Ed Houghton, Larry Irwin, Sara Almas and Dave McNalty, August 24, 2012, [TOC0204034](#)*

414. At 11:21 am, Sara Almas emailed draft council recommendation language to the EMC, David McNalty, and Deputy Mayor Lloyd, asking for comments. The draft language was:

**THAT** Council receive staff report EMC 2012-01,

**AND FURTHER THAT** Council direct staff to proceed with the construction of a Sprung insulated architectural membrane facility for a year-round single pad ice arena at central park, maintaining 2 ball diamonds, the outdoor ice rink, lawn bowling facility, and additional green space – while maintaining the option to twin the arena at a future date;

**AND FURTHER THAT** Council direct staff to proceed with installing a Sprung insulated architectural membrane structure over the existing Centennial Pool, and removing the existing building to provide a year-round pool to meet the community’s aquatic and competitive swimming needs.

*Email chain including Sara Almas, Dave McNalty, Marjory Leonard, Ed Houghton, Rick Lloyd, and Larry Irwin, August 24, 2012, [TOC0204140](#)*

415. At 11:45 am, Dave McNalty replied to the group, subject line, “RE: Staff Report No. EMC 2012-01 - Discussion Section – includes Marjory’s comments”. Mr. McNalty’s revisions to this section included the following statements:

- a. “The procurement process recommended for the supply and construction of the Outdoor Pool enclosure and the Single Ice Pad at Central Park is a direct purchase of the facilities from the supplier. Staff have exercised due diligence...” and,
- b. "...There is only one manufacturer of Architectural Membrane structures that has a proven track record of success and that distributes this technology.”

*Email chain including Ed Houghton, Dave McNalty, Marjory Leonard, Larry Irwin, and Sara Almas, August 24, 2012, [TOC0204100](#)*

416. Dave McNalty sent the following revised recommendation language at 12:02 pm:

**THAT** Council receive staff report EMC 2012-01,

**AND FURTHER THAT** Council direct staff to proceed with the purchase and construction of an Insulated Architectural Membrane facility for a year-round single pad ice arena at Central Park, maintaining 2 ball diamonds, the outdoor ice rink, the lawn bowling facility, and additional green space – while keeping the option to twin the new arena at a future date;

**AND FURTHER THAT** Council direct staff to proceed with the purchase and construction of an Insulated Architectural Membrane structure over the existing Outdoor Pool and including the removal and reconstruction of the existing building,

in order to provide a year-round pool to meet the community’s aquatic and competitive swimming needs.

*Email chain including Sara Almas, Dave McNalty, Marjory Leonard, Ed Houghton, Rick Lloyd, and Larry Irwin, August 24, 2012, [TOC0204140](#)*

417. Clerk Sara Almas replied to the group with her approval, copying Mayor Cooper and Deputy Clerk Megan Schollenberger on her email.

*Email chain including Sara Almas, Dave McNalty, Marjory Leonard, Ed Houghton, Rick Lloyd, Larry Irwin, Megan Schollenberger, and Sandra Cooper, August 24, 2012, [TOC0204156](#)*

418. Ed Houghton circulated a revised draft to the EMC and Dave McNalty at 12:05 pm on August 24, 2012. Under the consideration for the new single pad arena, this version of the report reduced the cost of the basic Insulated Architectural Membrane arena to \$7,392,000 and increased the cost of the Pre-Engineered Steel arena to “\$11,100,000 to \$12,300,000.” It added a note that the Final Report stated a double pad arena would cost \$25,300,000.

*Email and attachment from Ed Houghton to Sara Almas, Dave McNalty, Marjory Leonard, and Larry Irwin, August 24, 2012, [TOC0204146](#) and [TOC0204147](#)*

419. Under the consideration for the Eddie Bush Memorial Arena, the report omitted the sentence “This results in a potential expenditure of \$2,124,000 for the Town in relation to the proposed improvements to the EBMA.”

*Email and attachment from Ed Houghton to Sara Almas, Dave McNalty, Marjory Leonard, and Larry Irwin, August 24, 2012, [TOC0204146](#) and [TOC0204147](#)*

420. Under the Effect on Town Finances section, the report added a summary of the total costs:

The Total Cost of the Two Buildings is	\$10,617,000
Accessory Costs	\$316,000
Site Servicing Costs for Both Buildings	\$700,000
Total Cost (less taxes)	\$11,633,000

*Email and attachment from Ed Houghton to Sara Almas, Dave McNalty, Marjory Leonard, and Larry Irwin, August 24, 2012, [TOC0204146](#) and [TOC0204147](#)*

421. The report omitted information about the debenture costs for amounts not covered by the available finances.

*Email and attachment from Ed Houghton to Sara Almas, Dave McNalty, Marjory Leonard, and Larry Irwin, August 24, 2012, [TOC0204146](#) and [TOC0204147](#)*

422. Later that day on August 24, 2012, Ed Houghton sent the EMC an email with the subject line “Did You Know”, writing:

I have been reviewing the Central Park Redevelopment Project Report and it states the following:

The permit fees and design fees are stated in the report at \$2,504,000.

The contract administration fees are estimated at \$1,878,000

The relocation of ball diamonds is stated in the report at \$1,200,000.

The land for the relocation of ball diamonds is estimated at \$800,000.

The project contingency is stated in the report at \$5,507,000.

The total is \$11,889,000. The total of what we are proposing is \$11,600,00. Almost \$300,000 less.

Wow!

*Email chain including Ed Houghton, Marjory Leonard, Larry Irwin and Sara Almas, August 24, 2012, [EHH0000014](#)*

423. Marjory Leonard replied, “Wow is right”.

*Email chain including Ed Houghton, Marjory Leonard, Larry Irwin and Sara Almas, August 24, 2012, [EHH0000014](#)*

424. Ed Houghton sent the same email to Deputy Rick Mayor Lloyd and Councillor Kevin Lloyd, which is detailed further in [Summary Document 2-5](#).

*Email chain including Ed Houghton, Rick Lloyd and Kevin Lloyd, August 24, 2012, [TOC0204480](#)*

[Summary Document 2-5](#): Council, Staff, and Public Discussions Related to the Town’s Recreational Facilities, Chapter 1.5

## 7.22 Treasurer Marjory Leonard Answers Councillor Ian Chadwick's Tax Questions; Acting CAO Ed Houghton Explains the Amount of Available Collus Funds to Councillor Chadwick

425. On August 23, 2012 at 10:14 pm, Councillor Ian Chadwick wrote to Marjory Leonard and Ed Houghton, asking questions about tax consequences for "the average homeowner" and other funding questions related only to the MURF. He wrote:

1. What would it cost the average homeowner (in \$ and % of current tax bill) if we borrowed the entire amount (and for how many years would the debenture be)?
2. If we decided to build it in five years, how much would we have to put aside per year and what would that represent (\$ and %) to the average homeowner?
3. If we raised taxes 10% and dedicated all of that money to the project, how many years would it take to save \$35 million (assuming there were no other increases...) and how much would the town get out of that increase (50% of the total, with the rest going to school and county?)
4. How much (in \$ and % to the average taxpayer) would we have to raise to build it in three years?
5. Ditto for ten years.
6. If we do long-term planning like this - say a 5-year project - do we have a percentage we add to it to account for rising prices in the interim? For example, if the estimate is \$35m now, do we assume it will be 10% more in five years? Or more?
7. How much of the estimated \$10 million for the alternative proposal do we have available in reserves or other funds, and how much has to come from taxes and debentures?
8. Do you have figures for average or median household incomes in Collingwood? if so, can you please provide them.
9. How much does the YMCA pay in taxes or rent to the town every year? Do we have a lease agreement for the land they're on, and if so when does it come due for renewal?
10. How much would the town get annually if we raised all rec costs and rec user fees by 10%?

Thanks. I think you can see where I'm going, so anything you can add will be appreciated.

*Email chain including Marjory Leonard, Ian Chadwick, Ed Houghton, Rick Lloyd and Kevin Lloyd, August 23 and 24, 2012, [TOC0204450](#)*

426. Marjory Leonard replied to Councillor Chadwick's questions on August 24, 2012 at 4:33pm. Ms. Leonard said that her answers were based on taxes paid by the average homeowner in 2012, and included the following information:

- a. Borrowing \$35m through a 20 year debenture would increase the taxes paid by the average homeowner by 10.12%. Borrowing the same amount through a 40 year debenture would increase those taxes by 7.17%;
- b. If the Town set out to save \$35m in five years (i.e. \$7m per year), it would increase the average homeowner's taxes by 29.08%;
- c. If the Town raised taxes by 10%, it would take approximately 14.5 years to save \$35m (assuming no interest income was earned);
- d. Paying \$35m in three years would increase the average homeowner's taxes by 48.47% for those three years. Paying \$35m over ten years would increase the average homeowner's taxes by 14.54% for three years;
- e. An \$8m debenture would result in a 2.31% increase in taxes for the average homeowner; and
- f. The YMCA was on tax-exempt property, and she believed that the YMCA had a 99 year lease.

*Email chain including Marjory Leonard, Ian Chadwick, Ed Houghton, Rick Lloyd, and Kevin Lloyd, August 23 and 24, 2012, [TOC0204450](#)*

427. Ed Houghton forwarded Marjory Leonard's reply to Sara Almas, Larry Irwin, Mayor Sandra Cooper, and Deputy Mayor Rick Lloyd at 4:40 pm on August 24, 2012. Councillor Ian Chadwick forwarded the information to Councillor Kevin Lloyd and Deputy Mayor Lloyd at 5:16 pm on August 24, 2012. Deputy Mayor Lloyd replied, "PERFECT."

*Email chain including Marjory Leonard, Ian Chadwick, Ed Houghton, Rick Lloyd, Sara Almas, Larry Irwin and Sandra Cooper, August 23 and 24, 2012, [TOC0204410](#)*

*Email chain including Marjory Leonard, Ian Chadwick, Ed Houghton, Rick Lloyd and Kevin Lloyd, August 23 and 24, 2012, [TOC0204450](#)*

428. In an email exchange during the period between August 24 and August 27, 2012, Marjory Leonard responded to further questions from Councillor Chadwick about taxes that the YMCA could be paying to the Town.

*Email chain including Marjory Leonard, Ian Chadwick, and Ed Houghton, August 23-27, 2012, [TOC0517433](#)*

429. On August 25, 2012 at 6:09 pm, Councillor Ian Chadwick responded to Marjory Leonard's email chain responding to his tax questions, writing, "Woah. Did I miss something? \$8 million from Collus. It started out as \$15m, then got reduced to \$13, how it it dwindle to \$8m?" Ed Houghton responded to Councillor Chadwick and Ms. Leonard on August 26, 2012 at 7:29 am, writing:

You never missed anything. This \$8M was the portion that PowerStream gave to the Town. The Town still holds the \$1.7M promissory note and the recapitalization was just of \$4M which was just slightly north of \$14M. The amount was always mentioned to be between \$14 - \$15M with the real difference that we paid down more than a \$1.0M in regulated liability. This made our bottom line better (ie reduced liabilities by \$1M) but reduced the recapitalization by \$0.5M to the Town.

*Email chain including Marjory Leonard, Ian Chadwick, Kevin Lloyd, Rick Lloyd, and Ed Houghton, August 23-26, 2012, [TOC0204880](#)*

430. Councillor Chadwick forwarded Ed Houghton's email to Deputy Mayor Lloyd and Councillor Lloyd at 8:16 am on August 26, 2012, writing, "Are either of you aware that the Collus money was down to \$8 million? I don't recall that discussion. Did I miss something? It seems like an awful tumble from the optimism of \$15M back when the sale was first proposed." Councillor Lloyd responded at 8:19 am, "I believe there is another 7 plus million to come." Councillor Chadwick replied at 10:46 am, "Never mind. Ed called me and explained it. Brain fart. We have the money, but are keeping some for other projects... or we can spend it all. Our choice."

*Email chain including Marjory Leonard, Ian Chadwick, Kevin Lloyd, Rick Lloyd and Ed Houghton, August 23-27, 2012, [TOC0204880](#)*

## 7.23 Penny Skelton of the PRCAC meets with Mayor Sandra Cooper and the EMC to Discuss the Recreation Projects

431. On August 23, 2012, Penny Skelton sent an email to Paul Cadieux and Joe MacDonald detailing a meeting that she had with Mayor Sandra Cooper and the EMC. Ms. Skelton stated:

.... In a nutshell, Council is committed to investing in facilities in a reasonable time frame that meet the current and overdue needs of the community. Council accepted the Central Park Plan IN PRINCIPLE\*, and are now considering options which can be considered as 'phased- in projects'. The components are part of the Central Park Plan but not necessarily in the exact locations outlined in the report.

\* 'In Principle' adopts the 'idea' not necessarily the exact plan written in stone.

The sorts of buildings and construction techniques that are being investigated are not a band-aid approach, but permanent facilities which if necessary in the future could be moved leaving only the footings behind. Due diligence is being explored at all options. Honestly, the sort of material to be used to build the facilities is quite impressive, not a literal 'bricks and mortar building' but a permanent recreational facility for the community.

I know that everyone quotes my phrase, 'at the will of Council', but in fact this is the case, and consideration of options will be made by both the Council and Department.

Yes, all of this will have an effect on the operating budget of the municipality/department, Council and the Treasurer are well aware of the implications.

I believe that there is a genuine desire on the part of Council to provide needed facilities for the community at a cost the municipality can handle. Also, having a great plan and waiting on announcement of other level of government grants is a very tenuous management plan for facility development in this current fiscal climate.

I will be sending an email out to all committee members later today to remind them of the Council meeting and a link to the agenda so they can check it out. I think that if everyone attends and listens to the plans we will all have a better understanding of the project....

*Email chain including Penny Skelton, Paul Cadieux, Joe MacDonald, Sandra Cooper, Ed Houghton, Sara Almas, Larry Irwin, and Marjory Leonard, August 23, 2012, [TOC0549009](#)*

432. Penny Skelton forwarded the email to Ed Houghton and Sandra Cooper and thanked them for meeting with her. She also noted that she would be forwarding a version of the email to the members of the PRCAC. Mr. Houghton forwarded Ms. Skelton's emails to the other members of the EMC.

*Email chain including Penny Skelton, Paul Cadieux, Joe MacDonald, Sandra Cooper, Ed Houghton, Sara Almas, Larry Irwin and Marjory Leonard, August 23, 2012, [TOC0549009](#)*

## 7.24 Council Receives Information from Sprung before the August 27, 2012 Council Meeting

433. Abby Stec emailed Tom Lloyd and Dave Barrow at 10:31 am on August 24, 2012: "Hi guys, I need 3 more packages of the Sprung/BLT power point. Can you please send me the easiest format to print here..."

*Email from Abby Stec to Dave Barrow and Tom Lloyd, August 24, 2012, [CJ10007209](#)*

434. Sara Almas emailed Ed Houghton at 1:16 pm on August 24, 2012, asking if he wanted the Sprung packages hand delivered that day. Mr. Houghton responded, "Please. All but the DM." Ms. Almas confirmed with Mr. Houghton and made delivery arrangements with Staff. At 4:14pm, Deputy Clerk Megan Schollenberger emailed Council, writing:

... please note that information packages re: Sprung have been delivered to your homes for your review for the Council Meeting on Monday, August 27th, 2012.

Your Worship – please note that the Sprung Package is in your office.

*Email from Sara Almas to Ed Houghton, Megan Schollenberger and Tammy Legault, August 24, 2012, [TOC0204217](#)*

*Email chain including Sara Almas, Tammy Legault, Megan Schollenberger and Ed Houghton, August 24, 2012, [TOC0204215](#)*

*Email chain including Sara Almas, Tammy Legault, Megan Schollenberger and Ed Houghton, August 24, 2012, [TOC0204221](#)*

*Email from Megan Schollenberger to Town Councillors, Rick Lloyd, Sandra Cooper and Sara Almas, August 24, 2012, [TOC0204358](#)*

435. At 4:52 pm on August 24, 2012, Deputy Clerk Megan Schollenberger emailed Town Council and the Department Heads slide presentations for the August 27, 2012 Council meeting from Ameresco and the FOCP.

*Email and attachments from Megan Schollenberger to Town Councillors, Department Heads, and Becky Dahl, August 24, 2012, [TOC0204414](#), [TOC0204415](#), [TOC0204416](#), and [TOC0204417](#)*

## 7.25 The Pool/Arena Staff Report Recommends that Council Proceed with Sprung Structures to Construct a New Arena and Cover Centennial Pool

436. The Pool/Arena Staff Report was included in the Council Agenda for August 27, 2012.

*Council Agenda, August 27, 2012, [CJ10008012](#), p 2, 66*

437. The Pool/Arena Staff Report recommended that Council direct Staff to proceed with the purchase and construction of insulated membrane over the Central Park arena and the existing outdoor pool.

*Staff Report EMC 2012-01, August 27, 2012, [CJ10006146](#)*

438. With respect to covering the outdoor pool, the Pool/Arena Staff Report stated, among other things, that:

- a. A “significant advantage” is that “that the complete design and engineering works are included in the cost of the enclosure” and the “project would not be subject to additional engineering costs and contingencies”;
- b. The purchase would be limited to the membrane structure and interior components, “allowing the Town to construct the remaining site works independently, resulting in significant cost savings”;
- c. Staff were aware of only one supplier “...of the type of Insulated Architectural Membrane structure that would allow for satisfactory year round swimming pool use”; and
- d. The cost is estimated to be \$3,225,000 with an allowance of approximately \$200,000 for “site servicing, improvements to parking areas and necessary

landscaping”. The report further noted: “This work would be required in all options.”

*Staff Report EMC 2012-01, August 27, 2012, [CJI0006146](#)*

439. Regarding the construction of a new single-pad arena that could be phased into a double pad, the Pool/Arena Staff Report stated, among other things, that:
- a. Two types of construction were investigated, pre-engineered steel and an insulated membrane;
  - b. Certain site improvement costs will be incurred regardless the type of building;
  - c. The “intent will be to place the arena within Central Park to minimize the immediate displacement of existing recreational facilities while providing the best opportunities for the future park development within the proposed multi-use concept”;
  - d. Each type of arena would qualify for LEED Silver accreditation, however, a “significant difference” would be that the insulated membrane structure “has the LEED requirements built into its basic design, whereas the traditionally industrial Pre-Engineered Steel building must be modified to meet the requirements leading to additional engineering costs and custom components”;
  - e. The insulated membrane would be provided as a “turnkey” design and build solution and “the full costs of engineering and design are known and committed to at the time of order”;
  - f. “A minimal allowance for permits, fees and site design would be carried with the project”;
  - g. The estimated cost for the insulated membrane was “\$7,392,000 as compared to \$11,100,000 - \$12,300,000 (estimates provided by WGD) for the Pre Engineered Steel arena built using conventional construction methodology”;

- h. The insulated membrane allowed for “the efficient addition of a second floor lounge area with a view of the ice surface”, which was included in the estimate, whereas a similar addition to a pre-engineered steel arena would add \$1 million;
- i. “The costs of Central Park development will be minimized for the construction of an initial arena with either approach, however the Insulated Architectural Membrane arena procurement allows the Town to facilitate park development for site servicing, parking improvements and landscaping to proceed in a phased approach. An allowance of \$500,000 should be considered in this evaluation”; and
- j. Additional costs for accessories “such as Zamboni & Score Board Costs” would be \$316,000.

*Staff Report EMC 2012-01, August 27, 2012, [CJ10006146](#)*

440. The arena portion of the report concluded:

Staff is confident, on the basis of the research into options for a Single Pad Ice Arena in Central Park, that the most cost effective and time-efficient option for construction is an Insulated Architectural Membrane structure. The technology utilized in this building system is innovative and presents well for energy efficiency and the environment. The arena will not only satisfy the immediate ice needs of the community but will also further enhance the Town's image as a leader in the adoption of new and leading technologies.

*Staff Report EMC 2012-01, August 27, 2012, [CJ10006146](#)*

441. With regard to the Eddie Bush Memorial Arena, the Pool/Arena Staff Report noted:

An application has been submitted to the Ontario Community Infrastructure Improvement Fund (CIIF) for improvements to the Eddie Bush Memorial Arena (EBMA). With the addition of a year round ice arena in Central Park, the intent would be to prepare the EBMA for transition from a year round arena to a winter arena and summer event venue that will introduce new vibrancy to the downtown core. Although no detailed design has been completed, the budget for this project is set at \$3,124,000, of which \$1,000,000 may be recoverable in the form of a grant.

If CIIF funding is received, the timeline for completion is March 2014. In order to facilitate the proposed renovations a new year round ice facility must be in

operation or there would be major interruptions to the ice times available for user groups.

*Staff Report EMC 2012-01, August 27, 2012, [CJI0006146](#)*

442. The Pool/Arena Staff Report stated that “Staff have exercised due diligence in the research of potential forms of construction and feel that there would be no additional advantage to be gained from a further tender process for the following reasons”:
- a. “Element of competition was included in the gathering of estimates: the manufacturers of the Architectural Membrane structure knew they were in competition with the more traditional forms of construction; WGD Architects knew that they were in competition with the Architectural Membrane structures when producing estimates”;
  - b. “Cost effectiveness and benefits to the Town: through the investigative process, it has been determined that the Architectural Membrane structure would provide the most cost effective and all inclusive solution for the Town’s needs”;
  - c. “Sole Source: through Staff research, it has been determined that there is only one supplier that can meet the specifications Staff developed for the facilities”;  
and
  - d. “If one of the more traditional forms of construction had been determined to provide the most cost effective solution there would have been a further need to issue an RFP for construction since there are many companies capable of providing this service. There is only one manufacturer of Architectural Membrane structures that has a proven track record of success and that distributes this technology.”

*Staff Report EMC 2012-01, August 27, 2012, [CJI0006146](#)*

443. The Report stated that it had been reviewed by the EMC, Marta Proctor, and Dave McNalty, circulated to Department Heads, and that the comments received had been incorporated.

*Staff Report EMC 2012-01, August 27, 2012, [CJI0006146](#)*

444. The Pool/Arena Staff Report identified the following funds as available:

Reserve \$1,500,000

County – portion of Poplar Sideroad construction 2010 \$1,300,000

Collus PowerStream Partnership (to be confirmed by public) \$8,000,000

Potential DC – Heritage Park – parking/landscaping (22%) \$88,000

Potential DC – Central Park – arena enclosure (18%) \$821,488

Total Available (potentially) \$11,709,488

*Staff Report EMC 2012-01, August 27, 2012, [CJI0006146](#)*

445. The Report did not include the detailed information about current debenture repayment rates and amounts for the required financing.

*Staff Report EMC 2012-01, August 27, 2012, [CJI0006146](#)*

446. While it referenced work done by WGD, Staff Report EMC 2012-01 did not contain the WGD Report or any other WGD work product.

*Staff Report EMC 2012-01, August 27, 2012, [CJI0006146](#)*

*[Summary Document 2-4](#): WGD's Interaction with Collingwood Staff, Council and Residents (July-October 2012)*

447. On August 25, 2012, after the final Pool/Arena Report was circulated, Marta Proctor emailed Ed Houghton and the EMC stating:

I was wondering if you, and/or someone from the executive management team would have some time to review the arena and pool report on mondays agenda. I've reviewed the information and was hoping to clarify some of the numbers so I'm prepared to respond to any questions...

*Email chain including Marta Proctor, Ed Houghton, Sara Almas, Marjory Leonard, and Larry Irwin, August 25, 2012, [TOC0204740](#)*

448. Ed Houghton responded that Marta Proctor could call him the following day.

*Email chain including Marta Proctor, Ed Houghton, Sara Almas, Marjory Leonard, and Larry Irwin, August 25, 2012, [TOC0204740](#)*

## 7.26 Council Discuss Public Feedback in Advance of the August 27, 2012 Council Meeting and Respond to Emails from the Public

449. On August 24 and 25, 2012, Council received emails from members of the public speaking out against “temporary” facilities. These emails are described in [Summary Document 2-5](#).

*[Summary Document 2-5](#): Council, Staff, and Public Discussions Related to the Town’s Recreational Facilities, chapter 1.6*

450. On August 25, 2012, a citizen wrote to Councillor Ian Chadwick in favour of a new pool facility at Central Park. Councillor Chadwick forwarded the email to the other Councillors, Ed Houghton and Sara Almas, writing “Did everyone get this?” Deputy Mayor Rick Lloyd replied, “Yes more misinformed community members.” Mayor Sandra Cooper responded, “Monday will tell the story. Presentation will be informative.”

*Email chain including Member of the Public, Ian Chadwick, Sandy Cunningham, Town Councillors, Ed Houghton, and Sara Almas, August 25, 2012, [TOC0204819](#)*

*Email chain including Member of the Public, Ian Chadwick, Kevin Lloyd, Town Councillors, Ed Houghton, and Sara Almas, August 25, 2012, [TOC0204813](#)*

*Email chain including Member of the Public, Ian Chadwick, Dale West, Sandra Cooper, Town Councillors, Ed Houghton, and Sara Almas, August 25, 2012, [TOC0204817](#)*

*Email chain including Member of the Public, Ian Chadwick, Sandra Cooper, Rick Lloyd, Town Councillors, Ed Houghton, and Sara Almas, August 25, 2012, [TOC0204826](#)*

451. As part of this email exchange, Deputy Mayor Lloyd wrote Councillor Dale West directly:

I Need you to show leadership with the sprung proposal!

The. Americo proposal is only a delegation to Council and we never make any motions or recommend anything but only ask questions! Process!

The sprung proposal motion passed by Council was for staff to investigate and recommend, The motion being made To go with Sprung is as a result of the staff report!

So this should bail you out with Terry and Mark

*Email chain including Member of the Public, Ian Chadwick, Dale West, Sandra Cooper, Town Councillors, Ed Houghton, and Sara Almas, August 25, 2012, [TOC0204830](#)*

## 7.27 Acting CAO Ed Houghton Seeks to Ensure Mayor Sandra Cooper is “On Board”

452. On August 26, 2012, Councillor Kevin Lloyd emailed Council and Ed Houghton to explain why he opposed the MURF. Mayor Sandra Cooper responded: “Thank you for your explanation of logic. I look forward to our council meeting tomorrow since our conference participation.” Ed Houghton forwarded Mayor Cooper’s email to Deputy Mayor Rick Lloyd, stating: “Not sure what she means but I think we need to speak to Sandra today to ensure she is on board. In spite of what Paul says. Let me know when you are back”.

*Email chain including Ed Houghton, Rick Lloyd, Sandra Cooper, Kevin Lloyd, and Town Councillors, August 26, 2012, [TOC0204965](#)*

453. Mayor Sandra Cooper sent a second reply to Council, writing:

Sorry folks. pressed send too soon.

Councillor Lloyd, I appreciate your explanation on affordable recreation.

I look forward to discussion during our council meeting tomorrow.

I know that we have brought back some new ideas and insight during our recent attendance of AMO.

Again, I look forward to fulsome discussion in going forward.

*Email chain including Ed Houghton, Rick Lloyd, Sandra Cooper, Kevin Lloyd, and Town Councillors, August 26, 2012, [TOC0204993](#)*

454. Ed Houghton forwarded Mayor Sandra Cooper’s email to Deputy Mayor Rick Lloyd, writing, “... I just told her that I had difficulty understanding what she meant and that she might want to consider resending an email with further detail. I should have left it alone.”

*Email chain including Ed Houghton, Rick Lloyd, Sandra Cooper, Kevin Lloyd, and Town Councillors, August 26, 2012, [TOC0204993](#)*

455. Councillor Keith Hull replied to Mayor Sandra Cooper’s email message, asking “Who is making the presentation tomorrow evening representing Staff and is/will there be someone present that can answer questions specific to the structure?” Mayor Cooper replied:

Firstly, by now you should have received a hard copy of the presentation for tomorrow's meeting.

Ed will present the broad information.

Marjory will present the costing and procurement.

There will be a representative from Sprung who can answer specific questions council may have.

Marta has been on vacation for 2 1/2 weeks during this past 4 four weeks. Hence the executive management team being closely involved. Marta has provided some input to the staff report also.

*Email chain including Keith Hull, Sandra Cooper, Ed Houghton, and Town Councillors, August 26, 2012, [TOC0204989](#)*

## 7.28 Town Staff Consider the Increase in Operating Costs of the Sprung Structures

456. On August 26, 2012, Councillor Ian Chadwick emailed Marjory Leonard and Ed Houghton, asking Ms. Leonard to provide a copy of a recent report she had completed on the Town's debt. Ms. Leonard replied at 8:17 am on August 27, 2012, attaching two reports.

*Email chain and attachment including Ian Chadwick, Marjory Leonard, Ed Houghton, Sara Almas, and Larry Irwin, August 26-27, 2012, [TOC0517064](#) and [TOC0517065](#)*

457. Ed Houghton replied to Marjory Leonard's email, including the rest of the EMC, forwarding an excerpt from journalist Ian Adam's blog and asking, "Can we do an estimate of the losses." The excerpt from Mr. Adam's blog said:

...Does anyone realize that had council gone ahead with the recommendation to do a market sounding back in May when it had the chance, on Monday night it would have the chance to compare apples to apples.

Instead we're comparing apples with...well, something that aren't quite apples.

...

The current operating losses for the municipal pool are \$30,000 for a facility that operates three months of the year. Operating 12 months, what will the operating costs be then...

If the question can't be answered, then council must defer to discussion until it can be answered...

That would be the fiscally-responsible thing to do...

*Email chain and attachment including Ian Chadwick, Marjory Leonard, Ed Houghton, Sara Almas, and Larry Irwin, August 26-27, 2012, [TOC0517064](#) and [TOC0517065](#)*

458. Marjory Leonard responded to Ed Houghton's email, providing a spreadsheet of Centennial Pool Historical Data "for analysis", and writing:

...I estimate the operating loss would increase \$333,600 (\$275,000 more than we currently experience).

Marta and I did discuss this last Monday and we both felt that the loss would increase by around the \$270k mark without any real analysis. Staffing is the key.

*Email chain and attachment including Ed Houghton, Marjory Leonard, Sara Almas, and Larry Irwin, August 26-27, 2012, [TOC0517064](#) and [TOC0517065](#)*

459. At 10:07 am, Marjory Leonard emailed Dave McNalty, "...did Sprung provide us with pool operating estimates?" Mr. McNalty responded, "Not that I am aware of."

*Email chain including Marjory Leonard and Dave McNalty, August 27, 2012, [TOC0205193](#)*

## 7.29 Councillor Dale West and Deputy Mayor Rick Lloyd Discuss Financing for the Town's Recreational Facilities

460. On August 26, 2012, Councillor Dale West and Deputy Mayor Rick Lloyd exchanged emails regarding the steps Council had taken to locate other funding for the Town's recreational facilities. Deputy Mayor Lloyd explained that he didn't see fundraising as a viable option. He expressed his opinion that private partnerships are "...a real RED HERING as the private investors will demand a return on their investment and you can bet your ass they will want at least a 10 to 15 percent return on their investment... This kind of return on their investment could financially cripple organizations like Minor hockey or figure skating." He continued:

Fundraising feasibility or more consultants or private partnership RFQ of RFP is merely stall tactics and if this project isn't approved to proceed on Monday then just kiss it goodbye because I will do everything I can the derail it in the future as I will not have this as an election issue! I have been there and won't have this Council play into the hands of people like Carrier that would love the opportunity for this kind of debate during an election. This passes tomorrow night the kids will be

swimming in January and minor hockey will be skating in a new state of the art rink in May.

Dale this is exactly what you have Campaigned on and exactly what you have been preaching for ten plus years and now you have it at your finger tips so take a leading role tomorrow night and don't allow the bullshit to prevail as it has on this issue for years. let Ameraso present and let them go away so we can get this done NOW!

*Email chain including Dale West and Rick Lloyd, August 26, 2012, [TOC0204951](#)*

461. Councillor Dale West replied, speculating about whether the Clippers or other groups would contribute funds, and writing,

.... between you and me... if i had sat down today and read the two plans..  
ameresco or sprung

the choice is obvious (no new virtual debt vs financing 20 odd million at high rate)

so really the only concern is mark and terry... if they werent attached doubt i would think twice

because while the ameresco route might have been only route a few months ago... something better has apparently come along

*Email chain including Dale West and Rick Lloyd, August 26, 2012, [TOC0204951](#)*

462. Deputy Mayor Rick Lloyd replied, "... Terry totally understands and I think Mark is clinging because he has a lot to gain\$\$\$\$. We need to do what is best for our Community and at this time it isn't Amersco"

*Email chain including Dale West and Rick Lloyd, August 26, 2012, [TOC0204951](#)*

### 7.30 Deputy Mayor Rick Lloyd and Paul Bonwick Encourage Acting CAO Ed Houghton Ahead of the Council Vote on Sprung Structures

463. Deputy Mayor Rick Lloyd wrote to Acting CAO Ed Houghton at 11:50 am on August 26, 2012, writing:

Hey keep up the good work !!! I believe that Tomorrow we will have the results we hope for!

Its all coming together because of you and your leadership!

This has been the best few months of Council that I have ever been involved with and its all because of you and your team approach!

Get this behind us the look out what we can do next! LOL

Rick

*Email chain including Rick Lloyd, Ed Houghton, and Paul Bonwick, August 26, 2012, [TOC0204900.0001](#)*

464. Deputy Mayor Lloyd then forwarded his email to Paul Bonwick and said, “Keep his spirits up!”

*Email chain including Rick Lloyd, Ed Houghton, and Paul Bonwick, August 26, 2012, [TOC0204900.0001](#)*

465. On August 26, 2012, at 11:59 am, Ed Houghton forwarded Councillor Dale West’s contact information to Paul Bonwick. Mr. Bonwick replied, “All is good in the world. Good planning and execution always pay off and you are master of both! Chin up old boy...36 hours from now the sun will shine:-) Call you around dinner”.

*Email chain including Ed Houghton and Paul Bonwick, August 26, 2012, [TOC0204917.0001](#)*